

BUDDHISM

The Questions of King Milinda

A philosophical dialogue between the Indo-Greek king Menander (Milinda) and the Buddhist monk Nagasena, using similes and reasoned argument to resolve apparent contradictions in Buddhist doctrine. Presents the complete text in T.W. Rhys Davids's 1890/1894 translation (Sacred Books of the East).

Presented by Earth's Sacred Texts — blackbetty.space

Contents

THE SECULAR NARRATIVE

LAKKHANA PANHA. THE DISTINGUISHING CHARACTERISTICS OF ETHICAL QUALITIES.

Chapter II.2

Chapter II.3

VIMATICCHEDANA PANHO. THE REMOVAL OF DIFFICULTIES.

Chapter III.5

Chapter III.6

Chapter III.7

Chapter IV

[THE ABOLITION OF REGULATIONS.]

Chapter IV.3

[THE MURDER OF MOGGALLANA.]

THE PROBLEM OF INFERENCE.

THE DHUTANGAS.

Chapter VII

THE SECULAR NARRATIVE

¹ i. King Milinda, at Sagala the famous town of yore, To Nagasena, the world famous sage, repaired.
(So the deep Ganges to the deeper ocean flows.) To him, the eloquent, the bearer of the torch Of
Truth, dispeller of the darkness of men's minds, Subtle and knotty questions did he put, many,
Turning on many points. Then were solutions

² given Profound in meaning, gaining access to the heart, Sweet to the ear, and passing wonderful
and strange. For Nagasena's talk plunged to the hidden

³ depths Of Vinaya and of Abhidhamma (Law and Thought) Unravelling all the meshes of the Suttas'
net, Glittering the while with metaphors and reasoning high.

⁴ Come then! Apply your minds, and let your hearts rejoice, And hearken to these subtle
questionings, all grounds Of doubt well fitted to resolve.

⁵ Thus hath it been handed down by tradition There is in the country of the Yonakas l a great centre
of trade , a city that is called Sigala, situate in a delightful country well watered and hilly, abounding
in parks and gardens and groves and lakes and tanks, a paradise of rivers and mountains and woods.
Wise architects have laid it out , and its people know of no oppression, since all their enemies and
adversaries have been put down. Brave is its defence, with many and various strong towers and
ramparts, with superb gates and entrance archways ; and with the royal citadel in its midst, white
walled and deeply moated. Well laid out are its streets, squares, cross roads, and market places . Well
displayed are the innumerable sorts of costly merchandise [2] with which its shops are filled. It is
richly adorned with hundreds of alms-

⁶ halls of various kinds ; and splendid with hundreds of thousands of magnificent mansions, which
rise aloft like the mountain peaks of the Himalayas. Its streets are filled with elephants, horses,
carriages, and foot-passengers, frequented by groups of handsome men and beautiful women, and
crowded by men of all sorts and conditions, Brahmans, nobles, artificers, and servants. They resound
with cries of welcome to the teachers of every creed, and the city is the resort of the leading men of
each of the differing sects. Shops are there for the sale of Benares muslin, of Koumbara stuffs \ and
of other cloths of various kinds ; and sweet odours are exhaled from the bazaars, where all sorts of
flowers and perfumes are tastefully set out Jewels are there in plenty, such as men's hearts desire, and
guilds of traders in all sorts of finery display their goods in the bazaars that face all quarters of the
sky. So full is the city of money, and of gold and silver ware, of copper and stone ware, that it is a
very mine of dazzling treasures. And there is laid up there much store of property and corn and things
of value in warehouses foods and drinks of every sort, syrups and sweetmeats of every kind. In
wealth it rivals Uttara-kuru, and in glory it is as Aakamandi, the city of the gods .

⁷ Having said thus much we must now relate the previous birth history of these two persons (Milinda
B 2 and Mgasena) and the various sorts of puzzles \ This we shall do under six heads :

⁸ Their previous history (Pubba-yoga). 2. The Milinda problems. 3. Questions as to distinguishing
characteristics. 4. Puzzles arising out of contradictory statements.

⁹ Puzzles arising out of ambiguity. 6. Discussions turning on metaphor. And of these the Milinda
problems are in two divisions questions as to distinctive characteristics, and questions aiming at the

dispelling of doubt; and the puzzles arising out of contradictory statements are in two divisions the long chapter, and the problems in the life of the recluse.

¹⁰ THEIR PREVIOUS HISTORY (p.UBBA-YOGA). 4. By Pubba-yoga is meant their past Karma (their doings in this or previous lives). Long ago, they say, when Kassapa the Buddha was promulgating the faith, there dwelt in one community near the Ganges a great company of members of the Order. There the brethren, true to established rules and duties, rose early in the morning, and taking the long-handled brooms, would sweep out the courtyard and collect the rubbish into a heap, meditating the while on the virtues of the Buddha.

¹¹ One day a brother told a novice to remove the heap of dust. But he, as if he heard not, went about his business ; and on being called a second time, and a third, still went his way as if he had not heard. Then the brother, angry with so intractable a novice, dealt him a blow with the broom stick.

¹² 8. THEIR PREVIOUS BIRTH. 5 [3] This time, not daring to refuse, he set about the task crying ; and as he did so he muttered to himself this first aspiration : ' May I, by reason of this meritorious act of throwing out the rubbish, in each successive condition in which I may be born up to the time when I attain Nirvā, be powerful and glorious as the midday sun ! '

¹³ When he had finished his work he went to the river side to bathe, and on beholding the mighty billows of the Ganges seething and surging, he uttered this second aspiration: 'May I, in each successive condition in which I may be born till I attain Nirvā, possess the power of saying the right thing, and saying it instantly, under any circumstance that may arise, carrying all before me like this mighty surge ! '

¹⁴ Now that brother, after he had put the broom away in the broom closet, had likewise wandered down to the river side to bathe, and as he walked he happened to overhear what the novice had said. Then thinking : ' If this fellow, on the ground of such an act of merit, which after all was instigated by me, can harbour hopes like this, what may not I attain to ? ' he too made his wish, and it was thus : ' In each successive condition in which I may be born till I attain Nirvana, may I too be ready in saying the right thing at once, and more especially may I have the power of unravelling and of solving each problem and each puzzling question this young man may put carrying all before me like this mighty surge ! '

¹⁵ Then for the whole period between one Buddha and the next these two people wandered from existence to existence among gods and men. And our Buddha saw them too, and just as he did

¹⁶ to the son of Moggallā and to Tissa the Elder, so to them also did he foretell their future fate, saying : ' Five hundred years after I have passed away will these two reappear, and the subtle Law and Doctrine taught by me will they two explain, unravelling and disentangling its difficulties by questions put and metaphors adduced/

¹⁷ Of the two the novice became the king of the city of Sagala in India, Milinda by name, learned, eloquent, wise, and able; and a faithful observer, and that at the right time, of all the various acts of devotion and ceremony enjoined by his own sacred hymns concerning things past, present, and to come. Many were the arts and sciences he knew holy tradition and secular law ; the Sankhya, Yoga, Nyaya, and Vaisesika systems of philosophy; arithmetic; music; medicine; the four Vedas, the Puranas, and the Itihasas ; astronomy, magic, causation, and spells ; the art of war ; poetry ; conveyancing in a word, the whole nineteen.

¹⁸ As a disputant he was hard to equal, harder 10. MILINDA THE KING. still to overcome ; the acknowledged superior of all the founders of the various schools of thought. And as in wisdom so in strength of body, swiftness, and valour there was found none equal to Milinda in all India. He was rich too, mighty in wealth and prosperity, and the number of his armed hosts knew no end.

¹⁹ Now one day Milinda the king proceeded forth out of the city to pass in review the innumerable host of his mighty army in its fourfold array (of elephants, cavalry, bowmen, and soldiers on foot). And when the numbering of the forces was over, the king, who was fond of wordy disputation, and eager for discussion with casuists, sophists \ and gentry of that sort, looked at the sun (to ascertain the time), and then said to his ministers: 'The clay is yet young. What would be the use of getting back to town so early ? Is there no learned person, whether wandering teacher 2 or Brahman, the head of some school or order, or the master of some band of pupils (even though he profess faith

²⁰ in the Arahata, the Supreme Buddha), who would be able to talk with me, and resolve my doubts ?'

11. Thereupon the five hundred Yonakas said to Milinda the king: 'There are the six Masters, O king 1 Ptiraa Kassapa, Makkhali of the cowshed 1 f the Nigant&a. of the Ndta clan, Sa^aya the son of the Belaya woman, Aita of the garment of hair, and Pakudha Kayana. These are well known as famous founders of schools, followed by bands of disciples and hearers, and highly honoured by the people. Go, great king! put to them your problems, and have your doubts resolved V

²¹ So king Milinda, attended by the five hundred Yonakas, mounted the royal car with its splendid equipage, and went out to the dwellingplace of Purana Kassapa, exchanged with him the compliments of friendly greeting, and took his seat courteously apart. And thus sitting he said to

²² 2 All this is a mere echo of the opening paragraphs in the SSmawa-phala (D. 2), where Ajatasattu is described as visiting these six famous sophists. And the plagiarism is all the more inartistic as the old names are retained, and no explanation is given of their being born twice at an interval of five hundred years. One may indeed ask what is a glaring anachronism to our good Buddhist romancer compared with the advantage of introducing the stock-names when he has to talk of heretics? But the whole book is so full of literary skill, that it is at least strange that its author should have made this blunder; and there are other reasons for thinking the whole episode an interpolation. (See note on 13, ig.) So that probably our 15 came originally immediately after 10, and then (after the episode in 15-36) 37 takes up the narrative interrupted at the end of 10,

²³ I, 13. THE HERETICS OF OLD. 9 him : ' Who is it, venerable Kassapa, who rules the world ? ' ' The Earth, great king, rules the world ! '

²⁴ When he had thus spoken, neither could Ptiraa Kassapa swallow the puzzle, nor could he bring it up ; crestfallen, driven to silence, and moody , there he sat.

²⁵ Then Milinda the king said to Makkhali of the cowshed : ' Are there, venerable Gosla, good and evil acts? Is there such a thing as fruit, ultimate result, of good and evil acts ? '

²⁶ ' There are no such acts, O king ; and no such fruit, or ultimate result. Those who here in the world are nobles, they, O king, when they go to the

²⁷ III, 10, but the AvU'i is not one of them. This blunder, improbable in a writer so learned as our author elsewhere shows himself, is another reason for thinking these sections to be an interpolation.

²⁸ IV, 4, 7, and compare Anguttara III, 73, 4. other world, will become nobles once more. And those who are Brahmins, or of the middle class, or workpeople, or outcasts here, will in the next world become the same. What then is the use of good or evil acts 1 ? '

²⁹ ' If, venerable Gosila, it be as you say then, by parity of reasoning, those who, here in this world, have a hand cut off, must in the next world become persons with a hand cut off, and in like manner those who have had a foot cut off or an ear or their nose ! '

³⁰ And at this saying Makkhali was silenced. 14. Then thought Milinda the king within himself : 'All India is an empty thing, it is verily like chaff! There is no one, either recluse or Brahmin, capable of discussing things with me, and dispelling my doubts/ And he said to his ministers : ' Beautiful is the night and pleasant ! Who is the recluse or Brahmin we can visit to-night to question him, who will be able to converse with us and dispel our doubts 3 ? ' And at that saying the counsellors remained silent, and stood there gazing upon the face of the king.

³¹ Now at that time the city of Sigala had for twelve years been devoid of learned men, whether Brahmins, Samaras, or laymen. But wherever the king heard that such persons dwelt, thither he would

³² s This is an echo of the words in the corresponding passage of the Samawwa-phala Sutta (D. 2, i). I, I& ASSAGUTTA. 1 1 go and put his questions to them 1 . [6] But they all alike, being unable to satisfy the king by their solution of his problems, departed hither and thither, or if they did not leave for some other place, were at all events reduced to silence. And the brethren of the Order went, for the most part, to the Himalaya mountains.

³³ 1 6. Now at that time there dwelt, in the mountain region of the Himalayas, on the Guarded Slope, an innumerable company of Arahats (brethren who, while yet alive, had attained Nirvana). And the venerable Assagutta, by means of his divine power of hearing, heard those words of king Milinda. And he convened an assembly of the Order on the summit of the Yugandhara mountain, and asked the brethren : ' Is there any member of the Order able to hold converse with Milinda the king, and resolve his doubts ? '

³⁴ Then were they all silent. And a second and a third time he put the same question to them, and still none of all the number spake. Then he said to the assembled Order : ' There is, reverend Sirs, in the heaven of the Thirty-three , and east of the Vefayanta palace, a mansion called Ketumatt, wherein dwells the god Mahisena, He is able to hold converse with Milinda the king, and to resolve his doubts/ And the innumerable company of

³⁵ Arahats vanished from the summit of the Yugandhara mountain, and appeared in the heaven of the Thirty-three. 17. And Sakka, the king of the gods, beheld those brethren of the Order as they were coming from afar. And at the sight of them he went up to the venerable Assagutta, and bowed down before him, and stood reverently aside. And so standing he said to him : c Great, reverend Sir, is the company of the brethren that has come. What is it that they want ? I am at the service of the Order. What can I do for you ?'

³⁶ And the venerable Assagutta replied : ' There is, O king, in India, in the city of Sdgala, a king named Milinda. As a disputant he is hard to equal, harder still to overcome, he is the acknowledged superior of all the founders of the various schools of thought He is in the habit of visiting the members of the Order and harassing them by questions of speculative import/

³⁷ Then said Sakka, the king of the gods, to him : ' That same king Milinda, venerable one, left this condition to be born as a man. And there dwells in the mansion Ketumati a god, MaMsena by name, who is able to hold converse with him and to resolve his doubts. [7] That god we will beseech to suffer himself to be reborn into the world of men/

³⁸ 1 8. So Sakka, the king of the gods, preceded by the Order, entered the Ketumati mansion; and when he had embraced Mah&sena the god, he said to him : ' The Order of the brethren, Lord, makes this request of you to be reborn into the world of men/

³⁹ ' I have no desire, Sir, for the world of men, so overladen with action (Karma). Hard is life as a I, 19. MAHASENA THE GOD. 13

⁴⁰ man. It is here, Sir, in the world of the gods that, being reborn in ever higher and higher spheres, I hope to pass away!'

⁴¹ And a second and a third time did Sakka, the king of the gods, make the same request, and the reply was still the same. Then the venerable Assagutta addressed Mahasena the god, and said : ' On passing in review, Lord, the worlds of gods and men, there is none but thee that we find able to succour the faith by refuting the heretical views of Milinda the king. The whole Order beseeches thee, Lord, saying : " Condescend, O worthy one, to be reborn among men, in order to lend to the religion of the Blessed One thy powerful aid."

⁴² Then was Mahisena the god overjoyed and delighted in heart at the thought that he would be able to help the faith by refuting the heresy of Milinda ; and he gave them his word, and said :

⁴³ Very well then, venerable ones, I consent to be reborn in the world of men/ 19. Then the brethren, having thus accomplished the task they had taken in hand, vanished from the heaven of the Thirty-three, and reappeared on the Guarded Slope in the Himalaya mountains. And 1 the venerable Assagutta addressed the Order, and said : * Is there, venerable ones, any brother belonging to this company of the Order, who has not appeared in the assembly?'

⁴⁴ Thereupon a certain brother said there was, that Rohana had a week previously gone into the mountains, and become buried in meditation, [8] and suggested that a messenger should be sent to him. And at that very moment the venerable Rohana aroused himself from his meditation, and was aware

⁴⁵ that the Order was expecting him \ And vanishing from the mountain top, he appeared in the presence of the innumerable company of the brethren.

⁴⁶ And the venerable Assagutta said to him : ' How now, venerable Rohana ! When the religion of the Buddha is in danger of crumbling away, have you no eyes for the work of the Order ?'

⁴⁷ ' It was through inadvertence, Sir/ said he. ' Then, venerable Rohana, atone for it/ 'What, Sir, should I do?' * There is a Brahman village, venerable Rohana, called Kaangala , at the foot of the Himalaya mountains, and there dwells there a Brahman called Sowuttara. He will have a son called Nagasena. Go to that house for alms during seven years and ten months. After the lapse of that time thou shalt draw away the boy from a worldly life, and cause him to enter the Order. When he shall have abandoned the world, then shalt thou be free of the atonement for thy fault.'

⁴⁸ Now Mahisena the god passed away from the world of the gods, and was reborn in the womb of the wife of the Brahman So?mttara. And at the moment of his conception three strange, wonderful things took place : arms and weapons became all

⁴⁹ T, 21. MAHASENA THE GOD. 15 ablaze, the tender grain became ripe in a moment, and there was a great rain (in the time of drought). And the venerable Rohana went to that house for alms for seven years and ten months from the day of Mahisena's re-incarnation, but never once did he receive so much as a spoonful of boiled rice, or a ladleful of sour gruel, or a greeting, or a stretching forth of the joined hands, or any sort of salutation. Nay rather it was insults and taunts that fell to his share : and there was no one who so much as said, ' Be so good, Sir, as to go on to the next house V

⁵⁰ But when all that period had gone by he one day happened to have those very words addressed to him. And on that day the Brahman, on his way back from his work in the fields, [9] saw the Elder as he met him on his return, and said : ' Well, hermit, have you been to our place ? *

⁵¹ ' Yes, Brahman, I have/ ' But did you get anything there ? ' ' Yes, Brahman, I did/ And he was displeased at this, and went on home, and asked them : ' Did you give anything to that hermit?'

⁵² * We gave him nothing,' was the reply. 21. Thereupon the Brahman, the next day, seated himself right in the doorway, thinking to himself : * To-day I'll put that hermit to shame for having told a lie/ And the moment that the Elder in due course came up to the house again, he said : ' Yesterday you said you had got something at my house, having

⁵³ I, 22. all the while got nothing ! Is lying allowed to you fellows ?' And the Elder replied: ' Brahman, for seven years and ten months no one even went so far as to suggest politely that I should pass on. Yesterday this courtesy was extended to me. It was to that that I referred/

⁵⁴ The Brahman thought to himself: * If these men, at the mere experience of a little courtesy, acknowledge in a public place, and with thanks, that they have received an alms, what will they not do if they really receive a gift ! ' And he was much struck by this, and had an alms bestowed upon the Elder from the rice and curry prepared for his own use, and added furthermore : * Every day you shall receive here food of the same kind/ And having watched the Elder as he visited the place from that day onwards, and noticed how subdued was his demeanour, he became more and more pleased with him, and invited him to take there regularly his midday meal. And the Elder gave, by silence, his consent ; and daily from that time forth, when he had finished his meal, and was about to depart, he would pronounce some short passage or other from the words of the Buddha \

⁵⁵ Now the Brahman's wife had, after her ten months, brought forth her son ; and they called his name Nagasena. He grew up in due course till he became seven years old, and his father said to the child : ' Do you want, [10] dear Nagasena, to study the learning traditional in this Brahmanical house of ours ? '

⁵⁶ 23. BRAHMAN KNOWLEDGE. IJ 'What is it called, father ?' said he. ' The three Vedas are called learning (Sikkhd), other kinds of knowledge are only arts, my dear/

⁵⁷ 'Yes, I should like to learn them, father/ said the boy. Then Souttara the Brahman gave to a Brahman teacher a thousand pieces as his teaching fee, and had a divan spread for him aside in an inner chamber, and said to him : ' Do thou, Brahman, teach this boy the sacred hymns by heart/

⁵⁸ So the teacher made the boy repeat the hymns, urging him to get them by heart. And young Nagasena, after one repetition of them, had learnt the three Vedas by heart, could intone them correctly, had understood their meaning, could fix the right place of each particular verse , and had grasped the mysteries they contained . All at once there arose in him an intuitive insight into the Vedas, with a knowledge of their lexicography, of their prosody, of their grammar, and of the legends

attaching to the characters in them. He became a philologist and grammarian, and skilled alike in casuistry and in the knowledge of the bodily marks that foreshadow the greatness of a man .

⁵⁹ Then young Nagasena said to his father : ' Is [35] c there anything more to be learned in this Brahmanical family of ours, or is this all ? '

⁶⁰ And young Ngasena repeated his lesson to his teacher for the last time, and went out of the house, and in obedience to an impulse arising in his heart as the result of previous Karma, sought a place of solitude, where he gave himself up to meditation. And he reviewed what he had learnt throughout from beginning to end, and found no value in it anywhere at all. And he exclaimed in bitterness of soul : 'Empty forsooth are these Vedas, and as chaff. There is in them neither reality, nor worth, nor essential truth ! '

⁶¹ That moment the venerable Rohana, seated at his hermitage at Vattaniya, felt in his mind what was passing in the heart of Nagasena. And he robed himself, and taking his alms-bowl in his hand, he vanished from Vattaniya and appeared near the Brahman village Kajnangala. And young Nagasena, as he stood again in the doorway, saw him coming in the distance. At the sight of him he became happy and glad, and a sweet hope sprang up in his heart that from him he might learn the essential truth. And he went [11] to him, and said: ' Who art thou, .Sir, that thou art thus bald-headed, and wearest yellow robes ? '

⁶² 'They call me a recluse, my child' (Pabbaita : literally, 'one who has abandoned;' that is, the worldly life). * And why do they call thee " one who has abandoned?"

⁶³ ' Because a recluse is one who has receded from I, 23. REASONS FOR SHAVING. 1 9 the world in order to make the stain of sinful things recede. It is for that reason, my child, that they call me a recluse/

⁶⁴ ' Why, Sir, dost thou not wear hair as others do ?' ' A recluse shaves off his hair and beard on the recognition of the sixteen impediments therein to the higher life. And what are those sixteen l ? The impediments of ornamenting it, and decking it out, of putting oil upon it, of shampooing it, of placing garlands round it, of using scents and unguents, and myrobalan seeds, and dyes, and ribbons, and combs, of calling in the barber, of unravelling curls, and of the possibility of vermin. When their hair falls off they are grieved and harassed; yea, they lament sometimes, and cry, and beat their breasts, or fall headlong in a swoon and entangled by these and such impediments men may forget those parts of wisdom or learning which are delicate and subtle/

⁶⁵ * And why, Sir, are not thy garments, too, as those of other men ? ' ' Beautiful clothes, my boy, such as are worn by worldly men, are inseparable from the five cravings . But whatsoever dangers lurk in dress he who wears the yellow robes knows nothing of. It is for that reason that my dress is not as other men's/

⁶⁶ ' Dost thou know, Lord, what is real knowledge ?' * Yes, lad, the real knowledge I know ; and what is the best hymn (mantra) in the world, that too I know/

⁶⁷ ' Couldst thou teach it, Lord, to me too ?' C 2 ' Yes, I could. 5 1 Teach me, then/ ' Just now is not the right time for that ; we have come down to the village for alms/

⁶⁸ Then young Nagasena took the alms-bowl the venerable Rohana was carrying, and led him into the house, and with his own hand supplied him with food, hard and soft, as much as he required. And

when he saw that he had finished his meal, and withdrawn his hand from the bowl, he said to him : ' Now, Sir, will you teach me that hymn ?'

⁶⁹ ' When thou hast become free from impediments, my lad, by taking upon thee, and with thy parents' consent, the hermit's dress I wear, then I can teach it thee/

⁷⁰ So young [12] Nagasena went to his father and mother, and said : * This recluse says he knows the best hymn in the world, but that he cannot teach it to any one who has not entered the Order as his pupil I should like to enter the Order and learn that hymn/

⁷¹ And his parents gave their consent; for they wished him to learn the hymn, even at the cost of retiring from the world ; and they thought that when he had learned it he would come back again *.

⁷² Then the venerable Rohana took Nagasena to the Vattaniya hermitage, to the Viamba Vatthu, and having spent the night there, took him on to the Guarded Slope, and there, in the midst of the innumerable company of the Arahats, young Nagasena was admitted, as a novice, into the Order.

⁷³ I, 26. BUDDHIST EDUCATION. 2 1 26. And then, when he had been admitted to the Order, the venerable Nagasena said to the venerable Rohana : ' I have adopted your dress ; now teach me that hymn/

⁷⁴ Then the venerable Rohana thought thus to himself: 'In what ought I first to instruct him, in the Discourses (Suttanta) or in the deeper things of the faith (Abhidhamma)?' and inasmuch as he saw that Nagasena was intelligent, and could master the Abhidhamma with ease, he gave him his first lesson in that.

⁷⁵ And the venerable Nagasena, after hearing it repeated but once, knew by heart the whole of the Abhidhamma that is to say, the Dhamma Sanga;zi, with its great divisions into good, bad, and indifferent qualities, and its subdivisions into couples and triplets 1 the Vibhaffa, with its eighteen chapters, beginning with the book on the constituent elements of beings the Dhatu KalM, with its fourteen books, beginning with that on compensation and non-compensation the Puggala Pafttatti, with its six divisions into discrimination of the various constituent elements, discrimination of the various senses and of the properties they apprehend, and so on 2 the Kathi Vatthu, with its thousand sections, five hundred on as many points

⁷⁶ of our own views, and five hundred on as many points of our opponents' views the Yamaka, with its ten divisions into complementary propositions as to origins, as to constituent elements, and so on and the Pa#Mna, with its twenty-four chapters on the reason of causes, the reason of ideas, and the rest. And he said [13] : ' That will do, Sir. You need not propound it again. That will suffice for my being able to rehearse it/

⁷⁷ Then Nclgasena went to the innumerable company of the Arahats, and said : ' I should like to propound the whole of the Abhidhamma Pitaka, without abridgement, arranging it under the three heads of good, bad, and indifferent qualities/ And they gave him leave. And in seven months the venerable Nagasena recited the seven books of the Abhidhamma in full. And the earth thundered, the gods shouted their applause, the Brahma gods clapped their hands, and there came down a shower from heaven of sweet-scented sandalwood dust, and of Manddrava flowers ! And the innumerable company of the Arahats, then and there at the Guarded Slope, admitted the venerable Nagasena, then twenty years of age, to full membership in the higher grade of the Order.

⁷⁸ Now the next day after he had thus been admitted into full membership in the Order, the venerable Nagasena robed himself at dawn, and taking his bowl, accompanied his teacher on his round for alms to the village below. And as he went this thought arose within him : * It was, after all, empty-headed and foolish of my teacher to leave the rest of the Buddha's word aside, and teach me the Abhidhamma first ! '

⁷⁹ 29. NAGASENA'S PUNISHMENT. 23 And the venerable Rohana became aware in his own mind of what was passing in the mind of Nagasena, and he said to him : ' That is an unworthy reflection that thou art making, Nagasena ; it is not worthy of thee so to think/

⁸⁰ ' I cannot forgive you, Nagasena, simply on that promise/ was the reply. ' But there is a city called ScLgala, where a king rules whose name is Milinda, and he harasses the brethren by putting puzzles to them of heretical tendency. You will have earned your pardon, Nagasena, when you shall have gone there, and overcome that king in argument, and brought him to take delight in the truth/

⁸¹ * Not only let king Milinda, holy one, but let all the kings of India come and propound questions to me, and I will break all those puzzles up and solve them, if only you will pardon me ! ' exclaimed N&- gasena. But when he found it was of no avail, he said : ' Where, Sir, do you advise me to spend the three months of the rains now coming on 1 ?'

⁸² * There is a brother named Assagutta dwelling at the Vattaniya hermitage. Go, Nagasena, to him; and in my name bow down to his feet, and say : " My teacher, holy one, salutes you reverently, and asks whether you are in health and ease, in full vigour and comfort. He has sent me here to pass

⁸³ the three months of the rains under your charge." When he asks you your teacher's name, tell it him. But when he asks you his own name, say: "My teacher, Sir, knows your name/ ' '

⁸⁴ And Nagasena bowed down before the venerable Rohana, and passing him on his right hand as he left him, took his bowl and robe, and went on from place to place till he came to the Vattaniya hermitage, begging for his food on the way. And on his arrival he saluted the venerable Assagutta, and said exactly what he had been told to say, [15] and to the last reply Assagutta said : ' Very well then, Nagasena, put by your bowl and robe/ And the next day Nagasena swept out the teacher's cell, and put the drinking water and tooth-cleansers ready for him to use. The Elder swept out the cell again, threw away the water and the tooth-cleansers, and fetched others, and said not a word of any kind. So it went on for seven days. On the seventh the Elder again asked him the same questions as before. And on Nagasena again making the same replies, he gave him leave to pass the rainy season there.

⁸⁵ Now a certain woman, a distinguished follower of the faith, had for thirty years and more administered to the wants of the venerable Assagutta. And at the end of that rainy season she came one day to him, and asked whether there was any other brother staying with him. And when she was told that there was one, named Nagasena, she invited the Elder, and Nagasena with him, to take their midday meal the next day at her house. And the Elder signified, by silence, his consent. The next forenoon the Elder robed himself, and taking his bowl in his hand, went down, accompanied by Nagasena as his

⁸⁶ i,3i. N!GASENA'S CONVERSION. 25 attendant, to the dwelling-place of that disciple, and there they sat down on the seats prepared for them. And she gave to both of them food, hard and soft, as much as they required, waiting upon them with her own hands. When Assagutta had finished his

meal, and the hand was withdrawn from the bowl, he said to Nagasena: 'Do thou, Nagasena, give the thanks to this distinguished lady/ And, so saying, he rose from his seat, and went away. [16]

⁸⁷ And the lady said to Nagasena: 'I am old, friend Nagasena. Let the thanksgiving be from the deeper things of the faith/

⁸⁸ And Nagasena, in pronouncing the thanksgiving discourse, dwelt on the profounder side of the Abhidhamma, not on matters of mere ordinary morality, but on those relating to Arahatsip. And as the lady sat there listening, there arose in her heart the Insight into the Truth, clear and stainless, which perceives that whatsoever has beginning, that has the inherent quality of passing away. And Nagasena also, when he had concluded that thanksgiving discourse, felt the force of the truths he himself had preached, and he too arrived at insight 4 he too

⁸⁹ * Vipassana". Childers says this is an attribute of Arahatsip; and Trenckner translates it * superior intelligence/ But Arahats

⁹⁰ entered, as he sat there, upon the stream (that is to say, upon the first stage of the Excellent Way to Arahatsip). 32. Then the venerable Assagutta, as he was sitting in his arbour, was aware that they both had attained to insight, and he exclaimed: 'Well done! well done, Nagasena! by one arrow shot you have hit two noble quarries!' And at the same time thousands of the gods shouted their approval.

⁹¹ Now the venerable Nagasena arose and returned to Assagutta, and saluting him, took a seat reverently apart. And Assagutta said to him: 'Do thou now go, Nagasena, to Pāliputta. There, in the Asoka Park, dwells the venerable Dhammarakkhita. Under him you should learn the words of the Buddha/

⁹² c How far is it, Sir, from here to Pāliputta.' 'A hundred leagues, Nagasena.' 'Great, Sir, is the distance. It will be difficult to get food on the way. How shall I get there? J

⁹³ 'Only go straight on, Nagasena. You shall get food on the way, rice from which the black grains have been picked out, with curries and gravies of various sorts/

⁹⁴ 'Very well, Sir!' said Nagasena, and bowing only have it, because they have all the powers possessed by those in the previous stages of the path, and it is only superior as being above and beyond the intelligence of the worldly wise, or even of the mere moralist. It is less than the 'Divine Eye/ and Nagasena was not yet an Arahata Compare the passages quoted by Childers under Dhamma-akkhu and Dīpa-yakkhu, and also Mahāvagga I, 6, 33; Gtaka I, 140; Sumangala Vilāsinī, 237, 278.

⁹⁵ 34 NAGASENA ARRIVES AT INSIGHT. 27 down before his teacher, and passing him on the right side as he went, he took his bowl and his robe and departed for Pāliputta.

⁹⁶ [17] At that time a merchant of Pāliputta was on his way back to that city with five hundred waggons. And when he saw the venerable Nagasena coming in the distance, he stopped the waggons, and saluted Nagasena, and asked him: 'Whither art thou going, father?'

⁹⁷ 'To Pāliputta, householder/ 'That is well, father. We too are going thither. It will be more convenient for thee to go with us/

⁹⁸ And the merchant, pleased with Nagasena's manners, provided him with food, hard and soft, as much as he required, waiting upon him with his own hands. And when the meal was over, he took a

low seat, and sat down reverently apart. So seated, he said to the venerable Nagasena : ' What, father, is your name ? '

⁹⁹ ' I am called Nagasena, householder/ * Dost thou know, father, what are the words of Buddha?' 1
1 know the Abhidhamma/

¹⁰⁰ ' We are most fortunate, father ; this is indeed an advantage. I am a student of the Abhidhamma, and so art thou. Repeat to me, father, some passages from it/

¹⁰¹ Then the venerable Nagasena preached to him from the Abhidhamma, and by degrees as he did so there arose in Nagasena's heart the Insight into the Truth, clear and stainless, which perceives that whatsoever has in itself the necessity of beginning, that too has also the inherent quality of passing away.

¹⁰² And the Pālīputta merchant sent on his waggons in advance, and followed himself after them. And at a place where the road divided, not far from Pālīputta, he stopped, and said to Nagasena: 'This is the turning to the Asoka Park. Now I have here a rare piece of woollen stuff, sixteen cubits by eight. [18] Do me the favour of accepting it/ And Nagasena did s.o. And the merchant, pleased and glad, with joyful heart, and full of content and happiness, saluted the venerable Nagasena, and keeping him on his right hand as he passed round him, went on his way.

¹⁰³ But Nagasena went on to the Asoka Park to Dhamma-rakkhita. And after saluting him, and telling him on what errand he had come, he learnt by heart, from the mouth of the venerable Dhamma-rakkhita, the whole of the three baskets * of the Buddha's word in three months, and after a single recital, so far as the letter (that is, knowing the words by heart) was concerned. And in three months more he mastered the spirit (that is, the deeper meaning of the sense of the words).

¹⁰⁴ But at the end of that time the venerable Dham- 1 Pitakas. This expression is not used in the sacred books of the canon itself. When it first came into use is unknown. This is the earliest passage in which it has hitherto been found in the technical sense of a division of the Scriptures. It was in full use. at the time of Buddhaghosa (see the Sumangala Vilasinf, pp. 15, 16, 17, 18, &c., and the Samantapāsādikā, printed in Oldenberg's 'Vinaya Pitaka/ vol. iii, p. 293). The tertium quid of the comparison is not the basket or the box as a receptacle for preservation, but as a means of handing on (as Eastern navvies removing earth put it into baskets and pass these latter on from hand to hand). So the expression 'three baskets' means not 'the three collections/ but 'the three bodies of oral tradition as handed down from teacher to teacher/ See Trenckner's decisive argument in his 'Pali Miscellanies,' pp. 67-69.

¹⁰⁵ I, 36. NGASENA GAINS NIRVANA. 29 mā-rakkhita addressed him, and said : ' Just, Nagasena, as a herdsman tends the cows, but others enjoy their produce, so thou too earnest in thy head the whole three baskets of the Buddha's word, and still art not yet a partaker of the fruit of Samāpatti.'

¹⁰⁶ Now at that time the innumerable company of the Arahats at the Guarded Slope in the Himālaya mountains sent a message to him to come, for they were anxious to see him. And when he heard the message the venerable Nagasena vanished from the Asoka Park and appeared before them. And they said : ' Nagasena, that king Milinda is in the habit of harassing the brethren by knotty questions and by argumentations this way and that Do thou, Nagasena, go and [19] master him/

¹⁰⁷ ' Not only let king Milinda, holy ones, but let all the kings of India, come and propound questions to me. I will break all those puzzles up and solve them. You may go fearlessly to Sagala/

¹⁰⁸ Then all the Elders went to the city of Sdgala, lighting it up with their yellow robes like lamps, and bringing down upon it the breezes from the heights where the sages dwell .

¹⁰⁹ 2 3 7. At that time the venerable Ayupila was living at the Sankheyya hermitage. And king Milinda said to his counsellors : ' Beautiful is the night and pleasant ! Who is the wandering teacher or Brahman we can visit to night to question him who will be able to converse with us and to resolve our doubts ? '

¹¹⁰ And the five hundred Yonakas replied : c There is the Elder, Lord, named Ayupala, versed in the three baskets, and in all the traditional lore. He is living now at the Sankheyya hermitage. To him you might go, O king, and put your questions to him/

¹¹¹ 'Very well, then. Let the venerable one be informed that we are coming/ 1 Isi-vitaw parivita#z (nagara#z) akazsu. The meaning of this phrase, which has not been found elsewhere, is doubtful. Trenckner renders f making it respire the odour of saints/ The literal translation would be * making it blown round about by J&'shi-wind/ Perhaps it may be meant to convey the idea of * scented with the sweet breath of the wise/ But in any case the connotation is intended to be a pleasant one. Calling to mind the analogous phrase vianavataw friimzm, 'a hermitage with breezes from the desert/ (MaMvagga I, 22, i7=-ffullavagga VI, 4, 8.) I venture to suggest the rendering adopted above. HinaAkumburS (p. 24) has -ffz'shiwarayange gamangamanayew ^anita wa kivara witaye^ pratiwdtaya kal&huya. 'They set its air in commotion produced by the waving of the robes of the coming and going Ashis/

¹¹² 38. AYUPALA SILENCED. 3! Then the royal astrologer sent a message to Ayupdla to the effect that king Milinda desired to call upon him. And the venerable one said : ' Let him come/

¹¹³ So Milinda the king, attended by the five hundred Yonakas, mounted his royal chariot and proceeded ^to the Sankheyya hermitage, to the place where Ayupala dwelt, and exchanged with him the greetings and compliments of friendship and courtesy, and took his seat respectfully apart. And then he said to him :

¹¹⁴ * Of what use, venerable Ayupila, is the renunciation *of the world carried out by the members of your Order, and in what do you place the summum bonum ?'

¹¹⁵ c Our renunciation, O king,' replied the Elder, * is for the sake of being able to live in righteousness, and in spiritual calm/

¹¹⁶ ' Is there, Sir, any layman who lives so ? ' and the Exposition of Quietism , and the Exhortation to Rihula , the multitude of gods who attained to comprehension of the truth cannot be numbered. And not one of those beings, all of whom were laymen, had renounced the world 3 /

¹¹⁷ 'Then, most venerable Ayupila, your renunciation is of no use. It must be in consequence of sins committed in some former birth, that the Buddhist Samaras renounce the world, and even subject themselves to the restraints of one or other of the thirteen aids to purity 4 ! Those who remain on one seat till they have finished their repast were, forsooth, in some former birth, thieves who robbed other men of their food. It is in consequence of the Karma of having so deprived others of food that they have now only such food as they can get at one sitting ; and are not allowed to eat from time to time as they want It is no virtue on their part, no meritorious abstinence, no righteousness of life. And they who live in the open air were, forsooth, in

¹¹⁸ * The dhutangas, enumerated by Childers sub voce. I, 39AYUPALA SILENCED. 33 some former birth, dacoits who plundered whole villages. It is in consequence of the Karma of having destroyed other people's homes, that they live now without a home, and are not allowed the use of huts. It is no virtue on their part, no meritorious abstinence, no righteousness of life. And those who never lie down, they, forsooth, in some former birth, were highwaymen who seized travellers, and bound them, and left them sitting there. It is in consequence of the Karma of that habit that they have become Nesaiki in this life (men who always sit) and get no beds to lie on. It is no virtue on their part, no meritorious abstinence, no righteousness of life ! '

¹¹⁹ And when he had thus spoken the venerable AyupSla was silenced, and had not a word to say in reply. Then the five hundred Yonakas said to the king : ' The Elder, O king, is learned, but is also diffident. It is for that reason that he makes no rejoinder. But the king on seeing how silent Ayupala had become, clapped his hands [21] and cried out : * All India is an empty thing, it is verily like chaff! There is no one, either Samara or Brahman, capable of discussing things with me and dispelling my doubts ! ! '

¹²⁰ As he looked, however, at the assembly and saw how fearless and self-possessed the Yonakas appeared, he thought within himself : ' For a certainty there must be, methinks, some other learned brother capable of disputing with me, or those Yonakas would not be thus confident/ And he said to them :

¹²¹ * Is there, my good men, any other learned brother to discuss things with me and dispel my doubts ?' 40. Now at that time the venerable Nagasena, after making his alms-tour through the villages, towns, and cities, had in due course arrived at Sdgala, attended by a band of Samaras, as the leader of a company of the Order ; the head of a body of disciples ; the teacher of a school ; famous and renowned, and highly esteemed by the people. And he was learned, clever, wise, sagacious, and able; a skilful expounder, of subdued manners, but full of courage; well versed in tradition, master of the three Baskets (Pifekas), and erudite in Vedic lore . He was in possession of the highest (Buddhist) insight, a master of all that had been handed down in the schools, and of the various discriminations 2 by which the most abstruse points can be explained. He knew by heart the ninefold divisions of the doctrine of the Buddha to perfection , and was equally skilled in discerning both the spirit and the letter of the Word. Endowed with instantaneous and varied power of repartee, and wealth of language, and beauty of eloquence, he was difficult to equal, and still more difficult to excel, difficult to answer, to repel, or to refute. He was imperturbable as the depths of the sea, immovable as the king of mountains ; victorious in the struggle with evil, a dispeller

¹²² I, 41NGASENA. 35 of darkness and diffuser of light; mighty in eloquence, a confounder of the followers of other masters, and a crusher-out of the adherents of rival doctrines (malleus hereticorum). Honoured and revered by the brethren and sisters of the Order, and its lay adherents of either sex, and by kings and their high officials, he was in the abundant receipt of all the requisites of a member of the Order robes and bowl and lodging, and whatever is needful for the sick receiving the highest veneration no less than material gifts. To the wise and discerning who came to him with listening ear he displayed the ninefold jewel of the Conqueror's word, he pointed out to them the path of righteousness, bore aloft for them the torch of truth, set up for them the sacred pillar of the truth , and celebrated for their benefit the sacrifice of the truth. For them he waved the banner, raised the standard, blew the trumpet, and beat the drum of truth. And with his mighty lion's voice, [22] like

Indra's thunder but sweet the while, he poured out upon them a plenteous shower, heavy with drops of mercy, and brilliant with the coruscations of the lightning flashes of his knowledge, of the nectar waters of the teaching of the Nirvāṇa of the truth thus satisfying to the full a thirsty world.

¹²³ There then, at the Sankheyya hermitage, did the venerable Nagasena, with a numerous company of the brethren, dwell . Therefore is it said :

¹²⁴ ; with allusion to the sacred sacrificial post, which plays so great a part in Brahman ritual. D 2 * Learned, with varied eloquence, sagacious, bold, Master of views, in exposition sound, The brethren wise themselves in holy writ, Repeaters of the fivefold sacred word Put Nagasena as their leader and their chief. Him, Nagasena of clear mind and wisdom deep, Who knew which was the right Path, which the

¹²⁵ false, And had himself attained Nirvāṇa's placid heights! Attended by the wise, by holders to the Truth, He had gone from town to town, and come to

¹²⁶ Sigala; And now he dwelt there in Sankheyya's grove, Appearing, among men, like the lion of the hills/ 42. And Devamantiya said to king Milinda : c Wait a little, great king, wait a little ! There is an Elder named Nagasena, learned, able, and wise, of subdued manners, yet full of courage, versed in the traditions, a master of language, and ready in reply, one who understands alike the spirit and the letter of the law, and can expound its difficulties and refute objections to perfection . He is staying at present at the Sarikheyya hermitage. You should go, great king, and put your questions to him. He is able to discuss things with you, and dispel your doubts/

¹²⁷ Then when Milinda the king heard the name Nagasena, thus suddenly introduced, he was seized with fear, and with anxiety, and the hairs of his body stood on end . But he asked Devamantiya : 4 Is that really so ? '

¹²⁸ And Devamantiya replied : * He is capable, Sire, of discussing things with the guardians of the world with Indra, Yama, Varua, Kuvera, Pratapati, Suydma, [23] and Santushita and even with the great Brahma himself, the progenitor of mankind, how much more then with a mere human being!'

¹²⁹ ' Do you then, Devamantiya/ said the king, ' send a messenger to say I am coming.' And he did fo. And Nagasena sent word back that he might come. And the king, attended by the five hundred Yonakas, mounted his royal chariot, and proceeded with a great retinue to the Sankheyya hermitage, and to the place where Nagasena dwelt.

¹³⁰ At that time the venerable Nagasena was seated with the innumerable company of the brethren of the Order, in the open hall in front of the hermitage . So king Milinda saw the assembly from afar, and he said to Devamantiya : c Whose, Devamantiya, is this so mighty retinue ?'

¹³¹ ' These are they who follow the venerable Nagasena/ was the reply. Then at the sight there came over king Milinda terrible enough, especially as the Nagas were looked upon as supernatural beings. But it is no doubt also intended that the king had heard of his fame.

¹³² a feeling of fear and of anxiety, and the hairs of his body stood on end . But nevertheless, though he felt like an elephant hemmed in by rhinoceroses, like a serpent surrounded by the Garudas (the snake-eating mythical birds), like a jackal surrounded by boa-constrictors, or a bear by buffaloes, like a frog pursued by a serpent, or a deer by a panther, like a snake in the hands of a snake charmer, or a rat played with by a cat, or a devil charmed by an exorcist, like the moon when it is seized by Rhu, like a snake caught in a basket, or a bird in a cage, or a fish in a net, like a man who has lost his way

in a dense forest haunted by wild beasts, like a Yakkha (ogre) who has sinned against Vessavana (the king of ogres and fairies), or like a god whose term of life as a god has reached its end though confused and terrified, anxious, and beside himself in an agony of fear like that yet at the thought that he must at least avoid humiliation in the sight of the people, he took courage, and said to Devamantiya : f You need not [24] trouble to point out to me which is Nagasena. I shall pick him out unaided/

¹³³ ' Certainly, Sire, recognise him yourself/ said he . 44. Now Nagasena was junior in seniority (reckoned from the date of his full membership in the

¹³⁴ Phala. (See D. 2, 10 of our forthcoming edition, or p. 116 of Grimblot) I, 44NiGASENA. 39 Order) to the half of that great company seated in front of him, and senior to the half seated behind him. And as he looked over the whole of the assembly, in front, and down the centre, and behind, king Milinda detected Nagasena seated in the middle, and, like a shaggy lion who knows no fear or frenzy, entirely devoid of nervous agitation, and free from shyness and trepidation. And as soon as he saw him, he knew by his mien that that was Nagasena, and he pointed him out to Devamantiya.

¹³⁵ Whereupon the king rejoiced that he had recognised Ncigasena without having had him pointed out to him. But nevertheless, at the sight of him, the king was seized with nervous excitement and trepidation and fear. Therefore is it said :

¹³⁶ ' At the sight of Nagasena, wise and pure, Subdued in all that is the best subjection, Milinda uttered this foreboding word " Many the talkers I have visited, Many the conversations I have had, But never yet, till now, to-day, has fear, So strange, so terrible, overpowered my heart. Verily now defeat must be my lot, And victory his, so troubled is my mind." ' Here ends the introductory secular narrative (Bdhira-katha) 1 .

LAKKHANA PANHA. THE DISTINGUISHING CHARACTERISTICS OF ETHICAL QUALITIES.

¹ THE DISTINGUISHING CHARACTERISTICS OF ETHICAL QUALITIES. CHAPTER 1. i.

[25] Now Milinda the king went up to where the venerable Nagasena was, and addressed him with the greetings and compliments of friendship and courtesy, and took his seat respectfully apart. And Nagasena reciprocated his courtesy, so that the heart of the king was propitiated.

² And Milinda began by asking, * ' How is your Reverence known, and what, Sir, is your name ? ' ' I am known as Nagasena, O king, and it is by that name that my brethren in the faith address me. But although parents, O king, give such a name as Nagasena, or Surasena, or Virasena, or Sihasena, yet this, Sire, Nagasena and so on is only a generally understood term, a designation in common use. For there is no permanent individuality (no soul) involved in the matter 2 /

³ II, T, I. INDIVIDUALITY. 4! Then Milinda called upon the Yonakas and the brethren to witness : ' This Nagasena says there is no permanent individuality (no soul) implied in his name. Is it now even possible to approve him in that ? ' And turning to Nagasena, he said : ' If, most reverend Nagasena, there be no permanent individuality (no soul) involved in the matter, who is it, pray, who gives to you members of the Order your robes and food and lodging and necessities for the sick ? Who is it who enjoys such things when given ? Who is it who lives a life of righteousness ? Who is it who devotes

himself to meditation ? Who is it who attains to the goal of the Excellent Way, to the Nirvana of Arahatsip ? And who is it who destroys living creatures ? who is it who takes what is not his own ? who is it who lives an evil life of worldly lusts, who speaks lies, who drinks strong drink, who (in a word) commits any one of the five sins which work out their bitter fruit even in this life * ? If that be so there is neither merit nor demerit ; there is neither doer nor causer of good or evil deeds ; there is neither fruit nor result of good or evil Karma . [26] If, most reverend Nagasena, we are to think that were a man

⁴ I doubt whether, even in our author's time, the conception 'subject' was common ground, or that the word puggala had acquired that special connotation.

⁵ to kill you there would be no murder \ then it follows that there are no real masters or teachers in your Order, and that your ordinations are void. You tell me that your brethren in the Order are in the habit of addressing you as Nagasena. Now what is that Nagasena ? Do you mean to say that the hair is Nagasena ? '

⁶ ' I don't say that, great king/ ' Or the hairs on the body, perhaps ? ' ' Certainly not/ 'Or is it the nails, the teeth, the skin, the flesh, the nerves, the bones, the marrow, the kidneys, the heart, the liver, the abdomen, the spleen, the lungs, the larger intestines, the lower intestines, the stomach, the faeces, the bile, the phlegm, the pus, the blood, the sweat, the fat, the tears, the serum, the saliva, the mucus, the oil that lubricates the joints, the urine, or the brain, or any or all of these, that is Nagasena ? '

⁷ And to each of these he answered no. * Is it the outward form then (Rupa) that is Nagasena, or the sensations (Vedanci), or the ideas (Sa;Ha), or the confections (the constituent elements of character, Sa;/2khdr&), or the consciousness (Vm- #ana), that is Nagasena ? '

⁸ And to each of these also he answered no. II, i, I. SIMILE OF THE CHARIOT. 43 ' Then is it all these Skandhas combined that are Nagasena ? '

⁹ * No ! great king/ And still he answered no. ' Then thus, ask as I may, I can discover no Nagasena. Nagasena is a mere empty sound. Who then is the Nagasena that we see before us ? It is a falsehood that your reverence has spoken, an untruth ! '

¹⁰ And the venerable Nagasena said to Milinda the king: 'You, Sire, have been brought up in great luxury, as beseems your noble birth. If you were to walk this dry weather on the hot and sandy ground, trampling under foot the gritty, gravelly grains of the hard sand, your feet would hurt you. And as your body would be in pain, your mind would be disturbed, and you would experience a sense of bodily suffering. How then did you come, on foot, or in a chariot ? '

¹¹ ' I did not come, Sir, on foot [27]. I came in a carriage/ * Then if you came, Sire, in a carriage, explain to me what that is. Is it the pole that is the chariot ? '

¹² ' I did not say that/ ' Is it the axle that is the chariot ? ' ' Certainly not/ ' Is it the wheels, or the framework, or the ropes, or the yoke, or the spokes of the wheels, or the goad, that are the chariot ? '

¹³ And to all these he still answered no. 'Then is it all these parts of it that are the chariot ? ' * But is there anything outside them that is the chariot ? '

¹⁴ And still he answered no. * Then thus, ask as I may, I can discover no chariot. Chariot is a mere empty sound. What then is the chariot you say you came in ? It is a falsehood that your Majesty has spoken, an untruth! There is no such thing as a chariot! You are king over all India, a mighty monarch. Of whom then are you afraid that you speak untruth ? And he called upon the Yonakas and

the brethren to witness, saying : c Milinda the king here has said that he came by carriage. But when asked in that case to explain what the carriage was, he is unable to establish what he averred. Is it, forsooth, possible to approve him in that ? '

¹⁵ When he had thus spoken the five hundred Yonakas shouted their applause, and said to the king : * Now let your Majesty get out of that if you can ? 7

¹⁶ And Milinda the king replied to Nagasena, and said : ' I have spoken no untruth, reverend Sir. It is on account of its having all these things the pole, and the axle, the wheels, and the framework, the ropes, the yoke, the spokes, and the goad that it comes under the generally understood term, the designation in common use, of " chariot." '

¹⁷ ' Very good ! Your Majesty has rightly grasped the meaning of " chariot." And just even so it is on account of all those things you questioned me about [28] the thirty-two kinds of organic matter in a human body, and the five constituent elements of being that I come under the generally understood term, the designation in common use, of "Nagasena."

¹⁸ II, I, 2. SENIORITY. 45 For it was said, Sire, by our Sister Vaht in the presence of the Blessed One : "' Just as it is by the condition precedent of the co-existence of its various parts that the word ' chariot ' is used, just so is it that when the Skandhas are there we talk of a ' being . ' "' '

¹⁹ 'Most wonderful, Nagasena, and most strange. Well has the puzzle put to you, most difficult though it was, been solved. Were the Buddha himself here he would approve your answer. Well done, well done, Nagasena ! '

²⁰ 'How many years seniority have you, Nagasena ? ' ' But how can you say it is your " seven ?" Is it you who are "seven," or the number that is "seven?"'

²¹ Now that moment the figure of the king, decked in all the -finery of his royal ornaments, cast its shadow on the ground, and was reflected in a vessel of water. And Nagasena asked him : ' Your figure, O king, is now shadowed upon the ground, and reflected in the water, how now, are you the king, or is the reflection the king ? '

²² ' I am the king, Nagasena, but the shadow comes into existence because of me.' ' Just even so, O king, the number of the years is seven, I am not seven. But it is because of me, O king, that the number seven has come into existence ; and it is mine in the same sense as the shadow is yours . '

²³ 'Most wonderful again, and strange, Nagasena. Well has the question put to you, most difficult though it was, been solved ! '

²⁴ The king said : ' Reverend Sir, will you discuss with me again ? ' ' If your Majesty will discuss as a scholar (paaftt), well ; but if you will discuss as a king, no/

²⁵ 'When scholars talk a matter over one with another then is there a winding up , an unravelling ; one or other is convicted of error , and he then acknowledges his mistake; [29] distinctions are drawn, and contra-distinctions ; and yet thereby they are not angered. Thus do scholars, O king, discuss/

²⁶ * And how do kings discuss ? ' ' When a king, your Majesty, discusses a matter, and he advances a point, if any one differ from him on that point, he is apt to fine him, saying : " Inflict such and such a punishment upon that fellow ! " Thus, your Majesty, do kings discuss 4 /

²⁷ 'Very well. It is as a scholar, not as a king, that I will discuss. Let your reverence talk unrestrainedly, as you would with a brother, or a novice, or a lay disciple, or even with a servant. Be not afraid!'

²⁸ ; not in Childers, but see <2atoka II, 9 ; IV, 383, 384 ; and Morris in the 'Journal of the Pali Text Society/ 1887. IT, i, 3. SABBADINNA. 47

²⁹ 'Very good, your Majesty/ said Nagasena, with thankfulness. c Nagasena, I have a question to ask you ;' said the king. ' Pray ask it, Sire.'

³⁰ ' I have asked it, your Reverence/ c That is answered already.' ' What have you answered ? ' c To what, then, does your Majesty refer ?'

³¹ But Milinda the king thought : ' This Bhikkhu is a great scholar. He is quite capable of discussing things with me. And I shall have a number of points on which to question him, and before I can ask them all, the sun will set It would be better to carry on the discussion at home to-morrow/ And he said to Devamantiya : ' You may let his reverence know that the discussion with the king shall be resumed to-morrow at the palace/ And so saying, he took leave of Nagasena, and mounted his horse, and went away, muttering as he went, 'Nagasena, Nagasena!'

³² And Devamantiya delivered his message to Nagasena, who accepted the proposal with gladness. And early the next morning Devamantiya and Anantakslya and Mankura and Sabbadinna went to the king, and said : ' Is his reverence, Nalgasena, to come, [30] Sire, to-day ? '

³³ ' Yes, he is to come/ 'With how many of the brethren is he to come ? ' ' With as many as he likes/ And Sabbadinna said : ' Let him come with ten/ But the king repeated what he had said. And on Sabbadinna reiterating his suggestion, the king rejoined : 'All this preparation has been made, and I say:

³⁴ " Let him come with as many as he likes," yet Sabbadinna says : " Let him come with ten." Does he suppose we are not capable of feeding so many ? ' Then Sabbadinna was ashamed.

³⁵ And Devamantiya and Anantakiya and Mankura went to Nagasena and told him what the king had said. And the venerable Nagasena robed himself in the forenoon, and taking his bowl in his hand, went to Sigala with the whole company of the brethren. And Anantakaya, as he walked beside Nagasena, said :

³⁶ ' When, your reverence, I say, " Nagasena/ what is that Nagasena ?' The Elder replied : ' What do you think Nagasena is ? '

³⁷ 'The soul, the inner breath which comes and goes, that I suppose to be Nagasena/ * But those trumpeters, when they blow their trumpets,, does their breath return again to them ?'

³⁸ ' No, Sir, it does not/ ' No, Sir/ ' Then why don't they die ? ' ' I am not capable of arguing with such a reasoner. Pray tell me, Sir, how the matter stands/

³⁹ ' There is no soul in the breath. These inhalations and exhalations are merely constituent powers II, I, 5. RENUNCIATION. 49

⁴⁰ of the bodily frame/ said the Elder. And he talked to him from the Abhidhamma a to such effect that 1 Anantakiya confessed himself as a supporter of the Order.

⁴¹ And the venerable Nagasena went to the king, and sat down on the seat prepared for him. And the king provided Nagasena and his following with food, both hard and soft, as much as they required :

and presented each brother with a suit of garments, and Nagasena himself with a set of three robes. And then he said to him : ' Be pleased to keep your seat here, and with you ten of the brethren. Let the rest depart/

⁴² And when he saw that Nagasena had finished his meal, he took a lower seat, and sat beside him, and said : ' What shall we discuss ? '

⁴³ ' We want to arrive at truth. Let our discussion be about the truth/ And the king said : ' What is the object, Sir, of your 2 renunciation, and what the summumbonum at which you aim ?'

⁴⁴ ' How now, Sir ! Is it for such high reasons that all members of it have joined the Order ? ' [32] ' Certainly not, Sire. Some for those reasons,

⁴⁵ 1-1 I venture to think it is incorrect to put a full stop, as Mr. Trenckner has done, after akdsi. [35] = but some have left the world in terror at the tyranny of kings. Some have joined us to be safe from being robbed, some harassed by debt, and some perhaps to gain a livelihood/

⁴⁶ ' But for what object, Sir, did you yourself join/ * I was received into the Order when I was a mere boy, I knew not then the ultimate aim. But I thought : " They are wise scholars, these Buddhist Samaras, they will be able to teach me." And by them I have been taught ; and now do I both know and understand what is at once the reason for, and the advantage of renunciation/ 1 Well put, Nagasena!'

⁴⁷ The king said : ' Nagasena, is there any one who after death is not reindividualised ?' c Some are so, and some not/ <Who are they?'

⁴⁸ ' A sinful being is reindividualised, a sinless one is not/ ' If when I die, I die with craving for existence in my heart, yes ; but if not, no V

⁴⁹ ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' 7. The king said : ' Nagasena, he who escapes reindividualisation is it by reasoning that he escapes it?'

⁵⁰ ' Both by reasoning , your Majesty, and by wisdom , and by other good qualities/ ' But are not reasoning and wisdom surely much the same ? J

⁵¹ * Certainly not. Reasoning is one thing, wisdom II, i, 9. REASON AND WISDOM. 5 I another. Sheep and goats, oxen and buffaloes, camels and asses have reasoning, but wisdom they have not/

⁵² ' Well put, Nagasena ! ' 8. The king said: 'What is the characteristic mark of reasoning, and what of wisdom ?' * Reasoning has always comprehension as its mark; but wisdom has cutting off 1 /

⁵³ ' You remember the barley reapers ? ' 'Yes, certainly/ [33] ' How do they reap the barley?' ' With the left hand they grasp the barley into a bunch, and taking the sickle into the right hand, they cut it off with that/

⁵⁴ 'Just even so, O king, does the recluse by his thinking grasp his mind, and by his wisdom cut off his failings. In this way is it that comprehension is the characteristic of reasoning, but cutting off of wisdom/

⁵⁵ ' Well put, Nagasena ! ' 9. The king said : ' When you said just now, "And by other good qualities," to which did you refer?'

⁵⁶ E 2 'Good conduct, great king, and faith, and perseverance, and mindfulness, and meditation . 'And what is the characteristic mark of good conduct ? '

⁵⁷ 4 It has as its characteristic that it is the basis of all good qualities. The five moral powers 2 faith, perseverance, mindfulness, meditation, and wisdom ; the seven conditions of Arahatsip 3 self-possession, investigation of the Dhamma, perseverance, joy, calm, meditation, and equanimity ; the Path ; readiness of memory (unbroken self-possession) 4 ; the four kinds of right exertion ; the four constituent bases of extraordinary powers ; the four stages of ecstasy ; the eight forms of spiritual emancipation ; the four modes of self-concentration ; and the eight states of intense contemplation 10 have each and all of them good conduct (the observance of outward morality) as their basis. And to him who builds upon that foundation, O king, all these good conditions will not decrease 11 /

⁵⁸ * Give me an illustration/ ' Just, O king, as all those forms of animal and vegetable life which grow, develope, and mature, do so with the earth as their basis ; just so does the recluse, who is devoted in effort, develope in himself the five moral powers, and so on, by means of virtue, on the basis of virtue/

⁵⁹ 11 The above-mentioned meritorious conditions are those the sum of which make Arahatsip. 11,1,9GOOD CONDUCT. 53 ' Just, O king, as all the occupations which involve bodily exertion are carried on in ultimate dependence upon the earth, just so does the recluse develope in himself the five moral powers, and so on, by means of virtue, on the basis of virtue/ [34]

⁶⁰ ' Give me a still better illustration.' ' Just, O king, as the architect of a city, when he wants to build one, first clears the site of the town, and then proceeds to get rid of all the stumps and thorny brakes, and thus makes it level, and only then does he lay out the streets and squares, and crossroads and market places, and so build the city ; just so does the recluse develope in himself the five moral powers, and so on, by means of virtue, on the basis of virtue/

⁶¹ * Can you give me one more simile ? ' 'Just, O king, as an acrobat , when he wants to exhibit his skill, first digs over the ground, and proceeds to get rid of all the stones and fragments of broken pottery, and thus to make it smooth, and only then, on soft earth, shows his tricks ; just even so does the recluse develope in himself the five moral powers, and so on, by means of virtue, on the basis of virtue. For it has been said, Sire, by the Blessed One :

⁶² "Virtue's the base on which the man who's wise Can train his heart, and make his wisdom grow. Thus shall the strenuous Bhikkhu, undeceived, Unravel all the tangled skein of life .

⁶³ " This is the base like the great earth to men And this the root of all increase in goodness, The starting-point of all the Buddhas' teaching, Virtue, to wit, on which true bliss depends V ' v Well said, Nagasena ! '

⁶⁴ 10 2 . The king said, 'Venerable Nagasena, what is the characteristic mark of faith ? ' '

Tranquillisation, O king, and aspiration . ' 'And how is tranquillisation the mark of faith ? ' 'As faith, O king, springs up in the heart it breaks through the five hindrances lust, malice, mental sloth, spiritual pride, and doubt and the heart, free from these hindrances, [35] becomes clear, serene, untroubled/

⁶⁵ ' Give me an illustration/ 'Just, O king, as a suzerain king, when on the march with his fourfold army, might cross over a small stream, and the water, disturbed by the elephants and cavalry, the chariots and the bowmen, might become fouled, turbid , and muddy. And

⁶⁶ II, i, ro. FAITH. 55 when he was on the other side the monarch might give command to his attendants, saying: "Bring some water, my good men, I would fain drink." Now suppose the monarch had a water-clearing gem] 1 , and those men, in obedience to the order, were to throw the jewel into

the water ; then at once all the mud would precipitate itself, and the sandy atoms of shell and bits of water-plants would disappear, and the water would become clear, transparent, and serene, and they would then bring some of it to the monarch to drink. The water is the heart ; the royal servants are the recluse ; the mud, the sandy atoms, and the bits of water-plants are evil dispositions; and the water-cleansing gem is faith/

⁶⁷ * And how is aspiration the mark of faith ? ' ' In as much as the recluse, on perceiving how the hearts of others have been set free, aspires to enter as it were by a leap upon the fruit of the first stage, or of the second, or of the third in the Excellent Way, or to gain Arahathship itself, and thus applies himself to the attainment of what he has not reached; to the experience of what he has not yet felt, to the realisation of what he has not yet realised, therefore is it that aspiration is the mark of faith.'

⁶⁸ ' Give me an illustration.' of the hill, would empty itself into the brook below, so that the stream would rush along, overflowing both its banks. Now suppose a crowd of people, one after the other, were to come up, and being ignorant of the real breadth or depth of the water, were to stand fearful and hesitating on the brink. And suppose a certain man should arrive, who knowing exactly his own strength and power should gird himself firmly and, with a spring, land himself on the other side. Then the rest of the people, seeing him safe on the other side, would likewise cross. That is the kind of way in which the recluse, by faith \ aspires to leap, as it were by a bound, into higher things. For this has been said, O king, by the Blessed One in the Sayutta Nik&ya :

⁶⁹ "By faith he crosses over the stream, By earnestness the sea of life ; By steadfastness all grief he stills, By wisdom is he purified ."

⁷⁰ 'Well put, NagasenaF 3 In the Buddha, in the sufficiency of the Excellent Way he taught, and in the capacity of man to walk along it. It is spoken of slightly (compared with Arahathship) in Mahavagga V, i, 21 in the MaMparinibbana Sutta VI, 9 (of Ananda, who has faith, compared with the brethren, who have entered one or other of the stages of the Excellent Way) and in Ahguttara III, 21 (in comparison with intuitive insight and intellectual perception). For this last comparison see further the Puggala Pa##atti III, 3. From these passages a fair idea of the Buddhist view of faith could be formed. Although the Buddhist faith and the Christian faith are in things contradictory, the two conditions of heart are strikingly similar both in origin and in consequence.

⁷¹ II, I, ii. PERSEVERANCE. 57 1 1 \ The king said : c What, Ngasena, is the characteristic mark of perseverance ? ' ' The rendering of support, O king, is the mark of perseverance . All those good qualities which it supports do not fall away/

⁷² * Give me an illustration/ 'Just as a man, if a house were falling, ' would make a prop for it of another post, and the house so supported would not fall ; just so, O king, is the rendering of support the mark of perseverance, and all those good qualities which it supports do not fall away/

⁷³ ' Give me a further illustration/ 'Just as when a large army has broken up a small one, then the king of the latter would call to mind every possible ally and reinforce his small army , and by that means the small army might in its turn break up the large one ; just so, O king, is the rendering of support the mark of perseverance, and all those good qualities which it supports do not fall away [37]. For it has been said by the Blessed One : " The persevering hearer of the noble truth, O Bhikkhus, puts away evil and cultivates goodness, puts away that which is wrong and developes in himself that which is right, and thus does he keep himself pure."

⁷⁴ 'Well put, NagasenaP 12. The king said: 'What, Nagasena, is the characteristic mark of mindfulness 1 ?' (Repetition, O king, and keeping up V ' And how is repetition the mark of mindfulness ? ' ' As mindfulness, O king, springs up in his heart he repeats over the good and evil, right and wrong, slight and important, dark and light qualities, and those that resemble them, saying to himself : " These are the four modes of keeping oneself ready and mindful, these the four modes of spiritual effort, these the four bases of extraordinary powers, these the five organs of the moral sense, these the five mental powers, these the seven bases of Arahatship, these the eight divisions of the Excellent Way, this is serenity and this insight, this is wisdom and this emancipation V Thus does the recluse follow after

⁷⁵ 2 Apipana and upagawhana, both new words. This definition is in keeping with the etymological meaning of the word sati, which is ' memory/ It is one of the most difficult words (in its secondary, ethical, and more usual meaning) in the whole Buddhist system of ethical psychology to translateHardy renders ' conscience/ which is certainly wrong; and Gogerly (see my 'Buddhist Suttas/ p. 144) has meditation/ which is equally wide of the mark. I have sometimes rendered it 'self-possession/ It means that activity of mind, constant presence of mind, wakefulness of heart, which is the foe of carelessness, inadvertence, self-forgetfulness. And it is a very constant theme of the Buddhist moralist. Buddhaghosa, loc. cit., makes upaMana, 'readiness/ its mark.

⁷⁶ II, i, 12. MINDFULNESS (SATI). 59* those qualities that are desirable, and not after those that are not; thus does he cultivate those which ought to be practised, and not those which ought not. That is how repetition is the mark of mindfulness/

⁷⁷ * Give me an illustration/ 'It is like the treasurer of the imperial sovran , who reminds his royal master early and late of his glory, saying : " So many are thy war elephants, O king, and so many thy cavalry , thy war chariots and thy bowmen, so much the quantity of thy money, and gold, and wealth, may your Majesty keep yourself in mind thereof/

⁷⁸ ' And how, Sir, is keeping up a mark of mindfulness ? ' c As mindfulness springs up in his heart, O king, he searches out the categories of good qualities and their opposites, saying to himself: "Such and such qualities are good, and such bad ; [38] such and such qualities helpful, and such the reverse." Thus does the recluse make what is evil in himself to disappear, and keeps up what is good. That is how keeping up is the mark of mindfulness/

⁷⁹ c Give me an illustration/ 1 ^akkavattissa bhawagriko, no doubt with allusion to the gahapati-ratanaw, one of the seven treasures of the mythical King of Glory (see my ' Buddhist Suttas/ p. 257). It is particularly interesting to me to find here the use of the word 'treasurer* instead of 'householder;' for it was in that exact sense that I had understood the word gahapati in that connection, at a time when, in the then state of Pali scholarship, it seemed very bold to do fo.

⁸⁰ sovran 1 who instructs him in good and evil, saying : " These things are bad for the king and these good, these helpful and these the reverse." And thus the king makes the evil in himself die out, and keeps up the good.' * Well put, Nagasena ! '

⁸¹ I 2 . The king said: c What, Nagasena, is the characteristic mark of meditation 3 ? ' ' Being the leader, O king. All good qualities have meditation as their chief, they incline to it, lead up towards it, are as so many slopes up the side of the mountain of meditation/

⁸² ' Give me an illustration/ ' As all the rafters of the roof of a house, O king, go up to the apex, slope towards it, are joined on together at it, and the apex is acknowledged to be the top of all ; so is the habit of meditation in its relation to other good qualities/

⁸³ * It is like a king, your Majesty, when he goes down to battle with his army in its fourfold array. The whole army elephants, cavalry, war chariots, and bowmen would have him as their chief, their

⁸⁴ II, I, 14 WISDOM. 6 1 lines would incline towards him, lead up to him, they would be so many mountain slopes, one above another, with him as their summit, round him they would all be ranged. [39] And it has been said, O king, by the Blessed One : " Cultivate in yourself, O Bhikkhus, the habit of meditation. He who is established therein knows things as they really are ."' ' Well put, Nagasena !'

⁸⁵ The king said: 'What, Ngasena, is the characteristic mark of wisdom ? ' ' I have already told you, O king, how cutting off, severance, is its mark , but enlightenment is also its mark/

⁸⁶ ' And how is enlightenment its mark ? ' ' Give me an illustration/ cause radiance to arise, and light to shine forth, and make the objects there plainly visible. Just so would wisdom in a man have such effects as were just now set forth/ 'Well put, Nagasena!'

⁸⁷ The king said: 'These qualities which are so different , Nagasena, do they bring about one and the same result ? ' '

⁸⁸ ' They do. The putting an end to evil dispositions/ ' They are like the various parts of an army elephants, cavalry, war chariots, and archers who all work to one end, to wit : the conquest in battle of the opposing army/ ' Well put, N%asena !' Here ends the First Chapter. II, 2, T. IDENTITY. 63

Chapter II.2

¹ i. [40] The king said: c He who is born, Nagasena, does he remain the same or become another ? ' ' Neither the same nor another/

² ' Give me an illustration/ ' Now what do you think, O -king ? You were once a baby, a tender thing, and small in size, lying flat on your back. Was that the same as you who are now grown up ? ' '

³ ' No. That child was one, I am another/ ' If you are not that child, it will follow that you have had neither mother nor father, no ! nor teacher. You cannot have been taught either learning, or behaviour, or wisdom. What, great king! is the mother of the embryo in the first stage different from the mother of the embryo in the second stage, or the third, or the fourth x ? Is the mother of the baby a different person from the mother of the grown-up man ? Is the person who goes to school one, and the same when he has finished his schooling another ? Is it one who commits a crime, another who is punished by having his hands or feet cut off 2 ?'

⁴ * Certainly not But what would you, Sir, say to that ? ' The Elder replied : c I should say that I am the same person, now I am grown up, as I was when I was a tender tiny baby, flat on my back. For all these states are included in one by means of this body/

⁵ ' Give me an illustration/ f Yes, it might do so/ ' No.' ' Or the same that burns in the second watch and in the third ? ' '

⁶ ' No/ ' Then is there one lamp in the first watch, and another in the second, and another in the third ? ' ' tf No. The light comes from the same lamp all the night through/

⁷ The meaning is really quite plain in both the Pali and the Sinhalese. A man, at any one moment, is precisely all that he is then conscious of. The phase of his self-consciousness, the totality of that of which he is conscious, is always changing ; and is so different at death from what it was at birth that, in a certain sense, he is not the same at the one time as he was at the other. But there is a continuity in the whole series; a continuity dependent

⁸ II, 2, 2. ASSURANCE OF SALVATION. 65 ' It is like milk, [41] which when once taken from the cow, turns, after a lapse of time, first to curds, and then from curds to butter, and then from butter to ghee. Now would it be right to say that the milk was the same thing as the curds, or the butter, or the ghee ? '

⁹ * Just so, O king, is the continuity of a person or thing maintained. One comes into being, another passes away ; and the rebirth is, as it were, simultaneous. Thus neither as the same nor as another does a man go on to the last phase of his self-consciousness/

¹⁰ 'Well put, Nagasena P 2 l . The king said : ' Is a man, Nagasena, who will not be reborn, aware of the fact ? ' ' Yes, O king.'

¹¹ 'And how does he know it ? ' ' By the cessation of all that is cause, proximate or remote , of rebirth.' ' Give me an illustration/

¹² ' Suppose a farmer, great king, had ploughed and sown and filled his granary ,* and then for a period should neither plough nor sow, but live on the

¹³ on the whole body. And this fits the simile, in which the lamp is the body, and the flame the changing self-consciousness ; whereas it is impossible to make the simile fit the conclusion as rendered by Hardy.

¹⁴ On the phrase apubbazaariyaz see Dr. Morris's note at p. 101 of the Pali Text Society's Journal, 1887, and the passages he there quotes,

¹⁵ * 66 THE QUESTIONS OF ICING MILINDA. II, 2, 3. stored-up grain, or dispose of it in barter, or deal with it as he had need. Would the farmer be aware, great king, that his granary was not getting filled ? '

¹⁶ ' Yes, he ought to know it/ 'But how?' ' He would know that the cause, proximate and remote, of the filling of the granary had ceased.'

¹⁷ 'Just so with the man you spoke of. By the cessation of all that leads to rebirth, he would be conscious of having escaped his liability to it/

¹⁸ ' Well explained, Nagasena ! ' 3 \ The king said : ' He who has intelligence, Nagasena, has he also wisdom 2 ? ' ' Yes, great king/ [42]

¹⁹ ' What ; are they both the same ? ' ' Yes/ 'Then would he, with his intelligence which, you say, is the same as wisdom be still in bewilderment or not ? '

²⁰ 'In regard to some things, yes; in regard to others, no/ ' What would he be in bewilderment about ? ' ' He would still be in bewilderment as to those parts of learning he had not learnt, as to those countries he had not seen, and as to those names or terms he had not heard/

²¹ ' And wherein would he not be in bewilderment ? J 'As regards that which has been accomplished by insight (the perception, that is,) of the imper-

²² 2 ^ana and 11,2,3. INTELLIGENCE AND WISDOM. 67 manence of all beings, of the suffering inherent in individuality, and of the non-existence of any soul V

²³ ' Then what would have become of his delusions on those points/ ' When intelligence has once arisen, that moment delusion has died away/

²⁴ ' Give me an illustration/ 'It is like the lamp, which when a man has brought into a darkened room, then the darkness would vanish away, and light would appear/

²⁵ ' And what, Nagasena, on the other hand, has then become of his wisdom ?' 'When the reasoning wisdom has effected that which it has to do, then the reasoning ceases to go on. But that which has been acquired by means of it remains the knowledge, to wit, of the impermanence of every being, of the suffering inherent in individuality, and of the absence of any soul/

²⁶ ' Give me an illustration, reverend Sir, of what you have last said/ * It is as when a man wants, during the night, to send a letter, and after having his clerk called, has a lamp lit, and gets the letter written. Then, when that has been done, he extinguishes the lamp. But though the lamp had been put out the writing would still be there. Thus does reasoning cease, and knowledge remain/

²⁷ * Give me a further illustration/ * In Eastern districts [43] the peasants have a custom of arranging five pots full of water behind

²⁸ F 2 each hut with the object of putting out at once any spark of fire that may be kindled. Suppose now the house had caught fire, and they had thrown those five potfulls of water over the hut, and the fire had gone out, would those peasants then think of still going on using the water-pots ?'

²⁹ c The five water-pots are the five organs of moral sense faith, to wit, and perseverance in effort, and mindfulness, and meditation, and the reasoning wisdom. The peasantry are the recluse, who is devoted in effort l ; the fire is sinfulness. As the fire is put out by the water in the five pots, so is sinfulness extinguished by the five organs of moral sense, and when once extinguished it does not again arise 2 /

³⁰ * Give me a further illustration/ ' It is like a physician who goes to the sick man with the five kinds of drugs made from medicinal

³¹ 1 Yogi vaaro ; one of the technical terms in constant use by our author, but not found in the Pali Pitakas. Hardy renders it, * who is seeking Nirvana ; ' but though this may be suggested by the term, it is not its meaning. Literally it is he whose sphere, whose constant resort, is Yoga.' Now yoga is e diligence, devotion, mental concentration;' and there is nothing to show that our author is using the word as an epithet of Arahatsip. It seems to me, therefore 9 that the whole compound merely means one of those 'religious/ in the technical sense, who were also religious in the higher, more usual sense. It would thus be analogous to the phrase sawgmvaaro, e at home in war/ used of a war elephant in the Sa?72gamvaara itaka (Fausbell, II, 95), and of a soldier below, Mil. 44.

³² II, 2, 4SUICIDE. 69 roots , and grinding them up, gives him to drink, and thereby his sickness passes away. Would the physician in that case think of making any further use of the medicine ?'

³³ ' Certainly not, the medicine has done its work. What would be the use of any more ?' 'Just so, O king, when sinfulness is destroyed by the five moral powers, then reasoning ceases, but knowledge remains.'

³⁴ c Give me a further illustration/ * It is like a warrior, at home in war, who takes five javelins and goes down to battle to conquer the foe. And when he has cast them the enemy is broken. There is no need for him to go on casting javelins any more/

³⁵ The king said : ' He who will not be reborn, Nagasena, does he still feel any painful sensation ?' The Elder replied: 'Some he feels and some not/

³⁶ ' Which are they?' 'He may feel bodily pain, O king; but mental pain he would not/ * How would that be so ?' ' Because the causes, proximate or remote, of bodily pain still continue, he would be liable to it. But the causes, proximate or remote, of mental agony having ceased, he could not feel it. For it has been said by the Blessed One : " One kind of pain he suffers, bodily pain : but not mental/'

³⁷ ' The Arahata, O king, has need neither to curry favour nor to bear malice. He shakes not down the unripe fruit, but awaits the full time of its maturity. For it has been said, O king, by the Elder, Siriputta, the Commander of the faith [45] : "It is not death, it is not life I welcome ; As the hireling his wage, so do I bide my time. It is not death, it is not life I want; Mindful and thoughtful do I bide my time ."' 'Well put, Nagasena!'

³⁸ The king said: 'Is a pleasant sensation, Nagasena, good or evil or indifferent ?' ' It may be any one of the three/ * But surely. Sir, if good conditions are not painful, and painful ones not good, then there can arise no good condition that is at the same time painful V

³⁹ * Now, what do you think, great king ? Suppose a man were to hold in one hand a red-hot ball of iron, and in the other a lump of icy snow, would they both hurt him ?'

⁴⁰ ' Yes ; they both would.' ' But are they both hot ?' ' Certainly not/ ' But are they both cold ?' 'No/ * Then acknowledge yourself put in the wrong ! If the heat hurts, and they are not both hot, the pain cannot come from the heat. If the cold hurts,

⁴¹ 2,6. WHAT IS REBORN? JI and they are not both cold, the pain cannot come from the cold. How then, O king, can they both hurt you, since they are not both hot, nor both cold, and (as one is hot and the other cold) the pain comes neither from the hot nor from the cold?'

⁴² * I am not equal to argument with you. Be so good, Sir, as to explain how the matter stands/ Then the Elder reasoned with king Milinda, persuading him by talk on the subject drawn from the Abhidhamma, such as : ' There are these six pleasures, O king, connected with life in the world, and these other six with renunciation. There are six griefs connected with life in the world, and six with renunciation. There are six kinds of indifference to pleasure and to grief connected with life in the world, and six with renunciation. [46] Altogether there are thus six series of six, that is to say, thirtysix kinds of sensations in the present, and the like number in the past, and the like in the future. And adding all these up in one total we arrive at one hundred and eight kinds of sensation/

⁴³ 'Well put, Nagasena !' 6 1 . The king said : ' What is it, Nagasena, that is reborn ?' ' Name-and-form is reborn/ 'What, is it this same name-and-form that is reborn?'

⁴⁴ ' No : but by this name-and-form deeds are done, good or evil, and by these deeds (this Karma) another name-and-form is reborn/

⁴⁵ c If that be so, Sir, would not the new being be released from its evil Karma 1 ? 1 The Elder replied : ' Yes, if it were not reborn. But just because it is reborn, O king, it is therefore not released from its evil Karma/

⁴⁶ c Give me an illustration/ 'Suppose, O king, some man were to steal a mango from another man, and the owner of the mango were to seize him and bring him before the king, and charge him with the crime. And the thief were to say: "Your Majesty! I have not taken away this man's mangoes. Those that he put in the ground are different from the ones I took. I do not deserve to be punished." How then ? would he be guilty? 7

⁴⁷ * Certainly, Sir. He would deserve to be punished/ f But on what ground ? 'Just so, great king, deeds good or evil are done by this name-and-form and another is reborn. But that other is not thereby released from its deeds (its Karma)/

⁴⁸ ' Give me a further illustration/ n, 2, 6. KARMA. 73 another man's field on fire, and the owner of the field were to seize him, and bring him before the king, and charge him with the injury, and he were to say: "Your Majesty! It was not I who set this man's field on fire. The fire I left burning* was a different one from that which burnt his field. I am not guilty." Now would the man, O king, be guilty?'

⁴⁹ ' Certainly, Sir/ 'But why? ' ' Just so, great king, deeds good or evil are done by this name-and-form and another is reborn. But that other is not thereby released from its deeds (its Karma)/

⁵⁰ ' Give me a further illustration/ ' Suppose, O king, a man were to take a lamp and go up into the top storey of his house, and there eat his meal. And the lamp blazing up were to set the thatch on fire, and from that the house should catch fire, and that house having caught fire the whole village should be burnt. And they should seize him and ask : " What, you fellow, did you set our village on fire for?" And he should reply: "I've not set your village on fire ! The flame of the lamp, by the light of which I was eating, was one thing ; the fire which burnt your village was another thing/" Now if they, thus disputing, should go to law before you, O king, in whose favour would you decide the case?'

⁵¹ * In the villagers' favour/ ' But why ? J (Because, Sir, in spite of whatever the man might say, the one fire was produced from the other/

⁵² 'Just so, great king, it is one name-and-form which has its end in death, and another name-and-form which is reborn. But the second is the result of the first, and is therefore not set free from its evil deeds/

⁵³ ' Give me a further illustration/ * Suppose, O king, a man were to choose a young girl in marriage, and give a price l for her and go away. [48] And she in due course should grow up to full age, and then another man were to pay a price for her and marry her. And when the first one had come back he should say : " Why, you fellow, have you carried off my wife? " And the other were to reply: " It's not your wife I have carried off! The little girl, the mere child, whom you chose in marriage and paid a price for is one ; the girl grown up to full age whom I chose in marriage and paid a price for, is another/" Now if they, thus disputing, were to go to law about it before you, O king, in whose favour would you decide the case ?'

⁵⁴ ' In favour of the first/ 'But why?' ' Because, in spite of whatever the second might say, the grown-up girl would have been derived from the other girl/

⁵⁵ 'Just so, great king, it is one name-and-form which has its end in death, and another name-and-form II, 2, 7* KARMA. 75 which is reborn. But the second is the result of the first, and is therefore not set free from its evil deeds/

⁵⁶ ' Give me a further illustration. 5 ' Suppose a man, O king, were to buy of a herdsman a vessel of milk, and go away leaving it in his charge, saying : " I will come for it to-morrow;" and the next day it were to become curds. And when the man should come and ask for it, then suppose the other were to offer him the curds, and he should say : " It was not curds I bought of you ; give me my vessel of milk." And the other were to reply: " Without any fault of mine z your milk has turned to curds." Now if they, thus disputing, were to go to law about it before you, O king, in whose favour would you decide the case ?'

⁵⁷ ' In favour of the herdsman/ ' Because, in spite of whatever the other might say, the curds were derived from the milk/ ' Just so, great king, it is one name-and-form that finds its end in death, and another that is reborn. But that other is the result of the first, and is therefore not thereby released from its evil deeds (its bad Karma).'

⁵⁸ ' Very good, Nagasena ! * 7 2 . The king said : c Will you, Nagasena, be reborn ? ' there is an ambiguity here, as the word may mean ' to me not knowing it,' or ' to you not knowing it/ HinatfkumburS takes the latter interpretation, and renders : ' O come 1 Do you not know that your milk has become curds ? ' (Embala, tage kiri mawu bawa no dannehi dceyi.) 2 Not in Hardy.

⁵⁹ * Nay, great king, what is the use of asking that question again ? Have I not already told you that if, when I die, [49] I die with craving in my heart, I shall ; but if not, not I ? '

⁶⁰ ' Give me an illustration. 5 c Suppose, O king, a man were to render service to the king : and the king, pleased with him, were to bestow an office upon him. And then that he, while living through that appointment, in the full possession and enjoyment of all the pleasures of sense, should publicly declare that the king had repaid him naught. Now would that man, O king, be acting rightly ? '

⁶¹ ' Most certainly not' 'Just so, great king, what is the use of asking that question again ? Have I not already told you that if, when I die, I die with craving in my heart, I shall ; and if not, not ? '

⁶² ' You are ready, Nagasena, in reply/ 8, The king said : c You were talking just now of name-and-form. What does " name " mean in that ^expression, and what " form " ? '

⁶³ (Whatever is gross therein, that is " form": whatever is subtle, mental, that is " name." ' ' Why is it, Nagasena, that name is not reborn separately, or form separately ? '

⁶⁴ ' Give me an illustration/ ' As a hen, great king, would not get a yoke or IT, 2, 9. TIME. 77 an egg-shell separately, but both would arise in one, they two being intimately dependent one on the other ; just so, if there were no name there would be no form. What is meant by name in that expression being intimately dependent on what is meant by form, they spring up together. And this is, through time immemorial, their nature V * You are ready, Nagasena, in reply/

⁶⁵ The king said : ' You speak, Nagasena, of time immemorial. What does this word " time " mean ?' ' Past time, O king, and present, and future/ ' But what ? is there such a thing as time ? ' 6 There is time which exists, and time which does not/

⁶⁶ * Which then exists, and which not ? ' [50] (There are Confections (constituent potentialities of being) 2 , O king, which are past in the sense of having passed away, and ceased to be, or of having been dissolved, or altogether changed. To them time is not. But there are conditions of heart which are now producing their effect, or still have in them the inherent possibility of producing*

⁶⁷ effect, or which will otherwise lead to reindividualisation. To them time is. Where there are beings who, when dead, will be reborn, there time is. Where there are beings who, when dead, will not be

reborn, there time is not ; and where there are beings who are altogether set free (who, having attained Nirva in their present life, have come to the end of that life), there time is not because of their having been quite set free V Here ends the Second Chapter. II, 3? 2. CAUSATION. 79

Chapter II.3

¹ i. The king said : "What is the root, Nagasena, of past time, and what of present, and what of future time ? " Ignorance. By reason of Ignorance came the Confections, by reason of the Confections consciousness, by reason of consciousness name-and-form, by reason of name-and-form the six organs of sense 1 , by reason of them contact, by reason of contact sensation, by reason of sensation thirst, by reason of thirst craving, by reason of craving becoming, by reason of becoming birth, by reason of birth old age and death, grief, lamentation, sorrow, pain, and despair. Thus is it that the ultimate point in the past of all this time is not apparent.'

² * You are ready, Nagasena, in reply/ 2. The king said : ' You say that the ultimate point of time is not apparent. Give me an illustration of that/

³ 'Suppose, O king, a man were to plant in the ground a tiny seed, and that it were to come up as a shoot, and in due course grow, develope, and mature until it produced a fruit. [51] And then the man, taking a seed from that fruit, were again to plant it in the ground, and all should happen as before. Now would there be any end to this series ? '

⁴ ' Certainly not, Sir/ c Just so, O king, the ultimate point in the past of the whole of this time is not apparent/ ' Give me a further illustration/

⁵ ' The hen lays an egg. From the egg comes a hen. From the hen an egg. Is there any end to this series ? ' 'No.' c Just so, O king, the ultimate point in the past of the whole of this time is not apparent/

⁶ Then the Elder drew a circle on the ground and asked the king : ' Is there any end to this circle ? ' c No, it has no end/

⁷ 'No/ 2 ^"akkhu-viwwta. It is not clear from the terse phraseology of this passage whether this is supposed to be a subjective stage preliminary to the ' touch ' (phasso), or whether it is inclusive of it. (Compare Dhamma Sangawi, 589, 599, 620.) I am inclined to think it is the former. But if the latter be meant it might be rendered ' there arises that consciousness (of existence) which is dependent upon the eye.' See below, 4.

⁸ II, 3s 3TH E FIRST BEGINNINGS. 8 1 Then setting out a precisely corresponding circle of each of the other organs of sense (of the ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind 1), he in each case put the same question. And the reply being always the same, he concluded :

⁹ 'Just so, O king, the ultimate point of time in the past is not apparent.' ' You are ready, Nagasena, in reply/ 3. The king said : * When you say that the ultimate point is not apparent, what do you mean by "ultimate point"?"

¹⁰ ' But, if so, when you say that it is not apparent, do you mean to say that of everything ? Is the ultimate point of everything unknown ? '

¹¹ 'Partly so, and partly not/ 'Then which is so, and which not ? ' 'Formerly, O king, everything in every form, everything in every mode, was ignorance. It is to us as if it were not. In reference to that the ultimate beginning is unknown. But that, which has not been, becomes ; as soon as it has begun to become it dissolves away again. In reference to that the ultimate beginning is known V [52]

¹² 'But, reverend Sir, if that which was not, becomes, and as soon as it has begun to become passes again [35] G away, then surely, being thus cut off at both ends, it must be entirely destroyed 1 ? '

¹³ 'Yes, it might. But that is not my question. Could it grow again from the point at which it was cut off ? ' 'Certainly.'

¹⁴ Then the Elder repeated the simile of the tree and the seed, and said that the Skandhas (the constituent elements of all life, organic and inorganic) were so many seeds, and the king confessed himself satisfied.

¹⁵ The king said : 'Are there any Confections 3 which are produced ? ' 'Certainly.' 'Which are they ? ' 'Where there is an eye, and also forms, there is sight , where there is sight there is a contact through the eye, where there is contact through the eye there is a sensation, where there is sensation there is a longing , where there is longing there is a grasping , where there is grasping there is a becoming,

¹⁶ 4 ^akkhu-vijHfla. See note 2 above, p. 80. 11,3,5BECOMING. 83 where there is becoming there is birth, and at birth old age and death, grief, lamentation, pain, sorrow, and despair begin to be. Thus is the rise of the whole of this class of pain. Where there is neither eye nor form there is no sight, where there is not sight there is no contact through the eye, where there is not contact there is no sensation, where there is not sensation there is no longing, where there is not longing there is no grasping, where there is not grasping there is no becoming, where there is not becoming there is no birth, and where there is not birth there is neither old age nor death nor grief, lamentation, pain, sorrow, and despair. Thus is the ending of all this class of pain/

¹⁷ The king said : * Are there any Confections (qualities) which spring into being without a gradual becoming ? ' 'No. They all have a gradual becoming.'

¹⁸ 'Give me an illustration/ 'Now what do you think, great king ? Did this house in which you are sitting spring suddenly into being ? '

¹⁹ 'Certainly not, Sir. There is nothing here which arose in that way. Each portion, of it has had its gradual becoming these beams had their becoming in the forest, and this clay in the earth, and by the toil and sweat of women and of men I was this house produced/

²⁰ G 2 'Just so, great king, there is no Confection which has sprung into being without a gradual becoming. It is by a process of evolution that Confections come to be!'

²¹ * Give me a further illustration/ 'They are like all kinds of trees and plants which, when set in the ground, grow, develop, and mature, and then yield their fruits and flowers. The trees do not spring into being without a becoming. It is by a process of evolution that they become what they are. Just so, great king, there is no Confection which has sprung into being without a gradual becoming. It is by a process of evolution that Confections come to be ! '

²² * Give me a further illustration/ 'They are like the pots of various kinds which a potter might form when he has dug up the clay out of the earth. The pots do not spring into being without a becoming. It is by a process of evolution that they become what they are. Just so, great king, there is no

Confection which has sprung into being without a gradual becoming. It is by a process of evolution that Confections come to be ! '

²³ ' Give me a further illustration/ ' Suppose, O king, there were no bridge of metal qn a mandolin , no leather, no hollow space, no frame, no neck, no strings, no bow, and no human effort or exertion, would there be music ? '

²⁴ c Certainly not, Sir/ 'But if all these things were there, would not there be a sound ? ' pattaw. I don't know what this is. The Sinhalese merely repeats the words.

²⁵ H, 3, 5. FORMATION OF QUALITIES. 85 * Of course there would.' Give me a further illustration/ 'Suppose, O king, there were no fire-stick apparatus , no twirling-stick \ and no cord for the twirling-stick, and no matrix *, and no burnt rag for tinder, and no human effort and exertion, could there be fire by attrition ? '

²⁶ ' Certainly not/ (Yes, certainly/ [54] * Just so, great king, there is no Confection which has sprung into being without a gradual becoming. It is by a process of evolution that Confections come to be ! *

²⁷ ' Give me one more illustration/ ' Certainly not/ ' But where these things are present there fire might be struck, might it not ? '

²⁸ ' Yes/ ' Just so, great king, there is no Confection which has sprung into being without a gradual becoming. It is by a process of evolution that Confections come to be ! '

²⁹ ' Give me another illustration. 5 * Suppose, O king, there were no looking-glass, and no light, and no face in front of it, would there appear an image ? '

³⁰ 'No.' ' But given these things,there might be a reflection ? ' ' Yes, Sir, there might/ 'Just so, great king, there is no Confection which has sprung into being without a gradual becoming. It is by a process of evolution that Confections come to be F

³¹ * Very good, Nagasena ! ' 6. The king said : ' Is there, Nagasena, such a thing as the soul l ? ' 'The living principle within 2 which sees forms through the eye, hears sounds through the ear, experiences tastes through the tongue, smells odours through the nose, feels touch through the body, and discerns things (conditions, " dhamml") through the mind just as we, sitting here in the palace, can look out of any window out of which we wish to look, the east window or the west, or the north or the south/

³² The Elder replied : ' I will tell you about the five 11,3,6. THE SOUL. 87 doors , great king. Listen, and give heed attentively. If the living principle within sees forms through the eye in the manner that you mention, [55] choosing its window as it likes, can it not then see forms not only through the eye, but also through each of the other five organs of sense ? And in like manner can it not then as well hear sounds, and experience taste, and smell odours, and feel touch, and discern conditions through each of the other five organs of sense, besides the one you have in each case specified ? '

³³ ' No, Sir/ 'Then these powers are not united one to another indiscriminately, the latter sense to the former organ, and so on. Now we, as we are seated here in the palace, with these windows all thrown open, and in full daylight, if we only stretch forth our heads, see all kinds of objects plainly. Can the living principle do the same when the doors of the eyes are thrown open ? When the doors of the ear are thrown open, can it do so ? Can it then not only hear sounds, but see sights, experience tastes, smell odours, feel touch, and discern conditions ? And so with each of its windows ? '

³⁴ ' No, Sir/ [56] 'Then these powers are not united one to another indiscriminately. Now again, great king, if Dinna here were to go outside and stand in the gateway, would you be aware that he had done so ? '

³⁵ * Yes, I should know it/ ' And if the same Dinna were to come back again, and stand before you, would you be aware of his having done so ?'

³⁶ ' Yes, I should know it/ ' Well, great king, would the living principle within discern, in like manner, if anything possessing flavour were laid upon the tongue, its sourness, or its saltiness, or its acidity, or its pungency, or its astringency, or its sweetness 1 ?'

³⁷ ' Yes, it would know it/ c But when the flavour had passed into the stomach would it still discern these things ? ' ' Certainly not/

³⁸ ' Then these powers are not united one to the other indiscriminately. Now suppose, O king, a man were to have a hundred vessels of honey brought and poured into one trough, and then, having had another man's mouth closed over and tied up, were to have him cast into the trough full of honey. Would he know whether that into which he had been thrown was sweet or whether it was not ?'

³⁹ ' No, Sir/ ' But why not ?' * Because the honey could not get into his mouth/ 'Then, great king, these powers are not united one to another indiscriminately V * * I am not capable of discussing with such a reasoner. Be pleased, Sir, to explain to me how the matter stands/

⁴⁰ Then the Elder convinced Milinda the king with discourse drawn from the Abhidhamma, saying : ' It is by reason, O king, of the eye and of forms that sight arises, and those other conditions contact,

⁴¹ II, 3, 7THE SOUL. 89 sensation, idea, thought, abstraction, sense of vitality, and attention 1 arise each simultaneously with its predecessor. And a similar succession of cause and effect arises when each of the other five organs of sense is brought into play. [57] And so herein there is no such thing as soul (Vedagu) V

⁴² The king said : * Does thought-perception 3 arise wherever sight arises 4 ? ' ' Yes, O king, where the one is there is the other/

⁴³ ' And which of the two arises first ?' (First sight, then thought/ ' Then does the sight issue, as it were, a command to thought, saying : " Do you spring up there where I have ? " or does thought issue command to sight, saying : " Where you spring up there will I/"

⁴⁴ ' Then how is it, Sir, that thought arises wherever sight does ? ' ' Because of there being a sloping down, and because of there being a door, and because of there being a habit , and because of there being an association.'

⁴⁵ * How is that ? Give me an illustration of mind arising where sight arises because of there being a sloping down/ ' It will follow the slope of the ground/ ' And if it were to rain again, where would the water go to ?'

⁴⁶ * It would go the same way as the first water had gone.' ' What then ? Does the first water issue, as it were, command to the second, saying : " Do you go where I have ?" Or does the second issue command to the first, saying : " Whithersoever you go, thither will I" ? 1

⁴⁷ * Just so, great king, [58] is it by reason of the natural slope that where sight has arisen there also does thought arise. And neither does the sight-perception issue command to the mind-perception, saying : " Where I have arisen, there do thou also spring up ; " nor does the mind-perception inform

the sight-perception, saying : " Where thou hast arisen, there will I also spring up." There is no conversation, as it were, between them. All that happens, happens through natural slope/

⁴⁸ ' Now give me an illustration of there being a door/ f What do you think, great king ? Suppose a king had a frontier city, and it was strongly defended with towers and bulwarks, and had only one gateway. If a man wanted to leave the city, how would he go out ?'

⁴⁹ * By the gate, certainly/ c And if another man wanted to leave it, how would he go out ?' c The same way as the first/ ' What then ? Would the first man tell the second :

⁵⁰ 3)7SENSATION AND IDEAS. 91 " Mind you go out the same way as I do" ? Or would the second tell the first : " The way you go out, I shall go out too"? 1

⁵¹ * Just so, great king, with thought and sight/ * Now give me an illustration of thought arising where sight is because of habit/

⁵² * What do you think, great king ? If one cart went ahead, which way would a second cart go ?' ' The same as the first/ ' But would the first tell the second to go where it went, [59] or the second tell the first that it would go where it (the first) had gone ?'

⁵³ ' No, Sir. There would be no communication between the two. The second would follow the first out of habit/ * Now give me an illustration of how thought arises, where sight has arisen, through association/

⁵⁴ * In the art of calculating by using the joints of the fingers as signs or marks , in the art of arithmetic pure and simple , in the art of estimating the probable

⁵⁵ yield of growing crops *, and in the art of writing, O king, the beginner is clumsy. But after a certain time with attention and practice he becomes expert. Just so is it that, where sight has arisen, thought too by association springs up/

⁵⁶ And in response to similar questions, the Elder declared that in the same way thought sprang up wherever there was hearing, or taste, or smell, or touch : that in each case it was subsequent to the other, but arose without communication from [60] the natural causes above set out.

⁵⁷ The king said : ' Where thought (mental perception 3) is, Nagasena, is there always sensation ?' ' Yes, where thought arises there is contact, and there is sensation, and there is idea, and there is conceived intention, and there is reflection, and there is investigation V

⁵⁸ ' Reverend Sir, what is the distinguishing characteristic of contact (Phassa)?' 6 Touch , O king/ * But give me an illustration/ 4 It is as when two rams are butting together, O

⁵⁹ progress of arithmetical knowledge. When our author wrote, the old way of counting on the fingers was still in vogue, but the modern system was coming into general use.

⁶⁰ II, 3 ioSENSATION AND IDEA. 93 king. The eye should be regarded as one of those two, the form (object) as the other, and the contact as the union of the two/

⁶¹ ' It is as when two cymbals 1 are clashed together. The one is as the eye, the other as the object, and the junction of the two is like contact/

⁶² * Very good, Nagasena ! ' 10. ' Reverend Sir, what is the characteristic mark of sensation (Vedani) ?' ' Give me an illustration/

⁶³ ' It is like the case of the man 3 on whom the king, pleased with a service he has rendered him, should bestow an office. He while living, through that appointment, in the full possession and

enjoyment of all the pleasures of sense, would think : " Formerly I did the king a service. For that the king, pleased with me, gave me this office. It is on that account that I now experience such sensations/" And it is like the case of the man [61] who having done good deeds is re-born, on the dissolution of the body after death, into some happy conditions of bliss in heaven. He, while living there in the full possession and enjoyment of all the pleasures of sense, would think : " Formerly I must have done good deeds. It is on that account that I now experience such sensations/" Thus is it, great king, that the being experienced and enjoyed is the characteristic mark of sensation/

⁶⁴ c Very good, Nagasena ! ' ii. 'What is the distinguishing characteristic, Nagasena, of idea (Sann&) ? ' ' Recognition, O king l . And what does he recognise ? blueness and yellowness and redness and whiteness and brownness/

⁶⁵ * Give me an illustration/ * It is like the king's treasurer, O king, who when he sees, on entering the treasure, objects the property of the king of all those colours, recognises (that they have such). Thus it is, great king, that recognition is the mark of idea/

⁶⁶ f Very good, Nagasena ! ' ' What is the distinguishing characteristic, Nagasena, of the conceived purpose (^etand) ? ' ' The being conceived, O king, and the being prepared V

⁶⁷ ' Give me an illustration/ ' It is like the case of a man, O king, who should prepare poison, and both drink of it himself, and give of it to others to drink. He himself would suffer pain, and so would they. In the same way some individual, having thought out with intention some evil deed, on the dissolution of the body after death, would be reborn into some unhappy state of woe in purgatory, and so also would those who followed his advice. And it is like the case of a

⁶⁸ II, 3, 13PERCEPTION. 95 man, O king, who should prepare a mixture of ghee, butter, oil, honey and molasses, and should both drink thereof himself and give of it to others to drink. He himself would have pleasure, and so would they. [62] In the same way some individual, having thought out with intention some good deed, will be reborn, on the dissolution of the body after death, into some happy state of bliss in heaven, and so also would those who follow his advice. Thus is it, great king, that the being conceived, and the being prepared, are marks of the conceived purpose/ ' Very good, Nagasena ! *

⁶⁹ 'What, Nagasena, is the distinguishing characteristic of perception (Vi#&na) ? ' ' Recognition \ great king/ ' Give me an illustration/

⁷⁰ c It is like the case of the guardian of a city who, when seated at the cross roads in the middle of the city, could see a man coming from the East, or the South, or the West, or the North. In the same way, O king, he knows an object which he sees with his eye, or a sound which he hears with his ear, or an odour which he smells by his nose, or a taste which he experiences with his tongue, or a touchable thing which he touches with his body, or a quality that he recognises by his mind. Thus is it, great king, that knowing is the mark of perception/

⁷¹ ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' 13. ' What is the distinguishing characteristic, Nagasena, of reflection (Vitakka). So also Buddhaghosa, loc. cit., and below. III,

⁷² * Give me an illustration/ ' It is like the case of a carpenter, great king, who fixes in a joint a well-fashioned piece of wood. Thus is it that the effecting of an aim is the mark of reflection/

⁷³ ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' 14. 'What is the distinguishing characteristic, Nagasena, of investigation (Vi^&ra) ? ' ' Threshing out again and again V

⁷⁴ c Give me an illustration/ Here ends the Third Chapter CONDITIONS. 15. The king said : * When those conditions (whose marks you have just specified) have run together, is it possible, by bending them apart one to one side and one to the other , to make the distinction between them clear, so that one can say : " This is contact, and this sensation, and this idea, and this intention, and this perception, and this reflection, and this investigation 2 " ? '

⁷⁵ ' No : that cannot be done/ ' Give me an illustration/ ' Suppose, O king, the cook in the royal household were to make a syrup or a sauce, and were to put into it curds, and salt, and ginger, and cummin seed , and pepper, and other ingredients. And suppose the king were to say to him : " Pick out for me the flavour of the curds, and of the salt, and of the ginger, and of the cummin seed, and of the pepper, and of all the things you have put into it." Now would it be possible, great king, separating off one from another those flavours that had thus run together, to pick out each one, so that one could say : " Here is the sourness, and here the saltiness, and here the pungency, and here the acidity, and here the astringency, and here the sweetness 4 " ? *

⁷⁶ kumburS translates it by duru, and Hardy by 'onions' (p. 439). [35] H c And just so, great king, with respect to those conditions we were discussing/

⁷⁷ Very good, Nagasena ! ' 1 6. The Elder said: ' Is salt, O king, recognisable by the eye ? ' ' Yes, Sir, it is/ * But be careful, O king/

⁷⁸ 'Well then, Sir, is it perceptible by the tongue ? ' ' Yes, that is right/ ' Yes, every kind/ ' If that be so, Sir, why do bullocks bring whole cart-loads of it ? Is it not salt and nothing else that ought to be so brought ? '

⁷⁹ II, 3, i6CONDITIONS. 99 ' Certainly, Sir/ ' You are ready, Nagasena, in argument/ Here ends the questioning of Nagasena by Milinda . H 2 100 THE QUESTIONS OF KIKG MILINDA. HI, 4, I.

VIMATICCHEDANA PANHO. THE REMOVAL OF DIFFICULTIES.

¹ VIMATI-JE::HEDANA-PA#HO. THE REMOVAL OF DIFFICULTIES. CHAPTER 4 1 . 1. [65] The king said: < Are the five Ayatanas, Nagasena, (eye, ear, nose, tongue, and body,) produced by various actions, or by one action?' (that is, the result of various Karmas, or of one Karma.)

² By various actions, not by one/ ' Now, what do you think, O king ? If I were to sow in one field five kinds of seed, would the produce of those various seeds be of different kinds ? ?

³ ' Yes, certainly/ 'Well, just so with respect to the production of Ayatanas/ * Very good, Nagasena 2 ! ' 2. The king said : * Why is it, Nagasena, that all men are not alike, but some are short-lived and some long-lived, some sickly and some healthy, some ugly and some beautiful, some without influence and some of great power, some poor and some wealthy, some low born and some high born, some stupid and somewise ?'

⁴ a The meaning here is not easy to follow, as the word Ay atana is used either for the organs of sense, or for the objects of sense ; and there is nothing in the context to show which is meant, Probably the idea is that good sight, hearing, &c. in one birth are each the result of a separate Karma in the last birth. But I am by no means sure of this, and the Sinhalese (p. 76) is just as ambiguous as the Pali.

⁵ Ill, 4, 3. RENUNCIATION. I O I The Elder replied : 'Why is it that all vegetables are not alike, but some sour, and some salt, and some pungent, and some acid, and some astringent, and some sweet ? '

⁶ ' I fancy, Sir, it is because they come from different kinds of seeds/ ' And just so, great king, are the differences you have mentioned among men to be explained. For it has been said by the Blessed One : " Beings, O brahmin, have each their own Karma, are inheritors of Karma, belong to the tribe of their Karma, are relatives by Karma, have each their Karma as their protecting overlord. It is Karma that divides them up into low and high and the like divisions V *

⁷ The king said : ' You told me, Nagasena, that your renunciation was to the end that this sorrow might perish away, and no further sorrow might spring up V

⁸ ' Yes, that is so/ ' But is that renunciation brought about by previous effort, or to be striven after now, in this present time? 1

⁹ The Elder replied : ' Effort is now concerned with what still remains to be done, former effort has accomplished what it had to do/

¹⁰ ' Give me an illustration V ' Now what do you think, O king ? Is it when you feel thirst that you would set to work to have a well or an artificial lake dug out, with the intention of getting some water to drink ?'

¹¹ 'Just so, great king, is effort concerned now with what still remains to be done, former effort has accomplished what it had to do/

¹² ' Give me a further illustration/ ' Now what do you think, O king ? Is it when you feel hungry that you set to work to have fields ploughed and seed planted and crops reaped with the intention of getting some food to. eat ?'

¹³ ' Certainly not, Sir/ ' Just so, great king, is effort concerned now with what still remains to be done, former effort has accomplished what it had to do/

¹⁴ ' Give me a further illustration/ ' Now what do you think, O king ? Is it when the battle is set in array against you that you set to work to have a moat dug, and a rampart put up, and a watch tower built, and a stronghold formed, and stores of food collected ? Is it then that you would have yourself taught the management of elephants, or horsemanship, or the use of the chariot and the bow, or the art of fencing ?'

¹⁵ ' Certainly not, Sir/ That which he sees to be his weal ! Not with the carter's mode of thought, but firm 111,4,4PURGATORY. IO

¹⁶ Let him, with resolution, step right out As a carter who has left the smooth high road, And turned to byways rough, broods ill at ease] (Like him who hazards all at dice, and fails) So the weak mind who still neglects the good, And follows after evil, grieves at heart, When fallen into the power of death, as he, The ruined gamester, in his hour of need V 1 ' [67] ' Very good, Nagasena ! '

¹⁷ The king said : ' You (Buddhists 3) say thus : 44 The fire of purgatory is very much more fierce than an ordinary fire. A small stone cast into an ordinary fire may smoke for a day without being destroyed ; but a rock as big as an upper chamber cast into the furnace of purgatory would be that moment destroyed." That is a statement I cannot believe. Now, on the other hand you say thus : " Whatsoever beings are there reborn, though they

¹⁸ 1 (-rMyati. It is an odd coincidence that this word, which means either to burn or to meditate, according to the root from which it is derived, can be rendered here either * burn' or 'brood' in English. In fact it is the second, not the first, root that is here intended, as is plain from such passages as Gritaka III, 354, where the compound paMyati means c to brood over a thing/

¹⁹ PP; 5- burn for hundreds of thousands of years in purgatory, yet are they not destroyed." That too is a statement I don't believe/

²⁰ The Elder said : ' Now what do you think, O king ? Do not the females of sharks l and crocodiles and tortoises and peacocks and pigeons eat hard bits of stone and gravel ?'

²¹ ' What then ? Are these hard things, when they have got into the stomach, into the interior of the abdomen, destroyed ?'

²² c Yes, they are destroyed/ 'And the embryo that may be inside the same animals, is that too destroyed ?' ' But why not/ * I suppose, Sir, it escapes destruction by the influence of Karma/

²³ 'Just so, great king, it is through the influence of Karma that beings, though they have been for thousands of years in purgatory, are not destroyed. If they are reborn there, there do they grow up, and there do they die. For this, O king, has been declared by the Blessed One: " He does not die until that evil Karma is exhausted V '

²⁴ f Give me a further illustration/ HI, 4, 4KARMA. 105 ' Now what do you think, O king ? Do not the females of lions and tigers and panthers and dogs eat - hard bits of bone and flesh ?'

²⁵ 'What then? are such hard things, [68] when they have got into the stomach, into the interior of the abdomen, destroyed ?'

²⁶ ' Yes, they are destroyed ?' 'And the embryo that may be inside the same animals, is that too destroyed?' ' Certainly not/

²⁷ ' But why not ? ' ' I suppose, Sir, it escapes destruction by the influence of Karma/ 'Just so, great king, it is by the influence of Karma that beings in purgatory, though they burn for thousands of years, are not destroyed/

²⁸ ' Give me a further illustration/ ' Now what do you think, O king ? Do not the tender women wives of the Yonakas, and nobles, and brahmins, and householders eat hard cakes and meat?'

²⁹ ' Yes, they eat such hard things/ ' And when those hard things have got into the stomach, into the interior of the abdomen, are not they destroyed ?'

³⁰ ' Yes, they are/ ' And why not ? ' * I suppose, Sir, they escape destruction by the influence of Karma ? ' 'Just so, great king, it is through the influence

³¹ of Karma that beings in purgatory, though they burn for thousands of years, yet are they not destroyed. If they are reborn there, there do they grow up, and there do they die. For this, O king, has been declared by the Blessed One : " He does not die until that evil Karma is exhausted." ' ' Very good, Nagasena !'

³² The king said : ' Venerable Nagasena, your people say that the world rests on water, the water on air, the air on space . This saying also I cannot believe/

³³ Then the Elder brought water in a regulation water-pot , and convinced king Milinda, saying: * As this water is supported by the atmosphere, so is that water supported by air/

³⁴ ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' 6. The king said : ' Is cessation Nirvana 3 ? ' ' Yes, your Majesty' [69]. f All foolish individuals, O king, take pleasure in

³⁵ Ill, 4, 7NIRVANA. 107 the senses and in the objects of sense, find delight in them, continue to cleave to them l . Hence are they carried down by that flood (of human passions), they are not set free from birth, old age, and death, from grief, lamentation, pain, sorrow, and despair, they are not set free, I say, from suffering. But the wise, O king, the disciple of the noble ones, neither takes pleasure in those things, nor finds delight in them, nor continues cleaving to them. And inasmuch as he does not, in him craving 2 ceases, and by the cessation of craving grasping 2 ceases, and by the cessation of grasping becoming 2 ceases, and when becoming has ceased birth ceases, and with its cessation birth, old age, and death, grief, lamentation, pain, sorrow, and despair cease to exist. Thus is the cessation brought about the end of all that aggregation of pain. Thus is it that cessation is

³⁶ ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' 7. The king said : ' Venerable Nagasena, do all men receive Nirva ? ' c Not all, O king. But he who walks righteously, who admits those conditions which ought to be admitted, perceives clearly those conditions which ought to be clearly perceived, abandons those conditions which ought to be abandoned, practises himself in those conditions which ought to be practised, realises those conditions which ought to be realised he receives Nirvsla/

³⁷ * Very good, Nagasena ! ' ti///zanti. Compare Ahguttara II, 4, 6, and Theri G&M, 794. 8. The king said : ' Venerable Nagasena, does he who does not receive Nirva know how happy a state Nirv?za is 1 ?'

³⁸ ' Yes, he knows it ' ' But how can he know that without his receiving Nirvia ? ' ' Now what do you think, O king ? Do those whose hands and feet have not been cut off know how sad a thing it is to have them cut off?'

³⁹ c Yes, Sir, that they know/ ' But how do they know it ? ' [70] 'Just so, great king, it is by hearing the glad words of those who have seen Nirvda, that they who have not received it know how happy a state it is/ 'Very good, Nagasena ! ' Here ends the Fourth Chapter. 111,5,2. THE BUDDHA PRE-EMINENT. IOg

Chapter III.5

¹ i. The king said: * Have you, Nagasena, seen the Buddha?' ' No, Sire/ ' Then have your teachers seen the Buddha ?' ' No, Sire/

² ' Then, venerable Nagasena, there is no Buddha 1 1 ' ' But, great king, have you seen the river tJhi in the Himalaya mountains ?'

³ ' No, Sir/ ' No, Sir/ - ' Then, your Majesty, is there therefore no such river ? ' ' It is there. Though neither I nor my father has seen it, it is nevertheless there.'

⁴ ' Just so, great king, though neither I nor my teachers have seen the Blessed One, nevertheless there was such a person. 1

⁵ * Very good, Nagasena ! ' 2. The king said: 'Is the Buddha, Nagasena, pre-eminent ? ' ' Yes, he is incomparable.' * But how do you know of one you have never seen that he is pre-eminent'

⁶ earning it : " Deep, immeasurable, unfathomable is the mighty ocean. Into it do the five great rivers flow the Ganges, the Jumna, the Airavati, the Sarabhu, and the Mahl and yet is there in it no appearance of being more empty or more full 1" ?'

⁷ ' Yes, they would know that/ ' Just so, great king, when I think of the mighty disciples who have passed away then do I know that the Buddha is incomparable/ [71]

⁸ ' Very good, Nagasena P 3, The king said : * Is it possible, Nagasena, for others to know how incomparable the Buddha is ?'

⁹ * Yes, they may know it/ (But how can they ?' c Long, long ago, O king, there was a master of writing, by name Tissa the Elder, and many are the years gone by since he has died. How can people know of him?'

¹⁰ ' By his writing, Sir/ 'Just so, great king, whosoever sees what the Truth I is, he sees what the Blessed One was, for the Truth was preached by the Blessed One/

¹¹ * Very good, Nagasena I 1 4. The king said : ' Have you, Nagasena, seen what the Truth is ?' 'Very good, Nagasena T Ill, 5, 6. THE SOUL. 1 1 1

¹² The king said: 'Where there is no transmigration, Nagasena, can there be rebirth ? ' ' But how can that be ? Give me an illustration.'

¹³ * Suppose a man, O king, were to light a lamp from another lamp, can it be said that the one transmigrates from, or to, the other ?'

¹⁴ ' Certainly not/ 'Just so, great king, is rebirth without transmigration/ ' Give me a further illustration/ ' Do you recollect, great king, having learnt, when you were a boy, some verse or other from your teacher ? ' '

¹⁵ ' Well then, did that verse transmigrate from your teacher ? ' ' Certainly not/ 'Just so, great king, is rebirth without transmigration/

¹⁶ ' Very good, Nagasena P 6. The king said : ' Is there such a thing, Nagasena, as the soul I ? ' ' In the highest sense, O king, there is no such thing 2 / .

¹⁷ our lives long to conduct ourselves according to the Vinaya (the rules of the Order), which the Buddha preached, and which are called the eye of the Buddha, and according to the Sikkhipa dā (ethics) which he laid down, and which are called his command ? ' But there are other passages, no less amplified in the Sinhalese, where there is evidently no lacuna in the Pali ; and the passage may well have been meant as a kind of riddle, to which the Sinhalese supplies the solution.

¹⁸ ' Very good, Nagasena ! * 7. [72] The king said: 'Is there any being, Nagasena, who transmigrates from this body to another ? ' '

¹⁹ ' No, there is not/ * Yes, if it were not reborn ; but if it were, no V ' Give me an illustration/ 'Suppose, O king, a man were to steal another man's mangoes, would the thief deserve punishment? ' '

²⁰ < Yes/ ' But he would not have stolen the mangoes the other set in the ground. Why would he deserve punishment ?' c Because those he stole were the result of those that were planted/

²¹ c Just so, great king, this name-and-form commits deeds, either pure or impure, and by that Karma another name-and-form is reborn. And therefore is it not set free from its evil deeds ?'

²² 'Very good, Nagasena!' 8. The king said : ' When deeds are committed, Nztgasena, by one name-and-form, what becomes of those deeds ?'

²³ Mr c The deeds would follow it, O king, like a shadow that never leaves it V * Can any one point out those deeds, saying: " Here are those deeds, or there" ?'

²⁴ Ill, 5, io. THE BUDDHA, 113 ' Give me an illustration/ ' Now what do you think, O king ? Can any one point out the fruits which a tree has not yet produced, saying : " Here they are, or there " ? '

²⁵ ' Certainly not, Sir/ 'Just so, great king, so long as the continuity of life is not cut off, it is impossible to point out the deeds that are done/

²⁶ ' Very good, Nagasena !' 9. [73] The king said : ' Does he, Nagasena, who is about to be reborn know that he will be born ? '

²⁷ * Yes, he knows it, O king/ ' Give me an illustration/ ' Suppose a farmer, O king, a householder, were to put seed in the ground, and it were to rain well, would he know that a crop would be produced/

²⁸ ' Yes, he would know that/ * Just so, great king, does he who is about to be reborn know l that he will be born/ ' Very good, Ngasena 2 !'

²⁹ The king said: * Is there such a person as the Buddha, Nagasena?' ' Yes/ ' Can he then, Nagasena, be pointed out as being here or there ? '

³⁰ i vidual . It is not possible to point out the Blessed One as being here or there.' ' Give me an illustration/ ' Now what do you think, O king ? When there is a great body of fire blazing, is it possible to point out any one flame that has gone out, that it is here or there?'

³¹ * No, Sir. That flame has ceased, it has vanished/ 'Just so, great king, has the Blessed One passed away by that kind of passing away in which no root remains for the formation of another individual. The Blessed One has come to an end, and it cannot be pointed out of him, that he is here or there. But in the body of his doctrine he can, O king, be pointed out. For the doctrine 2 was preached by the Blessed One ?' ' Very good, Nagasena F Here ends the Fifth Chapter. Ill, 6, i. THE BODY. I I s

Chapter III.6

¹ i. The king said: ' Is the body, NaLgasena, dear to you recluses ? ' ' Then why do you nourish it and lavish attention upon it ? '

² * In all the times and places, O king, that you have gone down to battle, did you never get wounded by an arrow?' ' Yes, that has happened to me/

³ ' In such cases, O king, [74] is not the wound anointed with salve, and smeared with oil, and bound up in a bandage/ ' What then? Is the wound dear to you that you treat it so tenderly, and lavish such attention upon it?'

⁴ t No, it is not dear to me in spite of all that, which is only done that the flesh may grow again/ 'Just so, great king, with the recluses and the body. Without cleaving to it do they bear about the body for the sake of righteousness of life. The body, O king, has been declared by the Blessed One to be like a wound. And therefore merely as a sore, and without cleaving to it, do the recluses bear about the body. For it has been said by the Blessed One :

⁵ " Covered with clammy skin, an impure thing and foul, Nine-apertured, it oozes, like a sore V ' * Well answered, Nagasena ! '

⁶ I 2 2. The king said : c Did the Buddha, Nagasena, the omniscient one, foresee all things ? ' ' Yes. The Blessed One was not only omniscient. He foresaw all things/

⁷ ' Is there any physician, king, who knows all the medicinal drugs to be found on the earth ? ' ' Yes, there may be such a man/

⁸ (Well, O king, does he give his decoctions to the patient to drink at a time when illness has already set in, or before that ? ' '

⁹ 'When the malady has arisen/ 'Just so, great king, the Blessed One, though he was omniscient and foresaw all things, laid down no rule at an unseasonable time, but only when need arose did he establish a regulation which his disciples were not to transgress as long as they lived/

¹⁰ ' Well answered, Nagasena ! ' 3. [75] The king said: 'Is it true, Nagasena, that the Buddha was endowed with the thirty-two bodily marks of a great man, and graced with the eighty subsidiary characteristics ; that he was golden in colour with a skin like gold, and that there spread around him a glorious halo of a fathom's length?'

¹¹ ' Such, O king, was the Blessed One/ ' But were his parents like that ? ' ' In that case you must say that he was born fo. But surely a son is either like his mother, or those on

¹² Ill, 6, 4. CONDUCT. 1 1 7 the mother's side, or he is like his father, or those on the father's side ! ' The Elder replied : ' Is there such a thing, O king, as a lotus flower with a hundred petals ? '

¹³ * Where does it grow up ? ' ' It is produced in mud, and in water it comes to perfection V * But does the lotus resemble the mud of the lake, whence it springs up, either in colour, or in smell, or in taste ? '

¹⁴ ' Certainly not/ * Then does it resemble the water ? ' 6 Nor that either.' 'Just so, great king, is it that the Blessed One had the bodily signs and marks you have mentioned, though his parents had them not/

¹⁵ * Well answered, Ngasena!' 4. The king said : ' Was the Buddha, Nagasena, pure in conduct (was he a Brahma-^drin)?' ' Yes, the Blessed One was pure.'

¹⁶ ' Then, Nagasena, it follows that he was a follower of Brahma *.' ' Certainly/ [76] 'Well now, does that elephant ever trumpet (literally " cry the heron's cry l ") ? '

¹⁷ * He is a being with wisdom/ 5. The king said : c Is ordination 3 a good thing ? ' ' Yes, a good thing and a beautiful/ ' But did the Buddha obtain it, or not ? ' ' Great king, when the 'Blessed One attained omniscience at the foot of the tree of Knowledge, that was to him an ordination. There was no conferring of ordination upon him at the hands of others in the way that the Blessed One laid down regulations for his disciples, never to be transgressed by them their lives long 4 ! '

¹⁸ ' Very true, Nagasena ! ' reply. But the connection of ideas seems to me quite sufficient. 111,6,7PASSION. 6. The king said: 'To which of these two, Nagasena, the man who weeps at the death of his mother, and the man who weeps out of love for the Truth (Dhamma), are his tears a cure ? ' '

¹⁹ ' The tears of the one, O king, are stained and hot with the three fires of passion. The tears of the other are stainless and cool. Now there is cure in coolness and calm, but in heat and passion there can be no cure V

- ²⁰ The king said : ' What is the distinction, Nagasena, between him who is full of passion, and him who is void of passion ?'
- ²¹ ' But what does that mean ? ' ' The one is in want, O king, and the other not/ ' I look at it, Sir, in this way. He who has passion and he who has not both of them alike desire what is good to eat, either hard or soft. And neither of them desires what is wrong/
- ²² ' The lustful man, O king, in eating his food enjoys both the taste and the lust that arises from taste, [77] but the man free from lusts experiences the taste only, and not the lust arising therefrom/
- ²³ ' Well answered, Nagasena !' The Sinhalese follows the Pa*li, but that of course only shows that the text before the translator was here the same as in Mr. Trenckner's edition.
- ²⁴ The king said : * Venerable Nagasena, where does wisdom dwell ? * ' Nowhere, O king/ ' Where does the wind dwell, O king ? '
- ²⁵ * Not anywhere, Sir/ ' So there is no such thing as wind/ 'Well answered, Nagasena !' 9. The king said : ' When you speak of transmigration *, N Agasena, what does that mean ? '
- ²⁶ ' A being born here, O king, dies here. Having died here, it springs up elsewhere. Having been born there, there it dies. Having died there, it springs up elsewhere. That is what is meant by transmigration/
- ²⁷ * Give me an illustration/ ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' 10. The king said: 'By what, Nagasena, does one recollect what is past and done long ago ? '
- ²⁸ ' Do you recollect any business, O king, that you have done and then forgotten ? ' 'Yes/ ' What then ? Were you then without a mind ?'
- ²⁹ 6, II. MEMORY. 121 * No. But my memory failed me.' ' Then why do you say that it is by the mind, not by the memory, that we recollect ?'
- ³⁰ * Very good, Nagasena ! ' ii. The king said: * Does memory, Nagasena, always arise subjectively, [78] or is it stirred up by suggestion from outside l ?'
- ³¹ ' Both the one and the other/ ' But does not that amount to all memory being subjective in origin, and never artificial ?'
- ³² ' If, O king, there were no artificial (imparted) memory, then artisans would have no need of practice, or art, or schooling, and teachers would be useless. But the contrary is the case.' ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' Here ends the Sixth Chapter.

Chapter III.7

- ¹ i. The king said : ' In how many ways, Nagasena, does memory spring up ? ' 'In sixteen ways, O king, That is to say: by personal experience , as when the venerable Ananda, or the devoted woman Khufuttari, or any others who had that power, called to mind their previous births [79] or by outward aid , as when others continue to remind one who is by nature forgetful or by the impression made by the greatness of some occasion , as kings remember their coronation day, or as we remember the day of our conversion by the impression made by joy , as when one remembers that which gave him pleasure or by the impression made by sorrow , as when one remembers that which pained him or from similarity of appearance , as on seeing one like them we call to mind the mother or father or

sister or brother, or on seeing a camel or an ox or an ass we call to mind others like them or by difference of appearance , as when we remember that such and such a colour, sound, smell, taste, or touch belong to such and such a thing or by the knowledge of speech , as when one who is by nature forgetful is reminded by others and then himself remembers or by a sign , as when we recognise a draught bullock by a brand mark or some other sign or from effort to recollect , as when one by

² si Sabhaga-nimittato. 7 Visabhiga-nimittato. Til, 7, 2. MEMORY. 123 nature forgetful is made to recollect by being urged again and again : " try and think of it " or by calculation , as when one knows by the training he has received in writing that such and such a letter ought to follow after such and such a one or by arithmetic , as when accountants do big sums by their knowledge of figures or by learning by heart , as the repeaters of the scriptures by their skill in learning by heart recollect so much [80] or by meditation M , as when a Bhikkhu calls to mind his temporary states in days gone by by reference to a book , as when kings calling to mind a previous regulation, say : " Bring the book here/" and remind themselves out of that or by a pledge , as when at the sight of goods deposited a man recollects (the circumstances under which they were pledged) or by association , as when one remembers a thing because one has seen it, or a sound because one has heard it, or an odour because one has smelt it, or a touch because one has felt it, or a concept because one has perceived it/ * Very good, Nagasena ! *

³ The king said: 'Your people say, Nagasena, that though a man should have lived a hundred 11 Muddato (see above, p. 6). 12 Gawanito.

⁴ 13 Dharawato. The noun dhstrarzaka is only found here (where I follow the Sinhalese interpretation) and at G&takall, 203 (where it means ' debtor/ as in Sanskrit).

⁵ 14 Bhvanato. For a translation of the full text, here abridged in the text, see 'Buddhist Suttas/ pp, 215, 216 (17). 15 Pothaka-nibandhanato. I Upanikkhepatto.

⁶ 17 Anubhfilato, perhaps 'experience/ There are really seventeen, not sixteen, so some two must have been regarded by the author as forming one between them. These may be Nos. i and 14, or more likely Nos. 4 and 5.

⁷ years an evil life, yet if, at the moment of death, thoughts of the Buddha should enter his mind, he will be reborn among the gods. This I don't believe. And thus do they also say : " By one case of destruction of life a man may be reborn in purgatory." That, too, I cannot believe/

⁸ * But tell me,O king. Would even a tiny stone float on the water without a boat ? ' ' Certainly not/ * Very well ; but would not a hundred cart-loads of stones float on the water if they were loaded in a boat?'

⁹ ' Yes, they would float right enough/ * Well, good deeds are like the boat/ ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' 3. The king said : ' Do you (recluses), Nagasena, strive after the removal of past sorrow ?'

¹⁰ 'No/ 'What then? Is it future sorrow you strive to remove ?' 'No/ ' Present sorrow, then ?' [81] ' Not that either/ * Then if it be neither past, nor future, nor present sorrow that you strive to remove, whereunto is it that you strive ?'

¹¹ * What are you asking, O king ? That this sorrow should cease and no other sorrow should arise that is what we strive after/

¹² 'But, Nagasena, is there (now) such a thing as future sorrow ?' ' No. I grant that/ 'Then you are mighty clever people to strive after the removal of that which does not exist!'

¹³ 7,3* FUTURE SORROW. 125 ' Yes, certainly/ ' Then you set to work, I suppose, to have moats dug, and ramparts thrown up, and watch towers erected, and strongholds built, and stores of food collected 1 ?'

¹⁴ * Not at all. All that had been prepared beforehand/ ' Or you had yourself trained in the management of war elephants, and in horsemanship, and in the use of the war chariot, and in archery and fencing ?'

¹⁵ f But why ?' 'With the object of warding off future danger/ ' How so ? Is there such a thing (now) as future danger ?' * No. I must grant that/

¹⁶ ' Then you kings are mighty clever people to trouble yourselves about the warding off of that which does not exist ! ' ' Give me a further illustration/

¹⁷ * Tell me, O king. Is it when you are athirst that you set to work to have wells dug, or ponds hollowed out, or reservoirs formed, with the object of getting something to drink ?'

¹⁸ ' But to what end?' ' How so ? Is there such a thing as future thirst?' ' No, Sir: [Then the Elder referred, as before, to the means people always took of warding against future hunger, and the king expressed his pleasure at the way in which the puzzle had been solved.]

¹⁹ The king said : 'How far is it, Nagasena, from here to the Brahma world a ? ' ' Good, Nagasena ! Now do not your people say that a Bhikkhu, who has the power of Iddhi and the mastery over his mind , can vanish from Cambu-dlpa, and appear in the Brahma world, as quickly as a strong man could stretch forth his bent up arm, or bend it in again if it were stretched out ? That is a saying I cannot believe. How is it possible that he could traverse so quickly so many hundreds of leagues ? '

²⁰ The Elder replied : ' In what district, O king, were you born ? ' 3 ^Tetovasippatto, which Hfnai-kumburS renders mano vasi prdpta wu. I know of no passage in the Pitakas where the phrase occurs in connection with Iddhi ; but it is often used by our author. See, for instance, just below, III, 7, 9.

²¹ 7,5ALASANDA, 127 (There is an island called Alasanda . It was there I was born/ ' And how far is Alasanda from here ? '

²² ' About two hundred leagues/ ' Do you know for certain of any business you once did there and now recollect ? ' ' Oh, yes/

²³ * So quickly, great king, have you gone about two hundred leagues/ ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' 5. The king said : ' If one man, Nagasena, were to die here and be reborn in the Brahma world, and another were to -die here and be reborn in Kashmir, which of the two would arrive first ?'

²⁴ ' Both together, O king/ * Give me an illustration/ ' In what town [83], O king, were you born ? ' e There is a village called Kalasi. It was there I was born/

²⁵ ' And how far is Kalasi from here ? ' * About two hundred leagues/ * How far is Kashmir from here ? ' ' Twelve leagues/ ' Now, great king, think of Kalasi/ ' I have done so/ ' And now, think of Kashmir/ ' I have done so/

²⁶ * Well, which did you think of quickest ? ' ' Of each in the same time/ ' Just so, great king, would it take no longer to be reborn in the Brahma world than to be reborn in Kashmir. And tell me, O king. Suppose two

²⁷ birds were flying, and one were to alight on a tall tree, and the other on a small shrub. If they settled both at the same moment, whose shadow would first fall to the ground ? '

²⁸ * Very good, Nagasena ! ' 6. The king said : ' Venerable Nagasena, how many kinds of wisdom are there ? ' 1 Seven, O king/

²⁹ * And by how many kinds of wisdom does one become wise ? ' ' By one : that is to say by the kind of wisdom called " the investigation of the Truth . " ' '

³⁰ * Then why is it said there are seven ? ' ' Tell me, O king. Suppose a sword were lying in its sheath and not taken in the hand, could it cut off anything you wanted to cut off with it ? ' '

³¹ * Certainly not/ * Just so, great king, by the other kinds of wisdom can nothing be understood without investigation of the Truth/

³² ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' 7. The king said : * Which, Nagasena, is there more of, merit or demerit ? ' ' Merit/ [84] ' But why ? ' '

³³ 7,9' PEACE. 129 spring up within him, and joy will arise to him thus gladdened, and so rejoicing all his frame will be at peace, and being thus at peace he will experience a blissful feeling of content, and in that bliss his heart will be at rest, and he whose heart is thus at rest knows things as they really are \ For that reason merit increases. A man, for example, though his hands and feet are cut off, if he gave to the Blessed One merely a handful of lotuses, would not enter purgatory for ninety-one K alp as. That is why I said, O king, that there is more merit than demerit/ ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' '

³⁴ The king said : ' Whose, Nagasena, is the greater demerit his who sins consciously, or his who sins inadvertently ? ' '

³⁵ * He who sins inadvertently, O king, has the greater demerit/ ' In that case, reverend Sir, we shall punish doubly any of our family or our court who do wrong unintentionally/

³⁶ * But what do you think, O king ? If one man were to seize hold intentionally of a fiery mass of metal glowing with heat, and another were to seize hold of it unintentionally, which would be more burnt ? ' '

³⁷ * The one who did not know what he was doing/ ' Well, it is just the same with the man who does wrong/ ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' '

³⁸ The king said : * Is there any one, Nagasena, [35] * who can go with this bodily frame to Uttarakuru or to the Brahma world, or to any other of the four great continents (into which the world is divided)? 7

³⁹ * Yes, there are such people/ 1 But how can they ? ' [85] ' Do you recollect, O king, having ever jumped a foot or two feet across the ground ? ' '

⁴⁰ ' Yes, Nagasena, I can jump twelve feet/ ' But how?' ' I fix my mind on the idea of alighting there, and at the moment of my determination my body comes to seem light to me/

⁴¹ ' Just so, O king, can the Bhikkhu, who has the power of Iddhi, and has the mastery over his mind, when he has made his mind rise up to the occasion, travel through the sky by means of his mind/

⁴² * Very good, Nagasena ! ' 10. The king said : c Your people say there are bones even a hundred leagues long. Now there is no tree even one hundred leagues in length, how then can there be bones so long ? ' '

⁴³ ' But tell me, O king. Have you not heard of fishes in the sea five hundred leagues in length ? ' * Yes. I have heard of such/

⁴⁴ ' If so, could they not have bones a hundred leagues long ? ' ' Very good, Nagasena ! ' n. The king said: 'Your people, Nagasena, say that it is possible to suppress the inhaling and exhaling (of one's breath)/

⁴⁵ ' Yes, that can be done/ 'But how?' Ill, 7, 13. SNORING. ' Tell me, O king. Have you ever heard of a man snoring l ? ' ' Yes/ ' Well, would not that sound stop if he bent his body ?'

⁴⁶ * Yes/ * Then surely if that sound would stop at the mere bending of the body of one who is untrained alike in body, in conduct, in mind, and in wisdom why should it not be possible for the breathing of one trained in all these respects, and who has besides reached up to the fourth stage of the ecstatic contemplation , to be suppressed ?'

⁴⁷ 'Very good, Nagasena ! ' 12. The king said: 'There is the expression ocean, Nagasena. Why is the water called ocean ?' The Elder replied [86] ; ' Because there is just as much salt as water, O king, and just as much water as salt, therefore is it called ocean V

⁴⁸ * Very good, Nagasena ! ' 13. The king said : c Why, Nagasena, is the ocean all of one taste, the taste of salt ?' See 6&taka I, 60, 24; 160, 18. HfnaikumburS renders it < sleeping with a snore (gorawamin) like the sound of crows (k&ka).' 2 Mna.

⁴⁹ K 2 132 THE QUESTIONS OF KING MILINDA. 111,7,14- ' Because the water in it has stood so long, therefore it is all of one taste, the taste of salt V ' Very good, Nagasena ! '

⁵⁰ The king said: 'Can even the most minute thing, Nagasena, be divided?' c Yes, it can/ * And what, Sir, is the most minute of all things. 7

⁵¹ * Truth (D ham ma), O king, is the most minute and subtle. But this is not true of all qualities (Dhamma). Subtleness or the reverse are epithets of qualities. But whatever can be divided that can wisdom (PawH) divide, and there is no other quality which can divide wisdom/

⁵² * Very good, Nagasena ! ' 15. The king said: 'These three, Nagasena, perception, and reason, and the soul in a being, are they all different both in letter and in essence, or the same in essence differing only in the letter ?'

⁵³ * Recognition, O king, is the mark of perception, and discrimination of reason , and there is no such thing as a soul in beings V

⁵⁴ IIT, 7, 16. SOUL. 133 ' But if there be no such thing as a soul, what is it then which sees forms with the eye, and hears sounds with the ear, and smells odours with the nose, and tastes tastes with the tongue, and feels touch with the body, or perceives qualities with the mind ?'

⁵⁵ The Elder replied: ' If there be a soul (distinct from the body) which does all this, then if the door of the eye were thrown down (if the eye were plucked out) could it stretch out its head, as it were, through the larger aperture and (with greater range) see forms much more clearly than before ? Could one hear sounds better if the ears were torn away, or smell better if the nose were cut off, or taste better if the tongue were pulled out, or feel touch better if the body were destroyed ? '

⁵⁶ ' Certainly not, Sir/ * Then there can be no soul inside the body/ 'Very good, Nagasena P 1 6. The Elder said: 'A hard thing there is, O king, which the Blessed One has done/

⁵⁷ 'And what is that? 1 ' Give me an illustration/ ' Suppose, O king, a man were to wade down into the sea, and taking some water in the palm of his hand, were to taste it with his tongue. Would he

⁵⁸ givo by the 'life (or perhaps living principle, ^ivitft) inside the forms produced out of the four elements/ 1 Phasso, vedan, \$&nn&, /fcetand, k'M&m.

⁵⁹ distinguish whether it were water from the Ganges, or from the Jumna, or from the A&ravati, or from the Sarabhfi, or from the Maht ?'

⁶⁰ * Impossible, Sir/ * Very good, Nagasena !' Here ends the Seventh Chapter l . 1 7. The Elder said : ' Do you know, O king, what time it is now ?'

⁶¹ ' Yes, Sir, I know. The first watch of the night is now passed. The middle watch is now going on. The torches are lit. The four banners are ordered to be raised, and appropriate gifts to be issued to you from the treasury.'

⁶² The Yonakas said: 'Very good, great king. Most able is the Bhikkhu.' 'Yes, my men. Most able is the Bhikkhu. Were the master like him and the pupil like me, [88] a clever scholar would not take long in getting at the truth/

⁶³ Then the king, pleased with the explanations given of the questions he had put, had Nagasena robed in an embroidered cloak worth a hundred thousand , and said to him : ' Venerable Nagasena, I hereby order that you shall be provided with your daily meal for eight hundred days, and give you the

⁶⁴ Ill, 7, 1 8. DEPARTURE. 135 choice of anything in the palace that it is lawful for you to take/ And when the Elder refused, saying he had enough to live on, the king rejoined : ' I know, Sir, you have enough to live on. But you should both protect me and protect yourself yourself from the possibility of a public rumour to the effect that you convinced me but received nothing from me, and me from the possibility of a public rumour that though I was convinced I would give nothing in acknowledgement/

⁶⁵ ' Let it be as you wish, great king/ was the reply. Then the king said : ' As the lion, the kijig of beasts, when put into a cage, though it were of gold, would turn his face longingly to the outside ; even so do I, though I dwell in the world, turn my thoughts longingly to the higher life of you recluses. But, Sir, if I were to give up the household life and renounce the world it would not be long I should have to live, so many are my foes/

⁶⁶ Then the venerable Nagasena, having thus solved the questions put by Milinda the king, arose from his seat and departed to the hermitage.

⁶⁷ 1 8. Not long after Nagasena had gone, Milinda the king thought over to himself whether he had propounded his questions rightly, and whether the replies had been properly made. And he came to the conclusion that to questions well put replies had been well given. And Nctgasena likewise, when he reached the hermitage, thought the matter over to himself, and concluded that to questions well put right replies had been given.

⁶⁸ Now Nagasena robed himself early in the morning, and went with his bowl in his hand to the palace, and sat down on the seat prepared for him. And Milinda saluted the venerable Nagasena, [89] and sat down respectfully at his side, and said to him : ' Pray do not think, Sir, that I was kept awake all the rest of the night exulting in the thought of having questioned you. I was debating with myself as to whether I had asked aright, and had been rightly answered. And I concluded that I had.'

⁶⁹ And the Elder on his part said : ' Pray do not suppose, great king, that I passed the rest of the night rejoicing at having answered all you asked. I too was thinking over what had been said by us both. And I came to the result that you had questioned well, and that I had rightly answered/

⁷⁰ Thus did these two great men congratulate each the other on what he had spoken well. Here ends the answering of the problems of the questions of Milinda. IV, i, I. DILEMMAS. 13 7

Chapter IV

¹ CHAPTER 1. [90] i. Master of words and sophistry, clever and wise Milinda tried to test great Nagasena's skill. Leaving him not \ again and yet again, He questioned and cross-questioned him, until His own skill was proved foolishness. Then he became a student of the Holy Writ. All night, in secrecy, he pondered o'er The ninefold Scriptures, and therein he found Dilemmas hard to solve, and full of snares. And thus he thought: 'The conquering Buddha's

² words Are many-sided, some explanatory, Some spoken as occasion rose to speak, Some dealing fully with essential points. Through ignorance of what, each time, was meant There will be strife hereafter as to what The King of Righteousness has thus laid down In these diverse and subtle utterances. Let me now gain great Nagasena's ear, And putting to him that which seems so strange And hard yea contradictory get him To solve it. So in future times, when men Begin to doubt, the light of his solutions Shall guide them, too, along the path of Truth/

³ Now Milinda the king, whea the night was turning into day, and the sun had risen, bathed, and with hands clasped and raised to his forehead, called to mind the Buddhas of the past, the present, and the future, and solemnly undertook the observance of the eightfold vow, saying to himself : (For seven days from now will I do penance by taking upon myself the observance of the eight rules, and when my vow is accomplished will I go to the teacher and put to him, as questions, these dilemmas/ So Milinda the king laid aside his usual dress, and put off his ornaments ; and clad in yellow robes, with only a recluse's turban * on his head, in appearance like a hermit, did he carry out the eightfold abstinence, keeping in mind the vow ' For this seven days I am to decide no case at law. I am to harbour no lustful thought, no thought of ill-will, no thought tending to delusion. Towards all slaves, servants, and dependents I am to show a meek and lowly disposition. [91] I am to watch carefully over every bodily act, and over my six organs of sense. And I am to fill my heart with thoughts of love towards all beings/ Keeping this eightfold vow, establishing his heart in this eightfold moral law, for seven days he went not forth. But as the night was passing into day, at sunrise of the eighth day, he took his breakfast early, and then with downcast eyes and measured words, gentle in manner, collected in thought, glad and pleased and rejoicing in heart, did he go to Nagasena. And bowing down at his feet, he stood respectfully on one side, and said : 3. 'There is a certain matter, venerable Nagasena,

⁴ IV, 1, 4. SECRET DOCTRINE. 139 that I desire to talk over with you alone. I wish no third person to be present. In some deserted spot, some secluded place in the forest, fit in all the eight respects for a recluse, there should this point of mine be put. And therein let there be nothing hid from me, nothing kept secret. I am now in a fit state to hear secret things when we are deep in consultation. And the meaning of what I say can be made clear by illustration. As it is to the broad earth, O

Nagasena, that it is right to entrust treasure when occasion arises for laying treasure by, so is it to me that it is right to entrust secret things when we are deep in consultation/

⁵ Then having gone with the master to a secluded spot he further said : * There are eight kinds of places, Nagasena, which ought to be altogether avoided by a man who wants to consult. No wise man will talk a matter over in such places, or the matter falls to the ground and is brought to no conclusion. And what are the eight ? Uneven ground, spots unsafe by fear of men, windy places, hiding spots, sacred places, high roads, light bambti bridges, and public bathing places/

⁶ The Elder asked : ' What is the objection to each of these?' The king replied : 'On uneven ground, Nagasena, [92] the matter discussed becomes jerky, verbose, and diffuse, and comes to nothing. In unsafe places the mind is disturbed, and being disturbed does not follow the point clearly. In windy spots the voice is indistinct. In hiding places there are eavesdroppers. In sacred places the question discussed is apt to be diverted to the serious surroundings. On a high road it is apt to become frivolous, on a

⁷ bridge unsteady and wavering, at a public bathing place the discussion would be matter of common talk. Therefore is it said I : " Uneven ground, unsafe and windy spots, And hiding places, and god-haunted shrines, High roads, and bridges, and all bathing ghats These eight avoid when talking of high things/" '

⁸ ' There are eight kinds of people, Nagasena, who when talking a matter over, spoil the discussion. And who are the eight ? He who walks in lust, he who walks in ill-will, he who walks in delusion, he who walks in pride, the greedy man, the sluggard, the man of one idea, and the fool/

⁹ ' The first spoils the discussion by his lust, the next by his ill-will, the third by his delusions, the fourth by his pride, the fifth by his greed, the sixth by his sloth, the seventh by his narrowness, and the last by his folly. Therefore is it said :

¹⁰ " The lustful, angry, or bewildered man, The proud, the greedy, or the slothful man, The man of one idea, and the poor fool These eight are spoilers of high argument/" '

¹¹ ' There are nine kinds of people, Nagasena, who let out a secret that has been talked over with them, and treasure it not up in their hearts. And who are the nine ? The lustful man reveals it in obedience to some lust, the ill-tempered man in con-

¹² IV, 1, 8. THE RIPENING OF INSIGHT. 141 sequence of some ill-will, the deluded man under some mistake. [93] The timid man reveals it through fear, and the man greedy for gain to get something out of it. A woman reveals it through infirmity, a drunkard in his eagerness for drink, a eunuch because of his imperfection, and a child through fickleness. Therefore is it said : " The lustful, angry, or bewildered man, The timid man, and he who seeks for gain, A woman, drunkard, eunuch, or a child These nine are fickle, wavering, and mean. When secret things are talked over to them They straightway become public property." *

¹³ * There are eight causes, Nagasena, of the advance, the ripening of insight. And what are the eight ? The advance of years, the growth of reputation, frequent questioning, association with teachers, one's own reflection, converse with the wise, cultivation of the loveable, and dwelling in a pleasant land. Therefore is it said :

¹⁴ " By growth in reputation, and in years, By questioning, and by the master's aid, By though tfulness, and converse with the wise, By intercourse with men worthy of love, By residence within a pleasant spot By these nine is one's insight purified. They who have these, their wisdom grows ." "

¹⁵ "This spot, Nagasena, is free from the objections to talking matters over. And I am a model companion for any one desiring to do fo. I can keep a

¹⁶ secret, and will keep yours as long as I live. In all the eight ways just described my insight has grown ripe. It would be hard to find such a pupil as you may have in me.

¹⁷ [94=] * Now towards a pupil who conducts himself thus aright the teacher ought to conduct himself in accordance with the twenty-five virtues of a teacher. And what are the twenty-five ? He must always and without fail keep guard over his pupil. He must let him know what to cultivate, and what to avoid ; about what he should be earnest, and what he may neglect. He must instruct him as to sleep, and as to keeping himself in health, and as to what food he may take, and what reject He should teach him discrimination l (in food), and share with him all that is put, as alms, into his own bowl. He should encourage him, saying : " Be not afraid. You will gain advantage (from what is here taught you)"/ He should advise him as to the people whose company he should keep, and as to the villages and Vihiras he should frequent. He should never indulge in (foolish) talk 2 with him. When he sees any defect in him he should easily pardon it. He should be zealous, he should teach nothing partially, keep nothing secret, and hold nothing back . He should look upon him in his heart as a son, saying to himself : " I have begotten him in

¹⁸ IV, i, 9. THE MODEL TEACHER. 143 learning V He should strive to bring him forward, saying to himself: "How can I keep him from going back ? " He should determine in himself to make him strong in knowledge, saying to himself: " I will make him mighty." He should love him, never desert him in necessity, never neglect him in anything he ought to do for him, always befriend him so far as he can rightly do so 2 when he does wrong. These, Sir, are the twenty-five good qualities in a teacher. Treat me altogether in accordance therewith. Doubt, Lord, has overcome me. There are apparent contradictions in the word of the Conqueror. About them strife will hereafter arise, and in future times it will be hard to find a teacher with insight such as yours. Throw light for me on these dilemmas, to the downfall of the adversaries/

¹⁹ Then the Elder agreed to what he had said, and in his turn set out the ten good qualities which ought to be found in a lay disciple : (These ten, O king, are the virtues of a lay disciple. He suffers like pain and feels like joy as the Order does. He takes the Doctrine (D ham ma) as his master. He delights in giving so far as he is able to give. On seeing the religion (D h a rn ma) of the Conqueror decay, he does his best to revive it. He holds right views. Having no passion for excitement , he runs

²⁰ not after any other teacher his life long. He keeps guard over himself in thought and deed. He delights in peace, is a lover of peace. He feels no jealousy, [95] and walks not in religion in a quarrelsome spirit. He takes his refuge in the Buddha, he takes his refuge in the Doctrine, he takes his refuge in the Order. These, great king, are the ten good qualities of a lay disciple. They exist all of them in you. Hence is it fit, and right, and becoming in you that, seeing the decay of the religion of the Conqueror, you desire its prosperity. I give you leave. Ask of me whatever you will.'

²¹ [Here ends the introduction to the solving of dilemmas.] THE DILEMMAS. [ON HONOURS PAID TO THE BUDDHA.] 10. Then Milinda the king, having thus been granted leave, fell at the feet of the teacher, and raising his clasped hands to his forehead, said: 'Venerable Nagasena, these

leaders of other sects say thus : "If the Buddha accepts gifts he cannot have passed entirely away. He must be still in union with the world, having his being somewhere in it, in the world, a shareholder in the things of the world ; and therefore any honour paid to him becomes empty and vain \ On the other hand if he

²² 1 'Because honours should be paid, in the way of worship, to those who have so passed away, and to them only/ is the implied suggestion, as if it were common ground to the Buddhists and their opponents. But there is no such doctrine in the Pali Pi&kas, and could not be. The whole discussion breathes the spirit of a later time.

²³ TV, T, 10. GIFTS. 145 be entirely passed away (from life), unattached to the world, escaped from all existence, then honours would not be offered to him. For he who is entirely set free accepts no honour, and any act done to him who accepts it not becomes empty and vain." This is a dilemma "which has two horns. It is not a matter within the scope of those who have no mind \ it is a question fit for the great. Tear asunder this net of heresy, put it on one side. To you has this puzzle been put Give to the future sons of the Conqueror eyes wherewith to see the riddle to the confusion of their adversaries/-

²⁴ ' The Blessed One, O king/ replied the Elder, ' is entirely set free. And the Blessed One accepts no gift. Even at the foot of the Tree of Wisdom he abandoned all accepting of gifts, how much more then now when he has passed entirely away by that kind of passing away which leaves no root over (for the formation of a new existence). For this, O king, has been said by Sciriputta, the commander of the faith ;

²⁵ "Though worshipped, these Unequalled Ones, alike By gods and men, unlike them all they heed Neither a gift nor worship. They accept It not, neither refuse it. Through the ages All Buddhas were so, so will ever be 3 !" '

²⁶ ^ ii. The king said: 'Venerable Nagasena, a father may speak in praise of his son, or a son of his father. But that is no ground for putting the adversaries to shame. It is only an expression of their own belief. Come now I Explain this matter to me fully to the establishing of your own doctrine, [96] and to the unravelling of the net of the heretics/

²⁷ The Elder replied : c The Blessed One, O king, is entirely set free (from life). And the Blessed One accepts no gift If gods or men put up a building to contain the jewel treasure of the relics of a Tathigata who does not accept their gift, still by that homage paid to the attainment of the supreme good under the form of the jewel treasure of his wisdom do they themselves attain to one or other of the three glorious states . Suppose, O king, that though a great and glorious fire had been kindled, it should die out, would it then again accept any supply of dried grass or sticks ?'

²⁸ ' Even as it burned, Sir, it could not be said to accept fuel, how much less when it had died away, and ceased to burn, could it, an unconscious thing, accept it ?'

²⁹ * And when that one mighty fire had ceased, and gone out, would the world be bereft of fire ?' IV, i, 12, HONOURS PAID TO THE BUDDHA. 147

³⁰ "Then that saying of the sectarians that u an act done to him who accepts it not is empty and vain " turns out to be false. As that great and glorious fire was set alight, even so, great king, was the Blessed One set alight in the glory of his Buddhahood over the ten thousand world systems. As it went out, so has he passed away into that kind of passing away in which no root remains. As the fire,

when gone out, accepted no supply of fuel, just so, and for the good of the world, has his accepting of gifts ceased and determined. As men, when the fire is out, and has no further means of burning, then by their own strength and effort, such as resides in individual men, twirl the fire-stick and produce fire, and do any work for which fire is required so do gods and men, though a Tathigata has passed away and no longer accepts their gifts, yet put up a house for the jewel treasure of his relics, and doing homage to the attainment of supreme good under the form of the jewel treasure of his wisdom, they attain to one or other of the three glorious states. [97] Therefore is it, great king, that acts done to the Tathdgata, notwithstanding his having passed away and not accepting them, are nevertheless of value and bear fruit.'

³¹ * Now hear, too, another reason for the same thing. Suppose, O king, there were to arise a great and mighty wind, and that then it were to die away. Would that wind acquiesce in being produced again ?'

³² ' A wind that has died away can have no thought or idea of being, reproduced. And why ? Because the element wind is an unconscious thing/

³³ 'Or even, O king, would the word "wind" be L 2 still applicable to that wind, when it had so died away ?' 'Certainly not, Sir. But fans and punkahs are means for the production of wind. Any men who are oppressed by heat, or tormented by fever, can by means of fans and punkahs, and by the exertion of their own strength and power, such as resides in individual men, produce a breeze, and by that wind allay their heat, or assuage their fever/

³⁴ ' Then that saying of the sectarians that " an act done to him who accepts it not is empty and vain " turns out to be false, As the great and mighty wind which blew, even so, great king, has the Blessed One blown over the ten thousand world systems with the wind of his love, so cool, so sweet, so calm, so delicate. As it first blew, and then died away, so has the Blessed One, who once blew with the wind so cool, so sweet, so calm, so delicate, of his love, now passed away with that kind of passing away in which no root remains. As those men were oppressed by heat and tormented with fever, even so are gods and men tormented and oppressed with threefold fire and heat \ As fans and punkahs are means of producing wind, so the relics and the jewel treasure of the wisdom of a Tathigata are means of producing the threefold attainment. [98] And as men oppressed by heat and tormented by fever can by fans and punkahs produce a breeze, and thus allay the heat and assuage the fever, so can gods and men by offering reverence to the relics, and the

³⁵ IV, 1,13. HONOURS PAID TO THE BUDDHA. 149 jewel treasure of the wisdom of a Tathdgata, though he has died away and accepts it not, cause goodness to arise within them, and by that goodness can assuage and can allay the fever and the torment of the threefold fire. Therefore is it, great king, that acts done to the Tathagata, notwithstanding his having passed away and not accepting them, are nevertheless of value and bear fruit/

³⁶ * Now hear another reason for the same thing. Suppose, O king, a man were to make a drum sound, and then that sound were to die away. Would that sound acquiesce in being produced again ? '

³⁷ ' Certainly not, Sir. The sound has vanished. It can have no thought or idea of being reproduced. The sound of a drum when it has once been produced and died away, is altogether cut off. But, Sir, a drum is a means of producing sound. And any man, as need arises, can by the effort of power residing in himself, beat on that drum, and so produce a sound/

³⁸ ' Just so, great king, has the Blessed One except the teacher and the instruction he has left in his doctrine and discipline, and the jewel treasure of his relics whose value is derived from his righteousness, and contemplation, and wisdom, and emancipation, and insight given by the knowledge of emancipation just so has he passed away by that kind of passing away in which no root remains. But the possibility of receiving the three attainments is not cut off because the Blessed One has passed away. Beings oppressed by the sorrow of becoming can, when they desire the attainments, still receive them by means of the jewel treasure of his relics and of his doctrine and discipline and teaching. Therefore is it, great king, that

³⁹ all acts done to the Tathigata, notwithstanding his having passed away and not accepting, are nevertheless of value and bear fruit. And this future possibility, great king, has been foreseen by the Blessed One, and spoken of, and declared, and made known, when he said : " It may be, Ananda, that in some of you the thought may arise: [99] * The word of the Master is ended. We have noTeacher more ! ' But it is not thus, Ananda, that? you should regard it. The Truth which I have preached to you, the Rules which I have laid down for the Order, let them, when I am gone, be the| Teacher to you V So that because the Tathlgata has passed away and consents not thereto, that therefore any act done to him is empty and vain this saying of the enemy is proved false. It is untrue, unjust, not according to fact, wrong, and perverse. It is the cause of sorrow, has sorrow as its fruit, and leads down the road to perdition ! '

⁴⁰ ' Now hear another reason for the same thing. Does the broad earth acquiesce, O king, in all kinds of seeds being planted all over it ?'

⁴¹ 'Then how is it those seeds, planted without the earth's consent, do yet stand fast and v firmly rooted, and expand into trees with great trunks and sap and branches, and bearing fruits and flowers ?'

⁴² * Though the earth, Sir, gives no consent, yet it acts as a site for those seeds, as a means of their development. Planted on that site they grow, by

⁴³ IV, i, 15. TREES. 151 its means, into such great trees with branches, flowers, and fruit/ ' Then, great king, the sectaries are destroyed, defeated, proved wrong by their own words when they say that " an act done to him who accepts it not is empty and vain." As the broad earth, O king, is the Tathgata, the Arahat, the Buddha supreme. Like it he accepts nothing. Like the seeds which through it attain to such developments are the gods and men who, through the jewel treasures of the relics and the wisdom of the Tathigata though he have passed away and consent not to it being firmly rooted by the roots of merit, become like unto trees casting a goodly shade by means of the trunk of contemplation, the sap of true doctrine, and the branches of righteousness, and bearing the flowers of emancipation, and the fruits of Samaraship. [100] Therefore is it, great king, that acts done to the Tathdgata, notwithstanding his having passed away and not accepting them, are still of value and bear fruit'

⁴⁴ ' Now hear another and further reason for the same thing. Do camels, buffaloes, asses, goats, oxen, or men acquiesce in the birth of worms inside them?'

⁴⁵ ' Then how is it then, that without their consent worms are so born, and spread by rapid reproduction of sons and grandsons ? '

⁴⁶ * By the power of evil Karma, Sir/ 1 6. 'Now hear another and further reason for the same thing. Do men consent, O king, that the ninety-eight diseases should be produced in their bodies ?'

⁴⁷ * Certainly not, Sir/ 1 Then how is it the diseases come ? ' By evil deeds done in former births/ ' But, great king, if evil deeds done in a former birth have to be suffered here and now, then both good and evil done here or done before has weight and bears fruit. Therefore is it that acts done to the Tathsgata, notwithstanding his having passed away and not consenting, are nevertheless of value and bear fruit/

⁴⁸ 1 7. * Now hear another and further reason for the same thing. Did you ever hear, O king, of the ogre named Nandaka, who, having laid hands upon the Elder Sdriputta, was swallowed up by the earth?'

⁴⁹ ' Yes, Sir, that is matter of common talk among men/ 'Well, did Siriputta acquiesce in that ?' [101] * Though the world of gods and men, Sir, were to be destroyed, though the sun and moon were to fall upon the earth, though Sineru the king of mountains were to be dissolved, yet would not Siriputta the Elder have consented to any pain being inflicted on a fellow creature. And why not ? Because every condition of heart which could cause him to be angry or offended has been in him destroyed and rooted out And as all cause thereof had thus been removed, Sir, therefore could not Siriputta be angered even with those who sought to deprive him of his life/

⁵⁰ IV, r, 18. SARIPUTTA. 153 ' But if Sdriputta, O king, did not consent to it, how was it that Nandaka was so swallowed up ?'

⁵¹ * By the power of his evil deeds/ 1 8. * Now how many, O king, are those men who, in this life, have been swallowed up by the earth ? Have you heard anything on that point ?'

⁵² ' And whom, O king, had they wronged ? ' The Blessed One and his disciples/ ' Then did the Blessed One or his disciples consent to their being so swallowed up ? '

⁵³ * Certainly not, Sir/ ' Well has this deep question been explained by you, venerable Nagasena, and made clear. You have made the secret thing [102] plain, you have loosed the knot, you have made in the jungle an open space, the adversaries are overthrown, the wrong opinion has been proved false, the sectaries have been covered

⁵⁴ with darkness when they met you, O best of all the leaders of schools ! ' [Here ends the question as to not consenting to honours paid '.]

⁵⁵ [THE OMNISCIENCE OF THE BUDDHA.] 19. 'Venerable Nagasena, was the Buddha omniscient ?' ' Yes, O king, he was. But the insight of knowledge was not always and continually (consciously) present with him. The omniscience of the Blessed One was dependent on reflection/ But if he did reflect he knew whatever he wanted to know .

⁵⁶ * [If so, great king, our Buddha's knowledge must have been less in degree of fineness than that of the other Buddhas. And that is a conclusion hard to draw. But let me explain a little further.] Suppose, O king, you had a hundred cart-loads of rice in the husk, and each cart-load was of seven ammaas 3 and a half. Would a man without consideration be able to tell you in a moment how many laks of grains there were in the whole * ? '

⁵⁷ * Mr. Trenckner has marked this passage as corrupt, and I do not pretend to understand it either. The Sinhalese is also very

⁵⁸ IV, i, 21. THE GIANT BAMBU. 155 20. ' Now there are these seven classes of minds. Those, great king, who are full of lust, ill-will, delusion, or wrong doing, who are untrained in the management of their body, or in conduct, or in thought, or in wisdom, their thinking powers are brought into play with difficulty, and act slowly. And why is it so ? Because of the untrained condition of their minds. It is like the slow and heavy movements of a giant bambft when it is being dragged along with its wide-spreading, extensive, overgrown, and interlaced vegetation, and with its branches intricately entangled one with the other. So slow and heavy are the movements of the minds of those men, O king. And why ? Because of the intricate entanglements of wrong dispositions. This is the first class of minds/

⁵⁹ ' From it the second class is to be distinguished. Those, O king, who have been converted, for whom the gates of purgatory are closed, who have attained to right views, who have grasped the doctrine of the Master their thinking powers, so far as the three lower stages 1 are concerned, are brought quickly

⁶⁰ involved and confused. I have added the words in brackets from the Sinhalese, and translated the rest according to the general sense of the Sinhalese and the figures of the Pali. Hardy gives his 'version' at p. 386 of the 'Manual of Buddhism/ It says, ' In one load of rice there are 63,660,000 grains. Each of these grains can be separately considered by Buddha in a moment of time, In that moment the seven-times gifted mind exercises this power/ The last sentence is a misunderstanding of the opening words of our next section (IV, i, 20).

⁶¹ into play, [103] and act with ease. But as regards the higher regions they are brought into play with difficulty, and act slowly. And why is this so ? Because of their minds having been made clear as regards those three stages, and because of the failings (to be vanquished in the higher stages) still existing within them. It is like the movement of a giant bambti which has a clean trunk as far as the third knot, but above that has its branches intricately entangled. So far as regards the smooth trunk it would travel easily when dragged along, but it would stick obstinately as regards its upper branches. This is the second class of minds/

⁶² * From these the third class is to be distinguished. Those, O king, who are SakadAgimins , in whom lust, ill-will, and delusion are reduced to a minimum, their thinking powers, so far as the five lower stages are concerned, are brought quickly into play, and act with ease. But as regards the higher regions they are brought into play with difficulty, and act slowly. And why is this so ? Because of their minds having been made clear as regards those five stages, and because of the failings (to be vanquished in the higher stages) still existing within them. It is like the movement of a giant bambu which has a clean trunk as far as the fifth knot, but above that has its branches intricately entangled. So far as regards the smooth trunk it would travel easily when dragged along, but it would be moved with difficulty as far as its upper branches are concerned. This is the third class of minds/

⁶³ IV, i, 24. THINKING POWERS. 157 23. 'From these the fourth class is to be distinguished. Those, O king, who are Anagimins , who have completely got rid of the five lower fetters,

⁶⁴ their thinking powers, so far as the ten stages 2 are concerned, are brought quickly into play, and act with ease. [104] But as regards the higher regions they are brought into play with difficulty, and act slowly. And why is this so ? Because of their minds having been made clear as regards those ten stages, and because of the failings (to be vanquished in the higher stages) still existing within them. It

is like the movement of a giant bambft which has a smooth trunk as far as the tenth knot, but above that has its branches intricately entangled. This is the fourth class of minds/

⁶⁵ ' From these the fifth class is to be distinguished. Those, O king, who are Arahats, in whom the four Great Evils 3 have ceased, whose stains have been washed away, whose predispositions to evil 4 have been put aside, who have lived the life, and accomplished the task, and laid aside every burden, and reached up to that which is good, for whom the Fetter of the craving after any kind of future life has been broken to pieces , who have reached the higher insight , who are purified as regards all those conditions of heart in which a

⁶⁶ * Patta-paisambhidsL hearer can be pure, their thinking powers, as regards all that a disciple can be or do, are brought quickly into play, and act with ease. But as to those things which are within the reach of the Pa//eka~ Buddhas (of those who are Buddhas, but for themselves alone) they are brought into play with difficulty, and act slowly. And why is this so ? Because of their having been made pure as regards all within the province of a hearer, but not as regards that within the reach of those who are Buddhas (though for themselves alone). It is like the movement of a giant bambft which has been pruned of the branches arising out of all its knots and which, therefore, when dragged along moves quickly and with ease, because of its smoothness all along, and because of its being unencumbered with the jungly growth of vegetation. This is the fifth class of minds/

⁶⁷ [105] ' From these the sixth class is to be distinguished Those, O king, who are Pa//ekaBuddhas, dependent on themselves alone, wanting no teacher, dwellers alone like the solitary horn of the rhinoceros, who so far as their own higher life is concerned, have pure hearts free from stain, their thinking powers, so far as their own province is concerned, are brought quickly into play, and act with ease. But as regards all that is specially within the province of a perfect Buddha (one who is not only Buddha, that is enlightened, himself, but can lead others to the light) they are brought with difficulty into play, and move slowly. And why is this so ? Because of their purity as regards all within their own province, and because of the immensity of the province of the omniscient Buddhas. It is like a man, O king, who would fearlessly cross, and at will,

⁶⁸ IV, I, 26. THE BUDDHAS. 159 by day or night, a shallow brook on his own property. But when he comes in sight of the mighty ocean, deep and wide and ever-moving, and sees no further shore to it, then would he stand hesitating and afraid, and make no effort even to get over it And why ? Because of his familiarity with his own, and because of the immensity of the sea. This is the sixth class of minds/

⁶⁹ * From these the seventh class is to be distinguished. Those, O king, who are complete Buddhas , having all knowledge, bearing about in themselves the tenfold power (of the ten kinds of insight), confident in the four modes of just self-confidence, endowed with the eighteen characteristics of a Buddha, whose mastery knows no limit, from whose grasp nothing is hid, their thinking powers are on every point brought quickly into play, and act with ease. Suppose, O king, a dart well burnished, free from rust, perfectly smooth, with a fine edge, straight, without a crook or a flaw in it, were to be set on a powerful crossbow. Would there be any clumsiness in its action, any retarding in its movement, if it were discharged by a powerful man against a piece of fine linen, or cotton stuff, or delicate woolwork?'

⁷⁰ * Certainly not, Sir. And why? Because the stuff is so fine, and the dart so highly tempered, and the discharge so powerful/

⁷¹ * And just in the same way, great king, are the thinking powers of the Buddhas I have described brought quickly into play, and act with ease.

⁷² And why ? Because of their being purified in every respect. This is the seventh class of minds/ 27. 'Now of these, O king, the last the thinking powers of the omniscient Buddhas alto-

⁷³ aether outclasses the other six, and is clear and & active in its high quality that is beyond our ken. It is because the mind of the Blessed One is so clear and active that the Blessed One, great king, displays the double miracle. From that we may get to know, O king, how clear and active His mental powers are. And for those wonders there is no further reason that can be alleged. (Yet) those wonders, O king, [caused by means of the mind (alone) of the omniscient Buddhas T] cannot be counted, or calculated, or divided, or separated, (For) the knowledge of the Blessed One, O king, is dependent upon reflection , and it is on reflection that he knows whatever he wishes to know. (But) it is as when a man passes something he already has in one hand to the other, or utters a sound when his mouth is open, or swallows some food that he has already in his mouth, or opens his eyes when they are shut, or shuts them when open, or stretches forth his arm when it is bent in, or bends it in when stretched out more rapid than that, great king, and more easy in its action, is the all-embracing knowledge of the Blessed One, more rapid than that his reflection. And although it is by reflection that they know whatever they want to know, yet even when they

⁷⁴ IV, i, 27. REFLECTION. I6l are not reflecting the Blessed Buddhas are not, even then, anything other than omniscient/ ' But, venerable Nagasena, reflection is carried on for the purpose of seeking (that which is not clear when the reflection begins). Come now. Convince me in this matter by some reason/

⁷⁵ * Suppose, O king, there were a rich man, great in wealth and property one who had stores of gold and silver and valuables, and stores of all kinds of wheat, one who had rice, and paddy, and barley, and dry grain, and oilseed, and beans, and peas, and every other edible seed, who had ghee, and oil, and butter, and milk, and curds, and honey, and sugar, and molasses, [107] all put away in store-rooms in jars, and pots, and pans, and every sort of vessel. Now if a traveller were to arrive, one worthy of hospitality, and expecting to be entertained ; and all the prepared food in the house had been finished, and they were to get out of the jar some rice ready for cooking, and prepare a meal for him. Would that wealthy man merely by reason of the deficiency in eatable stuff at that unusual time be rightly called poor or needy ? '

⁷⁶ ' Certainly not, Sir. Even in the palace of a mighty king of kings there might be no food ready out of time, how much less in the house of an ordinary man/

⁷⁷ ' Just so, great king, with the all-embracing knowledge of a Tathgata when reflection only is wanting; but which on reflection grasps whatever he wants. Now suppose, O king, there were a tree in full fruit, with its branches bending this way and that by the weight of the burden of the bunches of its fruit, but no single fruit had fallen from it. [35] M

⁷⁸ Could that tree rightly, under the circumstances of the case, be called barren, merely because of the want of a fallen fruit ? '

⁷⁹ ' No, Sir. For though the falling of the fruit is a condition precedent to its -enjoyment, yet when it has fallen one can take as much as one likes.'

⁸⁰ * Just so, great king, though reflection is a necessary condition of the knowledge of the Tathigata, yet on reflection it perceives whatever he wants to know/

⁸¹ ' Does that happen always, Nagasena, at the moment of reflection ? ' ' Yes, O king. Just as when the mighty king of kings (the ^Takkavatti) calling to mind his glorious wheel of victory wishes it to appear, and no sooner is it thought of than it appears so does the knowledge of the TatMgata follow continually on reflection/

⁸² * Strong is the reason you give, Nagasena, for the omniscience of the Buddha. I am convinced that that is so/ [Here ends the question as to the omniscience of the Buddha being dependent on reflection *.]

⁸³ [WHY DEVADATTA WAS ADMITTED TO THE ORDER.] 28. 'Venerable Nagasena, who was it that admitted Devadatta 2 to the Order ?'

⁸⁴ IV, I, 28. DEVADATTA. 163 * Those six young nobles, O king, Bhaddiya and Anuruddha and Ananda and Bhagu and Kimbila and Devadatta, [10] together with Upali the barber as a seventh they all, when the Master had attained to Buddhahood, left the Sakya home out of the delight they felt in him, and following the Blessed One renounced the world \ So the Blessed One admitted them all to the Order/

⁸⁵ ' But was it not Devadatta who, after he had entered the Order, raised up a schism within it ? ' ' Yes. No layman can create a schism, nor a sister of the Order, nor one under preparatory instruction, nor a novice of either sex. It must be a Bhikkhu, under no disability, who is in full communion, and a co-resident V

⁸⁶ * And what Karma does a schismatical person gain ? ' * A Karma that continues to act for a Kalpa (a very long period of time)/

⁸⁷ ' What then, Nagasena ! Was the Buddha aware that Devadatta after being admitted to the Order would raise up a schism, and having done so would suffer torment in purgatory for a Kalpa ? '

⁸⁸ ' Yes, the Tathigata knew that/ M 2' datta after he had been admitted to the Order would stir up a schism then he cannot have been omniscient. This other double-pointed dilemma is put to you. Unravel this tough skein, break up the argument of the adversaries. In future times it will be hard to find Bhikkhus like to you in wisdom. Herein then show your skill ! '

⁸⁹ ' The Blessed One, O king, was both full of mercy and had all knowledge. It was when the Blessed One in his mercy and wisdom considered the life history of Devadatta that he perceived how, having heaped up Karma on Karma, he would pass for an endless series of Kalpas from torment to torment, and from perdition to perdition. And the Blessed One knew also that the infinite Karma of that man would, because he had entered the Order, become finite, and the sorrow caused by the previous Karma would also therefore become limited. [109] But that if that foolish person were not to enter the Order then he would continue to heap up Karma which would endure for a Kalpa. And it was because he knew that that, in his mercy, he admitted him to the Order/

⁹⁰ 'The Tathagata, O king, wounds people but to their good, he casts people down but to their profit, he kills people but to their advantage. Just as mothers and fathers, O king, hurt their children and even knock them down, thinking the while of their

⁹¹ IV, x, 30. DEVADATTA. 165 good ; so by whatsoever method an increase in the virtue of living things can be brought about, by that method does he contribute to their good. If Devadatta, O king,

had not entered the Order, then as a layman he would have laid up much Karma leading to states of woe, and so passing for hundreds of thousands of Kalpas from torment to misery, and from one state of perdition to another, he would have suffered constant pain. It was knowing that, that in his mercy, the Blessed One admitted Devadatta to the Order. It was at the thought that by renouncing the world according to His doctrine Devadatta's sorrow would become finite that, in his mercy, he adopted that means of making his heavy sorrow light. 30. ' As a man of influence, O king, by the power of his wealth or reputation or prosperity or birth, when a grievous penalty has been imposed by the king on some friend or relative of his, would get it made light by the ability arising from the trust reposed in him ; [110] just so did the Blessed One, by admitting him to the Order, and by the efficacy of the influence of righteousness and meditation and wisdom and emancipation of heart, make light the heavy sorrow of Devadatta, who would have had to suffer many hundreds of thousands of Kalpas. As a clever physician and surgeon, O king, would make a grievous sickness light by the aid of a powerful medicinal drug, just so did the Blessed One, in his knowledge of the right means to an end, admit Devadatta to the Order and thus make his grievous pain light by the aid of the medicine of the Dhamma, strong by the power of mercy \ Was then, O king,

⁹² the Blessed One guilty of any wrong in that he turned Devadatta from being a man of much sorrow into being a man of less sorrow ? ' '

⁹³ ' No indeed, Sir. He committed no wrong, not even in the smallest degree V * Then accept this, great king, to the full as the reason for which the Blessed One admitted Devadatta to the Order/

⁹⁴ ' Hear another and further reason, O king, for the Blessed One's having admitted Devadatta. Suppose men were to seize and hurry before the king some wicked robber, saying : " This is the wicked robber, your Majesty. Inflict upon him such punishment as you think fit ! " And thereupon the king were to say to them : " Take this robber then, my men, outside the town, and there on the place of execution cut off his head." And they in obedience to his orders were to take that man accordingly towards the place of execution. And some man who was high in office near the king, and of great reputation and wealth and property, whose word was held of weight , and whose influence was great should see him. And he were to have pity on him, and were to say to those men : " Stay, good fellows. What good will cutting off his head do to you ? Save him alive, and cut off only a hand or a foot I will speak on his behalf to the king." And they at the word of that influential person were to do so. Now would the officer who had acted so towards him have been a benefactor to that robber ?'

⁹⁵ IV, I, 32. DEVADATTA. 167 ' He would have saved his life, Sir. And having done that, what would he not have done ? ' ' But would he have done no wrong on account of the pain the man suffered [111] when his hand or foot was cut off ? ' '

⁹⁶ ' The pain the thief suffered, Sir, was his own fault. But the man who saved his life did him no harm/ 'Just so, great king, was it in his mercy that the Blessed One admitted Devadatta, with the knowledge that by that his sorrow would be mitigated/

⁹⁷ ' And Devadatta's sorrow, O king, was mitigated. For Devadatta at the moment of his death took refuge in Him for the rest of his existences when he said :

⁹⁸ " In him, who of the best is far the best , The god of gods, the guide of gods and men, Who see'th all, and bears the hundred marks Of goodness, 'tis in him I refuge take Through all the lives that I may have to live/'

⁹⁹ 2 * If you divide this Kalpa, O king, into six parts, it was at the end of the first part that Devadatta created schism in the Order. After he has suffered the other five in purgatory he will be released, and will become a Paeka-Buddha ³ under the name of A/⁴issara/

¹⁰⁰ ' Great is the gift bestowed, Nagasena, by the Blessed One on Devadatta. In that the Tathsgata has caused him to attain to the state of a PaekaBuddha, what has he not done for him ? '

¹⁰¹ * No, Sir. That is Devadatta's own fault ; and the Blessed One who mitigated his suffering has done him no harm/ 'Then accept this, O king, to the full as the reason for the Blessed One admitting Devadatta to the Order.

¹⁰² ' Hear another and further reason, O king, for his having done fo. [112] Suppose in treating a wound full of matter and blood, in whose grievous hollow the weapon which caused it remained, which stank of putrid flesh, and was made worse by the pain that varied with constantly changing symptoms, by variations in temperature, and by the union of the three humours, windy, bilious, and phlegmatic \ an able physician and surgeon were to anoint it with a rough, sharp, bitter, stinging ointment, to the end that the inflammation should be allayed. And when the inflammation had gone down, and the wound had become sweet, suppose he were then to cut into it with a lancet, and burn it with caustic. And when he had cauterised it, suppose he were to prescribe an alkaline wash, and anoint it with some drug to the end that the wound might heal up, and the sick man recover his health now tell me, O king, would it be out of cruelty that the surgeon thus smeared with ointment, and cut with the lancet, and cauterised

¹⁰³ IV, T, 34. DEVADATTA. 1 69 with the stick of caustic, and administered a salty wash ? ' * Certainly not, Sir ; it would be with kindness in his heart, and intent on the man's weal, that he would do all those things/

¹⁰⁴ ' And the feelings of pain produced by his efforts to heal would not the surgeon be guilty of any wrong in respect of them ?*

¹⁰⁵ c How so ? Acting with kind intent and for the man's weal, how could he therein incur a wrong ? It is of heavenly bliss rather that that kindly surgeon would be worthy/

¹⁰⁶ ' Just so, great king, was it in his mercy that the Blessed One admitted Devadatta, to the end to release him from pain/

¹⁰⁷ ' Hear another and further reason, O king, why the Blessed One did fo. Suppose a man had been pierced by a thorn. And another man with kindly intent and for his good were to cut round the place with another sharp thorn or with a lancet, and the blood flowing the while, were to extract that thorn. Now would it be out of cruelty that he acted so ? '

¹⁰⁸ * Certainly not, Sir. For he acted with kindly intent, and for the man's good. And if he had not done so the man might have died, or might have suffered such pain that he would have been nigh to death/

¹⁰⁹ ' Just even so, great king, was it of his mercy that the Tathagata admitted Devadatta, to the end to release him of his pain. If he had not done so [113] Devadatta would have suffered torment in purgatory through a succession of existences, through hundreds of thousands of Kalpas/

¹¹⁰ c Yes, Nagasena, the TatMgata turned Devadatta, who was being carried down with the flood, with his head against the stream ; he again pointed out the road to Devadatta when he was lost in the jungle ; he gave a firm foothold to" Devadatta when he was falling down the precipice : he restored

Devadatta to peace when he was swallowed up of desolation. But the reason and the meaning of these things could no one have pointed out, Nagasena, unless he were wise as you ! '

¹¹¹ [Here ends the dilemma about Devadatta.] [VESSANTARA'S EARTHQUAKE.] 35. * Venerable NAgasena, the Blessed One said thus : " There are these eight causes, O Bhikkhus, proximate or remote, for a mighty earthquake V This is an inclusive statement, a statement which leaves no room for anything to be supplemented, a statement to which no gloss can be added. There can be no ninth reason for an earthquake. If there were, the Blessed One would have mentioned it. It is because there is no other, that he left it unnoticed. But we find another, and a ninth reason, when we are told that on Vessantara's giving his mighty largesse the earth shook seven times . If, Nagasena, there are eight causes for an earthquake, then what we hear of the earthquake at Vessantara's largesse is false. And if that is true, then the statement as to the eight

¹¹² IV, i, 36. VESSANTARA. causes of earthquakes is false. This double-headed question, too, is subtle, hard to unravel, dark, and profound. It is now put to you. [114] No one of less knowledge can solve it, only one wise as you/

¹¹³ ' The Blessed One made the statement you refer to, O king, and yet the earth shook seven times at Vessantara's largesse. But that was out of season, it was an isolated occurrence, it was not included in the eight usual causes, and was not therefore reckoned as one of them. Just, O king, as there are three kinds of well-known rains reckoned in the world that of the rainy season, that of the winter months, and that of the two months Asi//fca and Sivana. If, besides these, any other rain falls, that is not reckoned among the usual rains, but is called " a rain out of season." And again, O king, just as there are five hundred rivers which flow down from the Himalayas, but of these ten only are reckoned in enumerations of rivers the Ganges, the Jumna, the Airavati, the Sarabhti, the Maht, the Indus, the Sarasvatl, the Vetravati, the Vitasal, and the ^fandabhagi the others not being included in the catalogue because of their intermittent flow of water. And again, O king, just as there are a hundred or two of officers under the king, but only six of them are reckoned as officers of state the commander-in-chief, the prime minister, and the chief judge, and the high treasurer, and the bearer^ of the sunshade of state, and the state sword-bearer. And why? Because of their royal prerogatives. The rest are not reckoned, they are all called simply officers. [115] Just as in all these cases, great king, the seven times repeated earthquake at the largesse of Vessantara was, as an isolated and extra-

¹¹⁴ ordinary occurrence, and distinct from the eight usual ones, not reckoned amongthose eight causes/ 37, * Now have you heard, O king, in the history of our faith of any act of devotion being done so as to receive its recompense even in this present life, the fame of which has reached up to the gods ? '

¹¹⁵ * Yes, Lord, I have heard of such. There are seven cases of such actions.' * Who were the people who did those things ?'

¹¹⁶ * And have you heard of others, O king, who, even in their human body, mounted up to the blessed abode of the great Thirty-three ? ;

¹¹⁷ * Yes, I have heard, too, of them/ c And who were they ?' c Guttala the musician, and Scldhina the king, and king Nimi, and king Mandhiti these four. Long ago was it done, this glorious deed and difficult/

¹¹⁸ ' But have you ever heard, O king, of the earth shaking, either now or in the past, and either once or twice or thrice, when a gift had been given ?'

¹¹⁹ ' No, Sir, that I have not heard of/ ' And I too, O king though I have received the traditions, and been devoted to study, and to hearing the law, and to learning by heart, and to the acquirements of discipleship, and though I have been ready to learn, and to ask and to answer questions, and to sit at the feet of teachers I too have never heard

¹²⁰ IV, T, 37. VESSANTARA. 1 73 of such a thing, except only in the case of the splendid gift of Vessantara the glorious king. And between the times of Kassapa the Blessed One, and of the Blessed One the Sikya sage, there have rolled by hundreds of thousands of years, but in all that period I have heard of no such case. [116] It is at no common effort, O king, at no ordinary struggle, that the great earth is moved. It is when overborne by the weight of righteousness, overpowered by the burden of the goodness of acts which testify of absolute purity, that, unable to support it, the broad earth quakes and trembles and is moved. Then it is as when a wagon is overladen with a too heavy weight, and the nave and the spokes are split, and the axletree is broken in twain. Then it is as when the heavens, overspread with the waters of the tempest driven by the wind, and overweighted with the burden of the heaped-up rain-clouds, roar and creak and rage at the onset of the whirlwind. Thus was it, great king, that the broad earth, unable to support the unwonted burden of the heaped-up and wide-reaching force of king Vessantara's largesse, quaked and trembled and was moved. For the heart of king Vessantara was not turned in the way of lust, nor of ill-will, nor of dullness, nor of pride, nor of delusion, nor of sin, nor of disputation, nor of discontent, but it was turned mightily to generosity. And thinking : " Let all those who want, and who have not yet come, now arrive ! Let all who come receive whatever they want, and be filled with satisfaction ! " it was on giving, ever and without end, that his mind was set. And on these ten conditions of heart, O king, was his mind too fixed on self-control, and on inward calm, and on

¹²¹ long-suffering, and on self-restraint, and on temperance, and on voluntary subjugation to meritorious vows, and on freedom from all forms of wrath and cruelty, and on truthfulness, and on purity of heart. He had abandoned, O king, all seeking after the satisfaction of his animal lusts, he had overcome all craving after a future life, his strenuous effort was set only towards the higher life. He had given up, O king, the caring for himself, and devoted himself thenceforth to caring for others alone. His mind was fixed immovably on the thought : "How can I make all beings to be at peace, healthy, and wealthy, and long lived?" [117] And when, O king, he was giving things away, he gave not for the sake of rebirth in any glorious state, he gave not for the sake of wealth, nor of receiving gifts in return, nor of flattery, nor of long life for himself, nor of high birth, nor of happiness, nor of power, nor of fame, nor of offspring either of daughters or of sons but it was for the sake of supreme wisdom and of the treasure thereof that he gave gifts so immense, so immeasurable, so unsurpassed. It was when he had attained to that supreme wisdom that he uttered the verse :

¹²² "Gāli, my son, and the Black Antelope, My daughter, and my queen, my wife, Maddi, I gave them all away without a thought And 'twas for Buddhahood I did this thing V"

¹²³ ' The angry man, O king, did the great king Vessantara conquer by mildness, and the wicked man by goodness, and the covetous by generosity,

¹²⁴ IV, I, 38. VESSANTARA. 1 75 and the speaker of falsehood by truth, and all evil did he overcome by righteousness \ When he was thus giving away he who was seeking after righteousness,

who had made righteousness his aim then were the great winds, on which the earth rests below, agitated by the full force of the power of the influence that resulted from his generosity, and little by little, one by one, the great winds began to blow confusedly, and up and down and towards each side the earth swayed, and the mighty trees rooted in the soil ² began to totter, and masses of cloud were heaped together in the sky, and terrible winds arose laden with dust, and the heavens rushed together, and hurricanes blew with violent blasts, and a great and terrible mighty noise was given forth. And at the raging of those winds, the waters little by little began to move, and at the movement of the waters the great fish and the scaly creatures were disturbed, and the waves began to roll in double breakers, and the beings that dwell in the waters were seized with fear and as the breakers rushed together in pairs the roar of the ocean grew loud, and the spray was lashed into fury, and garlands of foam arose, and the great ocean opened to its depths, and the waters rushed hither and thither, the furious crests of their waves meeting this way and that ; and the Asuras, and Garuas, and Yakkhas, and Nigas ³ shook with fear, and thought in their alarm : " What now ! How now ! is the great ocean being turned upside down ? "

¹²⁵ and sought, with terrified hearts, for a way of escape. And as the water on which it rests ¹ was troubled and agitated, then the broad earth began to shake, and with it the mountain ranges and the ocean depths, [118] and Sineru began to revolve, and its rocky mountain crest became twisted. And at the trembling of the earth, t¹ye serpents, and mungoosees, and cats, and jackals, and boars, and deer, and birds became greatly distressed, and the Yakkhas of inferior power wept, while those of greater power were merry/

¹²⁶ 'Just, O king, as when a huge and mighty cauldron ² is placed in an oven full of water, and crowded with grains of rice, then the fire burning beneath heats first of all the cauldron, and when that has become hot the water begins to boil, and as the water boils the grains of rice are heated and dive hither and thither in the water, and a mass of bubbles arises, and a garland of foam is formed just so, O king, king Vessantara gave away whatsoever is in the world considered most difficult to bestow, and by reason of the nature of his generosity the great winds beneath were unable to refrain from being agitated throughout, and on the great winds being thrown into confusion the waters were shaken, and on the waters being disturbed the broad earth trembled, and so then the winds and the waters and the earth became all three, as it were, of one accord by the immense and powerful influence that

¹²⁷ IV, 1,40. VESSANTARA. 177 resulted from that mighty giving. And there was never another giving, O king, which had such power as that generosity of the great king Vessantara.

¹²⁸ * And just, O king, as there are many gems of value found in the earth the sapphire, and the great sapphire, and the wish-conferring gem, and the cat's eye, and the flax gem , and the Acacia gem , and the entrancing gem, and the favourite of the sun , and the favourite of the moon , and the crystal, and the ka"opakkamaka , and the topaz, and the ruby, and the Ma sir a stone ⁶ but the glorious gem of the king of kings is acknowledged to be the chief of all these and surpassing all, for the sheen of that jewel, O king, spreads round about for a league on every side T just so, O king, of all the gifts that

¹²⁹ 4 -fiTanda-kanta; and so also in the Sinhalese, These are my thic gems, supposed to be formed out of the rays of the sun and moon respectively, and visible only when they shine.

¹³⁰ On similar lists of gems elsewhere see the JTullavagga IX, i, 3, and my note at pp. 249, 250 of the ' Buddhist Suttas '(vol. xi of the f Sacred Books of the East ').

¹³¹ [353 N have ever been given upon earth, even the greatest and the most unsurpassed, that giving of the good king Vessantara is acknowledged to surpass them all. And it was on the giving of that gift, O king, that the broad earth shook seven times V

¹³² 'A marvellous thing is it, Nagasena, of the Buddhas, and a most wonderful, that the Tathigata even when a Bodisat (in the course of becoming a Buddha) [119] was so unequalled in the world, so mild, so kind, and held before him aims so high, and endeavours so grand. You have made evident, NcLgasena, the might of the Bodisats, a most clear light have you cast upon the perfection of the Conquerors, you have shown how, in the whole world of gods and men, a TatMgata, as he continues the practice of his noble life, is the highest and the best. Well spoken, venerable Ngasena. The doctrine of the Conqueror has been exalted, the perfection of the Conqueror has been glorified, the knot of the arguments of the adversaries has been unravelled, the jar of the theories of the opponents has been broken in pieces, the dilemma so profound has been made clear, the jungle has been turned into open country, the children of the Conqueror have received the desire of their hearts . It is so, as you say, O best of the leaders of schools, and I accept that which you have said ! '

¹³³ [Here ends the dilemma as to the earthquake at Vessantara's gift.] IV, i, 42. KING SIVI. I 79 [KING sivi .] 42. ' Venerable Nagasena, your people say thus : " King Sivi gave his eyes to the man who begged them of him, and when he had thus become blind, new eyes were given to him from heaven V This statement is unpalatable , it lays its speaker open to rebuke, it is faulty. For it is said in the Sutta : " When the cause has been utterly destroyed, when there is no longer any cause, any basis left, then the divine eye cannot arise ." So if he gave his eyes away, the statement that he received new (divine) ones must be false : and if divine eyes arose to him, then the statement that he gave his eyes away must be false. This dilemma too is a double-pointed one, more knotty than a knot, more piercing than an arrow, more confusing than a jungle. It is now put to you. Rouse up in yourself the desire to accomplish the task that is set to you, to the refutation of the adversaries ! '

¹³⁴ N 2 ' King Sivi gave his eyes away, O king. Harbour no doubt on that point. And in stead thereof divine eyes were produced for him. Neither on that point should you harbour doubt/

¹³⁵ c Certainly not, O king/ 43. 'What then, O king? Is there in the world such a thing as Truth, by the asseveration of which true believers can perform the Act of Truth 1 ? 1

¹³⁶ 'Yes, Lord, there is. And by it true believers make the rain to fall, and fire to go out , and ward off the effects of poison, and accomplish many other things they want to do/

¹³⁷ ' Then, great king, that fits the case, that meets it on all fours. It was by the power of Truth that those divine eyes were produced for Sivi the king. By the power of the Truth the divine eye arose when no other cause was present, for the Truth itself was, in that case, the cause of its production. Sup-

¹³⁸ IV, I, 45. KING SIVI. l8l pose, O king, any Siddha (accomplished one 1) on intoning a charm , and saying : " Let a mighty rain now fall ! " were to bring about a heavy rainfall by the intoning of his charm would there in that case be any cause for rain accumulated in the sky by which the rain could be brought about ?'

¹³⁹ ' No, Sir. The charm itself would be the cause/ 'Just so, great king, in the case put. There would be no ordinary cause. The Truth itself would be sufficient reason for the growth of the divine eye ! '

¹⁴⁰ 'Now suppose, O king, a Siddha were to intone a charm, and say : " Now let the mighty blazing, raging mass of fire go back ! " and the moment the charm were repeated it were to retreat would there be any cause laid by which would work that result ? '

¹⁴¹ ordinary cause. The power of the Truth would be sufficient cause in itself! ' 45. c Now suppose, O king, one of those Siddhas were to intone a charm, [121] and were then to say : " Let this malignant poison become as a healing drug!" and the moment the charm were repeated that would be so would there be any cause in reserve for that effect to be produced ?'

¹⁴² ' Certainly not, Sir. The charm itself would cause the warding off of that malignant poison/ ' Just so, great king, without any ordinary cause the Truth itself was, in king Sivi's case, a sufficient reason for the reproduction of his eyes/

¹⁴³ 1 ' One who knows a powerful charm (or perhaps Vedic verse, mantra)/ says Hinai-kumbure\ 46. * Now there is no other cause, O king, for the attainment of the four Noble Truths. It is only by means of an Act of Truth that they are attained. In the land of China, O king, there is a king of China, who when he wants to charm the great ocean, performs at intervals of four months a solemn Act of Truth, and then on his royal chariot drawn by lions, he enters a league's distance into the great ocean. Then in front of the head of his chariot the mighty waves roll back, and when he returns they flow once more over the spot. But could the ocean be so drawn back by the ordinary bodily power of all gods and men combined ? '

¹⁴⁴ ' Sir, even the water in a small tank could not be so made to retire, how much less the waters of the great ocean ! ' ' By this know then the force of Truth. There is no place to which it does not reach/

¹⁴⁵ 'When Asoka the righteous ruler, O king, as he stood one day at the city of P^Haliputta in the midst of the townsfolk and the country people, of his officers and his servants, and his ministers of state, beheld the Ganges river as it rolled along filled up by freshets from the hills, full to the brim and overflowing that mighty stream five hundred leagues in length, and a league in breadth he said to his officers : " Is there any one, my good friends, who is able to make this great Ganges flow backwards and up stream ? "

¹⁴⁶ ' " Nay, Sire, impossible/" said they. ' Now a certain courtesan, Bindumatl by name, was in the crowd there at the river side, [122] and she heard people repeat the question that the king had asked. Then she said to herself: " Here am I, a

¹⁴⁷ IV, I, 47KING SIVI. 183 harlot, in this city of Pi&iliputta, by the sale of my body do I gain my livelihood, I follow the meanest of vocations. Let the king behold the power of an Act of Truth performed even by such as I." And she performed an Act of Truth l . And that moment the mighty Ganges, roaring and raging, rolled back, up stream, in the sight of all the people !

¹⁴⁸ ' Then when the king heard the din and the noise of the movement of the waves of the whirlpools of the mighty Ganges, amazed, and struck with awe and wonder, he said to his officers : " How is this, that the great Ganges is flowing backwards ? "

¹⁴⁹ ' And they told him what had happened. Then filled with emotion the king went himself in haste and asked the courtesan : " Is it true what they say, that it is by your Act of Truth that this Ganges has been forced to flow backwards ? "

¹⁵⁰ ' " Yes, Sire," said she. ' And the king asked : " How have you such power in the matter ? Or who is it who takes your words to heart (and carries them out)? By what authority is -it that you, insignificant as you are , have been able to make this mighty river flow backwards ? "

¹⁵¹ ' And she replied : " It is by the power of Truth, great king." devoid of virtue, under no restraint , sinful, who have overstepped all limits, and are full of transgression, and live on the plunder of fools ? "

¹⁵² ' " It is true, O king, what you say. That is just the kind of creature I am. But even in such a one as I so great is the power of the Act of Truth that I could turn the whole world of gods and men upside down by it."

¹⁵³ ' Then the king said : " What is this Act of Truth ? Come now, let me hear about it." "'Whosoever, O king, gives me gold be he a noble or a brahman or a tradesman or a servant I regard them all alike. When I see he is a noble I make no distinction in his favour. If I know him to be a slave I despise him not. Free alike from fawning and from dislike do I do service to him who has bought me. This, your Majesty, is the basis of the Act of Truth by the force of which I turned the Ganges back." ' "

¹⁵⁴ 'Thus, O king, is it that there is nothing which those who are steadfast to 'the truth may not enjoy. And so king Sivi gave his eyes away to him who begged them of him, [123] and he received eyes from heaven, and that happened by his Act of Truth. But what is said in the Sutta that when the eye of flesh is destroyed, and the cause of it, the basis of it, is removed, then can no divine eye arise, that is only said of the eye, the insight, that arises out of contemplation. And thus, O king, should you take it.'

¹⁵⁵ 'Well said, Nagasena! You have admirably Compare taka II, 114, and the Sutta Vibhanga on P&fcittiya 26. IV, 1,55DURATION OF THE FAITH. 185

¹⁵⁶ solved the dilemma I put to you ; you have rightly explained the point in which I tried to prove you wrong ; you have thoroughly overcome the adversary. The thing is so, and I accept it thus V

¹⁵⁷ [Here ends the dilemma as to king Sivi's Act of Truth.] [THE DILEMMA AS TO CONCEPTION. 49. This dilemma goes into details which can be best consulted in the

¹⁵⁸ [THE DURATION OF THE FAITH.] 55. c Venerable Nagasena, it has been said by the Blessed One : " But now the good law, Ananda, will only stand fast for five hundred years ." But on the other hand the Blessed One declared, just before

¹⁵⁹ 1 This idea of the power of an Act of Truth which Nagasena here relies on is most interesting and curious. The exact time at which it was introduced into Buddhism is as yet unknown. It has not been found in the Pitakas themselves, and is probably an incorporation of an older, pre-Buddhistic, belief. The person carrying it out is supposed to have some goodness, to call that virtue (and perhaps, as in the case of the quail, the goodness of the Buddhas also) to mind, and then to wish something, and that thing, however difficult, and provided there is nothing cruel in it, then comes to pass. It is analogous to the mystic power supposed to reside in names. Childers very properly points out that we have a very remarkable instance of an Act of Truth (though a very un-Buddhistic one) in the Hebrew book of the Kings II. i. 10 : 'And Elijah answered and said to the captain of fifty : " If I be a man of God, then let fire come down from heaven, and consume thee and thy fifty ! " And there came down fire from heaven, and consumed him and his fifty.' A great point, both in this legend and in the story

of the quail, is that the power of nature to be overcome is one looked upon by the Brahmans as divine.

¹⁶⁰ 2 ^Tullavagga X, i, 6, translated in 'Vinaya Texts/ vol. iii,p. 325. his death, in response to the question put by Subhadda the recluse : " But if in this system the brethren live the perfect life, then the world would not be bereft of Arahats 1 /' This last phrase is absolute, inclusive ; it cannot be explained away. If the first of these statements be correct, the second is misleading, if the second be right the first must be false. [131] This too is a double-pointed question, more confused than the jungle, more powerful than a strong man, more knotty than a knot. It is now put to you. Show the extent of the power of your knowledge, like a leviathan in the midst of the sea/

¹⁶¹ ' The Blessed One, O king, did make both those statements you have quoted. But they are different one from the other both in the spirit and in the letter. The one deals with the limit of the duration of the doctrine , the other with the practice of a religious life two things widely distinct, as far removed one from the other as the zenith is from the surface of the earth, as heaven is from purgatory, as good is from evil, and as pleasure is from pain. But though that be so, yet lest your enquiry should be vain, I will expound the matter further in its essential connection/

¹⁶² 'When the Blessed One said that the good law 3 would only endure for five hundred years, he said so declaring the time of its destruction, limiting the remainder of its existence. For he said : " The good law, Ananda, would endure for a thousand years if no women had been admitted to the

¹⁶³ IV, i,58DURATION OF THE FAITH. 187 Order. But now, Ananda, it will only last five hundred years/" But in so saying, O king, did the Blessed One either foretell the disappearance of the good law, or throw blame on the clear understanding thereof?'

¹⁶⁴ * Certainly not, Sir/ ' Just fo. It was a declaration of injury done, an announcement of the limit of what remained. As when a man whose income had been diminished might announce publicly, making sure of what remained : " So much property have I lost ; so much is still left" [132] so did the Blessed One make known to gods and men what remained when he announced what had been lost by saying: "The good law will now, Ananda, endure for five hundred years." In so saying he was fixing a limit to religion. But when in speaking to Subhadda, and by way of proclaiming who were the true Samaras, he said: "But if, in this system, the brethren live the perfect life, then the world would not be bereft of Arahats " in so saying he was declaring in what religion consisted. You have confounded the limitation of a thing with the statement of what it is. But if you like I will tell you what the real connection between the two is. Listen carefully, and attend trustfully to what I say/

¹⁶⁵ ' Suppose, O king, there were a reservoir quite full of fresh cool water, overflowing at the brim, but limited in size and with an embankment running all round it. Now if, when the water had not abated in that tank, a mighty cloud were to rain down rain continually, and in addition, on to the water already in it, would the amount of water in the tank decrease or come to an end?'

¹⁶⁶ ' Certainly not, Sir/ ' But why not, O king ?' ' Because of the continual downpour of the rain/ 1 Just so, O king, is the glorious reservoir of the good law of the teaching of the Conqueror ever full of the clear fresh cool water of the practice of duty and virtue and morality and purity of life, and continues overflowing all limits even to the very highest heaven of heavens. And if the children of the Buddha rain down into it continuously, and in addition, the rainfall of still further practice of duty and virtue and morality and purity of life, then will it endure for long, and the world will not be

bereft of Arahats. This was the meaning of the Master's words when he said : " But if, Subhadda, in this system the brethren continue in perfectness of life, then will the world not be bereft of Arahats." '

¹⁶⁷ ' Now suppose again, O king, that people were to continually supply a mighty fiery furnace with dried cow-dung, and dry sticks, and dry leaves would that fire go out ?'

¹⁶⁸ ' No indeed, Sir. Rather would it blaze more fiercely, and burn more brightly/ 'Just so, O king, does the glorious teaching of the Conqueror blaze and shine over the ten thousand world systems by the practice of duty and virtue and morality and purity of life. And if, O king, in addition to that, the children of the Buddha, devoting themselves to the five 1 kinds of spiritual exertion, continue zealous in effort if cultivating a longing for the threefold discipline, they train themselves therein

¹⁶⁹ IV, r, 6o. DURATION OF THE FAITH. 189 if without ceasing they carry out to the full the conduct that is right, and absolutely avoid all that is wrong, and practise righteousness of life then will this glorious doctrine of the Conqueror stand more and more steadfast as the years roll on, and the world will not be bereft of Arahats. It was in reference to this, O king, that the Master spake when he said : " But if, Subhadda, in this system the brethren continue in perfectness of life, then will the world not be bereft of Arahats." '

¹⁷⁰ ' Again, O king, suppose people were to continually polish with fine soft red powder a stainless mirror that was already bright and shining, well polished, smooth, and glossy, would dirt and dust and mud arise on its surface ?'

¹⁷¹ 1 Just so, O king, is the glorious doctrine of the Conqueror stainless by nature, and altogether free from the dust and dirt of evil. And if the children of the Buddha cleanse it by the virtue arising from the shaking off, the eradication of evil, from the practice of duty and virtue and morality and purity of life, then will this glorious doctrine endure for long, and the world will not be bereft of Arahats. It was in reference to this that the Blessed One spake when lie said : " But if, Subhadda, in this system the brethren continue in righteousness of life, then will not the world be bereft of Arahats." For the teaching of the Master, O king, has its root in conduct, has conduct as its essence, and stands fast so long as conduct does not decline V

¹⁷² 6 1. 'Venerable Nagasena, when you speak of the disappearance of the good law, what do you mean by its disappearance ? '

¹⁷³ ' There are three modes of the disappearance, O king, of a system of doctrine. And what are the three ? The decline of attainment to an intellectual grasp of it, the decline of conduct in accordance with it, and the decline of its outward form l . [134] When the attainment of it ceases, then even the man who conducts himself aright in it has no clear understanding of it. By the decline of conduct the promulgation of the rules of discipline ceases, only the outward form of the religion remains. When the outward form has ceased, the succession of the tradition is cut off. These are the three forms of the disappearance of a system of doctrine/

¹⁷⁴ ' You have well explained, venerable Nagasena, this dilemma so profound, and have made it plain. You have loosed the knot ; you have destroyed the arguments of the adversary, broken them in pieces, proved them wrong you, O best of the leaders of schools ! '

¹⁷⁵ [Here ends the dilemma as to the duration of the faith.] [THE BUDDHA'S SINLESSNESS.] 62. ' Venerable Nagasena, had the Blessed One, when he became a Buddha, burnt out all evil in himself, or was there still some evil remaining in him?'

¹⁷⁶ IV, 1,63. KARMA. ' He had burnt out all evil. There was none left/ ' But how, Sir ? Did not the Tathigata get hurt in his body ? '

¹⁷⁷ ' Yes, O king. At Raf agaha a splinter of rock pierced his foot *, and once he suffered from dysentery , and once when the humours of his body were disturbed a purge was administered to him , and once when he was troubled with wind the Elder who waited on him (that is Ananda) gave him hot water V

¹⁷⁸ ' Then, Sir, if the Tathigata, on his becoming a Buddha, has destroyed all evil in himself this other statement that his foot was pierced by a splinter, that he had dysentery, and so on, must be false. But if they are true, then he cannot have been free from evil, for there is no pain without Karma. All pain has its root in Karma, it is on account of Karma that suffering arises . This double-headed dilemma is put to you, and you have to solve it/

¹⁷⁹ ' No, O king. It is not all suffering that has its root in Karma. There are eight causes by which sufferings arise, by which many beings suffer pain. And what are the eight ? Superabundance of wind, [135] and of bile, and of phlegm, the union of these humours, variations in temperature, the avoiding of

¹⁸⁰ dissimilarities, external agency, and Karma. From each of these there are some sufferings that arise, and these are the eight causes by which many beings suffer pain. And therein whosoever maintains that it is Karma that injures beings, and besides it there is no other reason for pain, his proposition is false/

¹⁸¹ ' But, Sir, all the other seven kinds of pain have each of them also Karma as its origin, for they are all produced by Karma/

¹⁸² * If, O king, all diseases were really derived from Karma then there would be no characteristic marks by which they could be distinguished one from the other. When the wind is disturbed, it is so in one or other of ten ways by cold, or by heat, or by hunger, or by thirst, or by over eating, or by standing too long, or by over exertion, or by walking too fast, or by medical treatment, or as the result of Karma. Of these ten, nine do not act in a past life or in a future life, but in one's present existence. Therefore it is not right to say that all pain is due to Karma. When the bile, O king, is deranged it is so in one or other of three ways by cold, or by heat, or by improper food. When the phlegm is disturbed it is so by cold, or by heat, or by food and drink. When either of these three humours are disturbed or mixed, it brings about its own special, distinctive pain. Then there are the special pains arising from variations in temperature, avoidance of dissimilarities, and external agency . And there is the act that has Karma as its fruit, and the pain so brought about arising from the act done. So what

¹⁸³ IV, i, 6. KARMA. 193 arises as the fruit of Karma is much less than that which arises from other causes. And the ignorant go too far [136] when they say that every pain is produced as the fruit of Karma. No one without a Buddha's insight can fix the extent of the action of Karma.'

¹⁸⁴ ' Now when the Blessed One's foot was torn by a splinter of rock, the pain that followed was not produced by any other of the eight causes I have mentioned, but only by external agency. For Devadatta, O king, had harboured hatred against the Tathclgata during a succession of hundreds of thousands of births . It was in his hatred that he seized hold of a mighty mass of rock, and pushed it over with the hope that it would fall upon his head. But two other rocks came together, and

intercepted it before it had reached the Tathigata ; and by the force of their impact a splinter was torn off, and fell upon the Blessed One's foot, and made it bleed. Now this pain must have been produced in the Blessed One either as the result of his own Karma, or of some one else's act. For beyond these two there can be no other kind of pain. It is as when a seed does not germinate that must be due either to the badness of the soil, or to a defect in the seed. Or it is as when food is not digested that must be due either to a defect in the stomach, or to the badness of the food/

¹⁸⁵ 'But although the Blessed One never suffered pain which was the result of his own Karma, or brought about the avoidance of dissimilarity , yet

¹⁸⁶ O he suffered pain from each of the other six causes. And by the pain he could suffer it was not possible to deprive him of life. There come to this body of ours, O king, compounded of the four elements , sensations desirable and the reverse, pleasant and unpleasant. Suppose, O king, a clod of earth were to be thrown into the air, and to fall again on to the ground. Would it be in consequence of any act it had previously done that it would so fall ? '

¹⁸⁷ ' No, Sir. There is no reason in the broad earth by which it could experience the result of an act either good or evil. It would be by reason of a present cause [137] independent of Karma that the clod would fall to earth again/

¹⁸⁸ ' Well, O king, the Tathgata should be regarded as the broad earth. And as the clod would fall on it irrespective of any act done by it, so also was it irrespective of any act done by him that that splinter of rock fell upon his foot/

¹⁸⁹ ' Again, O king, men tear up and plough the earth. But is that a result of any act previously done ?
' ' Certainly not, Sir/

¹⁹⁰ 'Just so with the falling of that splinter. And the dysentery which attacked him was in the same way the result of no previous act, it arose from the union of the three humours. And whatsoever bodily disease fell upon him, that had its origin, not in Karma, but in one or other of the six causes referred to. For it has been said, O king, by the Blessed One, by him who is above all gods, in the glorious collection called the Sayutta Nik&y&a in

¹⁹¹ TV, i, 66. KARMA. 195 the prose Sutta, called after Moliya Slvaka : " There are certain pains which arise in the world, Sivaka, from bilious humour. And you ought to know for a certainty which those are, for it is a matter of common knowledge in the world which they are. But those Samaras and Brahmans, Slvaka, who are of the opinion and proclaim the view that whatsoever pleasure, or pain, or indifferent sensation, any man experiences, is always due to a previous act they go beyond certainty, they go beyond knowledge, and therein do I say they are wrong. And so also of those pains which arise from the phlegmatic humour, or from the windy humour, or from the union of the three, or from variation in temperature, or from avoidance of dissimilarity, [138] or from external action, or as the result of Karma. In each case you should know for a certainty which those are, for it is a matter of common knowledge which they are. But those Samaras or Brahmans who are of the opinion or the view that whatsoever pleasure, or pain, or indifferent sensation, any man may experience, that is always due to a previous act they go beyond certainty, they go beyond common knowledge. And therein do I say they are wrong." Fo, O king, it is not all pain that is the result of Karma. And you should accept as a fact that when the Blessed One became a Buddha he had burnt out all evil from within him/

¹⁹² 'Very good, Nagasena ! It is so ; and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the dilemma as to the Buddha's sinlessness] o 2

¹⁹³ [ON THE ADVANTAGES OF MEDITATION 1 .] 67. 'Venerable Nagasena, your people say that everything which a Tathigata has to accomplish that had the Blessed One already carried out when he sat at the foot of the Tree of Wisdom . There was then nothing that he had yet to do, nothing that he had to add to what he had already done. But then there is also talk of his having immediately afterwards remained plunged for three months in ecstatic contemplation . If the first statement be correct, then the second must be false. And if the second be right, then the first must be wrong. There is no need of any contemplation to him who has already accomplished his task. It is the man who still has something left to do, who has to think about it. [139] It is the sick man who has need of medicine, not the healthy ; the hungry man who has need of food, not the man whose hunger is quenched. This too is a double-headed dilemma, and you have to solve it ! '

¹⁹⁴ ' Both statements, O king, are true. Con- IV, 1,69. MEDITATION. 197 temptation has many virtues. All the Tathagatas attained, in contemplation, to Buddhahood, and practised it in the recollection of its good qualities. And they did so in the same way as a man who had received high office from a king would, in the recollection of its advantages, of the prosperity he enjoyed by means of it, remain constantly in attendance on that king in the same way as a man who, having been afflicted and pained with a dire disease, and having recovered his health by the use of medicine, would use the same medicine again and again, calling to mind its virtue.'

¹⁹⁵ * And there are, O king, these twenty and eight good qualities of meditation in the perception of which the Tathigatas devoted themselves to it. And which are they? Meditation preserves him who meditates, it gives him long life, and endows him with power, it cleanses him from faults, it removes from him any bad reputation giving him a good name, it destroys discontent in him filling him with content, it releases him from all fear endowing him with confidence, it removes sloth far from him filling him with zeal, it takes away lust and ill-will and dullness, it puts an end to pride, it breaks down all doubt, it makes his heart to be at peace, it softens his mind, [140] it makes him glad, it makes him grave, it gains him much advantage, it makes him worthy of reverence, it fills him with joy, it fills him with delight, it shows him the transitory nature of all compounded things, it puts an end to rebirth, it obtains for him all the benefits of renunciation. These, O king, are the twenty and eight virtues of meditation on the perception of which the Tathigatas devote themselves to it. But it is because

¹⁹⁶ the Tathigatas, O king, long for the enjoyment of the bliss of attainment, of the joy of the tranquil state of Nirvāṇa, that they devote themselves to meditation, with their minds fixed on the end they aim at.

¹⁹⁷ ' And there are four reasons for which the Tathigatas, O king, devote themselves to meditation. And what are the four ? That they may dwell at ease, O king and on account of the abundance of the advantages of meditation, advantages without drawback and on account of its being the road to all noble things without exception and because it has been praised and lauded and exalted and magnified by all the Buddhas. These are the reasons for which the Tathigatas devote themselves to it. So it is not, great king, because they have anything left to do, or anything to add to what they have already accomplished, but because they have perceived how diversified are the advantages it possesses, that they devote themselves to meditation.'

¹⁹⁸ ' Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the dilemma as to meditation.] [THE LIMIT OF THREE MONTHS.]

¹⁹⁹ 'Venerable Nagasena, it has been said by the Blessed One: " The Tathagata, Ananda, has thought out and thoroughly practised, developed, accumulated, and ascended to the very height of the four paths to saintship , and so mastered them as to be able to use them as a means of mental advancement, and as a basis for edification and he therefore, Ananda,

²⁰⁰ iddhi-pddl IV, I, 72. THE THREE MONTHS. should he desire it, might remain alive for a Kalpa, or for that portion of a Kalpa which has yet to run ." And again he said : " At the end of three months from this time the Tathagata will die ." If the first of these statements were true, then the limit of three months must have been false. If the second were true, [141] then the first must have been false. For the Tathagatas boast not without an occasion, the Blessed Buddhas speak no misleading words, but they utter truth, and speak sincerely. This too is a double-headed dilemma, profound, subtle, hard to expound. It is now put to you. Tear in sunder this net of heresy, put it on one side, break in pieces the arguments of the adversary ! '

²⁰¹ ' Both these statements, O king, were made by the Blessed One. But Kalpa in that connection means the duration of a man's life. And the Blessed One, O king, was not exalting his own power when he said so, but he was exalting the power of saintship. It was as if a king were possessed of a horse most swift of foot, who could run like the wind. And in order to exalt the power of his speed the king were to say in the presence of all his court townsfolk and country folk, hired servants and men of war, brahmins, nobles, and officers : " If he wished it this noble steed of mine could cross the earth to its ocean boundary, and be back here again, in a moment 3 ! "

²⁰² Now though he did not try to test the horse's speed in the presence of the court, yet it had that speed, and was really able to go along over the earth to its ocean boundary in a moment. Just so, O king, the Blessed One spake as he did in praise of the power of saintship, and so spake seated in the midst of gods and men, and of the men of the threefold wisdom and the sixfold insight the Arahats pure and free from stain when he said : " The Tathagata, Ananda, has thought out and practised, developed, accumulated, and ascended to the very height of the four powers of saintship, and so mastered them as to be able to use them as a means of mental advancement, as a basis for edification. And he therefore, Ananda, should he desire it, might remain alive for a Kalpa, or the part of a Kalpa that has yet to run/" And there was that power, O king, in the Tathigata, he could have remained alive for that time : and yet he did not show that power in the midst [142] of that assembly. The Blessed One, O king, is free from desire as respects all conditions of future life, and has condemned them all. For it has been said, O king, by the Blessed One : " Just, O Bhikkhus, as a very small quantity of excrement is of evil smell, so do I find no beauty in the very smallest degree of future life, not even in such for the time of the snapping of the fingers ." Now would the Blessed One, O king, who thus looked upon all sorts and conditions of future life

²⁰³ morning meal, to the royal city of Kus&vat!.' It is, of course, the sun horse which is meant. IV, I, 72. THE THREE MONTHS. 201

²⁰⁴ as dung have nevertheless, simply because of his power of Iddhi, harboured a craving desire for future life ? ' ' Very good, Nagasena ! It is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the dilemma as to the three months.] Here ends the First Chapter.

[THE ABOLITION OF REGULATIONS.]

¹ * Venerable Nagasena, it has been said by the Blessed One : " It is by insight, O Bhikkhus, that I preach the law, not without insight 1 /' On the other hand he said of the regulations of the Vinaya : "When I am gone, Ananda, let the Order, if it should so wish, abolish all the lesser and minor precepts V ; Were then these lesser and minor precepts wrongly laid down, or established in ignorance and without due cause, that the Blessed One allowed them to be revoked after his death ? If the first statement had been true, the second would have been wrong. If the second statement were really made, [143] then the first was false. This too is a double-headed problem, fine, subtle, abstruse, deep, profound, and hard to expound. It is now put to you, and you have to solve it/

² ' In both cases, O king, the Blessed One said as you have declared. But in the second case it was to test the Bhikkhus that he said it, to try whether, if leave were granted them, they would, after his death, revoke the lesser and minor regulations, or still adhere to them. It runs as if a

³ IV, 2, 3. ABOLITION OF REGULATIONS. 203 king of kings were to say to his sons : " This great country, my children, reaches to the sea on every side. It is a hard thing to maintain it with the forces we have at our disposal. So when I am gone you had better, my children, abandon the outlying districts along the border." Now would the princes, O king, on the death of their father, give up those outlying districts, provinces already in their power ? '

⁴ c No indeed, Sir. Kings are grasping. The princes might, in the lust of power, subjugate an extent of country twice or thrice the size of what they had, but they would never give up what they already possessed/

⁵ ' Venerable Nagasena, when the Blessed One referred to " lesser and minor precepts," this people might therein [144] be bewildered, and fall into doubt, and find matter for discussion, and be lost in hesitation, as to which were the lesser, and which the minor precepts/

⁶ * The lesser errors in conduct , O king, are the lesser precepts, and the lesser errors in speech 3 are the minor precepts : and these two together make up therefore " the lesser and minor precepts/' The

⁷ leading Elders too of old, O king, were in doubt about this matter, and they were not unanimous on the point at the Council held for the fixing of the text of the Scriptures 1 . And the Blessed One foresaw that this problem would arise/

⁸ * Then this dark saying of the Conquerors, Ndasena, which has lain hid so long, has been now to-day uncovered in the face of the world, and made clear to all/

⁹ [Here ends the problem as to the revocation of rules.] [ESOTERIC TEACHING.] 4. ' Venerable Nagasena, it was said by the Blessed One : " In respect of the truths, Ananda, the TatMgata has no such thing as the closed fist of a teacher who keeps something back 2 /' But on the other hand he made no reply to the question put by the son of the Malunkya woman . This problem, Nagasena, will be one of two ends, on one of which it must rest, for he must have refrained from answering either out of ignorance, or out of wish to conceal something. If the first statement be true it must have been out of ignorance. But

¹⁰ IV, 2, g. ESOTERIC TEACHING. 2 05 if he knew, and still did not reply, then the first statement must be false. This too is a doublepointed dilemma. It is now put to you, and you have to solve it/

¹¹ 'The Blessed One, O king, made that first statement to Ananda, and he did not reply to Milunkya-puttas question. But that was neither out of ignorance, nor for the sake of concealing anything. There are four kinds of ways in which a problem may be explained. And which are the four ? There is the problem to which an explanation can be given that shall be direct and final. There is the problem which can be answered by going into details. There is the problem which can be answered by asking another. And there is the problem which can be put on one side.

¹² e And which, O king, is the problem to which a direct and final solution can be given ? It is such as this " Is form impermanent ? " [145] " Is sensation impermanent?" "Is idea impermanent?" " Are the Confections impermanent ? " " Is consciousness impermanent ? "

¹³ 'And which is the problem which can be answered by asking another ? It is such as this "What then? Can the eye perceive all things?"

¹⁴ ' And which is the problem which can be put on one side ? It is such as this " Is the universe everlasting ? " " Is it not everlasting ? " " Has it an end ? " " Has it no end ? " " Is it both endless and unending ? " " Is it neither the one nor the other ? " " Are the soul and the body the same

¹⁵ thing ? " " Is the soul distinct from the body ? " " Does a Tathdgata exist after death ? " " Does he not exist after death ? " " Does he both exist and not exist after death ? " " Does he neither exist nor not exist after death ? "

¹⁶ * Now it was to such a question, one that ought to be put on one side, that the Blessed One gave no reply to Milunkyi-putta. And why ought such a question to be put on one side ? Because there is no reason or object for answering it. That is why it should be put aside. For the Blessed Buddhas lift not up their voice without a reason and without an object/

¹⁷ * Very good, Nclgasena ! Thus it is, and I accept it as you say ? ' [Here ends the dilemma as to keeping some things back *.]

¹⁸ [DEATH.] 6. ' Venerable Nagasena, this too was said by the Blessed One : " All men tremble at punishment, all are afraid of death ." But again he said : " The Arahata has passed beyond all fear 3 / 7 How then, Nagasena ? does the Arahata tremble with the fear of punishment ? [146] Or are the beings in purgatory, when they are being burnt and boiled and scorched and tormented, afraid of that death which would release them from the burning fiery pit of that awful place of woe 4 ? If the Blessed One, Nagasena,

¹⁹ IV, 2, 7. THE FEAR OF DEATH. 207 really said that all men tremble at punishment, and all are afraid of death, then the statement that the Arahata has passed beyond fear must be false. But if that last statement is really by him, then the other must be false. This double-headed problem is now put to you, and you have to solve it.'

²⁰ ' It was not with regard to Arahats, O king, that the Blessed One spake when he said : " All men tremble at punishment, all are afraid of death." The Arahata is an exception to that statement, for all cause for fear has been removed from the Arahata \ He spoke of those beings in whom evil still existed, who are still infatuated with the delusion of self, who are still lifted up and cast down by pleasures and pains. To the Arahata, O king, rebirth in every state has been cut off, all the four kinds of future existence have been destroyed, every re-incarnation has been put an end to, the rafters 2 of the house of life have broken, and the whole house completely pulled down, the Confections have altogether lost their roots, good and evil have ceased, ignorance has been demolished, consciousness

has no longer any seed (from which it could be renewed), all sin has been burnt away , and all worldly conditions have been overcome . Therefore is it that the Arahant is not made to tremble by any fear/

²¹ being in Niraya (often translated 'hell') when he will pass away from it. * Eight are meant gain, loss, fame, dishonour, praise, blame, pleasures, pains.

²² 'Suppose, O king, a king had four chief ministers, faithful, famous, trustworthy, placed in high positions of authority. And the king, on some emergency arising, were to issue to them an order touching all the people in his realm, saying : " Let all now pay up a tax, and do you, as my four officers, carry out what is necessary in this emergency." Now tell me, O king, would the tremor which comes from fear of taxation arise in the hearts of those ministers ? '

²³ ' No, Sir, it would not/ ' But why not ? ' * They have been appointed by the king to high office. Taxation does not affect them, they are beyond taxation. It was the rest that the king referred to when he gave the order : [147] " Let all pay tax." '

²⁴ 'Just so, O king, is it with the statement that all men tremble at punishment, all are afraid of death. In that way is it that the Arahant is removed from every fear/

²⁵ c But, Nagasena, the word " all " is inclusive, none are left out when it is used. Give me a further reason to establish the point/

²⁶ ' Suppose, O king, that in some village the lord of the village were to order the crier, saying : *' Go, crier, bring all the villagers quickly together before me." And he in obedience to that order were to stand in the midst of the village and were thrice to call out : " Let all the villagers assemble at once in the presence of the lord ! " And they should assemble in haste, and have an announcement made to the lord, saying : " All the villagers, Sire, have assembled. Do now whatsoever you require." Now when the lord, O king, is thus summoning all the heads of

²⁷ IY, 2, 10. THE FEAR OF DEATH. 20Q houses, he issues his order to all the villagers, but it is not they who assemble in obedience to the order ; it is the heads of houses. And the lord is satisfied therewith, knowing that such is the number of his villagers. There are many others who do not come women and men, slave girls and slaves, hired workmen, servants, peasantry, sick people, oxen, buffaloes, sheep, and goats, and dogs but all those do not count It was with reference to the heads of houses that the order was issued in the words : " Let all assemble." Just so, O king, it is not of Arahants that it was said that all are afraid of death. [148] The Arahant is not included in that statement, for the Arahant is one in whom there is no longer any cause that could give rise to fear/

²⁸ i o. (There is the non-inclusive expression, O king, whose meaning is non-inclusive, and the non-inclusive expression whose meaning is inclusive ; there is the inclusive expression whose meaning is non-inclusive, and the inclusive expression whose meaning is inclusive. And the meaning-, in each case, should be accepted accordingly. And there are five ways in which the meaning should be ascertained by the connection, and by taste, and by the tradition of the teachers, and by the meaning, and by abundance of reasons. And herein " connection " means the meaning as seen in the Sutta itself, " taste " means that it is in accordance with other Suttas, "the tradition of the teachers" means what they hold, *' the meaning " means what they think, and " abundance of reasons " means all these four combined . '

²⁹ p ii. 'Very well, Ngasena ! I accept it as you say. The Arahāt is an exception in this phrase, and it is the rest of beings who are full of fear. But those beings in purgatory, of whom I spoke, who are suffering painful, sharp, and severe agonies, who are tormented with burnings all over their bodies and limbs, whose mouths are full of lamentation, and cries for pity, and cries of weeping and wailing and woe, who are overcome with pains too sharp to be borne, who find no refuge nor protection nor help, who are afflicted beyond measure, who in the worst and lowest of conditions are still destined to a certainty to further pain, who are being burnt with hot, sharp, fierce, and cruel flames, who are giving utterance to mighty shouts and groans born of horror and fear, who are embraced by the garlands of flame which intertwine around them from all the six directions, and flash in fiery speed through a hundred leagues on every side can those poor burning wretches be afraid of death ?'

³⁰ * Yes, they can/ ' But, venerable Nagasena, is not purgatory a place of certain pain ? And, if so, why should the beings in it be afraid of death, which would release them from that certain pain ? What ! Are they fond of purgatory ? '

³¹ ' No, indeed. They like it not They long to be released from it. It is the power of death of which they are afraid/ Now this, Nagasena, I cannot believe, that they, who want to be released, should be afraid of rebirth.

³² found elsewhere (see jSullavagga VI, 4, 3, and my note there) as the name of a land of chair. And there is ? : milar ambiguity in the other words.

³³ IV, 2, 13 THE FEAR OF DEATH. 2 1 I [149] They must surely, Nagasena, rejoice at the prospect of the very condition that they long for. Convince me by some further reason V

³⁴ ' Death, great king, is a condition which those who have not seen the truth 2 are afraid of. About it this people is anxious and full of dread. Whosoever is afraid of a black snake, or an elephant or lion or tiger or leopard or bear or hyena or wild buffalo or gayal, or of fire or water, or of thorns or spikes or arrows, it is in each case of death that he is really in dread, and therefore afraid of them. This, O king, is the majesty of the essential nature of death. And all being not free from sin are in dread and quake before its majesty. In this sense it is that even the beings in purgatory, who long to be released from it, are afraid of Cath/

³⁵ * Suppose, O king, a boil were to arise, full of matter, on a man's body, and he, in pain from that disease, and wanting to escape from the danger of it, were to call in a physician and surgeon. And the surgeon, accepting the call, were to make ready some means or other for the removal of his disease were to have a lancet sharpened, or to have sticks put into the fire to be used as cauterisers, or to have something ground on a grindstone to be mixed in a salt lotion. Now would the patient begin to be in dread of the cutting of the sharp lancet, or of the burning of the pair of caustic sticks, or of the application of the stinging lotion ? '

³⁶ ' Yes, he would/ P 2 14. 'And suppose, O king, a man who had committed an offence against the crown, when bound with a chain, and cast into a dungeon, were to long for release. And the ruler, wishing to release him, were to send for him. Now would not that man, who had thus offended, and knew it, be in dread [150] of the interview with the king ?'

³⁷ ' Yes, Sir/ ' But if so, then can also the beings in purgatory, though they long to be released from it, yet be afraid of death/

³⁸ c Give me another illustration by which I may be able to harmonise l (this apparent discrepancy)/ ' Suppose, O king, a man bitten by a poisonous snake should be afraid, and by the action of the poison should fall and struggle, and roll this way and that. And then that another man, by the repetition of a powerful charm, should compel that poisonous snake to approach to suck the poison back again . Now when the bitten man saw the poisonous snake coming to him, though for the object of curing him, would he not still be in dread of it ?'

³⁹ ' Yes, Sir/ ' Well, it is just so with the beings in purgatory. IV, 2, I g. ' PIRIT. 213 Death is a thing disliked by all beings. And therefore are they in dread of it though they want to be released from purgatory/

⁴⁰ ' Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say.' [Here ends the dilemma as to the fear of death.] [PIRIT.]

⁴¹ 'Venerable Nagasena, it was said by the Blessed One : " Not in the sky, not in the ocean's midst, Not in the most secluded mountain cleft, Not in the whole wide world is found the spot Where standing one could 'scape the snare of

⁴² death 1 / But on the other hand the Pirit service was promulgated by the Blessed One 2 that is to say, the Ratana Sutta and the Khanda-parittsI and the Moraparitta and the Dharagga-paritti [151] and the An&iya-paritt and the Anguli-mala-parittL If, Nagasena, a man can escape death's snare neither by going to heaven, nor by going into the midst of the sea, nor by going to the summits of lofty palaces,

⁴³ nor to the caves or grottoes or declivities or clefts or holes in the mountains, then is the Pirit ceremony useless. But if by it there is a way of escape from death, then the statement in the verse I quoted is false. This too is a double-headed problem, more knotty than a knot. It is now put to you, and you have to solve it.'

⁴⁴ 1 6. ' The Blessed One, O king, said the verse you have quoted, and he sanctioned Pirit . But that is only meant for those who have some portion of their life yet to run, who are of full age, and restrain themselves from the evils of Karma. And there is no ceremony or artificial means 2 for prolonging the life of one whose allotted span of existence has come to an end. Just, O king, as with a dry and dead log of wood, dull , and sapless, out of which all life has departed, which has reached the end of its allotted period of life, you might have thousands of pots of water poured over it, but it would never become fresh again or put forth sprouts or leaves. Just so there is no ceremony or artificial means, no medicine and no Pirit, which can prolong the life of one whose allotted period has come to an end. All the medicines in the world are useless, O king, to such a one, but Pirit is a protection and assistance to those who have a period yet to live, who are full of life, and restrain themselves from the evil of Karma. And it is for that use that Pirit was appointed by the

⁴⁵ IV, 2, 17. PIRIT. 215 Blessed One. Just, O king, as a husbandman guards the grain when it is ripe and dead and ready for harvesting from the influx of water, but makes it grow by giving it water when it is young, and dark in colour like a cloud, and full of life just so, O king, should the Pirit ceremony be put aside and neglected in the case of one who has reached his allotted term of life, [152] but for those who have a period yet to run and are full of vigour, for them the medicine of Pirit may be repeated, and they will profit by its use/

⁴⁶ 1 7. * But, Nagasena, if he who has a term of life yet to run will live, and he who has none will die, then medicine and Pirit are alike useless/

⁴⁷ ' Have you ever seen, O king, a case of a disease being turned back by medicine ? ' ' Yes, several hundred times/ ' Then, O king, your statement as to the inefficiency of Pirit and medicine must be wrong/

⁴⁸ ' I have seen, Nagasena, doctors administer medicines by way of draughts or outward applications, and by that means the disease has been assuaged/

⁴⁹ 'And when, O king, the voice of those who are repeating Pirit is heard, the tongue may be dried up, and the heart beat but faintly, and the throat be hoarse, but by that repetition all diseases are allayed, all calamities depart. Again, have you ever seen, O king, a man who has been bitten by a snake having the poison resorbed under a spell (by the snake who gave the bite 1) or destroyed (by an antidote) or having a lotion applied above or below the spot 2 ?'

⁵⁰ s, that is common custom to this day in the world/ * Then what you said that Pirit and medicine are alike useless is wrong. And when Pirit has been said over a man, a snake, ready to bite, will not bite him, but close his jaws the club which robbers hold aloft to strike him with will never strike ; they will let it drop, and treat him kindly the enraged elephant rushing at him will suddenly stop the burning fiery conflagration surging towards him will die out the malignant poison he has eaten will become harmless, and turn to food assassins who have come to slay him will become as the slaves who wait upon him and the trap into which he has trodden will hold him not

⁵¹ 1 8. 4 Again, have you never heard, O king, of that hunter who during seven hundred years failed to throw his net over the peacock who had taken Pirit, but snared him the very day [153] he omitted to do so 1 ?'

⁵² * Yes, I have heard of it. The fame of it has gone through all the world/ 'Then what you said about Pirit and medicine being alike useless must be wrong. And have you never heard of the Dinava 2 who, to guard his wife,

⁵³ of the Pali Text Society' for 1884, p. 87. ffinakumbure\ p. 191, translates as follows: MaM raneni, wisha windsa karanniwu mantra padayakin wishaya baswana laddwft, wisha sanhinduwana ladd&wfl 9 ftrddhdho bhgayehi awushadha ^alayen temana laddwu, nayaku wisin dasa karana laddawfi kisiwek topa wisin dahn& ladde doeyi wiMla seka.

⁵⁴ IV, 2, ip. PIRIT. 217 put her into a box, and swallowing it, carried her about in his stomach. And how a Vidyadhara 1 entered his mouth, and played games with his wife. And how the Dnava when he became aware of it, vomited up the box, and opened it, and the moment he did so the Vidyadhara escaped whither he would 2 ? '

⁵⁵ ' Yes, I have heard that. The fame of it too has gone throughout the world/ ' Well, did not the Vidy&dhara escape capture by the power of Pirit ?'

⁵⁶ ' Yes, that was so/ ' Then there must be power in Pirit And have you heard of that other Vidyidhara who got into the harem of the king of Benares, and committed adultery with the chief queen, and was caught, and then became invisible, and got away 3 ?'

⁵⁷ ' Yes, I heard that story/ ' Well, did not he too escape capture by the power of Pirit?' 'Yes, Sir/ * Then, O king, there must be power in Pirit/

⁵⁸ 'Venerable Nagasena, is Pirit a protection to everybody ? ' a I don't know where this story comes from. It is not in the Pitakas anywhere. But Hinai-kumbur gives the fairy tale at full length, and in the course of it calls the Vidy&dharas by name Wiyassa-putra, ' Son of the Wind/ He quotes also a gdth which he places, not in the mouth of the Bodisat, but of Buddha himself. I cannot find the tale either in the Gatakabook, as far as published by Professor Fausboll, or in the KatM Sarit Sgara, though I have looked all through both.

⁵⁹ * Then it is not always of use ? ' * Does food keep all people alive ? ' * Only some, not others/ 4 But why not ? ' ' Inasmuch as some, eating too much of that same food, die of cholera/

⁶⁰ ' There are two reasons which make it destroy life over-indulgence in it, and weakness of digestion. And even life-giving food may be made poisonous by an evil spell/

⁶¹ 1 Just so, O king, is Pirit a protection to some and not to others. And there are three reasons [154] for its failure the obstruction of Karma, and of sin, and of unbelief. That Pirit which is a protection to beings loses its protecting power by acts done by those beings themselves. Just, O king, as a mother lovingly nourishes the son who has entered her womb, and brings him forth with care \ And after his birth she keeps him clean from dirt and stains and mucus, and anoints him with the best and most costly perfumes, and when others abuse or strike him she seizes them and, full of excitement, drags them before the lord of the place. But when her son is naughty, or comes in late, she strikes him with rods or clubs on her knee or with her hands. Now, that being so, would she get seized and dragged along, and have to appear before the lord ? '

⁶² ' No, Sir/ * But why not ? ' IV, 2,21. MARA. 2ig 'Just in the same way, O king, will Pirit which is a protection to beings, yet, by their own fault, turn against them/

⁶³ * Very good, Nagasena ! The problem has been solved, the jungle made clear, the darkness made light, the net of heresy unravelled and by you, O best of the leaders of schools !'

⁶⁴ [Here ends the dilemma as to Pirit] [M!RA, THE EVIL ONE.] 20. * Venerable Ngasena, your people say thus : " The Tathigata was in the constant receipt of the things necessary for a recluse robes, food, lodging, and the requisites for the sick/* And again they say : " When the Tathagata entered the Brahman village called the Five Sdla trees he received nothing, and had to return with his bowl as clean as before/" If the first passage is true the second is false, and if the second passage is true [155] the first is false. This too is a double-headed problem, a mighty crux hard to unravel. It is now put to you. It is for you to solve it/

⁶⁵ 'Both statements are true, but when he received nothing that day, that was the work of Mira, the evil one/ ' Then, Nagasena, how was it that the merit laid up by the Blessed One through countless aeons of time came to end that day ? How was it that Mira, who had only just been produced, could overcome the strength and influence of that merit ? In that case, Nagasena, the blame must fall in one of two

⁶⁶ ways either demerit must be more powerful than merit, or the power of Mira be greater than that of the Buddha. The root of the tree must be heavier than the top of it, or the sinner stronger than he who has heaped up virtue/

⁶⁷ * Great king, that is not enough to prove either the one or the other of your alternatives. Still a reason is certainly desirable in this matter. Suppose, O king, a man were to bring a complimentary present to a king of kings honey or honeycomb or something of that kind. And the king's doorkeeper

were to say to him : " This is the wrong time for visiting the king. Fo, my good fellow, take your present as quickly as ever you can, and go back before the king inflicts a fine upon you." And then that man, in dread and awe, should pick up his present, and return in great haste. Now would the king of kings, merely from the fact that the man brought his gift at the wrong time, be less powerful than the doorkeeper, or never receive a complimentary present any more?"

⁶⁸ * No, Sir. The doorkeeper turned back the giver of that present out of the surliness of his nature, and one a hundred thousand times as valuable [156] might be brought in by some other device/

⁶⁹ e Just so, O king, it was out of the jealousy of his nature that Mira, the evil one, possessed the Brahmins and householders at the Five Sila trees. And hundreds of thousands of other deities came up to offer the Buddha the strength-giving ambrosia from heaven, and stood reverencing him with clasped hands and thinking to themselves that they would thus imbue him with vigour/

⁷⁰ * That may be so, Nagasena. The Blessed IV, 2, 2g. MARA. 221 One found it easy to get the four requisites of a recluse he, the best in the world and at the request of gods and men he enjoyed all the requisites. But still Mara's intention to stop the supply of food to the Blessed One was so far carried out Herein, Sir, my doubt is not removed. I am still in perplexity and hesitation about this. My mind is not clear how the Tathagata, the Arahata, the supreme Buddha, the best of all the best in the world of gods and men, he who had so glorious a treasure of the merit of virtue, the unequalled one, unrivalled and peerless, how so vile, mean, insignificant, sinful, and ignoble a being as Mira could put any obstacle in the way of gifts to Him/

⁷¹ ' There are four kinds, O king, of obstacles the obstacle to a gift not intended for any particular person, to a gift set apart for some one, to the gift got ready, and to the enjoyment of a gift. And the first is when any one puts an obstacle in the way of the actual gift of a thing put ready to be given away, but not with a view to or having seen any particular donee, an obstacle raised, for instance, by saying : " What is the good of giving it away to any one else ? " The second is when any one puts an obstacle in the way of the actual gift of food intended to be prepared to be given to a person specified. The third is when any one puts an obstacle in the way when such a gift has been got ready, but not yet accepted. And the fourth is when any one puts an obstacle in the way of the enjoyment of a gift already given (and so the property of the donee) /

⁷² ' Now when Mira, the evil one, possessed the Brahmins and householders at the Five Sila trees, the food in that case was neither the property of, nor got ready for, nor intended to be prepared specially for the Blessed One. [157] The obstacle was put in the way of some one who was yet to come, who had not arrived, and for whom no gift was intended. That was not against the Blessed One alone. But all who had gone out that day, and were coming to the village, failed to receive an alms. I know no one, O king, in the world of men and gods, no one among Miras or Brahmas, no one of the class of Brahmins or recluses, who could put any obstacle in the way of an alms intended for, or got ready for, or already given to the Blessed One. And if any one, out of jealousy, were to raise up any obstacle in that case, then would his head split into a hundred or into a thousand pieces/

⁷³ ' There are four things, O king, connected with the Tathagatas, to which no one can do any harm. And what are the four ? To the alms intended for, and got ready for the Blessed One to the halo of a fathom's length when it has once spread out from him to the treasure of the knowledge of his omniscience and to his life. All these things, O king, are one in essence they are free from defect, immovable, unassailable by other beings, unchangeable by other circumstances \ And Mira, the evil

one, lay in ambush, out of sight, when he possessed the Brahmans and householders at the Five Sila trees. It was as when robbers, O king,

⁷⁴ IV, 2,26. MARA. 223 hiding out of sight in the inaccessible country over the border, beset the highways. But if the king caught sight of them, do you think those robbers would be safe ? '

⁷⁵ ' No, Sir, he might have them cut into a hundred or a thousand pieces with an axe/ 'Well, just so it was, hiding out of sight, that Mira possessed them. It was as when a married woman, in ambush, and out of sight, frequents the company of her paramour. [158] But if, O king, she were to carry on her intrigues in her husband's presence, do you think she would be safe ? '

⁷⁶ ' No, Sir, he might slay her, or wound her, or put her in bonds, or reduce her to slavery/ ' Well. It was like that, hiding out of sight, that Mira possessed them. But if, O king, he had raised any obstacle in the case of an alms intended for, got ready for, or in possession of the Blessed One, then his head would have split into a hundred or a thousand pieces/

⁷⁷ ' That is so, Nagasena. Mira, the evil one, acted after the manner of robbers, he lay in ambush, possessing the Brahmans and householders of the Five Sila trees. But if the same Mira, the evil one, had interfered with any alms intended for, or made ready for the Blessed One, or with his partaking thereof, then would his head have been split into a hundred or a thousand pieces, or his bodily frame have been dissipated like a handful of chaff/

⁷⁸ c Very good, Ncigasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the dilemma as to Mara's interference with alms.]

⁷⁹ [UNCONSCIOUS CRIME.] 27. ' Venerable Nagasena, your people say: "Whosoever deprives a living being of life, without knowing that he does so, he accumulates very serious demerit ." But on the other hand it was laid down by the Blessed One in the Vinaya : " There is no offence to him who acts in ignorance 2 /' If the first passage is correct, the other must be false ; and if the second is right, the first must be wrong. This too is a double-pointed problem, hard to master, hard to overcome. It is now put to you, and you have to solve it/

⁸⁰ c Both the passages you quote, O king, were spoken by the Blessed One. But there is a difference between the sense of the two. And what is that difference ? [159] There is a kind of offence which is committed without the co-operation of the mind , and there is another kind which has that co-operation. It was with respect to the first of the

⁸¹ IV, 2, 30. BUDDHA AND HIS FOLLOWERS. 225 two that the Blessed One said : " There is no offence to him who acts in ignorance V '

⁸² * Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the dilemma as to sins in ignorance.] [THE BUDDHA AND HIS FOLLOWERS.]

⁸³ ' Venerable Nagasena, it was said by the Blessed One : " Now the Tathigata thinks not, Ananda, that is he who should lead the brotherhood, or that the Order is dependent upon him V But on the other hand when describing the virtues and the nature of Metteyya, the Blessed One, he said thus : "He will be the leader of a brotherhood several thousands in number, as I am now the leader of a brotherhood several hundreds in number 3 /' If the first statement be right, then the second is wrong. If the second passage is right^ the first must be false. This too is a double-pointed problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

⁸⁴ * You quote both passages correctly, O king. But in the dilemma that you put the sense in the one passage is inclusive, in the other it is not. It is not the Tathdgata, O king, who seeks after a following, but the followers who seek after him.

⁸⁵ Q [160] It is a mere commonly received opinion, O king, that " This is I," or "This is mine," it is not a transcendental truth . Attachment is a frame of mind put away by the Tathagata, he has put away clinging, he is free from the delusion that " This is mine," he lives only to be a help to others . Just as the earth, O king, is a support to the beings in the world, and an asylum to them, and they depend upon it, but the broad earth has no longing after them in the idea that " These belong to me " just so is the Tathdgata a support and an asylum to all beings, but has no longing after them in the idea that " These belong to me." And just as a mighty rain cloud, O king, pours out its rain, and gives nourishment to grass and trees, to cattle and to men, and maintains the lineage thereof, and all these creatures depend for their livelihood upon its rain, but the cloud has no feelings of longing in the idea that " These are mine " just so does the Tathagata give all beings to know what are good qualities and maintains them in goodness, and all beings have their life in him, but the Tathagata has no feelings of longing in the idea that " These are mine." And why is it so ? Because of his having abandoned all self-regard V

⁸⁶ c Vei 7 good, Nagasena ! The problem has been well solved by variety of examples. The jungle has been made open, the darkness has been turned

⁸⁷ IV, 2, 32SCHISM. 227 to light, the arguments of the adversaries have been broken down, insight has been awakened in the sons of the Conqueror/

⁸⁸ [Here ends the dilemma as to the Buddha and his following.] [SCHISM.] 31. ' Venerable Nagasena, your people say : " The Tathigata is a person whose following can never be broken up." And again they say : " At one stroke Devadatta seduced five hundred of the brethren V If the first be true the second is false, but if the second be correct then the first is wrong. [161] This too is a double-pointed problem, profound, hard to unravel, more knotty than a knot. By it these people are veiled, obstructed, hindered, shut in, and enveloped. Herein show your skill as against the arguments of the adversaries/

⁸⁹ ' Both statements, O king, are correct. But the latter is owing to the power of the breach maker. Where there is one to make the breach, a mother will be separated from her son, and the son will break with the mother, or the father with the son and the son with the father, or the brother from the sister and the sister from the brother, or friend from friend. A ship pieced together with timber of all sorts is broken up by the force of the violence of the waves, and a tree in full bearing and full of sap is broken down by the force of the violence of the wind, and gold of the finest sort is divided by

⁹⁰ Q 2 bronze. But it is not the intention of the wise, it is not the will of the Buddhas, it is not the desire of those who are learned that the following of the Tathagata should be broken up. And there is a special sense in which it is said that that cannot be. It is an unheard-of thing, so far as I know, that his following could be broken up by anything done or taken, any unkindly word, any wrong action, any injustice, in all the conduct, wheresoever or whatsoever, of the Tath&gata himself. In that sense his following is invulnerable. And you yourself, do you know of any instance in all the ninefold word of the Buddha of anything done by a Bodisat which broke up the following of the Tathigata ?'

⁹¹ ' No, Sir. Such a thing has never been seen or heard in the world. It is very good, Nagasena, what you say : and I accept it so/ [Here ends the dilemma as to schism.] Here ends the Second Chapter. IV, 3>|THE DHARMA, 22Q

Chapter IV.3

¹ [PRECEDENCE OF THE DHARMA.] i. 'Venerable NsIgasena, it was said by the Blessed One : " For it is the Dhamma, O Vdsettha, which is * the best in the world , ' as regards both what we now see, and what is yet to come V But again (according to your people) the devout layman who has entered the Excellent Way, for whom the possibility of rebirth in any place of woe has passed away, who has attained to insight, and to whom the doctrine is known, even such a one ought to salute and to rise from his seat in token of respect for, and to revere, any member of the Order, though a novice, and though he be unconverted . Now if the Dhamma be the best that rule of conduct is wrong, but if that be right then the first statement must be wrong.

² 1 This is a quotation from a celebrated verse, which i>^ it were, the national anthem of those who, in the struggle for religious and ceremonial supremacy between the Brahmins and the nobles, took the side of the nobles (the Khattiyas). As might be expected it is not seldom found in the Buddhist Suttas, and is often put in the mouth of the Buddha, the most distinguished of these Khattiyas who were transcendental rather than military. It runs: 'The Khattiya is the best in the world of those who observe the rules of exogamous marriage, but of the whole race of men and gods he who has wisdom and righteousness is the best/ See, for instance, the Amba///^a Sutta, in the Dtgha NMya, and the Sumafigala Vil&sini on that passage. By 'best in the world' is meant 'entitled to take precedence before all others,' not best in the moral sense.

³ This too is a double-pointed problem. It is now put to you, and you have to solve it.' [162] 2. ' The Blessed One said what you have quoted, and you have rightly described the rule of conduct. But there is a reason for that rule, and that is this. There are these twenty personal qualities, making up the Samaaship of a Samara, and these two outward signs \ by reason of which the Samara is worthy of salutation, and of respect, and of reverence. And what are they ? The best form of self-restraint, the highest kind of self-control , right conduct, calm manners , mastery over (his deeds and words 4), subjugation (of his senses 5), long-suffering , sympathy ,

⁴ 7 Soraajw. ' Because he is docile and pleasant of speech/ says the Sinhalese: ' Suwaa klkaru bhwayen yukta bawa/ It is an abstract noun formed from surata, and does not occur in Sanskrit, though Bohtlingk-Roth give one authority for it (under sauratya) from a Buddhist work, the Vyutpatti. It is one of the many instances in which the Buddhist ethics has put new and higher meaning into current phrases, for in Sanskrit literature surata (literally 'high pleasure') is used frequently enough, but almost without exception in an obscene sense. The commentary on (jrsItaka III, 442 only repeats the word. It is there, as here, and in the Vyutpatti, and at Anguttara II, 15, 3, always allied with khanti. My translation follows Childers (who probably follows Bohtlingk-Roth) ; but the Sinhalese gloss here makes me very doubtful as to the exact connotation which the early Buddhists associated with ' high pleasure/

⁵ IV, 3> 2THE DHARMA. 23! the practice of solitude l , love of solitude , meditation , modesty and fear of doing wrong , zeal , earnestness , the taking upon himself of the precepts , recitation (of the Scriptures) 8 , asking questions (of those wise in the Dhamma and Vinaya), rejoicing in the Silas and other (rules of morality), freedom from attachment (to the things of the world), fulfilment of the precepts and the wearing of the yellow robe, and the being shaven. [163] In the practice of all these things does the member of the Order live. By being deficient in none of them, by being perfect in all, accomplished in all, endowed with all of them does he reach forward to the condition of Arahatsip, to the condition of those who have nothing left to learn ; he is marching towards the highest of all lands . Thus it is because he sees him to be in the company of the Worthy Ones (the Arahats) that the layman who has already entered on the Excellent Way thinks it worthy in him 10 to

⁶ 10 Arahati. I have endeavoured to imitate the play upon the words. reverence and to show respect to the Bhikkhu, though he may be, as yet, unconverted It is because he sees him to be in the company of those in whom all evil has been destroyed, because he feels that he is not in such society , that the converted layman thinks it worthy of him to do reverence and to show respect to the unconverted Bhikkhu. It is because he knows that he has joined the noblest brotherhood, and that he himself has reached no such state, that the converted layman holds it right to do reverence and to show respect to the unconverted Bhikkhu because he knows that he listens to the recitation of the Patimokkha, while he himself can not because he knows that he receives men into the Order, and thus extends the teaching of the Conqueror, which he himself is incapable of doing because he knows that he carries out innumerable precepts, which he himself cannot observe because he knows that he wears the outward signs of Samaaship, and carries out the intention of the Buddha, while he himself is gone away far from that because he knows that he, though he has given up his hair and beard, and is unanointed and wears no ornaments, yet is anointed with the perfume of righteousness, while he is himself addicted to jewelry and fine apparel that the converted layman thinks it right to do reverence, and to show respect to the unconverted Bhikkhu/

⁷ ' And moreover, O king, it is because he knows that not only are all these twenty personal qualities which go to make a Samara, and the two outward signs, found in the Bhikkhu, but that he carries them

⁸ IV, 3? 4THE DHARMA. 233 on, and trains others in them, that the converted layman, realising that he has no part in that tradition , in that maintenance of the faith, thinks it right to reverence and to show respect to the converted Bhikkhu. [164=] Just, O king, as a royal prince who learns his knowledge, and is taught the duties of a Khattiya, at the feet of the Brahman who acts as family chaplain , when after a time he is anointed king, pays reverence and respect to his master in the thought of his being the teacher, and the carrier on of the traditions of the family, so is it right for the converted Bhikkhu to do reverence and to pay respect to the unconverted Bhikkhu/

⁹ 'And moreover, O king, you may know by this fact the greatness and the peerless glory of the condition of the Bhikkhus that if a layman, a disciple of the faith, who has entered upon the Excellent Way, should attain to the realisation of Arahatsip, one of two results must happen to him, and there is no other he must either die away on that very day, or take upon himself the condition of a Bhikkhu. For immovable, O king, is that state of renunciation, glorious, and most exalted I mean the condition of being a member of the Order ! '

¹⁰ 'Venerable Nagasena, this subtle problem has been thoroughly unravelled by your powerful and great wisdom. No one else could solve it so unless he were wise as you/

¹¹ [Here ends the problem as to the precedence of the Dharma.] [THE HARM OF PREACHING.] 5.

* Venerable Nagasena, you Bhikkhus say that the Tathagata averts harm from all beings, and does them good 1 . And again you say that when he was preaching the discourse based on the simile of the burning fire 2 hot blood was ejected from the mouths of about sixty Bhikkhus. By his delivery of that discourse he did those Bhikkhus harm and not good. So if the first statement is correct, the second is false ; and if the second is correct, the first [165] is false. This too is a double-pointed problem put to you, which you have to solve/

¹² c Both are true. What happened to them was not the Tathagata's doing, but their own/ ' But, Nagasena, if the Tathagata had not delivered that discourse, then would they have vomited up hot blood ?'

¹³ ' No. When they took wrongly what he said, then was there a burning kindled within them, and hot blood was ejected from their mouths/

¹⁴ IV, 3> 8. PREACHING. 235 were closed up, and the snake were to die in consequence from want of air. Would not the serpent have been killed by that man's action ?'

¹⁵ ' Just so, Nagasena, was the Tathagata the prime cause of their destruction/ 7. ' When the Tathagata delivered a discourse, O king, he never did so either in flattery or in malice. In freedom both from the one and from the other did he speak. And they who received it aright were made wise , but they who received it wrongly, fell. Just, O king, as when a man shakes a mango tree or a jambu tree or a mee tree , such of the fruits on it as are full of sap and strongly fastened to it remain undisturbed, but such as have rotten stalks, and are loosely attached, fall to the ground [166] so was it with his preaching. It was, O king, as when a husbandman, wanting to grow a crop of wheat, ploughs the field, but by that ploughing many hundreds and thousands of blades of grass are killed or it was as when men, for the sake of sweetness, crush sugarcane in a mill, and by their doing so such small creatures as pass into the mouth of the mill are crushed also so was it that the Tathagata making wise those whose minds were prepared, preached the Dhamma without flattery and without malice. And they who received it aright were made wise, but they who received it wrongly, fell/

¹⁶ ' Then did not those Bhikkhus fall, Nagasena, just because of that discourse ? ' unto Arahatsip adds Hinai-kutnburS. 2 Madhuka. See ffitaka IV, 434. The Sinhalese (p. 208) has mfgahak (Bassia Latifolia).

¹⁷ ' How, then, could a carpenter by doing nothing to a piece of timber, and simply laying it by , make it straight and fit for use ? '

¹⁸ ' And so [167] with those sixty Bhikkhus, they fell neither by the act of the Tathagata nor of any one else, but solely by their own deed . Suppose, O king, a man were to give ambrosia 4 to all the people, and they, eating of it, were to become healthy and long-lived and free from every bodily ill. But one man, on eating it, were by his own bad digestion, to

¹⁹ IV, 3? 15THE FOOLISH FELLOW. 237 die. Would then, O king, the man who gave away the ambrosia be guilty therein of any offence ? '

²⁰ ' No, Sir/ ' Just so, O king, does the Tathagata present the gift of his ambrosia to the men and gods in the ten thousand world systems ; and those beings who are capable of doing so are made wise by

the nectar of his law, while they who are not are destroyed and fall. Food, O king, preserves the lives of all beings. But some who eat of it die of cholera \ Is the man who feeds the hungry guilty therein of any offence ? '

²¹ ' Just so, O king, does the Tathdgata present the gift of his ambrosia to the men and gods in the ten thousand world systems ; and those beings who are capable of doing so are made wise by the nectar of his law, while they who are not are destroyed and fall/

²² [Here ends the dilemma on the harm resulting from preaching.] [THE SECRETS OF A TATHAGATA.] n. [This dilemma treats of one of the thirty bodily signs of a 'great man' (MaMpurusha) supposed to be possessed by every TatMgata, but as it deals with matters not usually spoken of in this century, it is best read in the original.]

²³ [THE FOOLISH FELLOW.] 15. [170] 'Venerable Nagasena, it was said by the Elder Siriputta, the commander of the faith : " The

²⁴ TatMgata, brethren, is perfect in courtesy of speech. There is no fault of speech in the Tathdgata concerning which he should have to take care that no one else should know it \" And on the other hand the Tathagata, when promulgating the first Pirika on the occasion of the offence of Sudinna the Kalanda , addressed him with harsh words, calling him a useless fellow . And that Elder, on being so called, terrified with the fear of his teacher , and overcome with remorse, was unable to comprehend the Excellent Way . Now if the first statement be correct, the allegation that the Tathagata called Sudinna the Kalanda a useless fellow must be false. But if that be true, then the first statement must be false. [171] This too is a double-pointed problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

²⁵ 1 6. 'What Siriputta the Elder said is true, O king. And the Blessed One called Sudinna a useless fellow on that occasion. But that was not out of rudeness of disposition , it was merely pointing out the real nature (of his conduct) in a way that would do him no harm T , And what herein is meant by

²⁶ IV, 3>*7THE FOOLISH FELLOW. 239 " pointing out the real nature." If any man, king, in this birth does not attain to the perception of the Four Truths, then is his manhood (his being born as a man) in vain , but if he acts differently he will become different. Therefore is it that he is called a useless fellow . And so the Blessed One addressed Sudinna the Kalanda with words of truth, and not with words apart from the facts/

²⁷ 'But, Nagasena, though a man in abusing another speaks the truth, still we should inflict a small 3 fine upon him. For he is guilty of an offence, inasmuch as he, although for something real, abused him by the use of words that might lead to a breach (of the peace) V

²⁸ * Have you ever heard, O king, of a people bowing down before, or rising up from their seats in respect for, or showing honour to, or bringing the complimentary presents (usually given to officials) to a criminal ?'

²⁹ ' No, if a man have committed a crime of whatever sort or kind, if he be really worthy of reproof and punishment, they would rather behead him, or tor-

³⁰ translates: Upadra kara*za sitakin ut no wanneya, swabh&wa lakshazzayenmayaehiwadalakisiwek cet nam, swabhwa laksha#aya maya.

³¹ * Yisuw voharaw IUaranto. The Sinhalese (p. 224) has Wen wu waana wu wyawaharayekin hcesiremin. ture him , or bind him with bonds, or put him to death, or deprive him of his goods V

³² 'Did then the Blessed One, O king, act with justice or not ? * * With justice, Sir, and in a most fit and proper way. And when, Nagasena, they hear of it the world of men and gods will be made tender of conscience, and afraid of falling into sin, struck with awe at the sight of it, and still more so when they themselves associate with wrong-doers, or do wrong/

³³ 1 8. [172] * Now would a physician, O king, administer pleasant things as a medicine in a case where all the humours of the body were affected, and the whole frame was disorganised and full of disease ?'

³⁴ ' No. Wishing to put an end to the disease he would give sharp and scarifying drugs/ ' In the same way, O king, the Tathdgata bestows admonition for the sake of suppressing all the diseases of sin. And the words of the Tathigata, even when stern, soften men and make them tender. Just as hot water, O king, softens and makes tender anything capable of being softened, so are the words of theTathdgata, even when stern, yet as full of benefit, and as full of pity as the words of a father would be to his children. Just, O king, as the drinking of evil-smelling decoctions, the swallowing of nasty drugs, destroys the weaknesses of men's bodies, so are the words of the Tathagata, even when stern, bringers of advantage and laden with pity. And

³⁵ 1V,3 3 20. THE TALKING TREE. 24! just, O king, as a ball of cotton falling on a man raises no bruise, so do the words of the Tathigata, even when stern, do no harm/

³⁶ * Well have you made this problem clear 'by many a simile. Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/

³⁷ [End of the dilemma as to the Buddha's harsh words to Sudinna.] [THE TREE TALKING,] 19. ' Venerable Nagasena, the Tathigata said :

³⁸ " Brahman ! why do you ask an unconscious thing, Which cannot hear you, how it does to-day ? Active, intelligent, and full of life, How can you speak to this so senseless thing This wild Palisatree 1 ?" [173] And on the other hand he said : " And thus the Aspen tree then made reply : ' I, BMradvia, can speak too. Listen to me V " 6 Now if, Nagasena, a tree is an unconscious thing, it must be false that the Aspen tree spoke to Bhiradv&g*a. But if that is true, it must be false to say that a tree is unconscious. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

³⁹ 'The Master said, Nagasena, that a tree is unconscious. And the Aspen tree conversed with Bhiradva. But that last is said, O king, by a common form of speech. For though a tree being unconscious cannot talk, yet the word " tree " is used

⁴⁰ 2 <2ataka IV, 210, where the verses are ascribed to the Buddha. [35] * as a designation of the dryad who dwells therein, and in that sense that " the tree talks " is a wellknown expression. Just, O king, as a waggon laden with corn is called a corn-waggon. But it is not made of corn, it is made of wood, yet because of the corn being heaped up in it the people use the expression "corn-waggon." Or just, O king, as when a man is churning sour milk the common expression is that he is churning butter. But it is not butter that he is churning, but milk. Or just, O king, as when a man is making something that does not exist the common expression is that he is making that thing which all the while as yet is not, [174] but people talk of the work as accomplished before it is done. And the Tathagata, when expounding the Dhamma, does so by means of the phraseology which is in common use among the people/

⁴¹ [Here ends the dilemma as to the talking tree.] [THE BUDDHA'S LAST ILLNESS.] 21.

'Venerable Nagasena, it was said by the Elders who held the Recitation : " When he had eaten jifunda's alms, The coppersmith's, thus have I heard, The Buddha felt that sickness dire, That sharp pain even unto death . "

⁴² iv, 3? 22. THE BUDDHA'S LAST ILLNESS. 243 And afterwards the Blessed One said : " These two offerings of food, Ananda, equal, of equal fruit, and of equal result, are of much greater fruit and much greater result than any others V Now if sharp sickness fell upon the Blessed One, Nagasena, after he had partaken of -Sundays alms, and sharp pains arose within him even unto death, then that other statement must be wrong. But if that is right then the first must be wrong. How could that alms, Nagasena, be of great fruit when it turned to poison, gave rise to disease, [175] put an end to the period of his then existence, took away his life ? Explain this to me to the refutation of the adversaries. The people are in bewilderment about this, thinking that the dysentery must have been caused by his eating too much, out of greediness/

⁴³ c The Blessed One said, O king, that there were two almsgivings equal, of equal fruit, and equal result, and of much greater fruit, and much greater result than any others, that which, when a TatMgata has partaken of it, he attains to supreme and perfect Buddhahood (Enlightenment), and that when he has partaken of which, he passes away by that utter passing away in which nothing whatever remains behind . For that alms is full of virtue, full of advantage. The gods, O king, shouted in joy and gladness at the thought : " This is the last meal the Tathigata will take," and communicated a divine power of nourishment to that tender

⁴⁴ R 2 pork x . And that was itself in good condition, light, pleasant, full of flavour, and good for digestion 2 - It was not because of it that any sickness fell upon the Blessed One, but it was because of the extreme weakness of his body, and because of the period of life he had to live having been exhausted, that the disease arose, and grew worse and worse just as when, O king, an ordinary fire is burning, if fresh fuel be supplied, it will burn up still more or [176] as when a stream is flowing along as usual, if a

⁴⁵ 1 Sukara-maddava. There is great doubt as to the exact meaning of this name of the last dish the Buddha partook of. Maddati is c to rub/ or * to press/ or e to trample/ and just as * pressed beef is ambiguous, so is * boar-pressed ' or ' pork-tender' capable of various interpretations. The exegetical gloss as handed down in the Mah Vihara in Anur&dhapure, Ceylon, in the now lost body of tradition called the IMahd A//akathi, has been preserved by Dhammapala in his comment on Ud&na VIII, g (p, 8 1 of Dr. Steinthal's edition for the Pali Text Society). It means, I think, c Meat pervaded by the tenderness and niceness of boar's (flesh)/ But that is itself ambiguous, and Dhammapala adds that others say the word means not pork or meat at all, but ' the tender top sprout of the bambu plant after it has been trampled upon by swine ' others again that it means a kind of mushroom that grows in ground trodden under foot by swine others again that it means only a particular kind of flavouring, or sauce. As Mad dan a is rendered by Childers (withered/ I have translated it in my ' Buddhist Suttas' (pp. 71-73) ' dried boar's flesh/ But the fact is that the exact sense is not known. (Maddavdni pupphdni at Dhammapada 377 is ' withered flowers/ according to Fausboll. But it may be just as well tender flowers/ especially as Mardava in Sanskrit always means 'tender, pitiful/ &c. This is the only passage where the word is known to occur in Pali apart from those in which sukara-maddava is

mentioned.) The Sinhalese here (p. 230) repeats the word and adds the gloss : E tarutfu wu uru marasayehi.

⁴⁶ 2 <2atharaggi-te-assa hitam. On this curious old belief in an internal fire see my 'Buddhist Suttas/ p. 260. IV, 3, 23. THE BUDDHA'S LAST ILLNESS. 245

⁴⁷ heavy rain falls, it will become a mighty river with a great rush of water or as when the body is of its ordinary girth, if more food be eaten, it becomes broader than before. So this was not, O king, the fault of the food that was presented, and you can not impute any harm to it/

⁴⁸ 'But, venerable Nagasena, why is it that those two gifts of food are so specially meritorious ? ' ' Because of the attainment of the exalted conditions which resulted from them 1 /

⁴⁹ ' Of what conditions, Nagasena, are you speaking?' Of the attainment of the nine successive states which were passed through at first in one order, and then in the reverse order V

⁵⁰ * It was on two days, was it not, Nagasena, that the Tathdgata attained to those conditions in the highest degree ? * 'Yes, O king . '

⁵¹ nine successive conditions are glorious, even so are those gifts made, by their glory, [177] of greater fruit, and of greater advantage than any others. Very good, Nagasena 1 That is so, and I accept it as you say. 1

⁵² [Here ends the dilemma as to the Buddha s last illness.] [ADORATION OF RELICS.] 24. ' Venerable Nagasena, the Tathdgata said : * ' Hinder not yourselves, Ananda, by honouring the remains of the Tathagata V And on the other hand he said :

⁵³ " Honour that relic of him who is worthy of honour, Acting in that way you go from this world to heaven . " * Now if the first injunction was right the second must be wrong, and if the second is right the first must be wrong. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

⁵⁴ f Both the passages you quote were spoken by the Blessed One. But it was not to all men, it was to the sons of the Conqueror 3 that it was said : " Hinder not yourselves, Ananda, by honouring the remains of the Tathigata V Paying reverence is not the work of the sons of the Conqueror, [178] but rather the grasping of the true nature of all

⁵⁵ 3 <?ina-puttanafiz. That is, the members of the Order. * Here again Hinai-kumbur goes into a long account of the attendant circumstances (pp. 233, 234).

⁵⁶ IV, 3* 26. ADORATION OF RELICS. 247 compounded things, the practice of thought, contemplation in accordance with the rules of Satipa- ^clna, the seizing of the real essence of all objects of thought, the struggle against evil, and devotion to their own (spiritual) good. These are things which the sons of the Conqueror ought to do, leaving to others, whether gods or men, the paying of reverence V

⁵⁷ ' And that is so, O king, just as it is the business of the princes of the earth to learn all about elephants, and horses, and chariots, and bows, and rapiers, and documents, and the law of property , to carry on the traditions of the Khattiya clans, and to fight themselves and to lead others in war, while husbandry, merchandise, and the care of cattle are the business of other folk, ordinary Vessas and Suddas. Or just as the business of Brahmins and their sons is concerned with the Rig-veda, the Yaur-veda, the Sama-veda, the Atharva-veda, with the knowledge of lucky marks (on the body), of legends , Purdas, lexicography * prosody, phonology, verses, grammar, etymology, astrology, interpretation of omens, and of dreams, and of signs, study of the six Vedingas, of eclipses of the sun

and moon, of the prognostications to be drawn from the flight of comets, the thunderings of the gods, the junctions of planets, the fall of meteors, earthquakes, conflagrations, and signs in the heavens and on the earth, the study of arithmetic, of cas-

⁵⁸ uistry, of the interpretation of the omens to be drawn from dogs, and deer, and rats, and mixtures of liquids, and the sounds and cries of birds while husbandry, merchandise, and the care of cattle are the business of other folk, ordinary Vessas and Suddas. So it was, O king, in the sense of " Devote not yourselves to such things as are not your business, but to such things as are so" that the Tathigata was speaking [179] when he said : " Hinder not yourselves, Ananda, by honouring the remains of the Tathdgata." And if, O king, he had not said so, then would the Bhikkhus have taken his bowl and his robe, and occupied themselves with paying reverence to the Buddha through them 1 !'

⁵⁹ * Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the dilemma as to reverence to relics.] [THE SPLINTER OF ROCK.]

⁶⁰ 'Venerable Nagasena, you Bhikkhus say that: "When the Blessed One walked along, the earth, unconscious though it is, filled up its deep places, and made its steep places plain 2 /' And on the other hand you say that a splinter of

⁶¹ IV, 3>2p. THE SPLINTER OF ROCK. 249 rock grazed his foot . When that splinter was falling on his foot why did it not, then, turn aside ? If it be true that the unconscious earth makes its deep places full and its steep places plain for him, then it must be untrue that the splinter of rock hurt his foot. But if the latter statement be true, then the first must be false. This too is a doubleedged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it.'

⁶² ' Both statements, O king, are true. But that splinter of rock did not fall of itself , it was cast down through the act of Devadatta. Through hundreds of thousands of existences, O king, had Devadatta borne a grudge against the Blessed One . It was through that hatred that he seized hold of a mighty mass of rock, and pushed it over with the hope that it would fall upon the Buddha's head. But two other rocks came together, and intercepted it before it reached the Tathigata, and by the force of their impact a splinter was torn off, and fell in such a direction that it struck [180] the Blessed One's foot/

⁶³ c But, Nagasena, just as two rocks intercepted that mighty mass, so could the splinter have been intercepted.' * But a thing intercepted, O king, can escape, slip through, or be lost as water does, through the fingers, when it is taken into the hand or milk, or buttermilk, or honey, or ghee, or oil, or fish curry,

⁶⁴ 1 ^ullavagga VII, 3, 9. Compare the Sa0zyutta Nikdya I, 4, 8 ; IV, 2, 3 (pp. 27 and 1 10 of M. Lefon Peer's edition for the P&H Text Society).

⁶⁵ or gravy or as fine, subtle, minute, dusty grains of sand do, through the fingers, if you close your fist on them or as rice will escape sometimes when you have taken it into your fingers, and are putting it into your mouth.'

⁶⁶ * Well, let that be so, Nagasena. I admit that the rock was intercepted. But the splinter ought at least to have paid as much respect to the Buddha as the earth did/

⁶⁷ ' There are these twelve kinds of persons, O king, who pay no respect the lustful man in his lust, and the angry man in his malice, and the dull man in his stupidity, and the puffed-up man in his pride, and the bad man in his want of discrimination, and the obstinate man in his want of docility, and the mean man in his littleness, and the talkative man in his vanity, and the wicked man in his

cruelty, and the wretched man in his misery, and the gambler [181] because he is overpowered by greed, and the busy man in his search after gain. But that splinter, just as it was broken off by the impact of the rocks, fell by chance * in such a direction that it struck against the foot of the Blessed One just as fine, subtle, and minute grains of sand, when carried away by the force of the wind, are sprinkled down by chance in any direction they may happen to take. If the splinter, O king, had not been separated from the rock of which it formed a part, it too would have been intercepted by their meeting together. But, as it was, it was neither fixed on the earth, nor did it remain stationary in the air, but fell whithersoever

⁶⁸ IV, 3) 3 1 - THK SAMARA. 251 chance directed it, and happened to strike against the Blessed One's foot just as dried leaves might fall if caught up in a whirlwind And the real cause of its so striking against his foot was the sorrowworking deed I of that ungrateful, wicked, Devadatta/ 1 Very good, Nsargasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/

⁶⁹ [Here ends the dilemma as to the splinter grazing the Buddha's foot] [THE SAMARA.] 31. 'Venerable Nagasena, the Blessed One said: " A man becomes a Samara by the destruction of the Asavas ." But on the other hand he said : " The man who has these dispositions four

⁷⁰ Is he whom the world knows as Samara ." And in that passage these are the four dispositions referred to long-suffering, temperance in food, renunciation , and the being without the attachments 6 (arising from lust, ill-will, and dullness). Now these four dispositions are equally found in those who are still defective, in whom [182] the

⁷¹ Asavas have not yet been completely destroyed. So that if the first statement be correct, the second is wrong, and if the second be right the first must be wrong. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it'

⁷² c Both statements, O king, were made by the Blessed One. But the second was said of the characteristics of such and such men ; the first is an inclusive statement that all in whom the Asavas are destroyed are Samaras. And moreover, of all those who are made perfect by the suppression of evil, if you take them in regular order one after the other, then the Samara in whom the Asavas are destroyed is acknowledged to be the chief just, O king, as of all flowers produced in the water or on the land, the double jasmine 1 is acknowledged to be the chief, all other kinds of flowers of whatever sort are merely flowers, and taking them in order it is the double jasmine that people most desire and like. Or just, king, as of all kinds of grain, rice is acknowledged to be the chief, all other kinds of grain, of whatever sort, [183] are useful for food and for the support of the body, but if you take them in order, rice is acknowledged as the best/

⁷³ ' Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the dilemma as to what constitutes a Samara.]

⁷⁴ IV, 3, 34. EXULTATION. 253 [THE BUDDHA'S EXULTATION.] 33. 'Venerable Nagasena, the Blessed One said: " If, O Bhikkhus, any one should speak in praise of me, or of our religion (Dhamma), or of the Order, you should not thereupon indulge in joy, or delight, or exultation of mind 1 ". And on the other hand the Tathigata was so delighted, and pleased, and exultant at the deserved praise bestowed on him by Sela the Brahman, that -he still further magnified his own goodness in that he said :

⁷⁵ " A king am I, Sela, the king supreme Of righteousness. The royal chariot wheel In righteousness do I set rolling on That wheel that no one can turn back again 2 ! " Now if the passage first quoted be right then must the second be wrong, but if that be right then must the first be wrong. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

⁷⁶ [184] ' Both your quotations, O king, are correct. But the first passage was spoken by the Blessed One with the intention of setting forth truthfully, exactly, in accordance with reality, and fact, and

⁷⁷ 2 From the Sela Sutta in the Sutta Nipata (III, 7, 7). Professor FausbSll in his translation of this stanza (at vol. x, p. 102 of the ' Sacred Books of the East ') draws attention to the parallel at John xviii. 37. * Thou sayest that I am a king. To this end was I born. And for this cause came I into the world that I should bear witness unto the truth' where c truth/ if one translated the verse into Pili, would be correctly rendered "by Dhamma, 'righteousness, religion, truth, essential quality/ Professor Fausbb'll's version of the stanza runs : e I am a king, O Sela, an incomparable religious (Dhamma-raa) king, with justice (Dhamma), I turn the wheel, a wheel that is irresistible/

⁷⁸ sense, the real nature, and essence, and characteristic marks of the Dhamma. And the second passage was not spoken for the sake of gain or fame, nor out of party spirit, nor in the lust of winning over men to become his followers. But it was in mercy and love, and with the welfare of others in view, conscious that thereby three hundred young Brahmans would attain to the knowledge of the truth, that he said : " A king am I, Sela, the king supreme of righteous-

⁷⁹ ness." ' [Here ends the problem as to exultation of mind.] [KINDNESS AND PUNISHMENT.] 35, * Venerable Nagasena, the Blessed One said : " Doing no injury to any one

⁸⁰ Dwell full of love and kindness in the world V And on the other hand he said : " Punish him who deserves punishment , favour him who is worthy of favour." [185] Now punishment, Nagasena, means the cutting off of hands or feet, flogging , casting into bonds, torture , execution, degradation in rank .

⁸¹ IV, 3,36KINDNESS AND PUNISHMENT. 255 Such a saying is therefore not worthy of the Blessed One, and he ought not to have made use of it. For if the first injunction be right then this must be wrong, and if this be right then the injunction to do no injury to any one, but to dwell full of love and kindness in the world, must be wrong. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it.'

⁸² ' The Blessed One, great king, gave both the commands you quote. As to the first, to do no injury to any one, but to live full of love and kindness in the world that is a doctrine approved by all the Buddhas. And that verse is an injunction, an unfolding of the Dhamma, for the Dhamma has as its characteristic that it works no ill. And the saying is thus in thorough accord with it. But as to the second command you quote that is a special use of terms [which you have misunderstood. The real meaning of them is : " Subdue that which ought to be subdued, strive after, cultivate, favour what is worthy of effort, cultivation, and approval "]. The proud heart, great king, is to be subdued, and the lowly heart cultivated the wicked heart to be subdued, and the good heart to be cultivated carelessness of thought is to be subdued, and exactness of thought to be cultivated [186] he who is given over to wrong views is to be subdued, and he who has attained to right views is to be cultivated he who is not noble 1 is to be subdued, and the noble one is

⁸³ santati means also 'lineage, descent/ the phrase may equally well refer to the sort of punishment I have ventured to put into the text. 1 Ariyo and anariyo used technically in the sense of one who has not, and one who has, entered upon the Noble Eightfold Path.

⁸⁴ to be cultivated the robber I is to be subdued, and the honest brother is to be cultivated.' 37. * Let that be so, Nagasena. But now, in that last word of yours, you have put yourself into my power, you have come round to the sense in which I put my question. For how, venerable Nagasena, is the robber to be subdued by him who sets to work to subdue him ? '

⁸⁵ ' Thus, great king if deserving of rebuke let him be rebuked, if of a fine let him be fined, if of banishment let him be banished, if of death let him be put to death/

⁸⁶ c Is then, Nagasena, the execution of robbers part of the doctrine laid down by the Tathigatas ?' ' Certainly not, O king. 1

⁸⁷ * Then why have the TatMgatas laid down that the robber is to be taught better ?' * Whosoever, great king, may be put to death, he does not suffer execution by reason of the opinion put forth by the Tathigatas. He suffers by reason of what he himself has done. But notwithstanding that the doctrine of the Dhamma has been taught (by the Buddhas) 2 , would it be possible, great king, for a man who had done nothing wrong, and was walking innocently along the streets, to be seized and put to death by any wise person ?'

⁸⁸ * Certainly not/ IV, 3, 38 - DISMISSAL. 257 ' But why ? ' ' Because of his innocence.' ' It could not be, Sir.' 'So you see the teaching of the TatMgatas is a righteous teaching/

⁸⁹ ' Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the problem as to kindness and punishment.] [THE DISMISSAL OF THE ELDERS.]

⁹⁰ 'Venerable Nagasena, it was said by the Blessed One : " Anger I harbour not, nor sulkiness V But on the other hand the TathSgata dismissed the Elders ScLriputta and Moggalldna, together with the brethren who formed their company of disciples *.

⁹¹ 2 The episode here referred to will be found in the Maggima Nikaya, No. 67. Hna-kumbur gives it in full. The Buddha was staying at the Amalakf garden near the Sikya town called -SUtum^ . There the two elders with their attendant 500 disciples came to call upon him. The resident Bhikkhus received them with applause, and a great hubbub arose. The Buddha enquired what that noise was, like the chattering of fishermen when a net full of fishes was drawn to shore. Ananda told him. Thereupon the Buddha called the brethren together, made a discourse to them on the advantages of quiet, and ' sent away ' the visitors. They went to the public rest-house in the town. The town's folk enquired why, and

⁹² S How now, Nagasena, [187] was it in anger that the Tathgata sent away 1 the disciples, or was it in pleasure? Be so good as to explain to me how this was . For if, Nagasena, he dismissed them in anger, then had the Tath&gata not subdued all liability to anger in himself. But if it was in pleasure, then he did so ignorantly, and without due cause. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

⁹³ 'The Blessed One did say, O king: " Anger I harbour not, nor sulkiness." And he did dismiss the Elders with their disciples. But that was not in anger. Suppose, O king, that a man were to stumble against some root, or stake, or stone, or potsherd, or on uneven ground, and fall upon the broad earth. Would it be that the broad earth, angry with him, had made him fall ? '

⁹⁴ * No, indeed, Sir. The broad earth feels neither anger against any man nor delight. It is altogether when they heard the reason, went to the Buddha, and obtained his forgiveness for the offending brethren. The incident is the basis of another question below, IV, 4, 41.

⁹⁵ IV, 3, 39DISMISSAL. 259 free from ill-will, neither needs it to fawn on any one. It would be by reason of his own carelessness that that man stumbled and fell.'

⁹⁶ * Just so, great king, do the TatMgatas experience neither anger against, nor pride in any man. Altogether free are the TatMgatas, the Arahata-Buddhas, alike from ill-will, and from the need to fawn on any one. And those disciples were sent away by reason of what they themselves had done. So also the great ocean endures not association with any corpse. Any dead body there may be in it that does it promptly cast up, and leave high and dry on the shore . But is it in anger that it casts it up ? '

⁹⁷ * Certainly not, Sir. The broad ocean feels neither anger against any, nor does it take delight in any. It seeks not in the least to please any, and is altogether free from the desire to harm/

⁹⁸ 'Just so, great king, do the Tathdgatas feel neither anger against any man, nor do they place their faith in any man. The Tathigatas, the Arahata-Buddhas, are quite set free from the desire either to gain the goodwill of any man, or to do him harm. And it was by reason of what they themselves had done that those disciples were sent away. Just as a man, great king, who stumbles against the ground is made to fall, so is he who stumbles in the excellent teaching of the Conqueror made to go away. Just as a corpse in the great ocean is cast up, [188] so is he who stumbles in the excellent teaching of the Conqueror sent away. And when the Tathagata sent those disciples away it was for their good, and their

⁹⁹ S 2 gain, their happiness, and their purification, and in order that in that way they should be delivered from birth, old age, disease, and death/

¹⁰⁰ * Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the problem as to the dismissal of the Elders.] Here ends the Third Chapter. IV, 4> 2. MURDER OF MOGGALLANA, 261

[THE MURDER OF MOGGALLANA.]

¹ 'Venerable Nagasena, it has been said by the Blessed One : " This is the chief, O Bhikkhus, of those of my disciples in the Order who are possessed of the power of Iddhi, I mean Moggallana l " But on the other hand they say his death took place by his being beaten to death with clubs, so that his skull was broken, and his bones ground to powder, and all his flesh and nerves bruised and pounded together . Now, Nagasena, if the Elder, the great Moggallsna, had really attained to supremacy in the magical power of Iddhi, then it cannot be true that he was beaten to death with clubs . But if his death was on that wise, then the saying that he was chief of those possessed of Iddhi must be wrong. How could he who was not even able, by his power of Iddhi, to prevent his own murder, be worthy nevertheless to stand as succour to the world of gods and men ? This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

² ' The Blessed One did declare, O king, that Moggallcina was chief among the disciples in power 3
* By robbers/ adds Hinai-kumbur, so there is no question of martyrdom.

³ IV, 4, 3. of Iddhi. And he was nevertheless beaten to death by clubs. But that was through his being then possessed by the still greater power of Karma V

⁴ ' But, venerable Nagasena, [189] are not both of these things appurtenant to him who has the power of Iddhi that is the extent of his power, and the result of his Karma both alike unthinkable ? And cannot the unthinkable be held back by the unthinkable ? Just, Sir, as those who want the fruits will knock a wood apple ² down with a wood apple, or a mango with a mango, so ought not the unthinkable in like manner to be subject to restraint by the unthinkable ? '

⁵ 'Even among things beyond the reach of the imagination, great king, still one is in excess above the other, one more powerful than the other. Just, O king, as the monarchs of the world are alike in kind, but among them, so alike in kind, one may overcome the rest, and bring them under his command just so among things beyond the grasp of the imagination is the productive effect of Karma by far the most powerful. It is precisely the effect of Karma which overcomes all the rest, and has them under its rule ; and no other influence is of any avail to the man in whom Karma is working out its inevitable end . It is as when, O king, any man has committed an offence against the law .

⁶ 5 ' No good action has an opportunity at the time when evil Karma is in possession of a man/ says HinaA-kumburS (p. 250). 4 Pakaraze aparā[^]-[^]ati, literally ' against the book/ the book

⁷ IV, 4, 3MURDER OF MOGGALLANA. 263 Neither his mother nor his father, neither his sisters nor his brother, neither his friends nor his intimate associates can protect him then. He has fallen therein under the power of the king who will issue his command respecting him. And why is that so ? Because of the wrong that he has done. So is it precisely the effect of Karma which overcomes all other influences, and has them under its command, and no other influence can avail the man in whom Karma is working out its inevitable end. It is as when a jungle fire has arisen on the earth, then can not even a thousand pots of water avail to put it out, but the conflagration overpowers all, and brings it under its control. And why is that so ? Because of the fierceness of its heat. So is it precisely the effect of Karma which overcomes all other influences, and has them under its command; and no other influence can avail the man in whom Karma is working out its inevitable end. That is why the venerable one, great king, the great Moggallana, when, at a time when he was possessed by Karma, he was being beaten to death with clubs, was yet unable to make use of his power of Iddhi V

⁸ ' Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the problem as to the murder of Moggallana.] of the law being, no doubt, understood. But the Sinhalese has ' against any one.'

⁹ [ON SECRET DOCTRINE.] 4. [190] c Venerable Nagasena, it was said by the Blessed One : " The Dhatnma and the Vinaya (Doctrine and Canon Law) proclaimed by the Tathigata shine forth when they are displayed, and not when they are concealed V But on the other hand the recitation of the Pdtimokkha and the whole of the Vinaya Pitaka are closed and kept secret . So that if, Nagasena, you (members of the Order) carried out what is just, and right, and held of faith in the teaching of the Conqueror then would the Vinaya shine forth as an open thing. And why would that be so ? Because all the instruction therein, the discipline, the self-control, the regulations as to moral and virtuous conduct, are in their essence full of truth and righteousness, and redounding to emancipation of heart. But if the Blessed One really said that the Dhamma and Vinaya proclaimed by the TathSgata shine forth when displayed and not when kept secret, then the saying that the recitation of the Patimokkha and the whole of the Vinaya must be kept secret must be wrong. And if that be right, then the saying

of the Blessed One must be wrong. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

¹⁰ 'It was said, O king, by the Blessed One that the Dhamma and Vinaya proclaimed by the Tath&-IV, 4, 6ESOTERIC DOCTRINE. 265

¹¹ gata shine forth when displayed, and not when kept secret. And on the other hand the recitation of the Pitimokkha and the whole of the Vinaya Pitaka are kept close and secret l . But this last is not the case as regards all men. They are only kept secret up to a certain limit. And the recitation of the Patimokkha is kept secret up to that certain limit on three grounds firstly because that is the traditional custom 2 of previous Tathigatas, secondly out of respect for the Truth (Dhamma), and thirdly out of respect for the position of a member of the Order V 6. ' And as to the first it was the universal custom, O king, of previous Tathagatas for the recitation of the Pitimokkha to take place in the midst of the members of the Order only, to the exclusion of all others. Just, O king, as the Kshatriya secret formulas (of the nobles) are handed down among the nobles alone, and that this or that is so is common tradition among the nobles 4 of the world and kept secret from all others [191] so was this the universal custom of previous Tathagatas, that the recitation of the Pitimokkha should take place among the

¹² 1 This is, so far as I know, the earliest mention of this being the case. There is nothing in the Pttimokkha itself (see my translation of this list of offences against the rules of the Order in vol. i of the ' Vinaya Texts ' in the S. B. E.) as to its recitation taking place in secret, and nothing in the Vinaya as to its being kept secret. But the regulations in the Vinaya as to the recitation of the Patimokkha forbade the actual presence of any one not a member of the Order, and as a matter of fact any one not such a member is excluded in practice during its recitation now in Ceylon. But it would be no offence in a layman to read the Vinaya, and learned laymen who have left the Order still do fo.

¹³ (but the Sinhalese has Sakyayang). members of the Order only, and be kept secret from all others. And again, just as there are several classes of people, O king, known as distinct in the world such as wrestlers, tumblers, jugglers, actors, ballet-dancers, and followers of the mystic cult of the sun and moon, of the goddess of fortune and other gods x . And the secrets of each of these sects are handed on in the sect itself, and kept hidden from all others. Just so with the universal custom of all the Tathagatas that the recitation of the Pitimokkha should take place before the members of the Order only, and be kept secret from all others. This is why the recitation of the Pitimokkha is, up to that extent, kept secret in accordance with the habit of previous Tathigatas.'

¹⁴ 'And how is it that the Patimokkha is kept secret, up to that extent, out of reverence for the Dhamma ? The Dhamma, great king, is venerable and weighty. He who has attained to proficiency in it may exhort another in this wise : " Let not this Dhamma so full of truth, so excellent, fall into the hands of those unversed in it, where it would be despised and contemned, treated shamefully, made a game of, and found fault with. Nor let it fall into the hands of the wicked who would deal with it in all respects as badly as they." It is thus, O king, that the recitation of the Pitimokkha is, up to that

¹⁵ IV, 4, 8. ESOTERIC DOCTRINE. 267 extent, kept secret out of reverence for the Dhamma. For if not, then it would be like the best, most costly, and most rare red sandal wood of the finest kind, which when brought to Savara (that city of the outcast Kz.nd&& a) is despised and contemned, treated shamefully, made game of, and found fault with.'

¹⁶ [192] ' And how is it that the Patimokkha is kept secret, up to that extent, out of reverence for the position of a member of the Order ? The condition of a Bhikkhu, great king, is in glory beyond the reach of calculation by weight, or measure, or price. None can value it, weigh it, measure it. And the recitation of the P&timokkha is carried on before the Bhikkhus alone, lest any one who has occupied that position should be brought down to a level with the men of the world. Just, O king, as if there be any priceless thing, in vesture or floor covering, in elephants, chargers, or chariots, in gold or silver or jewels or pearls or women, or in unsurpassable strong drink , all such things are the appanage of kings just so, O king, whatever is most priceless in the way of training, of the traditions of the Blessed One, of learning, of conduct, and of the virtues of righteousness and self-control all these are the appanages of the Order of Bhikkhus. This is why the recitation of the Pdtimokkha is, to that extent, kept secret V

¹⁷ ' Very good, Nagasena! That is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the problem as to the secrecy in which the Vinaya is kept.]

¹⁸ [THE TWO KINDS OF FALSEHOOD.] 9. ' Venerable Nagasena, it has been said by the Blessed One that a deliberate lie is an offence of the greatest kind (involving exclusion from the Order *).

¹⁹ IV, i, 8, it is stated that a good Buddhist teacher should keep nothing secret from his pupil. And even in so old a text as the 'Book of the Great Decease' (Chap. II, 32, p. 36 of my translation in the * Buddhist Suttas '), it is said of the Buddha himself that he had ' no such thing as the closed fist of a teacher who keeps some things back.' This passage is itself quoted above at IV, 2, 4, as the basis of one of Milinda's questions ; and is entirely accepted by Nagasena, that is, by our author. The fact is that there has never been any such thing as esoteric teaching in Buddhism, and that the modem so called esoteric Buddhism is neither esoteric nor Buddhism. Its tenets, so far as they are Indian at all, are perfectly accessible, are well known to all those who choose to study the books of Indian mysticism, and are Hindu, not Buddhist. They are, indeed, quite contradictory to Buddhism, of which the authors of what they ignorantly call Esoteric Buddhism know but very little that little being only a portion of those beliefs which have been common ground to all religious teachers in India. If one doctrine more than any other is distinctive of Buddhism, it is the ignoring, in ethics, of the time-honoured belief in a soul that is, in the old sense, in a separate creature inside the body, which flies out of it, like a bird out of a cage, when the body dies. Yet the Theosophists, who believe, I am told, in seven souls inside each human body (which would be worse according to true Buddhism than seven devils), still venture to call themselves Buddhists, and do not see the absurdity of their position J

²⁰ IV, 49 io. FALSEHOOD. 269 And again he said : " By a deliberate lie a Bhikkhu commits a minor offence, one that ought to be the subject of confession made before another (member of the Order) 1 ." Now, venerable Nagasena, what is herein the distinction, what the reason, that by one lie a Bhikkhu is cast out of the Order, and by another he is guilty only of an offence that can be atoned for. If the first decision be right, then the second must be wrong ; but if the second be right, then the first must be wrong. This too is a doubleedged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

²¹ [193] *' Both your quotations, O king, are correct . But a falsehood is a light or heavy offence according to the subject matter. For what do you think, great king ? Suppose a man were to give another a slap with his hand, what punishment would you inflict upon him ? '

²² * But on the other hand, suppose it had been you 270 THE, QUESTIONS OF KING MILINDA. IV, 4, n. yourself that he had given the blow to, what would then be the punishment ? '

²³ c We should condemn him to have his hands cut off, and his feet cut off, and to be skinned alive , and we should confiscate all the goods in his house, and put to death all his family to the seventh generation on both sides/

²⁴ v But, great king, what is the distinction ? Why is it that for one slap of the hand there should be a gentle fine of a penny, while for a slap given to you there should be so fearful a retribution ? '

²⁵ * Because of the difference in the person (assaulted).' * Well ! just so, great king, is a falsehood a light or a heavy offence according to the attendant circumstances/

²⁶ * Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the problem as to the degree of offence in falsehood.]

²⁷ [THE BODISAT'S CONSIDERATION.] n. 'Venerable Nagasena, it has been said by the Blessed One in the discourse on the essential conditions : <c Long ago have his parents been destined for each Bodisat, and the kind of tree he is to select for his Bo tree, and the

²⁸ IV, 4? " THE BODISAT. 271 Bhikkhus who are to be his two chief disciples, and the lad who is to be his son, and the member of the Order who is to be his special attendant" But on the other hand he said: " When yet in the condition of a god in the Tusita heaven the Bodisat makes the eight Great Investigations he investigates the time (whether the right moment had come at which he ought to be re-born as a man), and the continent (in which his birth is to take place), and the country (where he is to be re-born), and the family (to which he is to belong), and the mother (who is to bear him), and the period (during which he was to remain in the womb), and the month (in which his birthday shall come), and his renunciation (when it shall be) 1 . [194] Now, Nagasena, before knowledge is ripe there is no understanding, but when it has reached its summit there is no longer any need to wait for thinking a matter over , for there is nothing outside the ken of the omniscient mind. Why then should the Bodisat investigate the time, thinking to himself: "In what moment shall I be born 2 ?" And for the same reason why should he investigate the family, thinking to him-

²⁹ self: " In what family shall I be born ?" And if, Nagasena, it is a settled matter who shall be the parents of the Bodisat, then it must be false that he " investigated the family." But if that be true, then must the other saying be wrong. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

³⁰ 'It was both a settled matter, O king, who should be the parents of the Bodisat, and he did investigate into the question as to which family he was to be born into. But how did he do so ? He thought over the matter as to whether his parents should be nobles or Brahmans. With respect to eight things, O king, should the future be investigated before it comes to pass. A merchant, O king, should investigate goods before he buys them an elephant should try with its trunk a path it has not yet trod a cartman should try a ford he has not yet crossed over a pilot should test a shore he has not yet arrived at, and so guide the ship a physician should find out the period of life which his patient has lasted 1 before he treats his disease a traveller should test the stability of a bambft bridge 2 before he mounts on to it a Bhikkhu should find out how much time has yet to run before sun turn before he begins to eat his meal and Bodisats, before they are born, should investigate the question whether it would be right for them to be born in the family of a noble or of a Brahman.

³¹ IV, 4, 14SUICIDE. These are the eight occasions on which investigation ought to precede action/ ' Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say.'

³² [Here ends the problem as to the Bodisat's consideration.] [ON SUICIDE.] 13. [195] 'Venerable Nagasena, it has been said by the Blessed One : " A brother is not, O Bhikkhus, to commit suicide. Whosoever does so shall be dealt with according to the law 1 /' And on the other hand you (members of the Order) say : " On whatsoever subject the Blessed One was addressing the disciples, he always, and with various similes, preached to them in order to bring about the destruction of birth, of old age, of disease, and of death. And whosoever overcame birth, old age, disease, and death, him did he honour with the highest praise ." Now if the Blessed One forbade suicide that saying of yours must be wrong, but if not then the prohibition of suicide must be wrong. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

³³ * The regulation you quote, O king, was laid down by the Blessed One, and yet is our saying you refer to true. And there is a reason for this, a

³⁴ T reason for which the Blessed One both prohibited (the destruction of life), and also (in another sense) instigated us to it 1

³⁵ ' What, Ngasena, may that reason be ? ' ' The good man, O king, perfect in uprightness, is like a medicine to men z in being an antidote to the poison of evil, he is like water to men in laying the dust and the impurities of evil dispositions, he is like a jewel treasure to men in bestowing upon them all attainments in righteousness, he is like a boat to men inasmuch as he conveys them to the further shore of the four flooded streams (of lust, individuality, delusion, and ignorance) 2 , he is like a caravan owner to men in that he brings them beyond the sandy desert of rebirths, he is like a mighty rain cloud to men in that he fills their hearts with satisfaction, he is like a teacher to men in that he trains them in all good, he is like a good guide to men in that he points out to them the path of peace. It was in order that so good a man as that, one whose good qualities are so many, so various, so immeasurable, [196] in order that so great a treasure mine of good things, so full of benefit to all beings, might not be done away with, that the Blessed One, O king, out of his mercy towards all beings, laid down that injunction, when he said : " A brother is not, O Bhikkhus, to commit suicide. Whosoever does so shall be dealt with according to the law." This is the reason for which the Blessed One prohibited (self-slaughter). And it was said, O king,

³⁶ by the Elder Kumira Kassapa, the eloquent, when he was describing to Payisi the Ragunya the other world : " So long as Samaras and Brahmans of uprightness of life, and beauty of character, continue to exist however long that time may be just so long do they conduct themselves to the advantage and happiness of the great masses of the people, to the good and the gain and the weal of gods and men 1 !'"

³⁷ c And what is the reason for which the Blessed One instigated us (to put an end to life) ? Birth, O king, is full of pain, and so is old age, and disease, and death. Sorrow is painful, and so is lamentation, and pain, and grief, and despair. Association with the unpleasant is painful, and separation from the pleasant . The death of a mother is painful, or of a father, or a brother, or a sister, or a son, or a wife, or of any relative. Painful is the ruin of one's family, and the suffering of disease, and the loss of wealth, and decline in goodness, and the loss of in-

³⁸ 1 This Kumara Kassapa is said at Anguttara I, xiv, 3 to have been the most eloquent of the early disciples. Another eloquent little outburst of his is preserved for us in verses 201 and 202 of the

TherS; GdthL ' O for the Buddhas, and their doctrines! O for the achievements of our Master 1
 Thereby may the disciple realise the Truth. Through countless seons of time has Selfness followed on
 Selfness. But this one is now the last. This aggregation (of mental and material qualities which forms
 me now again into an individuality) is at last the end, the end of the coming and going of births and
 deaths. There will be no rebirth for me!' But where the verses are so full of allusions to the deepest
 Buddhist psychology, it is impossible to reproduce in English the vigour of the original Pali. Selfness
 (Sakkya) is the condition of being a separate individual.

³⁹ T 2 sight Painful is the fear produced by despots, or by robbers, or by enemies, or by famine, or by
 fire, or by flood, or by the tidal wave, or by earthquake, or by crocodiles or alligators. Painful is the
 fear of possible blame attaching to oneself, or to others, the fear of punishment, the fear of
 misfortune. Painful is the fear arising from shyness in the presence of assemblies of one's fellows,
 painful is anxiety as to one's means of livelihood, painful the foreboding of death. [197] Painful are
 (the punishments inflicted on criminals[^], such as being flogged with whips, or with sticks, or with
 split rods, having one's hands cut off, or one's feet, or one's hands and feet, or one's ears, or one's
 nose, or one's ears and nose. Painful are (the tortures inflicted on traitors) being subjected to the
 Gruel Pot (that is, having boiling gruel poured into one's head from the top of which the skull bone
 has been removed 1) or to the Chank Crown 2 (that is, having the scalp rubbed with gravel till it
 becomes smooth like a polished shell) or to the Rahu's Mouth 3 (that is, having one's mouth held
 open by iron pins, and oil put in it, and a wick lighted therein) or to the Fire Garland 4 or to the Hand
 Torch 5 (that is, being made a living torch, the whole body, or the arms only, being wrapped up in
 oily cloths, and set on fire) or to the Snake Strips 6 (that is, being skinned in strips from the neck to
 the hips, so that the skin falls in strips round the legs) or to the Bark Dress 7 (that is, being skinned
 alive from the neck downwards, and having each strip of

⁴⁰ IV, 4, I5SUICIDE. 277 skin as soon as removed tied to the hair, so that these strips form a veil
 around one) or to the Spotted Antelope * (that is, having one's knees and elbows tied together, and
 being made to squat on a plate of iron under which a fire is lit) or to the Flesh-hooks 2 (that is, being
 hung up on a row of iron hooks) or to the Pennies 3 (that is, having bits cut out of the flesh, all over
 the body, of the size of pennies) or to the Brine Slits 4 (that is, having cuts made all over one's body
 by means of knives or sharp points, and then having salt and caustic liquids poured over the wounds)
 or to the Bar Turn 5 (that is, being transfixed to the ground by a bar of iron passing through the root
 of the ear, and then being dragged round and round by the leg) or to the Straw Seat 6 (that is, being
 so beaten, with clubs that

⁴¹ 6 Paldla-pi/[^]akaTz. I follow throughout Hinai-kumbure's interpretation (pp. 260, 261) of these
 pretty names, which could be well matched in the West. That some Indian kings were cruel in the
 extreme is no doubt true. But it must not be supposed that this list gives the names of well-known
 punishments. It is merely a string of technical terms which is repeated by rote whenever tortures have
 to be specified. And the meaning of its terms was most likely unknown to the verj r people who so
 used them. For the whole list (which is taken by our author from the Pali Pitakas) is explained by
 Buddhaghosa in his commentary, the Manoratha Purawt, on Anguttara II, i, i, as edited by Dr. Morris
 at pp. 113, 114 of the first edition of his Anguttara for the Pali Text Society, 1884. But Buddhaghosa's
 explanations differ from Hinai-kumbure s in several details; and to nearly half the names he gives

alternative meanings, quite contradictory to those that he gives first. So the list had its origin some centuries (say 400-500) B. c., and was certainly

⁴² the bones are broken, and the body becomes like a heap of straw) or to be anointed with boiling oil, or to be eaten by dogs, or to be impaled alive, or to be beheaded. Such and such, O king, are the manifold and various pains which a being caught in the whirlpool of births and rebirths has to endure. Just, O king, as the water rained down upon the Himlaya mountain flows, in its course along the Ganges, through and over rocks and pebbles and gravel, whirlpools and eddies and rapids \ and the stumps and branches of trees which obstruct and oppose its passage, just so has each being caught in the succession of births and rebirths to endure such and such manifold and various pains. Full of pain, then, is the continual succession of rebirths, a joy is it when that succession ends. And it was in pointing out the advantage of that end, the disaster involved in that succession, that the Blessed One, great king, instigated us to get beyond birth, and old age, and disease, and death by the realisation of the final end of that succession of rebirths. This is the sense, O king, which led the Blessed One to instigate us (to put an end to life)/

⁴³ 'Very good, Nagasena ! Well solved is the puzzle (I put), well set forth are the reasons (you alleged). That is so, and I accept it as you say/

⁴⁴ [Here ends the problem as to suicide.] not understood in the fifth century A. D. ; and was probably therefore unintelligible also, at least in part, to our author.

⁴⁵ LOVE. 279 [A LOVING DISPOSITION.] 1 6. [198] 'Venerable Nagasena, it has been said by the Blessed One : " Eleven advantages, O brethren, may be anticipated from practising, making a habit of, enlarging within one, using as a means of advancement, and as a basis of conduct, pursuing after, accumulating, and rising well up to the very heights of the emancipation of heart, arising from a feeling of love (towards all beings) 1 . And what are these eleven ? He who does so sleeps in peace, and in peace does he awake. He dreams no sinful dreams. He becomes dear to men, and to the beings who are not men . The gods watch over him. Neither fire, nor poison, nor sword works any harm to him. Quickly and easily does he become tranquillised. The aspect of his countenance is calm. Undismayed does he meet death, and should he not press through to the Supreme Condition (of Aarahatship), then is he sure of rebirth in the Brahma world ." But on the other hand you (members of

⁴⁶ the Order) say that " Sima the Prince, while dwelling in the cultivation of a loving disposition toward all beings, and when he was (in consequence thereof) wandering in the forest followed by a herd of deer, was hit by a poisoned arrow shot by Piliyakkha the king, and there, on the spot, fainted and fell 1 /' Now, venerable Nagasena, if the passage I have quoted from the words of the Blessed One be right, then this statement of yours must be wrong. But if the story of Prince Scilma be right, then it cannot be true that neither fire, nor poison, nor sword can work harm to him who cultivates the habit of love to all beings. This too is a double-edged problem, so subtle, so abstruse, so delicate, and so profound, that the thought of having to solve it might well bring out sweat over the body even of the most subtle-minded of mortals. This problem is now put to you. Unravel this mighty knot . Throw light upon this matter 3 to the accomplishment of the desire of those sons of the Conqueror who shall arise hereafter V

⁴⁷ * The Blessed One spake, O king, as you have quoted And Prince Sima dwelling in the cultivation of love, and thus followed by a herd of deer when he was wandering in the forest, was hit by the

poisoned arrow shot by king Piliyakkha, and then and there fainted and fell. But there is a reason for that [199] And what is the reason ? Simply that those virtues (said in the passage you quoted

⁴⁸ 3 -SakkhuzTz dehi. So also p. 95 of the text. 17,4,16LOVE. 28l to be in the habit of love) are virtues not attached to the personality of the one who loves, but to the actual presence of the love that he has called up in his heart \ And when Prince S4ma was upsetting the water-pot, that moment he lapsed from the actual feeling of love. At the moment, O king, in which an individual has realised the sense of love, that moment neither fire, nor poison, nor sword can do him harm. If any men bent on doing him an injury come up, they will not see him, neither will they have a chance of hurting him. But these virtues, O king, are not inherent in the individual, they are in the actual felt presence of the love that he is calling up in his heart.'

⁴⁹ * Or it is like the case of a man [200] who has entered into a well-formed mighty cave. No storm of rain, however mightily it might pour down, would be able to w r et him. But that would be by no virtue inherent

⁵⁰ in the man. It would be a virtue inherent in the cave that so mighty a downpour of rain could not wet the man. And just so, O king, is it with the virtue inherent in the felt presence of love that a man has called up in his heart V

⁵¹ 1 This is no quibble. The early Buddhists did believe in the power of a subjective love over external circumstances. It is true that the best known instances in which this power is represented as having been actually exercised, are instances of the power of love over the hearts of other beings, and hence, indirectly, over their actions. Thus when Devadatta had had the fierce, manslaying elephant Nalagiri let loose against the Buddha (^ullavagga VII, 3, n, 12), Gotama is said to have permeated him with his love, and the elephant then went up to him only to salute him, and allowed himself to be stroked, and did no harm. And when the five disciples had intended, when he went to Benares, to show him no respect, the Buddha, in like manner, is said to have * concentrated that feeling of his love which was able to pervade generally all beings in earth and heaven/ and to have ' directed it specially towards them/ Then f the sense of his love diffused itself through their hearts. And as he came nearer and nearer, unable any longer to adhere to their resolve, they rose from their seats, and bowed down before him, and welcomed him with every mark of reverence and of respect' (' Buddhist Birth Stories/ vol. i, p. 112).

⁵² And when he wished to convert Rqg-a the Mallian, the Buddha is said, in like manner, to have ' suffused him with the feeling of his love/ And then Rqa, e overcome by the Blessed One by the sense of his love just as a young calf follows the kine, so did he go from apartment to apartment ' seeking the Blessed One (Mahavagga VI, 36, 4).

⁵³ And again, when the Bhikkhus told the Buddha of a brother having been killed by a snake-bite, he is represented (in the -ffullavagga V, 6) to have said : ' Now surely that brother had not let his love flow out over the four royal kinds of serpents. Had he done so, he would not have died of the bite of a snake/ And then he is said to have enjoined the use of a poem of love to snakes (set out in the text quoted) as a safeguard against snake-bite. This goes really much further than the other instances, but no case is given of that safeguard having been actually used successfully. And I know of no case in the Pali Pitakas of the felt presence

⁵⁴ IV, 4> T 7DEVADATTA. 283 ' Most wonderful is it, Nagasena, and most strange how the felt presence of love has the power of warding off all evil states of mind 1 /

⁵⁵ ' Yes ! The practice of love is productive of all virtuous conditions of mind both in good (beings) and in evil ones. To all beings whatsoever, who are in the bonds of conscious existence , is this practice of love of great advantage, and therefore ought it to be sedulously cultivated/

⁵⁶ [Here ends the problem as to the power of love.] [DEVADATTA.] 1 7. ' Venerable Nagasena, is the consequence the same to him who does good and to him who does evil, or is there any difference in the two cases ? '

⁵⁷ * There is a difference, O king, between good and evil. Good works have a happy result, and lead to Sagga , and evil works have an unhappy result, and lead to Niraya V

⁵⁸ of the feeling of love being said to have actually counteracted either fire, or poison, or sword. It is noteworthy that the Sinhalese inserts here six pages (265-271) of matter not found in the P&1L But as it gives at length the story of Prince Sima, it is taken, I presume, from the (rataka book.

⁵⁹ IV, 4, 18. ' But, venerable Nagasena, your people say that Devadatta was altogether wicked, full of wicked dispositions, and that the Bodisat 1 was altogether pure, full of pure dispositions . And yet Devadatta, through successive existences , was not only quite equal to the Bodisat, but even sometimes superior to him, both in reputation and in the number of his adherents.

⁶⁰ 1 8. 'Thus, Nagasena, when Devadatta became the Purohita (family Brahman, royal chaplain) of Brahmadatta, the king, in the city of Benares, then the Bodisat was a wretched KndX a (outcast) 4 who knew by heart a magic spell. And by repeating his spell he produced mango fruits out of season . This

⁶¹ 2 'Wicked' and 'pure' are in the Pali kawhe and sukka, literally, 4 dark ' and ' light.' The only other passage I recollect where these names of colours are used in an ethical sense is the 87th verse of the Dhammapada. Professor Max Muller there renders : f A wise man should lea\ e the dark state (of ordinary life), and follow the bright state (of the Bhikshu),' (S.B.E., vol. x, p. 26.) But the words should certainly be translated : f A wise man should put away wicked dispositions, and cultivate purity of heart/ Bhavetha could never refer to adopting or following any outward profession. It is exclusively used of the practice, cultivation, of inward feelings. And the commentary, which is quoted by Professor Fausboll, takes the passage in the Dhammapada in that sense, just as Hinai-kumbur (p. 271) does here.

⁶² 4 jfiTavaka-a</lla. The JSTawalas are a well-known caste still existing in India if indeed that can rightly be called a caste -which is beneath all others. ^Ty&avaka is not in Childers, but is applied below (p. 256 of our text) to Mara, the Buddhist Satan. See also the next note.

⁶³ IV, 4> 20. DEVADATTA. 285 is one case in which the Bodisat was inferior to Devadatta in birth, [201] inferior to him in reputation/

⁶⁴ 'And again, when Devadatta became a king, a mighty monarch of the earth , living in the enjoyment of all the pleasures of sense, then the Bodisat was an elephant, decked with all manner of ornaments that the king migKt make use of them. And the king, being put out of temper at the sight of his graceful and pleasant style of pace and motion, said to the elephant trainer with the hope of bringing about the death of the elephant : " Trainer, this elephant has not been properly trained, make him perform the trick called 4 Sky walking.'" In that case too the Bodisat w r as inferior to Devadatta, was a mere foolish animal V

⁶⁵ 'And again, when Devadatta became a man who gained his living by winnowing grain , then 217-30), and also from the older and shorter version contained in the Old Commentary on the Patimokkha (on the 6gth Sakhiya, Vinaya IV, pp. 203, 204). [The name of that story in Professor Fausboll's edition is -Oavaka-ataka, but throughout the story itself the word Aazala is used in the passages corresponding to those in which Professor Fausboll has ^Tapaka (sic), a coincidence which throws light on our author, -Oavaka-a</ala.] The story here referred to is the Amba ffitaka (No. 474) in which the word .Oavaka does not occur.

⁶⁶ 1 c Of Magadha/ says Hinai-kumbur (p. 272). the Bodisat was a monkey called " the broad earth." Here again we have the difference between an animal and a man, and the Bodisat was inferior in birth to Devadatta V

⁶⁷ 'And again, when Devadatta became a man, by name Souttara, a Nesslda (one of an outcast tribe of aborigines, who lived by hunting), and was of great strength and bodily power, like an elephant, then the Bodisat was the king of elephants under the name of the " Six-tusked." And in that birth, the hunter slew the elephant In that case too Devadatta was the superior . '

⁶⁸ 'And again, when Devadatta became a man, a wanderer in the woods, without a home, then the Bodisat was a bird, a partridge who knew the Vedic hymns. And in that birth too the woodman killed the bird. So in that case also Devadatta was the superior by birth V

⁶⁹ 4 And again, when Devadatta became the king of Benares, by name Kalabu, then the Bodisat was an ascetic who preached kindness to animals. And the king (who was fond of sport), enraged with the ascetic, had his hands and feet cut off like so many bambu sprouts . In that birth, too, Deva-

⁷⁰ IY, 4, 27. DEVADATTA. 287 datta was the superior, both in birth and in reputation among men/ 24. ' And again, when Devadatta became a man, a woodman, then the Bodisat was Nandiya the monkey king. And in that birth too the man killed the monkey, and his mother besides, and his younger brother. So in that case also it was Devadatta who was the superior in birth V

⁷¹ 'And again, when Devadatta became a man, a naked ascetic, by name Karambhiya, then the Bodisat was a snake king called " the Yellow one." So in that case too it was Devadatta [202] who was the superior in birth V

⁷² ' And again, when Devadatta became a man, a crafty ascetic with long matted hair, then the Bodisat was a famous pig, by name cc the Carpenter/' So in that case too it was Devadatta who was the superior in birth 3 /

⁷³ "And again, when Devadatta became a king among the ATetas, by name. Sura Pariara , who had the power of travelling through the air at a level above men's heads , then the Bodisat was a Brah-

⁷⁴ man named Kapila. So in that case too it was Devadatta who was the superior in birth and in reputation/ 28. ' And again, when Devadatta became a man, by name Sama, then the Bodisat was a king among the deer, by name Ruru. So in that case too it was Devadatta who was the superior in birth V

⁷⁵ ' And again, when Devadatta became a man, a hunter wandering in the woods, then the Bodisat was a male elephant, and that hunter seven times broke off and took away the teeth of the elephant So in that case too it was Devadatta who was the superior in respect of the class of beings into which he was born V

⁷⁶ ' And again, when Devadatta became a jackal who wanted to conquer the world , and brought the kings of all the countries in India under his control, then the Bodisat was a wise man, by name Vidhura. So in that case too it was Devadatta who was the superior in glory/

⁷⁷ 'And again, when Devadatta became the IV, 4, 3 6 - DEVADATTA. 289 elephant who destroyed the young of the Chinese partridge, then the Bodisat was also an elephant, the leader of his herd. So in that case they were both on a par V

⁷⁸ 'And again, when Devadatta became a yakkha, by name Unrighteous, then the Bodisat too was a yakkha, by name Righteous. So in that case too they were both on a par 2 /

⁷⁹ * And again, when Devadatta became a sailor, the chief of five hundred families, then the Bodisat too was a sailor, the chief of five hundred families. So in that case too they were both on a par 3 /

⁸⁰ 'And again, when Devadatta became a caravan leader, the lord of five hundred waggons, then the Bodisat too was a caravan leader, the lord of five hundred waggons. So in that case too they were both on a par V

⁸¹ [203] c And again, when Devadatta became a king of deer, by name Sikha, then the Bodisat was a king of deer, by name Nigrodha. So in that case too they were both on a par 5 /

⁸² * And again, when Devadatta became a commander-in-chief, by name S&kha, then the Bodisat [35] u was a king, by name Nigrodha. So in that case too they were both on a par V

⁸³ (And again, when Devadatta became a brahman, by name Kha?^ahala, then the Bodisat was a prince, by name -ffanda. So in that case that Khadahala was the superior 2 /

⁸⁴ 'And again, when Devadatta became a king, by name Brahmadatta, then the Bodisat was his son, the prince called Mahi Paduma. In that case the king had his son cast down seven times, from the precipice from which robbers were thrown down. And inasmuch as fathers are superior to and above their sons, in that case too it was Devadatta was the superior V

⁸⁵ * And again, when Devadatta became a king, by name Mahi Patipa, then the Bodisat was his son, Prince Dhamma-p&l& and that king had the hands and feet and head of his son cut off. So in that case too Devadatta \was the superior V

⁸⁶ 'And now again, in this life, they were in the Sikya clan, and the Bodisat became a Buddha, all wise, the leader of the world, and Devadatta having left the world to join the Order founded by Him who is above the god of gods, and having attained to the powers of Iddhi, was filled with lust to become himself the Buddha. Come now, most venerable Nllgasena! Is not all that I have said true, and just, and accurate ? '

⁸⁷ s This is the Maha Paduma a*taka (No. 472, Fausboll, vol. iv, pp. 187-195). It was a case of Joseph and Potiphar's wife.

⁸⁸ * This tragical story is No. 358 in the Gataka collection (Fausboll, vol. iii, pp. 177-182). DEVADATTA. 2 9 1 41. 'All the many things which you, great king, have now propounded, are so, and not otherwise.'

⁸⁹ ' Then, Nagasena, unless black and white are the same in kind, it follows that good and evil bear equal fruit/ ' Nay, not so, great king ! Good and evil have not the same result. Devadatta was opposed by everybody. No one was hostile to the Bodisat. And the hostility which Devadatta felt towards the Bodisat, that came to maturity and bore fruit in each successive birth. And so also as Devadatta,

when he was established in lordship over the world, [204] was a protection to the poor, put up bridges and courts of justice and rest-houses for the people, and gave gifts according to his bent to Samaras and Brahmans, to the poor and needy and the wayfarers, it was by the result of that conduct that, from existence to existence, he came into the enjoyment of so much prosperity. For of whom, O king, can it be said that without generosity and selfrestraint, without self-control and the observance of the Upasatha \ he can reach prosperity ?

⁹⁰ * And when, O king, you say that Devadatta and the Bodisat accompanied one another in the passage from birth to birth, that meeting together of theirs took place not only at the end of a hundred, or a thousand, or a hundred thousand births, but was in fact constantly and frequently taking place through an immeasurable period of time . For you should regard that matter in the light of the comparison drawn by the Blessed One between the case of the

⁹¹ U 2 purblind tortoise and the attainment of the condition of a human being. And it was not only with Devadatta that such union took place. Siriputta the Elder also, O king, was through thousands of births the father, or the grandfather, or the uncle 19 or the brother, or the son, or the nephew, or the friend of the Bodisat; and the Bodisat was the father, or the grandfather, or the uncle, or the brother, or the son, or the nephew, or the friend of Sariputta the Elder.

⁹² c And when, O king, Devadatta as the god, had been himself Unrighteous, and had led others into unrighteousness of life, he was burnt in purgatory for an immeasurable period of time . [205] But the Bodisat, who, as the god, had been himself Righteous, and had led others into righteousness of life, lived in all the bliss of heaven for a like immeasurable period of time. And whilst in this life, Devadatta, who had plotted injury against the Buddha, and had created a schism in the Order, was swallowed up by the earth, the Tathigata,

⁹³ 2 'Fifty-seven kois and sixty hundreds of thousands of years/ says the text, with touching accuracy. IV, 4, 4iDEVADATTA. 293

⁹⁴ knowing all that can be known, arrived at the insight of Buddhahood , and was completely set free (from the necessity of becoming) by the destruction of all that leads to re-existence.'

⁹⁵ * Very good, Nagasena! That is so, and I accept it as you say V [Here ends the dilemma as to Devadatta's superiority to the Bodisat in previous births.]

⁹⁶ 2 This discussion is very interesting, both as a specimen of casuistry, and as an exposition of orthodox Buddhist belief. And it is full of suggestion if taken as a statement of the kind of reason which led the Buddhist editors of the earlier folk-lore to identify Devadatta with the characters referred to by king Milinda. But the facts are that those editors, in using the old stories and legends for their ethical purposes, always identified Devadatta with the cruel person in the story, and paid no heed to the question whether he was superior or not in birth or in the consideration of the world, to the person they identified with the Bodisat In searching through the four volumes of the published (jratikas, and the proof-sheets of the fifth volume with which Professor Fausboll has favoured me, for the purpose of tracing the stories referred to by our author, I find that Devadatta appears in sixty-four of them, and that in almost every one of these sixty-four he is either superior in birth, or equal to the character identified with the Bodisat. This is not surprising, for it is not unusually the superiors in birth who are guilty of the kind of cruelty and wickedness which the Buddhist editors would ascribe to Devadatta. So that our author, had he chosen to do so, might have adduced many other instances of a similar kind to those he actually quotes. I add in an appendix the full list of the Devadatta stories in

the Gtakas. It is clear our author had before him a version of the ffataka book slightly different from our own, as will be seen from the cases pointed out in the notes in which, as to names or details, the story known to him differs from the printed text. And also that here (as at III, 6, 2) he would have been able to solve his own dilemma much better if he had known more of the history of those sacred books on the words of which it is based.

⁹⁷ [WOMEN'S WILES.] 42. ' Venerable Nagasena, it has been said by the Blessed One : ** With opportunity, and secrecy, And the right woo'r, all women will go wrong Aye, failing others, with a cripple even ." But on the other hand it is said: " Mahosadha's wife, Amara, when left behind in the village while her husband was away on a journey, remained alone and in privacy, and regarding her husband as a man would regard his sovran lord, she refused to do wrong, even when tempted with a thousand pieces ." Now if the first of these passages be correct, the second must be wrong ; and if the second be right, [206] the first must be wrong. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

⁹⁸ * It is so said, O king, as you have quoted, touching the conduct of Amari, Mahosadha's wife. But the question is would she have done wrong, on receipt of those thousand pieces, with the right man : or would she not have done so, if she had had the opportunit} 7 -, and the certainty of secrecy, and a suitable wooer ? Now, on considering the matter, that lady Amari was not certain of any of these

⁹⁹ IV, 4, 43WOMEN. 295 things. Through her fear of censure in this world the opportunity seemed to her not fit, and through her fear of the sufferings of purgatory in the next world. And because she knew how bitter is the fruit of wrong-doing, and because she did not wish to lose her loved one, and because of the high esteem in which she held her husband, and because she honoured goodness, and despised ignobleness of life, and because she did not want to break with her customary mode of life for all these reasons the opportunity seemed to her not fit.

¹⁰⁰ ' And, further, she refused to do wrong because, on consideration, she was not sure of keeping the thing secret from the world. [207] For even could she have kept it secret from men, yet she could not have concealed it from spirits I even could she have kept it secret from spirits, yet she could not have concealed it from those recluses who have the power of knowing the thoughts of others even could she have kept it secret from them, yet she could not have concealed it from those of the gods who can read the hearts of men even could she have kept it secret from the gods, yet she could not have escaped, herself, from the knowledge of her sin even could she have remained ignorant of it herself, yet she could not have kept it secret from (the law of the result which follows on) unrighteousness . Such were the

¹⁰¹ a Adhammena raho na labheyya. I am in great doubt as to the real meaning of these words, which Hinai-kumburS (p. 286) renders merely adharmayen rahasak no labannS. They look very much like a kind of personification of Karma. The phrase is really very parallel to the saying in Numbers xxxii. 23, Be sure your sin will find you out * namely, in its results and is as true ethically as it is difficult grammatically.

¹⁰² various reasons which led her to abstain from doing \wrong because she could not be sure of secrecy. * And, further, she refused to do wrong because, on consideration, she found no right wooer. Mahosadha the wise, O king, was endowed with the eight and twenty qualities. And which are those twentyeight ? He was brave, O king, and full of modesty, and ashamed to do wrong, he had many adherents, and many friends, he was forgiving, he was upright in life, he was truthful, he was pure in

word; and/ deed and heart \ he was free from malice, he was not puffed up, he felt no jealousy , he was full of energy, he strove after all good things , he was popular with all men, he was generous, he was friendly , he was humble in disposition, he was free from guile, he was free from deceit, he was full of insight, he was of high reputation, he had much knowledge, he sought after the good of those dependent on him, his praise was in all men's mouths, great was his wealth, and great his fame. Such were the twentyeight qualities, O king, with which Mahosadha, the wise, was endowed. And it was because she found no wooer like unto him that she did no wrong V

¹⁰³ * Sakhilo, ' kindly in speech/ says the Sinhalese. 5 This is all very well, but it does not confirm, it explains away, the supposed quotation from the Buddha's words.

¹⁰⁴ IV, 4, 44 ARAHATS. 29 7 [Here ends the dilemma as to the wickedness of women .] [ON THE FEARLESSNESS OF THE ARAHATS.] 44. ' Venerable Nagasena, it was said by the Blessed One : " The Arahats have laid aside all fear and trembling 2 / ' But on the other hand when, in the city of RCLfagaha, they saw Dhana-palaka, the man-slaying elephant, bearing down upon the Blessed

¹⁰⁵ 1 The position of women in India, at the time when Buddhism arose, was, theoretically, very low. The folk tales are full of stories turning on the wiles of women, and the Hindoo law-books seem never tired of the theme of her uncleanness, her weakness, and her wickedness. But, except in matters of property, the bark was I think worse than the bite. Among the people, in the homes of the peasantry, the philippics of the Brahmin priests were not much regarded, and the women led lives as pleasant as those of their male relations, and shared in such mental and physical advantages as their male relations enjoyed. The influence of Buddhism must have been felt in two directions. In the first place the importance attached to the celibate life must have encouraged the kind of view taken of women among Catholics in mediaeval times (the Brahmin view being much akin to those that were promulgated by Luther). On the other hand the fact that women were admitted to the Order, and that the still higher aim of Arahatship was held to be attainable by them, must have helped to encourage a high esteem for women. We have many instances of women who were credited with the insight of Arahatship. A whole treatise in the Buddhist sacred books, the Theri Gatha, is devoted to hymns and poems ascribed to them, and many of these reach a very high level of intelligent and spiritual emotion.

¹⁰⁶ One, all the five hundred Arahats forsook the Conqueror and fled, one only excepted, Ananda the Elder . Now how was it, Nagasena? Did those Arahats run away from fear or did they run away willing to let the Blessed One be destroyed, and thinking : " (Our conduct) will be clear (to him) from the way in which he himself will act ," [208] or did they run away with the hope of watching the immense and unequalled mighty power which the Tathagata would exhibit ? If, Nagasena, what the

¹⁰⁷ 1 Here again we have a variation between our author's words and those of the Pitakas. In the -Sullavagga VII, 3, n, 12 (translated in pp. 247-250 of vol. iii of the 'Vinaya Texts' in the ' Sacred Books of the East '), we have the oldest versions of this story; and there the elephant is called, not Dhana-palaka, but Nilagiri, and the number of attendant disciples (who are not called Arahats) is not given as five hundred. The Buddha is simply said to have entered Ra-agaha * with a number of Bhikkhus/ Nothing also is said, either of their running away, or of Ananda's remaining behind. It is, no doubt, an easily explicable and very pretty alteration of the story, which exhibits Ananda, the beloved disciple, as acting in this Tray. But it is none the less an alteration.

¹⁰⁸ It should be added that Nal&giri (it should be Nadgiri) in the Vinaya text is a personal name of the elephant, but may be derived from its place of origin. (See the references to a famous elephant named Naagiri in the Megha Duta and Naagiri in the KatM Sarit Sagara XI, 42, XII, 10, XIII, 7, 29. But Paraini VI, 3, 117, gives the latter as the name of a mountain.) So while there may be a variation in the legend, it may also be that we have only two names for the same elephant, just as one might speak of the Shetland pony (named) Brownie. And the stanza quoted below (p. 410 of the Pali text) shows that the name Dhana-palaka was given already in older texts to the Nadgiri elephant.

¹⁰⁹ IV, 4,45ARAHATS. 299 Blessed One said as to the Arahats being devoid of fear be true, then this story must be false. But if the story be true, then the statement that the Arahats have put away fear and trembling must be false. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

¹¹⁰ 'The Blessed One did say, O king, that Arahats have put away all fear and trembling, and five hundred Arahats, save only Ananda, did, as you say, run away when the elephant Dhana-pilaka bore down upon the Tathagata that day in Ragaha. But that was neither out of fear, nor from willingness to let the Blessed One be destroyed. For the cause by which Arahats could be made to fear or tremble has been destroyed in them, and therefore are they free from fear or trembling. Is the broad earth, O king, afraid at people digging into it, or breaking it up, or at having to bear the weight of the mighty oceans and the peaked mountain ranges ? '

¹¹¹ 'But why not? 1 * Because there is no cause in the broad earth which could produce fear or trembling/ 'Just so, O king. And neither is there any such cause in Arahats. And would a mountain peak be afraid of being split up, or broken down, or made to fall, or burnt with fire ? ?

¹¹² ' Certainly not, Sir/ 'But why not ?' [209] 'The cause of fear or trembling does not exist within it/ ' And just so, O king, with Arahats. If all the creatures of various outward form in the whole

¹¹³ universe 1 were, together, to attack one Arahat in order to put him to fear, yet would they bring about no variation in his heart. And why? Because there is neither condition nor cause for fear (in him, whence fear could arise). Rather, O king, was it these considerations that arose in the minds of those Arahats : " To-day when the best of the best of men, the hero among conquerors, has entered into the famous city, Dhana-pdlaka the elephant will rush down the street. But to a certainty the brother who is his special attendant will not forsake him who is above the god of gods. But if we should not go away, then neither will the goodness of Ananda be made manifest, nor will the elephant actually approach 2 the Tathagata. Let us then withdraw. Thus will great masses of the people attain to emancipation from the bonds of evil, and the goodness of Ananda be made manifest" It was on the realisation of the fact that those advantages would arise from their doing so, that the Arahats withdrew to every side/

¹¹⁴ 'Well, Nagasena, have you solved the puzzle. That is fo. The Arahats feared not, nor did they tremble. But for the advantages that they foresaw they withdrew on every side/

¹¹⁵ [Here ends the problem as to the panic of the Arahats.] IV, 4, 47OMNISCIENCE. 3<DI [ON CAUSING THE OMNISCIENT ONE TO CHANGE HIS

¹¹⁶ MIND.] 46. 'Venerable Nagasena, your people say that the Tathigata is all wise \ And on the other hand they say : " When the company of the members of the Order presided over by Sariputta and Moggallina had been dismissed by the Blessed One , then the Sakyas of KitumH and Brahma

Sabanipati, by means of the parables of the seed and of the calf, gained the Buddha over, and obtained his forgiveness, and made him see the thing in the right light 3 / 1 Now how was that, Nagasena? Were those two parables unknown to him that he should be [210] appeased and gained over to their side, and brought to see the matter in a new light ? But if he did not already know them, then, Nagasena, he was not all-wise. If he did know them, then he must have dismissed those brethren rudely and violently 4 in order to try them ; and therein is his unkindness made manifest. This too is a double-edged problem now put to you, and you have to solve it/

¹¹⁷ ' The Tathagata, O king, was all-wise, and yet, pleased at those parables, he was gained over by them, he granted pardon to the brethren he had sent

¹¹⁸ away, and he saw the matter in the light (in which the intercessors on their behalf wished him to see it). For the TatMgata, O king, is lord of the Scriptures. It was with parables that had been first preached by the Tathdgata himself 1 that they conciliated him, pleased him, gained him over, and it was on being thus gained over that he signified his approval (of what they had said). It was, O king, as when a wife conciliates, and pleases, and gains over her husband by means of things that belong to the husband himself; and the husband signifies his approval thereof. Or it was, O king, as when the royal barber conciliates and pleases and gains over the king when he dresses the king s head with the golden comb 2 which belongs to the king himself, and the king then signifies his approval thereof. Or it was, O king, as when an attendant novice, when he serves his teacher with the food given in alms which his teacher has himself brought home, conciliates him and pleases him and gains him over, and the teacher then signifies his approval thereof.'

¹¹⁹ ' Very good, Nagasena ! That is so, and I accept it as you say/ [Here ends the problem as to the all-wise Buddha being gained over by intercession .] Here ends the Fourth Chapter.

THE PROBLEM OF INFERENCE.

¹ 1. Now Milinda the king went up to the place where Nagasena was, and bowed down before him, and took his seat on one side. And when so seated he, longing to know, to hear, and to remember, and longing to make the light of knowledge arise and to break in pieces his ignorance, roused up in himself courage and zeal, and, full of self-possession and thoughtfulness, spake thus to Nagasena :

² 'Venerable Nagasena, tell me, have you ever seen the Buddha? ?' 'No, O king.' 'Then have your teachers ever seen the Buddha?'

³ 'No, Sire.' 'So you say, venerable Nagasena, that you have never seen the Buddha, and that your teachers have never seen the Buddha. Therefore, Nagasena, the Buddha did not exist. There is no clear evidence, in that case, of a Buddha.'

⁴ 'But did those Kshatriyas of old exist, who were the founders of the line of kings from which you come ?' 'Certainly, Sir. How can there be any doubt about that ?'

⁵ 'Well, O king. Have you ever seen them ?' SNonSin * A similar question has been already asked above, III, 5, 1 (I, 109).

⁶ lees OF MILINDA THE KING. 207 'And those who instructed you—the family chaplains, and officers of the staff, and those who lay down the law, and ministers of state—have they ever seen those Kshatriyas of old ?'

⁷ ‘No, Sir.’ ‘If then neither have you seen them, nor your teachers, where are they? There is no clear evidence, in that case, of those Kshatriyas of old!’

⁸ ‘But, Nagasena, the royal insignia they used are still to be seen—[880] the white sunshade of state, and the crown, and the slippers, and the fan with the yak’s tail, and the sword of state, and the priceless throne—and by these can we know and believe that the Kshatriyas of old lived once.’

⁹ ‘Just so, O king, can we know that Blessed One and believe in him. For there is a reason for our knowledge and belief that the Blessed One was. And what is that reason >—The royal insignia used by that Blessed One, by him of knowledge and insight, the Arahats, the Buddha Supreme, are still to be seen—the four Means of keeping oneself ready and mindful, and the fourfold Great Struggle, and the four steps to Iddhi, and the five Organs of the moral sense, and the five moral Powers, and the seven forms of the wisdom of the Arahats, and the Noble Eightfold Path —and by these can the whole

¹⁰ It is perhaps worthy of remark that both here and twice else- 208 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES KG. world of gods and men know and believe that that Blessed One existed once. By this reason, on this ground, by this argument, through this inference, can it be known that the Blessed One lived.

¹¹ ‘He who, himself set free in that bless’d state In which the Upadhis have ceased to be, —Lusts, sin, and Karma,—has brought safe ashore, Saved from the sea of woe, great multitudes— Only by inference can it be known That he, the best of men, existed once?.”

¹² ‘Venerable Nagasena, give me an illustration.’ ‘Just, O king, as the architect of a city 2, when he wants to build one, would first search out a pleasant spot of ground, with which no fault can be found, even, with no hills or gullies in it, free from rough ground and rocks, not open to the danger of attack. And then, when he has made plain any rough places there may still be on it, he would clear it thoroughly of all stumps and stakes, and would proceed to build there a city fine and regular, measured out into suitable quarters *, with trenches and ramparts thrown up around it*, with strong gateways, watch-towers, and battlements, with wide squares and open places and junctions (where two roads meet) and cross-ways (where four py ee where, at pp. 37, 335 (of the Pali), our author reverses the order of Nos. 4 and 5—the five moral Powers and the five Organs (of the higher sense) —which are really only the same mental qualities looked at from two different points of view.

¹³ * These verses have not been traced as yet in the Pisakas. * There is another parable of the architect above, p. 34 of the Pali (I, 53 of the translation),

¹⁴ * Bhagaso mitam, an expression constantly recurring. * Ukkinna. See Gataka IV, 106. Vi45 OF MILINDA THE KING. 209 toads meet)?, with cleanly and even high roads?, with regular lines of open shops (bazaars), well provided with parks, and gardens, and lakes, and lotus-ponds, and wells, adorned with many kinds of temples to the gods, free from every fault. And then when the city stood there in all its glory, he would go away to some other land. And in course of time that city might become mighty and prosperous, filled with stores of food, [881] peaceful, glorious, happy, free from distress and calamity, the meetingplace of all sorts and conditions of men. Then nobles and brahmans, merchants and work-people ; soldiers mounted on elephants, and on horses, and on chariots; infantry, and bowmen, and swordsmen ; standard-bearers, officers, and camp-followers*; highborn warriors whose delight is in war, fighting champions, men mighty as elephants, heroes,

men who fight in buckskin ‘4, devoted fighting-men born of slaves in great houses or of the privates in the royal army®; troops of professional wrestlers ° ;

¹⁵ ' According to the dictionaries each of those four words (kakkara, katukka, sandhi, and singhataka) means either a square, or a place where four roads meet. The Sinhalese has Apana-katushka-sandhi ceti, omitting the last and certainly inexact in its rendering of the first word. Sandhi I have only met with here in this sense.

¹⁶ ® For pivda-davika Hinasi-kumburé (who at p. 475 gives the Pali of all this) reads pizda-dayaka. *Vammino yodhino. But both Hinasi-kumburé here, and the parallel passage in the Sama##a Phala Sutta (D. II, 14), read Kamma-yodhino.

¹⁷ P 210 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES WV, 4e cooks and curry makers, barbers and bathing attendants, smiths and florists, workers in gold and silver and lead and tin and copper and brass? and iron, and jewellers; messengers; potters, salt gatherers’, tanners, carriage builders, carvers in ivory®, rope makers, comb makers, cotton-thread spinners, basket makers, bow manufacturers, bowstring makers, arrow fletchers, painters, dye manufacturers, dyers, weavers, tailors, assayers of gold‘, cloth merchants °, dealers in perfumes, grass cutters, hewers of wood, hired servants °, people who live by gathering flowers and fruits and roots in the woods, hawkers of boiled rice, sellers of cakes, fishmongers, butchers, dealers in strong drinks, play actors, dancers, acrobats’, conjurors, professional bards *, wrestlers

¹⁸ * Vaffakara. See the note above on IV, 7, 11 (p. 267 of the Pali). * Dantakara, which in the Sinhalese is simply repeated. There is no such word in Clough.

¹⁹ * Hera##ika. Childers says ‘royal treasurer,’ and Hnaikumburé ‘coiners of silver masakas’ (ran masu tanannoya), but Subhfiti (in his Sihalese gloss on Abhidhana Padipika, verse 343) renders it ‘judgers of gold’ (ran balann); and that this is right is shown by the context in the passage of the Sumangala Vilasin? (p. 315), where the probably identical word hera#@aka is used.

²⁰ * Dussika. Hfnasi-kumburé renders this word here by pili welendo, ‘cloth-sellers,’ but above (p. 262 of the Pali) by sAyam karako, ‘dice manufacturers.’

²¹ * It is instructive that men working for hire are put here among the lowest sort of work-people, while the slave born in the house stands in the best company.

²² " Langhaka. Pinum karayo, ‘turners of summersets’ in the Sinhalese. See Gataka I, 431, and above, pp. 31, 191 of the Pali.

²³ * Vetalika. Vetdliye hi mangalashaka kiyann4wf in Vee OF MILINDA THE KING. 211 (boxers), corpse burners, casters out of rotten flowers’, savages’, wild men of the woods, prostitutes, swingers and jumpers’, and the slave girls of bullies—people of many countries, people from Scythia, Bactria, China, and Vilata; people of Uggeni, of Bharuka%sha, of Benares, of Kosala, and of the border lands; people from Magadha, and Sdketa, and Sura¢éha, and the West; from Kofumbara and Madhura, from Alexandria, Kashmir, and Gandhdra*,—all these coming to take up their residence there, and finding the new city to be regular, faultless, perfect, and pleasant, would know: “Able indeed must that architect have been by whom this city was built!”

²⁴ ‘Just so, O king, that Blessed One, peerless, unequalled, unapproached, incomparable, admirable beyond all measure by weight or calculation, of infinite virtue, full of virtue and perfection,

boundless in wisdom and glory and zeal and power, who, when he had attained to the summit of all the perfections

²⁵ the Simhalese (Wandi-bhafayo according to Subhfiti on Abhidhana Padtpika 369). Pee PN 22 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES V, 6.

²⁶ of the Buddhas, [832] overthrew Mara and all his hosts,—he, bursting asunder the net of heresy, and casting aside ignorance, and causing wisdom to arise, and bearing aloft the torch of Truth, reached forward to Buddhahood itself, and so, unconquered and unconquerable in the fight, built this city of Righteousness. And the Blessed One's City of Righteousness, O king, has righteousness for its rampart, and fear of sin for its moat, and knowledge for the battlement over its city gate, and zeal for the watch-tower above that, and faith for the pillars at its base, and mindfulness for the watchman at the gate, and wisdom for the terrace above, and the Suttantas for its market-place, and the Abhidhamma for its cross-ways, and the Vinaya (the Canon Law) for its judgment hall, and constant self-possession for its chief street. And in that street, O king, these bazaars are open—a flower bazaar, and a fruit bazaar, and an antidote bazaar, and a medicine bazaar, and an ambrosia bazaar, and a bazaar for precious stones, and a bazaar for all manner of merchandise.'

²⁷ 'But what, venerable Nagasena, is the flower bazaar of the Blessed One, the Buddha ?' 'There are certain subjects for meditation, O king, that have been made known by the Blessed One, by him of knowledge and insight, by the Arahāt, the Buddha Supreme. And they are these. The idea of the impermanence (of every thing and of every being), the idea of the absence of any abiding principle (any soul in any thing or any being), the idea of the impurity and the idea of the danger connected with the body, the idea of getting rid of evil dispositions, the idea of freedom from passion, the idea of peace, the idea of dissatisfaction with the

²⁸ V, 6. OF MILINDA THE KING. 213 things of the world, the idea of the transitory nature of all conditions, the idea of ecstatic trance, the ideas of a corpse in the various stages of decay, the ideas of a place of execution in all its various horrors, the idea of love to all beings, the idea of pity for all beings, the idea of sympathy with all beings, the idea of equanimity in all the changing circumstances of life, the idea of death, and the idea of the body. These, O king, are the subjects for meditation prescribed by the Blessed One. And of these, whoever, longing to be delivered from old age and death, takes any one as the subject of his meditation, by that meditation does he become set free from passion, set free from malice, set free from dullness, set free from pride, set free from wrong views, by that does he cross the ocean of Samsara, and stem the torrent of cravings, and cleanse himself of the threefold stain², and destroy within himself all evil; and so, entering that glorious city, spotless and stainless, pure and white, [883] ageless and deathless, where all is security and calm and bliss—the city of Nirvāṇa—he emancipates his mind in Arahātship! And this, O king, is what is called "The Blessed One's bazaar of flowers." "Take with you Karma as the price,

²⁹ And go ye up to that bazaar, Buy there an object for your thought, Emancipate yourselves. Be free @!"''' ' This stanza has not yet been found in the Pisakas. In the first line it does not seem quite clear at first sight why Karma, of all things, should be the price. That Indian word being too

³⁰ 214 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES V. 7. 'And what, venerable Nagasena, is the perfume bazaar of the Blessed One, the Buddha ?'

³¹ 'There are certain categories of virtue, O king, that have been made known by the Blessed One, and anointed by the perfume of that righteousness the children of the Blessed One fill with the fumes

of the fragrant incense of the perfume of goodness the whole world of gods and men, in every direction, and to windward and to leeward, continuing to pervade it again and yet again. And which are those categories? The virtue of taking refuge},

³² full of meaning to be translateable, is necessarily retained, and hence the phrase ‘taking Karma as the price’ may convey no meaning at all. If so, in trying to escape Scylla the unhappy translator has fallen into Charybdis. But it must mean one of two things, either something to be abandoned, given up; or something good which the buyer possesses, and may exchange for the good he wants to buy. If our author means the first it must be Karma (as one of the Upadhis), as a basis for continued individuality, and be much the same as egoism. If he means the other, then Karma, though standing alone, must be here used in the sense of kusala-kamma, good Karma, that is, the effect of good deeds done in a former life. Now our author never elsewhere uses kamma, without any qualifying adjective, in the sense of good Karma. On pp. 4, 20, 67, 108 foll., 134, 151, 189, 302 of the Pali the unqualified word means throughout bad Karma, the effect of bad deeds done in a former birth. In a few passages it is used of former deeds in a way that apparently includes both good and bad. See especially pp. 3, 10, 146, 268. Now a buyer, in the case put, could not give up either the bad or the good deeds he had already done in a former life—that would be beyond his power. He could only offer, in exchange for the good he wanted to buy, good Karma (that is, in the sense of good deeds) either in the present, or in the immediate future. Below, V, 21 (p. 341 of the Pali), will be found instances given by our author himself, It is forced, no doubt, to call this ‘a price,’ but it is probably the sense intended, and so Hinasi-kumburé takes it.

³³ * Taking the threefold refuge in the Buddha, the Doctrine (Dharma), and the Order. V, 8: OF MILINDA THE KING. 21s the virtue that is fivefold and eightfold and tenfold A; and the virtue of self-restraint tabulated in the five recitations that compose the Patimokkha®, And this, O king, is what is called “The Blessed One’s bazaar of perfumes.” For it has been said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods:

³⁴ “No flower’s scent can go against the wind, Not sandal wood’s, nor musk’s, nor jasmine flower’s : But the sweet perfume of the good doth go Against the wind, and the good man pervades, On every side, the sweetness of his life *.”

³⁵ “Red sandal wood, musk, and the lotus, and jasmine— The perfume of goodness surpasseth them all. Abundant the sweet scent of musk and of sandal wood— Still stronger, the scent of the good mounts to heaven *!” 8. ‘And what, venerable Nagasena, is the fruit bazaar of the Blessed One, the Buddha ?’ ‘Certain fruits have been made known, O king, by the Blessed One. And they are these :— The fruit of the first stage of the Excellent Way (con-

³⁶ \$ From Anguttara Nikaya III, 79. The verse is quoted in the Dhammapada, verse 54, and also in the Gataka Book, III, 291.

³⁷ 216 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES V, 9. version), and of the second stage, and of the third stage, and of the fourth (Arahatship) ',—the fruit of the attainment of emptiness ?,—the fruit of the attainment of the absence of the three signs (of an unconverted life, lust, malice, and dullness)—and the truth of the attainment of that state in which no low aspirations survive. [884] And whosoever desires any one of these, he gives his Karma as the price, and buys the fruit he longs for—either conversion or any other.

³⁸ ‘Just, O king, as any man who has a mangotree bearing fruit all the year round, he does not knock down the fruits until buyers come. But when a buyer has come, and the fruit-grower has taken the price, then he says: “Come, my good man, this tree is always in bearing (it has therefore fruits in all stages of growth), take from it the kind of fruit you prefer, whether unripe, or decayed®, or hairy’, or sour, or ripe®.” And the buyer, for the price paid, takes the kind he likes the best—if that be unripe fruit then he takes that, if it be decayed fruit then that, if it be hairy fruit then that, if it be sour fruit then that, if it be ripe fruit then he takes a ripe one. Just so, O king, whosoever desires any one of those other fruits, he gives his Karma as the price, and buys the fruit he longs for—

³⁹ ‘The details of these ‘fruits’ will be found in ‘Buddhism,’ pp. 108-110. * As to in respect of what, see the note above on IV, 8, 69 (p. 219 of the Pali).

⁴⁰ * Dovilam, nilata says the Simhalese, p. 484. * Kesika. Hinai-kumburé merely repeats this word. ° The mango is used in all stages—when ripe for eating, and for pickles, curries, &c., in other stages.

⁴¹ V, 10. OF MILINDA THE KING. 217 either conversion or any other. And this, O king, is what is called “The Blessed One’s bazaar of fruits,” “Men give their Karma as the price, And buy the fruit ambrosia ; And happiness is theirs, and peace, Who’ve bought the fruit ambrosia ?.”

⁴² ‘And what, venerable Nagasena, is the antidote bazaar of the Blessed One, the Buddha ?’ ‘Certain drugs, O king, have been made known by the Blessed One; drugs by which the Blessed One delivers the whole world of gods and men from the poison of evil dispositions. And what are these drugs? The four Noble Truths made known by the Blessed One, that is to say, the truth as to sorrow, and the truth as to the origin of sorrow, and the truth as to the cessation of sorrow, and the truth as to that path which leads to the cessation of sorrow”. And whosoever, longing for the highest insight (the insight of Arahatsip)*, hear this doctrine of the four truths, they are set quite free from rebirth, [885] they are set quite free from old age, they are set quite free from death, they are set quite free from grief, lamentation, pain, sorrow, and despair. And this, O king, is what is called “The Blessed One’s bazaar of antidotes.”

⁴³ 218 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES ¥4e “Of all the drugs, in all the world, The antidotes of poison dire, Not one equals that Doctrine sweet. Drink that, O brethren. Drink and live!”

⁴⁴ ‘And what, venerable Nagasena, is the medicine bazaar of the Blessed One, the Buddha ?’ ‘Certain medicines, O king, have been made known by the Blessed One, medicines by which he cures the whole world of gods and men. And they are these:—“The four Means of keeping oneself ready and mindful, and the fourfold Great Struggle, and the four Steps to Iddhi, and the five Organs of the moral sense, and the five moral Powers, and the seven Forms of the Wisdom of the Arahats, and the Noble Eightfold Path*.” By these medicines the Blessed One purges men of wrong views, purges them of low aspirations, purges them of evil speaking, purges them of evil deeds, purges them of evil modes of livelihood, purges them of wrong endeavours, purges them of evil thoughts, purges them of erroneous meditation; and he gives emetics to the vomiting up of lusts, and of malice, and of dullness, and of doubt, and of self-righteousness, and of sloth of body and inertness of mind, and of shamelessness and hardness of heart, and of all evil. And this, O king, is what is called “The Blessed One’s bazaar of medicine.” “Of all the medicines found in all the world,

⁴⁵ Many in number, various in their powers, Not one equals this medicine of the Truth. Drink that, O brethren. Drink, and drinking, live!

⁴⁶ Vs 12. OF MILINDA THE KING. 219 For having drunk that medicine of the Truth, Ye shall have past beyond old age and death, And—evil, lusts, and Karma rooted out—

⁴⁷ Thoughtful and seeing, ye shall be at rest!!” 12. ‘And what, venerable Nagasena, is the ambrosia bazaar of the Blessed One, the Buddha ?’

⁴⁸ ‘An ambrosia, O king, has been made known by the Blessed One, that ambrosia with which he besprinkles the whole world of gods and men—as men anoint a king on his coronation day—[886] and men and gods, when sprinkled with that ambrosia, are set free from rebirths, old age, disease, and death, from grief, and lamentation, and pain, and sorrow, and despair. And what is that ambrosia? That meditation which consists in active attention to, and leads to a true grasp of, the real conditions of corporeal things*. For it has been said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods:

⁴⁹ “They, O brethren, feed on ambrosia who feed on active attention directed to corporeal things *.” This, O king, is what is called “ The Blessed One’s

⁵⁰ ambrosia bazaar.” ’ 1 Nibbut, with allusion to the freedom and calm of Nirvaza. The verses have not been traced as yet in the Pifakas.

⁵¹ ® KAaya-gata-sati-bhavan, where each term really requires a long commentary. 220 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Vo: “ He saw mankind afflicted with disease, He opened freely his ambrosia shop ; Go, then, O brethren, give your Karma for it, And buy, and feed on, that ambrosial food ?.”

⁵² ‘And what, venerable Nagasena, is the jewel bazaar of the Blessed One, the Buddha ?’ ‘Certain jewels, O king, have been made known by the Blessed One, and adorned with those jewels the children of the Blessed One shine forth in splendour, illuminating the whole world of gods and men, brightening it in its heights, in its depths, from horizon to horizon, with a brilliant glory. And those jewels are these—the jewel of right conduct, and the jewel of meditation, and the jewel of knowledge, and the jewel of emancipation, and the jewel of the insight which arises from the assurance of emancipation, and the jewel of discrimination, and the jewel of the sevenfold wisdom of the Arahats%;

⁵³ “And what, O king, is the Blessed One’s jewel of right conduct®? The right conduct which follows on self-restraint according to the rules of the Patimokkha, the right conduct which follows on

⁵⁴ * Not traced as yet. All these stanzas seem to belong together, and will doubtless be found in the same Sutta or poem. * These seven jewels (or treasures, ratanani) of the Buddha are intended of course to correspond to the seven treasures (also ratanani) of the king of kings (the kakkavatti). They are different from the seven ‘Treasures of the Noble Ones’ (Ariyadhanani) which are ethical qualities, whereas these jewels are means to the attainment of Arahatship,

⁵⁵ * Sila, a most difficult word to translate, as it includes so much that in English would be expressed by the varying phrases: goodness, virtue, righteousness, uprightness, morality, &c.

⁵⁶ Vou OF MILINDA THE KING, 227 restraint of the bodily organs and the mind!, the right conduct which results from a pure means of livelihood, the right conduct in relation to the four requisites of a recluse’, the right conduct presented in the Short, and Middle, and Long Summonses ®, the right conduct of those who are walking in the Path, and the right conduct of those who have attained each of the various fruits thereof (beginning at conversion and ending at Arahatship)*. And all the beings in the world, O king, gods® and men, and the Maras too (the spirits of evil), and the Brahmas (the

very highest of the gods), and Samazas and Brahmans are filled with longing and desire for a man who wears, as his ornament, this jewel of right conduct. And the Bhikkhu, O king, who puts it on shines forth in glory all around, upwards and downwards, and from side to side, surpassing in lustre all the jewels to be found from the Waveless Deep* below to the highest heavens above, excelling them all, overwhelming them all. Such, O king, are the jewels of right conduct set out for sale in the Blessed One's bazaar of gems. And this is what is called 'The Blessed One's jewel of righteousness.'

⁵⁷ \$ Translated in 'Buddhist Suttas,' pp. 189-200. * What we have here are the two higher stages of the three into which Buddhist ethics naturally falls. 'The morality of laymen has been included above, V, 7, where it already passes over into that of the ordinary, unconverted member of the Order. Here we begin with that, starting with the last item of the previous list, and go on, through the silas, to the highest ethics of Arahatsip.

⁵⁸ > The devas, those gods dwelling in Sakka's heaven, and, I think, the devatés also (fairies, nyads, dryads, &c.). 222 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES V, 15.

⁵⁹ 'Such are the virtues sold in that bazaar, The shop of the Enlightened One, the Blest ; Pay Karma as the price, O ye ill-clad! Buy, and put on, these lustrous Buddha-gems !'

⁶⁰ 15. 'And what, O king, is the Blessed One's jewel of meditation? The meditation that consists of specific conceptions, and of investigation regarding them?;—the meditation that consists of reflection only, specific conceptions being lost sight of ?;—the meditation that continues after specific conceptions and reflection on them have both ceased *;—the meditation that is void (of lusts, evil dispositions, and Karma);—the meditation from which three signs (of an unconverted life—lust, malice, and dullness) are absent ;—the meditation in which no low aspirations remain*. And when a Bhikkhu, O king, has put on this jewel of meditation (Sam4adhi), then ideas of lust, and ideas of anger, and ideas of cruelty, and all the various bad thoughts that have their basis in the evil dispositions of pride, self-righteousness, adhesion to wrong views, and doubt—all these, since they come into contact with meditation, flow off from him, disperse, and are dispelled, they stay not with him, adhere not to him. Just, O king, as when water has fallen on a lotus leaf it flows off from it, is dispersed and scattered

⁶¹ * I think the first Gana (see 'Buddhist Suttas,' Pp. 272) is meant. * Apparently the passage over from the first to the second Ghana.

⁶² * But insight, and the resulting bliss, remain. Compare above, i, 2, 3 Gs 67). | * Compare above, V, 8, on the last three.

⁶³ V, 16. OF MILINDA THE KING. 223 ee away, stays not on it, adheres not to it!—so when a Bhikkhu has put on this jewel of meditation, then ideas of lust, and ideas of anger, and ideas of cruelty, and all the various bad thoughts that have their basis in the evil dispositions of pride, selfrighteousness, obstinacy in wrong views, and doubt—these all, as soon as they come in contact with meditation, flow off, disperse, and are dispelled, stay not with him, adhere not to him. And why not? Because of the exceeding purity of the habit of meditation. This, O king, is what is called "The Blessed One's jewel of meditation," and such are the jewels of meditation set out for sale in the Blessed One's bazaar of gems,

⁶⁴ "Bad thoughts can ne'er arise beneath the brow Encircled by this coronet of gems. It charms away perplexed and wandering thought. Make it your own, buy it, put on the crown!"

⁶⁵ Fo, 1nd what, .O king. is, the, Blessed One's jewel of knowledge? That knowledge by which the disciple of the noble ones knows thoroughly what is virtue, and what is not; what is blameworthy, and what is not ; what should be made a habit of, and what should not; what is mean, and what is exalted; [888] what is dark, and what is light, and what is both dark and light;—the knowledge by which he truly knows what sorrow is, and what the origin of sorrow is, and what the cessation of sorrow is, and what is the path that leads thereto. This, O king, is what is called ‘The Blessed One’s jewel of knowledge.’”

⁶⁶ See the note upon IV, 8, 65. 224 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Vir “ He who has knowledge as his jewelled wreath, Will not continue long in outward form’, Soon will he reach Nirvaza, in rebirth In any world? no longer take delight!”

⁶⁷ ‘And what, O king, is the Blessed One’s jewel of emancipation? Arahatsip is called the jewel of emancipation, and the Bhikkhu who has reached Arahatsip is said to have decked himself with the jewel of emancipation. And just as a man, O king, who is decorated with ornaments made of strings of pearls, of diamonds and gold and corals; whose limbs are anointed with akalu, and with frankincense #4, and with Talis®, and with red sandal wood; who is adorned with a garland of Ironwood blossoms, and Rottleria flowers, and flowers from the Sal tree, and the Salaa*, and the champak, and yellow jasmines’, and Atimuttaka flowers °, and

⁶⁸ * Bhavo here equal to paz&a skandha, according to Hinasikumburé, p. 491. * Akalu; only found here. The Simhalese has agaru kalu, and agaru according to Clough is Dalbergia.

⁶⁹ * Tagara. Agil tuwarala, ‘logwood frankincense.’ ®> Talisaka. Clough says the Talis tree is Flacourtia cataphracta. ® Not in the Pali dictionaries. But it is mentioned in Buddhavamsa II, 51 (there spelt saala). This verse is quoted at Gataka I, 13, verse 51, and the word is there spelt salava. The Simhalese has salala, and the ‘Sanskrit lexicons have sarala. Clough identifies it, no doubt wrongly, with the last, the Anglo-Indian Hal tree, which the botanists call the Shorea robusta.

⁷⁰ T Yathika; stnidda, says Hinasi-kumburé, p. 492, and Clough thinks this is oleander. But Béhtlingk-Roth say a sort of jasmine, Jasminum auriculatum.

⁷¹ * Yohombu in the Simhalese. Clough says this is a creeper called Borago Zeylanica. But does that grow in the NorthWest of India? According to Béhtlingk-Roth, Atimuttaka is the

⁷² V, 18. OF MILINDA THE KING, 225 trumpet flowers, and lotuses, and white and Arabian jasmines ‘—just as, with all this finery of garlands and perfumes and jewelry, he would outshine all other men, overwhelming them with brilliant glory and splendour—just so, O king, does he who has attained to Arahatsip, he in whom the Great Evils (lusts, and becoming, delusion, and ignorance) are rooted out, he who has put on the diadem of emancipation of heart, just so does he outshine all other Bhikkhus from the lowest in attainment up to those even who are themselves emancipated ?, overwhelming them in brilliant glory and splendour. And why is that so? Because, O king, there is one diadem that is the chief of all, and that is this diadem of emancipation of heart! And this, O king, is what is called “The Blessed One’s jewel of

⁷³ emancipation.” “All the people that dwell in a house look up To their Lord when he wears his crown of gems— The wide world of the gods and of men looks up To the wearer of Freedom’s diadem !”

⁷⁴ ‘And what, O king, is the Blessed One’s jewel of the insight that follows on the assurance of emancipation? The knowledge arising out of looking back over the course >—that knowledge by

⁷⁵ name of three plants, one of which is the Gaertnera Racemosa, much cultivated for the beauty and perfume of its flowers.

⁷⁶ Q 226 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES V, 19. which the disciple who is walking along the Excellent Way passes, from time to time, both the Way itself and the Fruits thereof up to Nirvāṇa in review, and is aware what evil dispositions he has got rid of, and what evil dispositions remain to be conquered— that is what [889] is called “The jewel of the assurance that follows on the knowledge of emancipation.” “ The knowledge by which the Noble Ones know

⁷⁷ The stages they've passed, and the road yet untrod ;— Strive, O ye sons of the Conqueror, strive That jewel—‘ Assurance ’—yourselves to obtain!”

⁷⁸ ‘And what, O king, is the Blessed One's jewel of discrimination? The discrimination of the sense of, and the discrimination of the deeper truths underlying the sense of the sacred writ, and the discrimination of philological peculiarities, and the discrimination of correct and ready exposition?. And the Bhikkhu, O king, who is adorned with these four jewels of discrimination, whatsoever company he enters into, whether of nobles, or brahmins, or merchants, or workpeople, enters it in confidence, neither put out nor shy; undaunted and undismayed, he enters the assembly without excitement or fear. Just, O king, as a warrior, a hero in the fight, when accoutred in all his harness

⁷⁹ course he has followed along the Excellent Way, he becomes conscious of having got beyond each of the obstacles (the Samyoganas) that can beset him. It is the doctrine of ‘final assurance’ from the Buddhist point of view. Compare #4nzadassana at Digha II, 83.

⁸⁰ ‘ Pafisambhida. Htfnasi-kumburē merely repeats the ambiguous technical terms of the Pali. Childers, sub voce, gives the various interpretations of other authorities. Compare above, I, 29, 34, 36. The third and fourth seem to me to be doubtful.

⁸¹ V, 19. OF MILINDA THE KING. 227 of war?, goes down undismayed to the battle, in the confident thought: “If the enemy should remain afar off I can knock them down with my arrows, should they come thence towards me I can hit them with my javelins, should they come yet nearer I can reach them with my spear, should they come right up I can cleave them in two with my sabre ?, should they come to close quarters I can pierce them through and through with my dagger *”—just so, O king, does the Bhikkhu, when he wears the fourfold jewel of discernment, enter any assembly undismayed, in the confident thought: “Should any one put to me a puzzle turning on the discrimination of the sense, I shall be able to explain it, comparing sense with sense, explanation with explanation, reason with reason, argument with argument *,—and thus shall I resolve his doubts,

⁸² Q 228 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES V, 19. PDK dispel his perplexity, and delight him by my exposition of the problem raised. Should any one put to me a puzzle turning on discrimination of the deeper truths, I shall be able to explain it by comparing truth with truth, and the various aspects and phases of Arahantship each with each ', [840]— and thus his doubts too shall I be able to resolve, and, dispelling his perplexity, to delight him with my exposition of the problem raised. Should any one put to me a puzzle turning on the discrimination of philological peculiarities, I shall be able to explain it by comparing derivation with derivation', and word with word, and particle with particle,

and letter with letter, and one modification of a letter by contact (sandhi) with another, and consonant with consonant, and vowel with vowel, and accent (intonation) with accent, and quantity with quantity, and rule with rule, and idiom with idiom ;—and thus his doubts too shall I be able to resolve, and, dispelling his perplexity, to delight him with my exposition of the problem raised. Should any one put to me a puzzle turning on the discrimination of expositions, I shall be able to explain it by comparing metaphor with metaphor, and characteristic with characteristic’, and sentiment with sentiment—and thus his doubts too shall I be able to resolve, and, dispelling his perplexity, to delight him with my exposition of the

⁸³ will reply by adducing parallel passages, much in the style of modern scholarship. * He gives the principal ones, as set out in his previous arguments.

⁸⁴ * Nirutti, Hinadi-kumburē unfortunately simply repeats all these technical terms. * Lakkhama. As for instance above, I, 51-62.

⁸⁵ Visor OF MILINDA THE KING. 229 problem raised. And this, O king, is what is called “The Blessed One’s jewel of discrimination.”

⁸⁶ “First buy the jewel of discrimination, Then cut! it with your knowledge and your skill ; Fo, free from all anxiety and fear, Shall you illuminate both earth and heaven!”

⁸⁷ ‘And what, O king, is the Blessed One’s jewel of the sevenfold wisdom of the Arahats? It is self-possession, and investigation of the system of doctrine, and zeal, and joy, and tranquillity, and contemplation, and equanimity. And the Bhikkhu, O king, who is adorned with this sevenfold jewel of the divisions of the higher wisdom® shines forth over the whole world of gods and men, brightens it, illuminates it, and dispersing the darkness makes the light arise. This, O king, is what is called “The Blessed One’s jewel of the sevenfold wisdom.”

⁸⁸ “The gods and men in reverence stand up To him who wears this wisdom-diadem. Show your good actions then,—that is the price,—

⁸⁹ And buy, and wear, this wisdom-diadem !” [841] 21. ‘And what, venerable Nagasena, is the bazaar for all manner of merchandise set up by the Blessed One, the Buddha ?’

⁹⁰ ‘The Blessed One’s bazaar for all manner of * Phaseyya; literally ‘he who having bought pafisambhida shall touch it with his #4za.’ The Sivhalese, p. 494, has sparsako@a, which does not help us.

⁹¹ ? The Simhalese again only repeats these seven technical terms, except the second Dhamma-vikaya, which it renders by prag#a.

⁹² § Bodhi. Childers says, ‘the supreme knowledge of a Buddha.’ But this is wrong, as is evident even from the context here. The whole exposition is of Arahatsip, not Buddhahood.

⁹³ 230 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES V, 21. merchandise, O king, is the ninefold word of the Buddha; and the relics remaining of his body, and of the things he used; and the sacred mounds (Ketiyaṇi, Dagabas) erected over them!; and the jewel of his Order. And in that bazaar there are set out by the Blessed One the attainment (in a future birth) of high lineage, and of wealth, and of long life, and of good health, and of beauty, and of wisdom, and of worldly glory, and of heavenly glory, and of Nirvaṇa. And of these all they who desire either the one or the other, give Karma as the price, and so buy whichever glory they desire. And some buy with it a vow of right conduct, and some by observance of the Uposatha day, and so on down to the smallest Karma-price they buy the various

glories from the greatest to the least. Just, O king, as in a trader's shop, oil, seed, and peas and beans can be either taken in barter for a small quantity of rice or peas or beans, or bought for a small price decreasing in order according to requirement—just so, O king, in the Blessed One's bazaar for all manner of merchandise advantages are to be bought for Karma according to requirement. And this, O king, is what is called "The Blessed One's bazaar of all manner of merchandise."

⁹⁴ "Long life, good health, beauty, rebirth in heaven, High birth, Nirvaza—all are found for sale—There to be bought for Karma, great or small— In the great Conqueror's world-famed bazaar. Come; show your faith, O brethren, as the price, Buy and enjoy such goods as you prefer?!"

⁹⁵ * Hinadi-kumburē, characteristically enough for a Ceylon man, adds, 'and the Footprint and the Bo-tree,? > The first line only of these verses is in the Samyutta III, 2, 7.

⁹⁶ Ni820%, OF MILINDA THE KING. 231 22. 'And the inhabitants that dwell in the Blessed One's City of Righteousness, O king, are such as these: Masters in the Suttantas, and masters in the Vinaya, and masters in the Abhidhamma; preachers of the faith; repeaters of the Gatakas, and repeaters of the Digha, and repeaters of the Maggima, [842] and repeaters of the Samyutta, and repeaters of the Anguttara, and repeaters of the Khuddaka Nikaya ; —men endowed with right conduct, men accomplished in meditation, men full of knowledge, men taking delight in contemplation of the sevenfold wisdom of the Arahats, men of insight ;—men who frequent the woods for meditation, or sit at the roots of trees, or dwell in the open air, or sleep on heaps of straw, or live near cemeteries, or lie not down to sleep,—men who have entered the Excellent Way, men who have attained one or more of the four fruits thereof, men who are still learners (have not yet reached Arahatship, but are close upon it), men enjoying the Fruits, that is, either Sotapannas, or Sakadagmins, or Andgamins, or Arahats ;—men of the threefold wisdom?, men of the sixfold transcendental wisdom', men of the power of Iddhi, men who have reached perfection in knowledge, men

⁹⁷ ® Teviggd, having the pubbe-nivdsdnussati-#iva, the ketopariya-#4ma, and the 4savanam khaya-#ana. See Digha Nikaya II, 91-94 and 97.

⁹⁸ 232 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Voie23 skilled in the maintenance of constant self-possession, in the Great Struggle, in the Steps to Iddhi, in the Organs of their moral sense, in the sevenfold wisdom, in the Excellent Way, in Gana, in Vimokkha, and in the attainment of the exalted and tranquil bliss that is independent of form or the absence of form —yea! like a forest full of bamboos, full of reeds, that City of Righteousness has been ever crowded and frequented by such Arahats as these! For it is said?:

⁹⁹ (1) " Men devoid of passion, and of malice, and of dullness, men in whom the Great Evils (lust, becoming, delusion, and ignorance) are not, men who have neither craving thirst, nor grasping desires,—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹⁰⁰ (2) " Men whose home is the forest, men who have taken on themselves the extra vows, men full of joy, men who are wearing rough garments, men rejoicing in solitude, heroes—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹⁰¹ (3) "Men who sleep sitting, or on any sleeping-place that comes, or spend their time standing or walking up and down in meditation, men who clad themselves in cast-off raiment—all these dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹⁰² (4) “Men wearing the full set of three robes, tranquil, with a skin for the fourth, who rejoice in taking but one meal each day, the wise—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹⁰³ (5) “The earnest and prudent, heroes who feed on little and know no greed, content whether they receive an alms or receive it not—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹⁰⁴ * It is not known in what text. V, 22. OF MILINDA THE KING. 233 (6) “The meditative, delighting in Gana, heroes of tranquil minds, and steadfast, looking forward to Nirvaxa—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹⁰⁵ (7) “Men walking in the path, and standing in the fruits thereof, those who have attained some fruits thereof but are yet learners as to the last, whose hope is directed to the utmost goal—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹⁰⁶ (8) “Those who have entered the stream, and those who, free from stains, will only be reborn once more on earth, those who will never return again, and Arahats—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹⁰⁷ (9) “Those skilled in the means of attaining undisturbed self-possession, and rejoicing in contemplation on the sevenfold wisdom, those who are full of insight, and bear the words of the Dharma in their hearts—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹⁰⁸ (10) “Those skilled in the Steps to Iddhi, and rejoicing in the meditations of Samadhi, those who are devoted to the Great Struggle—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹⁰⁹ (11) “Those perfect in the sixfold wisdom of the Abhi#zas, delighting in the sphere that is theirs by rightful inheritance’, those having the power of flying through the air—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹¹⁰ (12) “Those of downcast eyes, and measured speech, the doors of whose senses are guarded, who 234 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES V, 23.

¹¹¹ are self-restrained, who are well trained according to the supreme Dhamma—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.

¹¹² (13) “Those of the threefold wisdom, and of the sixfold wisdom, those who have become perfect in Iddhi and perfect in knowledge—these are they who dwell in the City of Righteousness.”

¹¹³ ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus who carry in their hearts the words of the excellent knowledge that is immeasurable, who are free from bonds, whose goodness and fame and power and glory no man can weigh, who (in imitation of their Master)! keep the royal chariot-wheel of the kingdom of righteousness rolling on, who have reached perfection in knowledge—such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “The Commanders of the Faith in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.”

¹¹⁴ ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus, who have the power of Iddhi, who have learned the discriminations *, who are full of confidence, who travel through the air, who are hard to oppose, hard to overcome, who can move without support, who can shake the broad earth and the waters on which it rests, who can touch the sun and the moon, who are skilful in transforming themselves and in making steadfast resolutions and high aspirations, who are perfect in Iddhi—such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “The royal chaplains in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.”

¹¹⁵ ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus who have taken upon themselves the extra vows, * Anuppavattaka. See below, p. 363 of the Pali. * See above, V, 19.

¹¹⁶ V, 23. OF MILINDA THE KING. 235 who desire little and are content, who would loathe any breach of the regulations as to the manner of seeking an alms’, and beg straight on from hut to hut, as a bee smells flower after flower ®, and then go away into the loneliness of the woods, those who are indifferent as to their body and as to life, those who have attained to Arahatsip, those who place the highest value on the virtues of the practice of the extra vows—such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “The judges in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.”

¹¹⁷ ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus who are pure and stainless, in whom no evil dispositions are left, who, skilful in the knowledge of the fall and rise of beings?, have perfected themselves in the Divine Eye—such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “The givers of light 4 in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.”

¹¹⁸ ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus [844] who are learned in the traditions, who hand on what has been handed down, the repeaters of the Discourses, and of the Canon Law, and of the tables of contents, those who are skilled in the exact determination of letters into surds and sonants, into

¹¹⁹ ‘That is the fall of beings from one state of existence—their death in that state in other words—and their rise, their rebirth, in another.

¹²⁰ * Gotaka, as a city official, is something akin to torchbearer, lamplighter. 236 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES V, 23. longs and short, as to lightness and heaviness’, those who know by heart the ninefold word—such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “The peace officers * in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.”

¹²¹ ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus who are learned in the Vinaya (Rules of the Order, Canon Law), wise in the Vinaya, skilled in detecting the source of offences ?, skilled in deciding whether any act is an offence or not, whether an offence is grievous or slight, whether it can be atoned for or not, skilled in deciding questions as to the rise, the acknowledgment, the absolution, or the confession of an offence; as to the suspension, or the restoration, or the defence of an offender ®, who are perfect masters in the Vinaya—such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “The Raipa-dakshas® in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.”

¹²² ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus who wear on their brows the lotus garland of that noble Emancipation, who have attained to that

¹²³ * Dhamma-rakkhé, ‘dharmikawf draksha-grahamayehi niyuktawf’ in the Sinhalese. ‘Nidana-pashana-kusalaé; ‘Apatti geva hoera dekwtmehi dakshaw{,’ says the Sinhalese.

¹²⁴ * One word, vu/‘hana, is here doubtful. > See Mahavagega IX, 4, 9. 10, &c. ® Literally ‘skilled in form, shape, beauty.’ The Sinhalese repeats this ambiguous expression, adding the qualification am4tyayo, ‘ministers, officials’ One would think that these would have been the judges, but our author has already made the Arahats the judges in his Dhamma-nagara. This only leaves him some minor official post to give away to those learned in Canon Law, and he has chosen one as unintelligible in Ceylon as it is to me.

¹²⁵ V, 23. OF MILINDA THE KING. 237 highest and best and most exceeding excellent of all conditions, who are loved and longed for by the great multitudes—such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “Flower-sellers in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.”

¹²⁶ ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus who have penetrated to the comprehension of the four Truths, and have seen them with their eyes, who are wise in the teaching, who have passed beyond doubt as to the four fruits of Samazaship, who having attained to the bliss thereof, share those fruits with others who have entered the paths !— such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “Fruit-dealers in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.”

¹²⁷ ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus who, being anointed with that most excellent perfume of right conduct, are gifted with many and various virtues, and are able to dispel the bad odour of sin and evil dispositions—such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “Perfume dealers in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.”

¹²⁸ ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus whose delight is in the Dhamma, and whose converse is pleasant, who find exceeding joy in the higher subtleties of the Dharma and the Vinaya?, who either in the forest, or at the foot of trees, or in empty

¹²⁹ ? Pasipanna, which Hinadi-kumbur  takes here to mean Arahats, but see the note above, V, 20 (p. 341 of the Pali). * Abhidhamme abhivinaye. A phrase very instructive as to the correct rendering of the much misunderstood word abhidhamma. As I pointed out already in the ‘Hibbert Lectures’ for 1881, it is a blunder to translate it, as is usually done, by ‘metaphysics. The whole context is taken from the Sangiti Sutta.

¹³⁰ 238 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES V, 23. places, drink the sweet sap of the Dharma, who plunging themselves, as it were, in body, speech, and mind into the sweet juice? of the Dharma, excel in expounding it, in seeking and in detecting the deeper truths in the various doctrines, who— wheresoever and whensoever the discourse is of wishing for little, of contentment, of solitude, of retirement, of the exertion in zeal, of right conduct, of meditation, of knowledge, of emancipation, of the insight arising from the assurance of emancipation— [845] thither do they repair, and drink in the sweet savour of that discourse—such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “Thirsty and drunkards in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.”

¹³¹ ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus who are addicted to the habit of wakefulness from the first watch of the night to the last, who spend day and night in sitting, standing, or walking up and down in meditation, who, addicted to the habit of contemplation, are devoted to their own advancement by the suppressing of evil dispositions—such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “Watchmen in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.”

¹³² ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus who in the spirit and in the letter, in its arguments and explanations, in its reasons and examples, teach and repeat, utter forth and recapitulate the ninefold word of the Buddha—such Bhikkhus are called, O

¹³³ king, “Lawyers (dealers in Dharma?) in the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness.” “The ambrosia of the Saddharma,’ says Hinasi-kumbur  Pp. 502. * Dhammapanika. The Sinhalese has Dharmikapazikayo.

¹³⁴ Near OF MILINDA THE KING. 239 ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus who are wealthy and rich in the wealth of the treasures of the Doctrine, in the wealth of the traditions, and the

text, and the learning thereof, who comprehend the signs, and vowels, and consonants thereof, in all their details, pervading all directions with their knowledge — such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “Bankers of the Dhamma? in the Blessed One's City of Righteousness.”

¹³⁵ ‘And furthermore, O king, those of the Bhikkhus who have penetrated to the sublimer teaching, who understand exposition and the divisions of objects of meditation to be practised, who are perfect in all the subtler points of training*—such Bhikkhus are called, O king, “ Distinguished masters of law in the Blessed One's City of Righteousness.”

¹³⁶ ‘Thus well planned out, O king, is the Blessed One’s City of Righteousness, thus well built, thus well appointed, thus well provisioned, thus well established, thus well guarded, thus well protected, thus impregnable by enemies or foes. And by this explanation, O king, by this argument, by this reason, you may by inference know that the Blessed One did once exist.

¹³⁷ (1) “As when they see a pleasant city, well planned out, Men know, by inference, how great the founder was ; So when they see our Lord’s ‘City of Righteousness’

¹³⁸ They know, by inference, that he did once ” sexist. 240 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES W524. [846] (2) “As men, seeing its waves, can judge, by

¹³⁹ inference, The great extent and power of the world-embracing sea ; So may they judge the Buddha when they see the waves That he set rolling through the world of gods and men—

¹⁴⁰ He who, unconquered in the fight, allays all griefs, Who rooted out, in his own heart, Craving’s dread power, And set his followers free from the whirlpool of rebirths—

¹⁴¹ ‘Far as the waves of the Good-Law extend and roll, So great, so mighty, must our Lord, the Buddha, be. (3) “As men, seeing its mighty peaks that tower

¹⁴² aloft, Can judge, by inference, Himalaya’s wondrous height ; So when they see the Buddha’s Mount-of-Righteousness— Stedfast, unshaken by fierce passion’s stormy blasts,

¹⁴³ Towering aloft in wondrous heights of calm and peace, Where lusts, evil, and Karma cannot breathe or live,— They draw the inference: ‘Great as this mountain high

¹⁴⁴ That mighty Hero’s power upon whose word it stands,’ V, 24. OF MILINDA THE KING. 241 (4) “As men, seeing the footprint of an elephant

¹⁴⁵ king, Can judge, by inference: ‘ How great his size must be!’ So when they see the footprint of the elephant of men, Buddha, the wise, upon the path that men have trod,

¹⁴⁶ They know, by inference: ‘How glorious Buddha was?!’ (5) “ As when they see all living things crouching in fear, Men know: ‘ ’Tis the roar of the king of the beasts that frightens them.’ Fo, seeing other teachers break and fly in fear, They know: ‘ ’Tis a king of the truth hath

¹⁴⁷ uttered words sublime!’ (6) “Seeing the earth smiling, well watered, green with grass, Men say: ‘A great and pleasant rain hath fallen fast.’

¹⁴⁸ So when they see this multitude rejoicing, peaceful, blest, Men may infer: ‘How sweet the rain that stilled their hearts !’

¹⁴⁹ (7) “Seeing the wide earth soaked, boggy, a marsh of mud, Men say: ‘Mighty the mass of waters broken loose.’ [36] R THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Viton

¹⁵⁰ Fo, when they see this mighty host, that once were dazed With the mud of sin, swept down in Dhamma’s stream, and left In the wide sea of the Good-Law, some here, some there,

¹⁵¹ All, gods and men alike, plunged in ambrosial waves, They may infer, and say: 'How great that Dhamma is!' (3) [847] "As when men, travelling, feel a glorious

¹⁵² perfume sweet Pervading all the country side, and gladdening them, infer at once, 'Surely, 'tis giant forest trees are flowering now !'

¹⁵³ Fo, conscious of this perfume sweet of righteousness That now pervades the earth and heavens, they may infer: 'A Buddha, infinitely great, must once have lived!'"

¹⁵⁴ 'And it would be possible, O king, to show forth the Buddha's greatness, by a hundred or a thousand such examples, such reasons, such arguments, such metaphors. Just, O king, as a clever garland maker will, from one heap of all kinds of flowers, both following the instruction of his teacher, and also using his own individuality as a man, make many variegated and beautiful bouquets,—just so, O king, that Blessed One is, as it were, an infinite, immeasurable, heap of variegated flowers of virtue. And I now, a garland maker, as it were in the

¹⁵⁵ V, 25. OF MILINDA THE KING. 243 church of the Conqueror, stringing those flowers together, —both following the path of our teachers of old, and also using such power of wisdom as in me is,— could show forth by inference the power of the Buddha in innumerable similes. But you, on the other hand, must show a desire to hear them!' 'Hard would it be, Nagasena, for any other men thus to have shown by inference, drawn from such examples, the power of the Buddha. I am filled with satisfaction, venerable Nagasena, at your so perfectly varied exposition of this problem.'

¹⁵⁶ Here ends the problem of Inference". 'The Sinhalese is here much expanded. 2 Mr. Trenckner reads 'Anumana pas#ham, the Sinhalese has 'Maha Anum4na Prasnayayi, 244 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Wi, 7

THE DHUTANGAS.

¹ 1. The king saw Bhikkhus in the forest, lone And far away from men, keeping hard vows. And then he saw too householders, at home, Eating the sweet fruits of the Noble Path'. Considering both of these, deep doubts he felt. 'If laymen also realise the Truth Then surely vowing vows must be in vain. Come! let me ask that best of teachers, wise In the threefold basket of the Buddha's words, Skilled to o'erthrow the arguments of the foe. He will be able to resolve my doubts!'

² Now Milinda the king went up to the place where Nagasena was, and bowed down before him, and took his seat on one side. And when so seated, he said to Nagasena: 'Venerable Nagasena, is there any layman living at home, enjoying the pleasures of sense, occupying a dwelling encumbered with wife and children, enjoying the use of sandal wood from Benares, and of garlands, perfumes, and ointments, accepting gold and silver, with an embroidered head-dress on, set with diamonds and pearls and gold—is there any such who has seen face to face the calm, the supreme good, Nirvavza ?'

³ 'Not one hundred only, O king, nor two nor 1 «Standing in the Fruit of the Anadgamins.' So they had already reached the third stage in the Excellent Way.

⁴ V. OF MILINDA THE KING, © 245 three nor five nor six hundred, not a thousand only, nor a hundred thousand, nor ten millions, nor ten thousand millions, not even only a billion laymen (have

seen Nirvaza)—not to speak of twenty or thirty or a hundred or a thousand who have attained to clear understanding (of the four Truths)', By

⁵ * I take this to mean, 'Not to speak of comparatively small numbers who have experienced Abhisamaya, an innumerable host of laymen have reached Nirvaza—that is, have reached, and during their lives remained in, the third stage of the Path, and attained Arabatship just before they died. Abhisamaya is used either absolutely or in composition. Manabhisamaya (A. IV, 38, 5=M. I, 12) certainly, and perhaps Atthabhisamaya, is used of Arahats, but they do not occur in our author. He uses occasionally Dhammabhisamaya (see pp. 255, 350, &c., of the Pali) and Katu-sakkabhisamaya (see pp. 171, 334, &c.), but more frequently Abhisamaya absolutely. Dhammabhisamaya, 'penetration into, clear understanding of, the Dhammas or Dhamma,' may refer to the four Dhammas of Anguttara IV, 1 (= M. P.S., IV, 2, 3), or to the comprehension of the qualities (Dhammas) of things, or (what is very much the same) to the comprehension of the principal doctrine (Dhamma) of the impermanence of all things. In the last case it would be the same thing, looked at from a slightly different point of view, as the Dhamma-fakkhu, the Eye for the Truths (see Sumangala Vilasini I, 237), or as that insight (Vipassana) which is the entrance to the Path. But the four Truths (as to sorrow, &c.) are also important Dhammas, and as the expression Katu-sakkabhisamaya clearly refers to them and them only, this may also be the meaning of dhammabhisamaya, or at any rate of abhisamaya standing above. So at least I take the latter here. We know that the 'Eye for the Dhamma,' the perception of the first only of the tizi lakkhamani (impermanence), implies and involves the entrance into the Path. Oddly enough there is as yet no evidence to show whether the perception of the cardinal doctrine of the four Truths necessarily does so too; or can do so alone, without the Dhammakakkhu. If the latter, then there are two gates to the Path. And this is not only quite possible, but is the inference one might fairly draw from the constant phrase 'After the exposition of the Truths had concluded so and so attained to' one or other of the phalani.

⁶ 246 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 3. what kind of exposition shall I lay before you evidence showing that I know this???'

⁷ 'Do you yourself tell me *.' 3. 'Then, O king, I will explain it. All those passages in the ninefold word of the Buddha that deal with holiness of life, [849] and attainment of the path, and the divisions of the excellent habit of living under vows, shall be brought to bear in this connection', Just, O king, as water which has rained down upon a country district, with both lowlying and high places, level land and undulations, dry ground and wet, will—all of it—flow off thence and meet together in the ocean of great waters; so will all those passages meet together, and be brought into connection, here. And a manifestation of reasons out of my experience and knowledge shall be also brought to bear. Thus will this matter be thoroughly analysed, its beauty will be brought out', it will be exhausted *, brought home

⁸ * Literally 'shall I give you anuyoga,' which the Sinhalese renders 'opportunity for speech'(!). Above, at p. ro of the Pali, the rendering is quite different, 'padam di samugema.' The only translation that fits the context in both of these places (the only ones in which the idiom has, so far, been found) is 'lay before you (proofs of my) mastery (over the subject),' or something of that sort. It is a disappointing satisfaction to find that the phrase was as unintelligible in Ceylon as it is to us. In

my version above I should now prefer to write instead of ‘repeated his lesson to his teacher for the last time,’ ‘gave his teacher proofs that he had understood what he had taught him.’

⁹ ® Hinasi-kumburé, p. 508, puts these words into the mouth of Nagasena. * Literally ‘will come into connection here.’ * Vikitto, which the Sinhalese only repeats.

¹⁰ * Paripummo; literally ‘filled’ (paripfira wanneya). - Viva OF MILINDA THE KING, 247 to rest’. It will be, O king, as when an able writing-master, on exhibiting, by request, his skill in writing, will supplement the written signs by an explanation of reasons out of his experience and knowledge, and thus that writing of his becomes finished, perfect, without defect. So will I also bring to bear a manifestation of reasons out of my experience and knowledge; and thus shall this matter be thoroughly analysed, its beauty shall be brought out, it shall be exhausted, set at rest”.

¹¹ ‘In the city of Savatthi, O king, about fifty millions of the disciples of the Blessed One, devout men and devout women, were walking in the paths, and out of those three hundred and fifty-seven thousand * were established in the fruit of the third path. And all of them were laity, not members of the Order. And there too, at the foot of the Gandamba tree, when the double miracle took place’, two hundred millions of living beings’ penetrated to an understanding (of the four Truths). And again on the delivery of the Rahulovada® discourse, and of the Maha Mangala” discourse, and of the Samasitta*® exposition, and of the

¹² ‘ This curious number (like others below) must have a history and a meaning. * See Sumangala Vilasini, p. 57; Gataka I, 77, 78; 1V, 263-266.

¹³ ® See the note above on I, 32 (p. 20 of the Pali). * See the note above, loc. cit. 248 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 4. ParAdbhava! discourse, and of the Purabheda? discourse, and of the Kalaha-vivada discourse, and of the Xftila-v ydha' discourse, and of the Maha-vytha! discourse, and of the Tuwazaka? discourse, and of the Sdriputta! discourse, an innumerable number of celestial beings penetrated to knowledge (of the four Truths). In the city of Ragagaha three hundred and fifty thousand devout laymen and devout laywomen, disciples of the Blessed One, were walking in the Paths. And there again at the taming of Dhanapala the great elephant ® nine hundred million living beings, and again at the meeting at the Pasdzika Ketiya on the occasion of the Padyana discourse? one hundred and forty million living beings, and again at the Indasdla cave eight hundred millions of gods, and again at Benares [850] in the deer park Isipatana at the first preaching of the Dhamma one hundred and eighty million Brahma gods and innumerable others, and again in the heaven of the Thirty-Three at the preaching of the Abhidhamma on the Pazau Kambala Rock® eight hundred millions of the gods, and on the descent from the world of the gods at the gate of the city of Sankassa °, at the miracle of the manifestation to the world v

¹⁴ * In the Athakavagea of the Sutta Nipata. > Sutta Nipata I, 6. * See the note above on IV, 4, 44 (p. 207 of the Pali), also below, p. 410 of the Pali.

¹⁵ * Sutta Nipata, pp. 185, 205 (of Professor Fausbél’s edition for the Pali Text Society). * See ‘Buddhist Suttas,’ p. 154, and the note above on I, 38.

¹⁶ ° Gataka IV, 265. " Loka-vivarama-paihariye, referred to at DAshavamsa II, 120. The exact meaning of the second word, literally ‘ uncovering,’

¹⁷ = Vise. OF MILINDA THE KING. 249 three hundred millions of believing men and deities penetrated to a knowledge (of the four Truths). And again at Kapila-vatthu among the Sakyas, at the

preaching of the Buddhavamsa! in the Nigrodha Arama, and again at the preaching of the Maha Samaya Suttanta, gods in numbers that cannot be counted penetrated to a knowledge of the Dhamma. And again at the assemblies on the occasions of Sumana the garland maker, and of Garahadinna, and of Ananda the rich man, and of Gambuka the naked ascetic*, and of Mazdika the god, and of Ma#ka-kumdali the god, and of Sulasa the courtesan ®, and of Sirima the courtesan, and of the weaver's daughter, and of Subhadda, and of the spectacle of the cremation of the Brahman of Saketa, and of the Sinaparantas, and of the problem put by Sakka*, and of the Tirokuada Sutta?, and of the 'Ratana Sutta*'—at each of these eighty-four thousand penetrated to a knowledge of the Dhamma. So long, O king, as the Blessed One remained in the world, so long wheresoever in the three great divisions

¹⁸ is doubtful. Alwis, in another connection, renders it 'prosperity.' See his quotation from Buddhaghosa's Papa#ka Sfidant quoted by Childers sub voce. The Sinhalese has rfipa-kdya-sampat dakwa dakwéA, 'continually manifesting (to all the world) the glory of his outward form.'

¹⁹ * See the commentary on that work quoted by Dr. Morris in his edition for the Pali Text Society, pp. vili-x. * Compare Thera Gatha 283-286.

²⁰ ® In the Sutta Nipata and Khuddaka Pasha. 250 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 5. (of India)! or in the sixteen principal countries (in them)" he stayed, there, as a usual thing, two, three, four, or five hundred, or a thousand, or a hundred thousand, both gods and men, saw face to face the calm, the supreme good, Nirvaza. And all of those who were gods, O king, were laymen, They had not entered the Order. So these and many other billions of gods, O king,—even while they were yet laymen, living at home, enjoying the pleasures of sense,—saw face to face (realised in themselves) the condition of Peace, the Supreme Good, Nirvaza *, 5. 'If so, venerable Nagasena,—if laymen, living at home and enjoying the pleasures of sense, can see Nirvaza,—what purpose then do these extra vows serve? That being so, rather must [851] the vows be workers of mischief. For, Nagasena, if diseases would abate without medicine, what would be the advantage of weakening the body by emetics, by purges, and other like remedies ?>—if one's enemies could be subdued with one's fists only, where would be the need of swords and spears, of javelins and bows and cross-bows, of maces and of clubs ?—if trees could be climbed by clambering up them with the aid of the knots and of the crooked and hollow places in them, of the thorny excrescences and creepers and branches growing on them, what would be the need of going in quest of ladders long and strong ?—if sleeping on the bare ground gave

²¹ * That is, Pa&tna, Avanti, and Dakkhiz4patha (say the East, the Upper Ganges Valley, and the Dekkan). * The full list is given in the note at 'Vindya Texts,' II, 146.

²² * This Buddhist way of looking on the gods as laymen has been already referred to above in the note on p. 20 of the P4li, I, 32 of the translation.

²³ VI, 6. OF MILINDA THE KING, 251 ease to the limbs?, why should one seek after fine large beds, soft to the touch ?—if one could cross the desert alone, inaccessible though it be, and full of danger and fear, why need one wait for a grand caravan, well armed and well equipped ?>—if a man were able by his own arms to cross a flowing river, what need he care for firm dykes or boats ?>—if he could provide board and lodging for himself out of his own property, why should he trouble to do service to others, to flatter with sweet words, to run to and fro?—when he can get water from a natural pool, why should he dig wells and tanks and artificial ponds? And just so, venerable Nagasena, if laymen, living at home and enjoying the pleasures of sense, can realise in themselves

the condition of Peace, the Supreme Good, Nirvaza, what is the need of taking upon oneself these vows ?’

²⁴ ‘There are, O king, these twenty-eight good qualities in the vows, virtues really inherent in them; and on account of these all the Buddhas alike have longed for them and held them dear. And what are the twenty-eight? The keeping of the vows, O king, implies a mode of livelihood without evil, it has a blissful calm as its fruit, it avoids blame, it works no harm to others, it is free from danger, it brings no trouble on others, it is certain to bring with it growth in goodness, it wastes not away, it deludes not, it is in itself a protection’, it works the satisfaction of desires and the taming of all beings, it is good for self-

²⁵ control, it is appropriate ?, (he who keeps the vows) is self-dependent 2, is emancipated *, the keeping of them is the destruction of lust, and of malice, and of dullness ; it is the pulling away of pride, the cutting off of evil thoughts, the removal of doubts, the suppression of sloth, the putting away of discontent ; it is long-suffering, its merit is beyond weight, and its virtue beyond measure, and it is the path that leads to the end of every grief. These, O king, are the twenty-eight good qualities in the vows; [352] and it is on account of these that all the Buddhas alike have longed for them and held them dear.

²⁶ ‘And whosoever, O king, thoroughly carry out the vows, they become completely endowed with eighteen good qualities. What are these eighteen ? Their walk is pure, their path is accomplished, well guarded are they in deed and word, altogether pure are they in manners and in mind, their zeal flags not, all their fears are allayed, all delusions (as to the permanence and as to the degree) of their individuality have been put away, anger has died away while love (to all beings) * has arisen in their hearts, in taking nourishment they eat it with the three right views regarding food®, they are honoured of

²⁷ ‘ Patiripam, probably ‘to the life of a recluse,’ but the Sinhalese takes it to mean ‘to the doctrine’ (sAsana). * Anissitam. See the note above on the translation of p. 321 of the Pali. ‘Independent of craving’ (tr7shw), says the Sinhalese.

²⁸ * Vippamuttam. Of tr¢sha, says the Sinhalese again. * Metta, which always has the connotation. Htnadi-kumbur¢ accordingly renders it sakala-satwayan kerehi maitreya.

²⁹ ° Aharo pari##ato. The three right views are, 1 as to its nature, 2 as to its impurity, 3 as to the lust of taste. VI, 9. OF MILINDA THE KING. 253

³⁰ all men, they are temperate in eating, they are full of watchfulness, they need no home, wheresoever is a pleasant spot there do they dwell, they loathe to do ill, they take delight in solitude, they are in earnest always. These, O king, are the good qualities with which they who carry out the vows are completely endowed.

³¹ “And these ten, O king, are the individuals worthy of those advantages inherent in the vows— the man full of faith, ashamed to do wrong, full of courage, void of hypocrisy, master of himself, not unstable’, desirous to learn, glad to undertake the task that is hard, not easy to take offence, of a loving heart. These, O king, are the ten individuals worthy of those advantages inherent in the vows.

³² g. ‘And all they, O king, who as laymen, living at home and in the enjoyment of the pleasures of sense, realise in themselves the condition of Peace, the Supreme Good, Nirvaza,—all they had in former births accomplished their training, laid the foundation, in the practice of the thirteen vows,

had purified their walk and conduct by means of them; and so now, even as laymen, living at home and in the enjoyment of the pleasures of sense, do they realise in themselves the condition of Peace, the Supreme Good, Nirvaza. Just, O king, as a clever archer first in regular succession teaches his pupils at the training ground the different kinds of bows, the manner of holding the bow up, and of keeping it in a firm grasp, and of bending the fingers, and of planting the feet, and of taking up the arrow, and of placing it on

³³ 254 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 10: the string, and of drawing it back, and of restraining it, and of aiming at the mark, and thus of hitting 'a man of straw, or targets made of the Kanaka plant', or of grass, or of straw, or of masses of clay, or of shields *—and after that, introducing them to the service of the king, he gains the reward of high-bred chargers and chariots and elephants and horses and money and corn and red gold and slave girls and slaves and wives and lands. [853] Just so, O king, all they who as laymen, living at home in the enjoyment of the pleasures of sense, realise in themselves the condition of Peace, the Supreme Good, Nirvaza, —all they had in former births accomplished their training, laid the foundation, in the practice of the thirteen vows, had purified their walk and conduct by means of them; and so now, even as laymen, and living at home in the enjoyment of the pleasures of sense, do they realise in themselves the condition of Peace, the Supreme Good, Nirvaza.

³⁴ 'And there is no realisation of Arahatsip, O king, in one single life, without a previous keeping of the vows. Only on the utmost zeal and the most devoted practice of righteousness, and with the aid of a suitable teacher, is the realisation of Arahatsip attained. Just, O king, as a doctor or surgeon first procures for himself a teacher, either by the payment of a fee or by the performance of service, and then

³⁵ ® Phalaka. But Hinasi-kumburé, p. 514, takes it in the technical sense of a kind of rough roller, made of the wood apple tree (dimbul porf), and used for levelling rice-fields.

³⁶ Wij t2e OF MILINDA THE KING, 255 thoroughly trains himself in holding the lancet, in cutting, marking, or piercing with it, in extracting darts, in cleansing wounds, in causing them to dry up, in the application of ointments, in the administration of emetics and purges and oily enemas, and only when he has thus gone through training, served his apprenticeship, made himself skilful, does he visit the sick to heal them. Just so, O king, all they who as laymen, living at home in the enjoyment of the pleasures of sense, realise in themselves the condition of Peace, the Supreme Good, Nirvaza,—all they had in former births accomplished their training, laid the foundation, in the practice of the thirteen vows, had purified their walk and conduct by means of them; and so now, even as laymen, and living at home in the enjoyment of the pleasures of sense, do they realise in themselves the condition of Peace, the Supreme Good, Nirvaza.

³⁷ 'And there is no perception of the truth to those who are not purified by the virtues that depend on the keeping of the vows. Just as without water no seed will grow, so can there be no perception of the truth to those not purified by the practice of the vows. Just as there is no rebirth in bliss to those who have done no meritorious actions, no beautiful deeds, so is there no perception of the truth for those not purified by the practice of the vows.

³⁸ 'Like the broad earth, O king, is the character resulting from the keeping of the vows, to serve as a basis to those who desire to be pure'. Like water is it, O king, to wash away the stain of all things

³⁹ 256 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES ME, 22. evil in those who desire to be pure. Like the fire is it, O king, to burn out the lust of all evil in those who desire to be pure [854]. Like the wind is it, O king, to carry away the dust of all evil in those desiring to be pure. Like medicine is it, O king, to allay the disease of evil in those desiring to be pure. Like ambrosia is it, O king, to act as an antidote to the poison of evil in those desiring to be pure. Like arable land is it, O king, on which to grow the crop of all the virtues of renunciation to those desiring to be pure. Like a wishing-gem! is it, O king, for conferring all the high attainments they long and crave for upon those who desire to be pure. Like a boat is it, O king, for carrying to the further shore of the mighty ocean of transmigration all those who desire to be pure. Like a place of refuge is it, O king, where those who desire to be pure can be safe from the fear of old age and death. Like a mother is it, O king, to comfort those who desire to be pure when afflicted with the sorrows of sin. Like a father is it, O king, to raise up in those who desire to be pure and to increase in goodness all the good qualities of those who have renounced the world. Like a friend is it, O king, in not disappointing those who desire to be pure in their search after the good qualities of those who have renounced the world. Like a lotus flower, O king, is it, in not being tarnished by the stain of evil. Like costly perfume (of saffron and of jasmine and the Turkish incense and the Greek) ?

⁴⁰ * Manoharo. Childers does not give this meaning to the word, but it is confirmed by the passages above and below, pp. 118, 358 of the Pali, and by the Sinhalese.

⁴¹ * Katu-gatiya-gandho. The two last are Yavana and Tarukkha. Bohtlingk-Roth explain both as Olibanum. Our VI, 12. OF MILINDA THE KING, 257

⁴² is it, O king, for counteracting the bad odour of evil for those who desire to be pure. Like a lofty mountain range is it, O king, for protecting those who desire to be pure from the onslaught of the winds of the eight conditions to which men are subject in this world (gain and loss, and fame and dishonour, and praise and blame, and happiness and woe)". Like the space of heaven is it, O king, in the freedom from all obstruction, in the magnitude, in the great expanse and breadth it gives to those who desire to be pure. Like a stream is it, O king, in washing away for those who desire to be pure the stain of all evil, Like a guide is it, O king, in bringing safe out of the desert of rebirths, out of the jungle of lusts and sins, those who desire to be pure. Like a mighty caravan is it, O king, for bringing those who desire to be pure safe into that most blessed city of Nirvaza, peaceful and calm, where no fear dwells. [855] Like a well-polished spotless mirror is it, O king, for showing to those who desire to be pure the true nature of the constituent elements of all beings. Like a shield is it, O king, for warding off from those who desire to be pure the clubs and the arrows and — the swords of evil dispositions. Like a sunshade is it, O king, for warding off from those who desire to be pure the scorching heat of the threefold fire?. Like

⁴³ author does not give the details, but it is unlikely that he meant other perfumes than those usually comprised in the term 'perfume of four kinds.' The expression is not found in the Pitakas, though it occurs in Buddhaghosa; and its use by our author may help to settle his date when we know its history, and the exact composition of the two foreign perfumes it includes.

⁴⁴ » The eight Loka-dhammas. [36] s 258 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 13. the moon is it, O king, as being longed and hoped for by those who desire to be pure. Like the sun is it, O king, as dispelling the blackness of the darkness of ignorance for those who desire to be pure. Like the ocean is it, O king, as causing to arise in those desiring to be pure the costly treasures of the virtues of those

who have renounced the world, and by reason too of its immensity, of its being beyond measure and beyond count.

⁴⁵ ‘ Thus is it, O king, of great service to those desiring to be pure, a remover of all sorrow and lamentation, an antidote to discontent; it puts an end to fear, and individuality, and imperviousness of mind ; to evil, and to grief, and to pain, and to lust, and to malice, and to dullness, and to pride, and to heresy, and to all wrong dispositions ; it brings with it honour and advantage and bliss; it fills them with ease and with love and with peace of mind; it is free from blame; it has happiness here as its fruit; it is a mine and treasure of goodness that is beyond measure and beyond count, costly above all things, and precious.

⁴⁶ ‘Just, O king, as men for nourishment seek after food, for health medicine, for assistance a friend, for crossing water a boat, for pleasant odours a perfume, for security a place of refuge, for support the earth, for instruction a teacher, for honours a king, and for whatever they desire a wishing-gem—just so, O king, do the Arahats seek after the virtues of the keeping of the vows for the attainment of all the advantages of renunciation of the world.

⁴⁷ ‘And what water is for the growth of seeds, [856] what fire is for burning, what food is for giving strength, what a creeper is for tying things up, what

⁴⁸ VASrs. OF MILINDA THE KING. 259 a sword is for cutting, what water is for allaying thirst, what a treasure is for giving confidence, what a boat is for crossing to the further shore, what medicine is for allaying disease, what a carriage is for journeying at ease, what a place of refuge is for appeasing fear, what a king is for protection, what a shield is for warding off the blows of sticks and stakes, of clubs, of arrows, and of darts, what a teacher is for instruction, what a mother is for nourishing, what a mirror is for seeing, what a jewel is for ornament, what a dress is for clothing, what a ladder is for mounting up, what a pair of scales is for comparison, what a charm is for repetition, what a weapon is for warding off scorn, what a lamp is for dissipating darkness, what a breeze is for allaying fever, what knowledge of an art is for the accomplishment of business, what medicinal drugs are for the preservation of life, what a mine is for the production of jewels, what a gem is for ornament, what a command is for preventing transgression, what sovereignty is for dominion—all that, O king, is the character-that-comes-of-keeping-the-vows for the good growth of the seed of renunciation, for the burning out of the stains of evil, for giving the strength of Iddhi, for tying up one’s self in self-control and presence of mind, for the complete cutting off of doubt and mistrust, for allaying the thirst of craving, for giving confidence as to perception of the truth, for crossing to the further shore of the fourfold stream (of sensuality, individuality, delusion, and ignorance), for allaying the disease of evil dis-

⁴⁹ 260 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 15. positions, for attaining to the bliss of Nirvava, for appeasing the fears that arise from birth, old age, decay and death, grief, pain, lamentation, woe, and despair, for being protected in the possession of the advantages of renunciation, for warding off discontent and evil thoughts, for instruction in all the good involved in the life of those who have renounced the world, for nourishment therein, for explaining to men quietude and insight, and the path and the fruits thereof and Nirvava, for bestowing upon men a costly ornament high in the praise and admiration of the world, for closing the doors of all evil states, for mounting up to the peaks of the mountain heights of renunciation, for distinguishing crooked and cunning and evil intentions in others, for the proper recitation of those qualities which ought to be practised and those which ought

not, for warding off as one's enemies all evil dispositions, for dissipating the darkness of ignorance, for allaying the fever arising from the scorching of the threefold fire, for the accomplishment of the attainment of the Condition of Peace—so gentle and so subtle,—for the protection of the virtues of the life of a recluse, for the production of the precious jewels of the sevenfold wisdom— self-possession, investigation of the truth, energy, joy, calm contemplation, and serenity,—for the adornment of the recluses, for the prevention of any transgression against that blameless, abstruse, delicate bliss [857] that comes of peace, for dominion over all the qualities that recluses and Arahats affect. Thus, O king, is it that keeping the vows is one and the same thing as attaining to all these qualities. And the advantage thereof, O king, cannot be weighed, neither measured; it has no equal, no rival, no

⁵⁰ Vi, 16. OF MILINDA THE KING. 261 superior, great is it and glorious, extensive and abundant, deep and broad, and large and wide, full of weight and worth and might.

⁵¹ 'And whosoever, O king, having evil cravings in his heart, being hypocritical, greedy, a slave to his stomach', seeking after material gain or worldly fame and glory, unfit (for the outward signs of Arahats), not having reached the attainments, whose conduct is inconsistent (with membership in the Order), unworthy of it, inappropriate to it—whosoever being such shall take upon himself the vows, he shall incur a twofold punishment, suffering the loss of the good that may be in him. For in this world he shall receive disgrace, and scorn, and blame, and ridicule, and suspension, and excommunication *, and expulsion, and he shall be outcast, rejected, dismissed; and in his next life he shall suffer torment in the great Avīṇi purgatory that is a hundred leagues in depth, and covered, as with a garland, with hot and scorching, fierce and fiery blazing flames; therein shall he rise and fall for myriads of. years, upwards and downwards and across,—a foam-bubble, as it were, cast up and thrown from side to side in a boiling seat, And, when released from thence, then as a mighty Preta (ghost), in the outward form of a monk, but with

⁵² 262 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, v body and limbs lean and rugged and dark, with head swollen, bloated, and full of holes, hungry and thirsty, odd and dreadful in colour and form, his ears all torn, and his eyes ever winking, his limbs a mass of mortifying sores, his whole body the prey of maggots, his stomach all scorching and hot like a flery furnace blazing in the breeze, yet with a mouth no larger than a needle so that his thirst can never cease, with no place of refuge to fly to, no protector to help him, groaning and weeping and crying out for mercy, shall he wander wailing o'er the earth! 17. 'Just, O king, as whosoever, being unfit for royalty, without having properly attained to it, being inappropriate to it, unworthy of it, unsuitable for it, a low-born man and base in lineage, should receive the consecration of a king, he would suffer mutilation, having his hands or his feet, or his hands and feet cut off, or his ears or his nose, or his ears and nose cut off, [858] or he would be tortured, being subjected to the Gruel Pot, or to the Chank Crown, or to the Rahu's Mouth, or to the Fire Garland, or to the Hand Torch, or to the Snake Strips, or to the Bark Dress, or to the Spotted Antelope, or to the Flesh Hooks, or to the Pennies, or to the Brine Slits, or to the Bar Turn, or to the Straw Seat > oF he would be anointed with boiling oil, or be eaten by dogs, or be impaled alive, or be beheaded, or be subjected to punishments of various kinds. And why? Because he being unfit for it, without having properly attained to it, being inappropriate to it, unworthy of it, unsuitable for it, a low-born man

⁵³ * Sfina (for sfina). See Kullavagga X, 1, 2, 3. * Aru-gatto pakka-gatto. See Magghima Nikaya I, 506. * On all these see the notes above, I, 270, 2

⁵⁴ Vi, wi OF MILINDA THE KING, 263 and base in lineage, he had placed himself in the seat of sovereignty, and thus transgressed beyond his right limits. Just so, O king, whosoever having evil cravings in his heart, being hypocritical, greedy, a slave to his stomach, seeking after material gain or worldly fame and glory, unfit (for the outward signs of Arahatsip), not having reached the attainments, whose conduct is inconsistent (with membership in the Order), unworthy of it, inappropriate to it—whosoever being such shall take upon himself the vows, he shall incur a twofold punishment, suffering the loss of the good that may be in him. For in this world he shall receive disgrace, and scorn, and blame, and ridicule, and suspension, and excommunication, and expulsion, and he shall be outcast, rejected, dismissed; and in his next life he shall suffer torment in the great Avīḥi purgatory that is a hundred leagues in depth, and covered, as with a garland, with hot and scorching, fierce and fiery blazing flames; therein shall he rise and fall for myriads of years, upwards and downwards and across,—a foam-bubble, as it were, cast up and thrown from side to side in a boiling sea. And, when released from thence, then as a mighty Preta (ghost), in the outward form of a monk, but with body and limbs lean and rugged and dark, with head swollen, bloated, and full of holes, hungry and thirsty, odd and dreadful in colour and form, his ears all torn, and his eyes ever winking, his limbs a mass of mortifying sores, his whole body the prey of maggots, his stomach all scorching and hot like a fiery furnace blazing in the breeze, yet with a mouth no larger than a needle so that his thirst can never cease, with no place of refuge to fly

⁵⁵ 264 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 18. to, no protector to help him, groaning and weeping and crying out for mercy, shall he wander wailing o'er the earth!

⁵⁶ ‘ But whosoever, O king, is fit, who has reached the attainments, whose conduct is consistent with membership in the Order, who is worthy of it, appropriate to it, who desires little and is content, given to seclusion, not fond of society, alert in zeal, resolute of heart, without guile, without deceit, not a slave to his stomach, seeking neither material gain nor worldly fame or glory, full of faith, who has entered the Order from belief (in the doctrine, and not from worldly motives), and is full of desire for release from old age and death—whosoever being such shall take upon himself the vows with the idea of upholding the faith, he is deserving of twofold honour. For he is near and dear to, loved and longed for by both gods and men, dear as rare jasmine flowers to the man bathed and anointed, as sweet food to the hungry, as cool, clear, fragrant water to the thirsty, as a healing drug to a poisoned man, as a costly chariot drawn by high-bred steeds to the hurrying traveller, as a wishing-gem to the greedy for gain, as the pure white sunshade of sovereignty to one ambitious for a throne, as the blessed attainment of the fruits of Arahatsip to the seeker after holiness. It is he who attains to the fullest mastery over the four Earnest Meditations, the fourfold Great Struggle, the four Roads to Saintship, the five Organs of the moral sense, the five moral Powers, the seven forms of Wisdom, and the Noble Eightfold Path E quietude and insight reign in his heart, attainment

⁵⁷ * For the details of these constituent elements of Arahatsip, see my note in ‘ Buddhist Suttas,’ pp. 60-63. VI, 19. OF MILINDA THE KING. 265

⁵⁸ through study becomes easy to him, and the four fruits of the life of a recluse’, [859] the four kinds of Discrimination 2, the threefold Knowledge ’, the sixfold higher Wisdom ‘, in a word, the

whole religion of the recluses becomes his very own, an anointed king is he, and over him is borne the pure white sunshade of emancipation!

⁵⁹ 1g. 'Just, O king, as all the citizens and country folk in the land, the soldiers and the peons (royal messengers), wait in service upon a Kshatriya king, born to the purple, and on both sides of lineage high, when he has been consecrated with the inauguration ceremonies of the Kshatriyas®; the thirty-eight divisions of the royal retinue, and the dancing men, and acrobats, and the soothsayers °,

⁶⁰ ' These are the four stages of the path to Arahatsip. ? Patisambhida—in worldly things, and in religion, in intuitive knowledge, and in exposition.

⁶¹ * Tisso Vigga. One explanation of this term is the knowledge of the three limitations of individuality,—its impermanence, the pain involved in the struggle to maintain it, and the absence of any permanent principle (any soul) in any individual. But it is also explained in the Anguttara Nikaya III, 58, as meaning the knowledge firstly of one's own former births, secondly of other people's former births, and thirdly of the nature, the origin, and the right method of subduing sorrow and the 4savas (that is, lust, individuality, delusion, and ignorance). The first triplet is identical with the three lakkhazas, the second with the last three of the Dasabalas, the ten powers of a Buddha. Soin the Sutta Vibhanga (Paragika I, 1-8) the last of these three is called tatiya vigga. Compare also ' Buddhist Suttas,' p. 162.

⁶² * The Abhiz7as. 266 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 19. and the heralds, and Samazas and Brahmans, and the followers of every sect, frequent his court, and he becomes the lord of every seaport, and treasure-mine, and town, and custom-house?—giving instructions as to the fate of every foreigner and criminal *—just so, O king, whoever is fit, who has reached the attainments, whose conduct is consistent with membership in the Order, who is worthy of it, appropriate to it, who desires little and is content, given to seclusion, not fond of society, alert in zeal, resolute of heart, without guile, without deceit, not a slave to his stomach, seeking neither material gain nor worldly fame or glory, full of faith, who has entered the Order from belief (in the doctrine, and not from worldly motives), and is full of desire for release from old age and

⁶³ and Mukha-mangalika may be those who prophesy the lucky days on which a thing is to be commenced. But this is the only passage in which the phrases occur in Pali, and in Sanskrit we have only much later authorities. See the Commentary on Sakuntala, quoted in the note on p. 152 of Sir M. Monier-Williams's edition, and Wilson's explanation in his Sanskrit Dictionary of swasti-vakana.

⁶⁴ * Softhi-vakaka, 'utterers of blessing.' The Simhalese has sdbhana-vakanikayo (perhaps ' augurs'). ? Sunka/hana, 'taxing-place,' But the Simhalese, p. 524, has only samasthana.

⁶⁵ * I can only guess at the meaning of this enigmatical phrase, which the Simhalese again merely repeats, but a precisely similar passage occurs in the Sumangala Vildsini, p. 246; and though the exact course of proceedings in the ancient law courts of India is still, in many details, uncertain, it is yet clear that the actual apportionment of punishment (as well as the execution of it) was always held to be the sole prerogative of the king. This was more especially the case where mutilation or a death sentence was concerned. Minor punishments the judges could, no doubt, order without reference to the king. See Jolly, 'Beitrage zur indischen Rechts-geschichte,' in the ' Zeitschrift der deutschen morg. Gesellschaft,' 1890, pp. 344 foll.

⁶⁶ VI, 20. OF MILINDA THE KING, 267 death—whosoever being such shall take upon himself the vows with the idea of upholding the faith, he is deserving of twofold honour. For he is near and dear to, loved and longed for by both gods and men, dear as rare jasmine flowers to the man bathed and anointed, as sweet food to the hungry, as cool, clear, fragrant water to the thirsty, as a healing drug to a poisoned man, as a costly chariot drawn by high-bred steeds to the hurrying traveller, as a wishing-gem to the greedy for gain, as the pure white sunshade of sovereignty to one ambitious for a throne, as the blessed attainment of the fruits of Arahathship to the seeker after holiness. It is he who attains to the fullest mastery over the four Earnest Meditations, the fourfold Great Struggle, the four Roads to Saintship, the five Organs of the moral sense, the five moral Powers, the seven forms of Wisdom, and the Noble Eightfold Path, quietude and insight reign in his heart, attainment through study becomes easy to him, and the four fruits of the life of a recluse, the four kinds of Discrimination, the threefold Knowledge, the sixfold higher Wisdom, in a word, the whole religion of the recluses becomes his very own, an anointed king is he, and over him is borne the pure white sunshade of emancipation !

⁶⁷ ‘Such, O king, are the thirteen vows purified by which a man shall bathe in the mighty waters of Nirvaza, and there indulge himself, as one sporting in the waves, with the manifold delights of religion, he shall addict himself to the eight modes of transcendental ecstasy, he shall acquire the powers of Iddhi, distant sounds, human and divine, shall greet his ear, he shall divine the thoughts of others, he

⁶⁸ 268 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 20. a shall be able to call to mind his own previous births, and to watch the rise and fall from birth to birth of others, and he shall perceive the real nature and the origin of, he shall perceive the means of escape from sorrow, and from lust, individuality, delusion, and ignorance, the stains of life!

⁶⁹ ‘And what are these thirteen? Wearing raiment made up of pieces taken from a dust-heap—Wearing three robes, and three robes only—Living on food received by begging—Begging straight on from house to house—Eating only once a day, at one sitting —Eating from one vessel only—Refusing food in excess of the regulations—Dwelling in the woods—Dwelling at the root of a tree—Dwelling in the open air—Dwelling in or near a cemetery—Not altering the mat or bed when it has once been spread out to sleep on—and sleeping in a sitting posture. It is he, O king, who, in former births, has undertaken and practised, followed and carried out, observed, framed his conduct according to, and fulfilled these thirteen vows, who acquires all the results of the life of a recluse, and all its ecstasy of peace and bliss becomes his very own 1.

⁷⁰ 1 The Sinhalese, pp. 525-531, goes at great length into the details of all these vows, each of which it divides into stages of greater or less severity, specifying the practice to be followed in each stage. As a matter of fact the members of the Buddhist Order have not observed them in any completeness. Like the Buddha himself, the majority have undertaken only the second of the thirteen—the wearing of three robes; and the others have only been occasionally practised, and then usually only one or more at a time, by isolated members. It is true that the Gataka Commentary (Fausbdl, vol. ii, p. 449) says that Upasena Vangantaputta kept the whole thirteen of the Dhutangas. But this is at variance with the older text (in the Vinaya, Nissaggiya, No. XV) giving that account of the same episode on which the story in the

⁷¹ VI, 22. OF MILINDA THE KING. 269 21. ‘Just, O king, as a shipowner who has become wealthy by constantly levying freight in some seaport town, will be able to traverse the high seas, and go to Vanga, or Takkola, or China, or Sovira, or Surat, or Alexandria, or the Koromandel coast, or Further India, or any other place where ships do congregate—just so, O king, [860] it is he who in former births has undertaken and practised, followed and carried out, observed, framed his conduct according to, and fulfilled these thirteen vows, who acquires all the results of the life of a recluse, and all its ecstasy of peace and bliss becomes his very own. ae

⁷² ‘And just, O king, as a husbandman will first remove the defects in the soil—weeds, and thorns, and stones—and then by ploughing, and sowing,

⁷³ GAataka Commentary is based. The thirteen vows are not referred to at all in the rules of the Order, as translated in the three volumes of the Vinaya Texts, nor are they mentioned as a whole in any Pitaka text yet published. But the thirteen names are given together in a different order in a passage twice repeated in the Parivara, a late book, probably written in Ceylon (pp. 131, 193). It is there declared of each of the thirteen vows that five sorts of people undertake them—those who do so from stupidity, those who do so from vain desire, those who are mad, those who do so because the vows have been exalted by the Buddhas and their followers, those who do so from high motives. It is clear therefore that our author’s doctrine of the thirteen Dhutangas is at variance with primitive Buddhism. It would require, however, a separate note on each of the thirteen to show the exact degree of this variance. The basis on which each of these observances rests can be found in the older teaching, and nearly all of them have been praised or followed, in a greater or less degree, from very early times,—not indeed as general rules binding on all members of the Order, but as supplementary or extra vows, conducive, but subsidiary to the ethical self-culture of the Arahats.

⁷⁴ 270 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 23, and irrigating, and fencing, and watching, and reaping, and grinding, will become the owner of much flour, and so the lord of whosoever are poor and needy, reduced to beggary and misery—just so, O king, it is he who in former births has undertaken and practised, followed and carried out, observed, framed his conduct according to, and fulfilled these thirteen vows, who acquires all the results of the life of a recluse, and all its ecstasy of peace and bliss becomes his very own,

⁷⁵ ‘And again, O king, just as an anointed monarch is master over the treatment of outlaws, is an independent ruler and lord, and does whatsoever he desires, and all the broad earth is subject to him—Just so, O king, is he who has undertaken, practised, and fulfilled in former births these vows, master, ruler, and lord in the religion of the Conquerors, and all the virtues of the Samavzas are his.

⁷⁶ ‘And was not Upasena, the Elder, he of the sons of the Vangantas!, from his having thoroughly practised all the purifying merits of the vows, able to neglect the agreement arrived at by the members of the Order resident at SAVatthi, and to visit with his attendant brethren the Subduer of men, then retired into solitude, and when he had bowed down before him, to take his seat respectfully aside ? And when the Blessed One saw how well trained his retinue was, then, delighted and glad and exalted in heart, he greeted them with courteous words, and said in his unbroken beautiful voice :

⁷⁷ “Most pleasant, Upasena, is the deportment of * According to the Sinhalese this was a Brahman clan. But the derivation suggests the borders of Bengal, where it is somewhat strange to find Brahmans so early,

⁷⁸ VI, 25. OF MILINDA THE KING. eye these brethren waiting upon you. How have you managed thus to train your followers ?” ‘And he, when so questioned by the omniscient Buddha, the god over all gods, spake thus to the Blessed One as to the real reason for the goodness of their nature: ““ Whosoever, Lord, may come to me to ask for admission to the Order or to become my disciple, to him do I say [861]: ‘I, Sir, am a frequenter of the woods, who gain my food by begging, and wear but this robe pieced together from cast-off rags. If you will be the same, I can admit you to the Order and make you my disciple.’ Then, if he agree thereto with joy, and abase himself?, I thereupon admit him to the Order and to the company of my pupils. But if not, then neither do I admit him to the one nor to the other. Thus is it, Lord, that I train them’.” And thus is it, O king, that he who has taken upon himself the vows becomes master, ruler, and lord in the religion of the Conquerors; and all its ecstasy of peace and bliss becomes his very own.

⁷⁹ ‘Just, O king, as a lotus flower of glorious, pure, and high descent and origin is glossy, soft, desirable, sweet-smelling, longed for, loved, and praised, untarnished by the water or the mud, graced with tiny petals and filaments and pericarps, the resort of many bees, a child of the clear cold

⁸⁰ 272 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 25. stream—just so is that disciple of the Noble Ones who in former births has undertaken and practised, followed and carried out, observed and framed his conduct according to, and fulfilled these thirteen vows, endowed with the thirty graces. And what are the thirty? His heart is full of affectionate, soft, and tender love, evil is killed, destroyed, cast out from within him, pride and self-righteousness are put an end to and cast down, stable and strong and established and undeviating is his faith, he enters into the enjoyment of the heart’s refreshment, the highly praised and desirable peace and bliss of the ecstasies of contemplation fully felt, he exhales the most excellent and unequalled sweet savour of righteousness of life, near is he and dear to gods and men alike, exalted by the best of beings the Arahats Noble Ones themselves, gods and men delight to honour him, the enlightened, wise, and learned approve, esteem, appreciate, and praise him, untarnished is he by the love either of this world or the next, he sees the danger in the smallest tiniest offence, rich is he in the best of wealth—the wealth that is the fruit of the Path, the wealth of those who are seeking the highest of the attainments,—he is partaker of the best of the four requisites of a recluse that may be obtained by asking, he lives without a home addicted to that best austerity that is dependent on the meditation of the Ganas, [862] he has unravelled the whole net of evil, he has broken and burst through, doubled up and utterly destroyed both the possibility of rebirth in any of the five future states, and the five obstacles to the

⁸¹ * Compare ‘ Buddhist Suttas,’ p. 10, and the note there. VI, 26. OF MILINDA THE KING. Pa] 2 higher life in this one (lust, malice, sloth, pride, and doubt), unalterable in character, excellent in conduct’, transgressing none of the rules as to the four requisites of a recluse, he is set free from rebirths, he has passed beyond all perplexity, his mind is set upon complete emancipation, he has seen the truth®, the sure and steadfast place of refuge from all fear has he gained, the seven evil inclinations (to lust, and malice, and heresy, and doubt, and pride, and desire for future life, and ignorance) are rooted out in him, he has reached the end of the Great Evils (lust, individuality, delusion, and ignorance), he abounds in the peace and the bliss of the ecstasies of contemplation, he is endowed with all the virtues a recluse should have. These, O king, are the thirty graces he is adorned withal.

⁸² ‘And was not Sariputta, the Elder, O king, the best man in the whole ten thousand world systems, the Teacher of the world himself alone excepted? And he who through endless ages had heaped up merit, and had been reborn in a Brahman family, relinquished all the delights of the pleasures of sense, and gave up boundless wealth *, to enter the Order according to the teaching of the Conqueror, and having restrained his actions, words, and thoughts by these thirteen vows, became in this life of such exalted virtue that he was the one who, after the Master, set rolling on the royal chariot-

⁸³ 3’ For sankha Hinasi-kumburé has sahassa. [36] S 22 Weal THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 26. wheel of the kingdom of righteousness in the religion of Gotama, the Blessed One. So that this was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in that most excellent collection, the Anguttara Nikaya?:

⁸⁴ “T know, O brethren, of no other man who in succession to me sets rolling on the glorious chariotwheel of the kingdom of righteousness so well as Sariputta. Sdriputta, O brethren, sets rolling that wheel the best of all.”’

⁸⁵ ‘Most excellent, Nagasena! The whole ninefold word of the Buddha, the most exalted conduct, the highest and best of the attainments to be gained in the world,—all these are wrapped up together in the virtues that result from the keeping of the VOWS.

⁸⁶ Here ends the Ninth Chapter’, Here ends the Solving of Puzzles. ? The ninth, because the numbering of the Vaggas is carried on from the last book. But according to the divisions enumerated at the beginning of the work (translated at p. 4 of the previous volume) it is one of the principal divisions of the book that is here closed, and the chapters ought not to run on, WEF, Oy, OF MILINDA THE KING. 275

Chapter VII

¹ OPAMMA-KATHA-PAWNHO. THE SIMILES. CHAPTER 1. 1. [863] ‘Venerable Nagasena, with how many qualities must a member of the Order (a Bhikshu) be endowed to realise Arahatsip ?’

² ‘ The brother, O king, who wishes to attain Arahatsip must take :— SOW AKA YE Po . One quality of the ass . : eVLise, 2 . And five of the cock ‘ , ee ae . And one of the squirrel . ‘ ‘ 28

³ And one of the female panther. o, 9 And two of the male panther. ; E10 And five of the tortoise A ‘ bT And one of the bamboo i ‘ RTT . And one of the bow. ‘ ‘ e718 . And two of the crow. 3 ; 1 210 . And two of the monkey. t : net . And one of the gourd . : wT Lea, 1 . And three of the lotus . ‘ ; f) 2 . And two of seed . : ‘ ‘ pe Ss . And one of the Sal-tree . : 87 . And three of a ship : ; : a . And two of the anchor . ; : ria Gt . And one of the mast. ‘ ; JP EIS . And three of the pilot. : ‘ om ErA . And one of the sailor . : P Sky . And five of the ocean. : j ALO . And five of the earth , , Aa GIR as

⁴ se THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Vil; 1,8". Oa 22; 23. 24. 25: 26. 27. 2S: 29. 30. Ze Ae 33: 34. ao: 36. 37: 38. 39. 40. At. A>. 4 3: 44. 45. 46. 47. 48. 49. 50. 5. 52. 53. 5455:

⁵ And five of water . And five of fire And five of wind And five of rock And five of space . And five of the moon And seven of the sun

⁶ And three of Sakka And four of a sovran overlord And one of the white ant And two of the cat And one of the rat And one of the scorpion

⁷ And one of the mungoose : [364] And two of the old jackal And three of the deer And four of the bull And two of the boar

⁸ And five of the elephant And seven of the lion And three of the Kakravaka bird t And two of the Pezahika bird And one of the house-pigeon . And two of the owl

⁹ And one of the crane And two of the bat And one of the leech And three of the serpent And one of the rock-snake And one of the road spider

¹⁰ And one of the land tortoise . And five of the mountain height And three of the tree BA aS en = Ea WELL eG And one of the child at the breast .

¹¹ II aa ay OE 4, I OBR WwW Dd VII, 1, t. OF MILINDA THE KING. oTF 56. And five of the rain-cloud . Wii, 6,.12 57. And three of the jewel . S ‘ ay; 58. And four of the hunter . : : 20 59. And two of the fisherman . : . 24 60. And two of the carpenter. : 26 61. And one of the waterpot ‘ ; VII, (Be

¹² And two of iron . . ; ‘ ae 63. And three of a sunshade : : aay | 64. And three of a rice field. : : sell ey, 65. And two of medicine. ; PETC, 66. And three of food . ‘ : : nas ©:

¹³ And four of the archer?. aS, ae And four of the king. And two of the doorkeeper. And one of a grindstone. And two of a lamp. And two of the peacock. And two of the steed. And two of the publican. And two of a threshold. And one of a balance. And two of a sword. And two of a fish. [865] And one of a borrower. And two of a sick man. And two of a corpse. And two of a river. And one of a buffalo. And two of a road. And one of a tax-gatherer. And three of a thief.

¹⁴ 278 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Vi ap And one of the hawk. And one of the dog. And three of the physician. And two of a woman with child. And one of the yak cow. And two of the hen. _ And three of the dove. And two of the one-eyed man. And three of the husbandman. And one of the female jackal 1. _ And two of the dyers’ straining-cloth *. And one. of a spoon. And one of the negociator of a loan. And one of a collector. And two of a charioteer. And two of a village headman. And one of a tailor. And one of a helmsman. And two of a bee.’

¹⁵ Here ends the. Table of Contents. ® Kangavarakassa. See Magghima Nikdya I, 142-4, and Gataka V, 186, in both of which passages the Burmese MSS. read kanka-. The Simhalese, p. 540, has perahan kadé.

¹⁶ NAD Ate Px OF MILINDA THE KING, 279 tT; Tue Ass. 2. ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the harsh-voiced ass which you say he ought to take, which is that?’

¹⁷ ‘Just, O king, as the ass, wheresoever he may lie down—whether on a dust heap, or in the open space where four roads meet, or three !, or at the entrance to a village, or on a heap of straw—{366]—nowhere is he given to resting long; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort?, wheresoever he may spread out his mat for repose—whether on strewed grass, or leaves, or on a bed of thorns, or on the bare earth—nowhere should he be given to sloth. This is the one quality of the ass he ought to have. For this has been said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods:

¹⁸ “Sleeping on pillows of chaff, my disciples, O brethren, Keep themselves earnest and ardent in strenuous feht?” 2 Yogt yogavakaro. The rendering of these words is quite inadequate, and has given me much trouble. Neither ‘yogee’ nor ‘devotee’ can be used, for they both have acquired connotations contradictory to what was in our author’s mind. He means the Buddhist Bhikshu belonging to that class among the Bhikshus (by no means the majority) who had devoted themselves to a life of systematic effort according to the Buddhist scheme of selftraining. But I have found it

impossible to put into any English phrase sufficiently short for the constant repetition of the two Pali words any full and accurate representation of all that they imply. See the note above on p. 43 of the Pali, and Gataka, vol. i, p. 303.

¹⁹ 'Not traced as yet. Mr. Trenckner prints the passage as 280 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 1, 3. pen ee ee 'And this too, O king, was said by S4riputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith:

²⁰ "Tf it but raineth not knee-deep on him When sitting in high meditations plunged— What cares the man on Arahatsip intent for ease

²¹ Tue Cock. 3. 'Venerable Nagasena, those five qualities of the cock which you say he ought to take, what are they: 2' 'Just, O king, as a cock goes early and betimes to roost ; so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, early and betimes sweep out the open space around the Dagaba, and having got ready? the drinking-water for the day's use, and dressed himself', and taken his bath, he should bow

²² prose, but it is clearly two verses with a slight corruption in the first line. The point of the verses lies in the untranslatable pun of the words upadh4na, 'pillow,' and padhana, 'strenuous fight.' The word etarahi seems to me suspect, and some such reading as kaingaropadhana va would restore the metre, and at the same time bring the play on the words more into prominence.

²³ > That is, 'filtered;' perahd naga taba, says the Simhalese, Pp. 541. * Sarfram pafigag gitva, 'rested a little to remove the weariness

²⁴ of his body,' says the Simhalese here, but adds below, § 4, siwuru heenda. Vib, age OF MILINDA THE KING. 281 down in reverence before the Dagaba, and then pay visits to the senior Bhikshus, and, on his return, enter in due time into the chamber of solitude. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of the cock he ought to have.

²⁵ 'And again, O king, as a cock rises early and betimes ; so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, rise early and betimes to sweep out the open space around the Dagaba, and get ready the drinking-water for the day's use, and dress himself, and pay his daily reverence to the Dagaba, and enter into the chamber of solitude. This, O king, is the second of the qualities of the cock he ought to have.

²⁶ 'And again, O king, as the cock is unremitting in scratching the earth to pick up what he can find to eat; so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, practise continual self-examination and circumspection in taking any nourishment he may find to eat, reminding himself : [867] "I eat this, seeking not after pleasure, nor after excitement, nor after beauty of body, nor after elegance of form, but merely for the preservation of my body, to keep myself alive, as a means of appeasing the pain of hunger, and of assisting me in the practice of the higher life. Thus shall I put an end to all former sorrow, and give no cause for future sorrow to arise; therein shall I be free from blame, and dwell at ease." This, O king, is the third of the qualities of the cock he ought to have. For it has been said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods:

²⁷ " Like child's flesh in the desert wild, Or smearing grease upon the wheel, 282 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 1, 6. Solely to keep himself alive, Does he, when feeling faint, take food 1."

²⁸ 'And again, O king, as the cock, though it has eyes, is blind by night; so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, though he is not blind, be as one blind. Whether in the woods, or

on his daily walk for alms in search of food, blind should he be and deaf and dumb to all delights of form, or sound, or taste, or smell, or touch, should not make them the objects of his thought, should pay no special, detailed, attention to them*. This, O king, is the fourth of the qualities of the cock he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Maha KaAayana, the Elder :

²⁹ “ Let him with eyes be as one blind, And he who hears be as the deaf, As to the last word, I take it, with Hinasi-kumburé, p. 542, to be muffZito, and not amukshito as is printed in the text. That is also the reading adopted by Fausbél at Gataka II, 294, where the verses are quoted.

³⁰ * Na nimittam gahetabbam nenubyaf#ganam gahetabbam. On these common expressions compare Anguttara I, 2, 6, &c.; Puggala Pa#fatti I, 17, IV, 24, &c.; Digha II, 64, &c.; and Buddhaghosa as quoted in ‘ Vinaya Texts, II, 9. Hinasi-kumburé only repeats the first, but explains the second by ncewata neewata wimasfmem,

³¹ VIL, 1, 7. OF MILINDA THE KING. 283 He who can speak be as the dumb, The man of strength as were he weak. As each new object rises to his ken, On the sweet couch of blest Nirvaza’s peace Let him lie down and rest !.”

³² ‘And again, O king, as the cock, even though persecuted ? with clods and sticks and clubs? and cudgels, will not desert his home ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort,—whether he be engaged in robemaking or in building-work, or in any of his daily duties, or in teaching, or in receiving instruction *—never give up his presence of mind. For that, O king—his presence of mind —is the home in which he dwells. This, O king, is the fifth of the qualities of the cock he ought to have. [868] And this, O king, has been said by the Blessed One, the god over all gods®:

³³ “ And which, O Bhikshu, is the Bhikshu’s resort, the realm which is his own by right ?—it is this, the four modes of being mindful and thoughtful *.”

³⁴ \$ Lakufa. See above, pp. 255, 301 of the Pali, and compare the Hindi. 284 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Vil, 1,5: ‘ And this too, O king, has been said by Sariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith:

³⁵ “ The elephant distinguishes good food From bad, he knows what gives him sustenance, And even when asleep he guards his trunk 1— So let each Buddha’s son, earnest in zeal,

³⁶ Never do violence to the Conqueror’s word, Nor injury to his self-possession, best of gifts?.” 3. THE SQUIRREL. 8. ‘ Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the squirrel which you say he ought to take, which is that ?’

³⁷ ‘Just as the squirrel, O king, when an enemy falls upon him, beats his tail on the ground till it swells, and then with his own tail as a cudgel drives off the foe; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when his enemy, sin, falls upon him, beat the cudgel of his self-possession till it swells, and then by the cudgel of self-possession drive all evil inclinations off. This, O king, is the one quality of the squirrel which he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Aulla Panthaka, the Elder:

³⁸ “When sins, those fell destroyers of the gains Gained by the life of recluse, fall on us, They should be slain, again and yet again,

³⁹ et Mae By resolute self-possession as a club ®. * As he does in war, according to Maggfima I, 415. * Not traced as yet. It is not included in the collection of Sariputta's verses preserved in the Thera Gatha.

⁴⁰ VI, 1, 10. OF MILINDA THE KING. 285 4. THE PANTHER (FEMALE) 1. 9. 'Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the female of the panther which you say he ought to take, which is that ?'

⁴¹ 'Just, O king, as the female of the panther conceives only once, and does not resort again and again to the male?; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort—seeing how future conceptions and births involve a period of gestation and a fall from each state as it is reached, and dissolution and death and destruction, seeing the horrors of transmigration and of rebirths in evil states, the annoyance of them, the torment of them,—he should steadfastly resolve never to enter upon any future life. [869] This, O king, is the one quality of the female panther which he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Sutta Nipata, in the Sutta of Dhaniya the cowherd :

⁴² "Like a strong bull who's burst the bonds that bound him, Or elephant who's forced his way through jungle, Thus shall I never more enter the womb—

⁴³ And now, if 'it so please you, god, rain on *!" 5. THE PANTHER (MALE). to. 'Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of the panther which you say he ought to take, which are they?'

⁴⁴ 286 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 1, 11. 'Just, O king, as the panther, lying in ambush in wild places, behind a thicket of long grass or brushwood, or among the rocks, catches the deer; so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, resort to solitary places in the woods, at the foot of a tree, on mountain heights, in caves and grottoes, in cemeteries, in forests, under the open sky, on beds of straw, in quiet, noiseless spots, free from strong winds, and hid from the haunts of men. For the strenuous Bhikshu, O king, earnest in effort, who frequents such solitudes, will soon become master of the six forms of transcendent insight. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of the panther he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Elders who collected the scriptures :

⁴⁵ "As the panther by lying in ambush catches the deer, So the sons of the Buddha, with insight and earnestness armed, By resorting to solitudes gain that Fruit which is best?"

⁴⁶ 'And again, O king, as the panther, whatever may be the beast he has killed, will never eat it if it has fallen on the left side; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, not partake of any food that has been procured by gifts of bamboos, or palms' leaves, or flowers, or fruits, or baths 2, or chunam, or tooth-sticks, [370] or water for washing ; or by flattery, or by gaining the laity over by sugared

⁴⁷ Se eee * That is, of course, Arahatsip. The lines are not to be found in the published texts. * Sindna-danena; omitted by the Sutta Vibhanga and by Hinai-kumburé (who quotes the P4li of this passage).

⁴⁸ Malye rf tr. OF MILINDA THE KING. 287 words (literally by pea-soup-talk), suppressing the truth and suggesting the false', or by petting their children®, or by taking messages as he walks from house to house', or by doctoring them, or by acting as a go-between, or as a messenger on matters of business or ceremony 4, or by exchanging with them things he has received as alms, or by giving back again to them as bribes robes or food once given to him', or by giving them hints as to lucky

sites, or lucky days, or lucky signs (on their children's bodies at birth), or by any other of those wrong modes of obtaining a livelihood that have been condemned by the Buddha '—no food so procured should he eat, as the panther will not eat any prey that has fallen on its left side. This is the second of the qualities of the panther he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Sariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith : "This food, so sweet, has been procured

⁴⁹ Through intimation given by speech. Were I, then, to partake thereof, My mode of livelihood would be blamed. ® Referring to the Silas.

⁵⁰ 288 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 1, 12. ee Now though by hunger dire oppressed My stomach seem to rise, to go, Ne'er will I break my rule of life, Not though my life I sacrifice*."''

⁵¹ Tue Tortoise. 12, 'Venerable NAgasena, those five qualities of the tortoise which you say he ought to take, what are they?'

⁵² 'Just, O king, as the tortoise, which is a water animal, keeps to the water ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, let his heart go out over the whole wide world with pity and with love—mighty, abounding, beyond measure, free from every feeling of hatred or of malice—towards all creatures that have life. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of the tortoise he ought to have.

⁵³ 'And again, O king, just as the tortoise, when, as he swims on the water and raises his head, he catches sight of any one, that moment sinks, and dives into the depths, lest they should see him again ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when evil inclinations fall upon him, sink into the waters of meditation, dive down into the deeps thereof, lest those evil inclinations should catch sight of him again. This, O king, is the

⁵⁴ * Not traced as yet. Hinaé-kumburé gives a long account of the circumstances under which these verses were spoken. SaAriputta was ill, Moggallana asked him what would be good for him to take. Sariputta told him. His friend then, by intervention of the king of the gods, procured it. But Sariputta refused to make use of it.

⁵⁵ ? The Brahma-viharas (Nos. 1 and 2). See ' Buddhist Suttas,' Pp. 201. WU, 1,76. OF MILINDA THE KING. 289 second of the qualities of the tortoise he ought to have.

⁵⁶ [871] ' And again, O king, just as the tortoise gets up out of the water, and suns himself; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when he rouses himself (withdraws his mind) out of meditation,—whether taken sitting, or lying down, or standing, or walking up and down,—sun his mind in the Great Struggle against evil dispositions. This, O king, is the third of the qualities of the tortoise he ought to have.

⁵⁷ 'And again, O king, just as the tortoise, digging a hole in the ground, dwells alone; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, giving up worldly gain and honour and praise, take up his abode alone, plunging into the solitudes of empty lonely places in the groves and woods and hills, in caves and grottoes, noiseless and quiet. This, O king, is the fourth of the qualities of the tortoise he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Upasena, the Elder, of the sons of the Vangantas:

⁵⁸ "Lonely and quiet places, haunts Of the deer, and of wild beasts, Should the Bhikshu seek as his abode, For solitude's sweet sake 1."

⁵⁹ ‘And again, O king, as the tortoise, when on his rounds he sees any one, draws in at once all his head and limbs into his shell, and hiding them there, keeps still in silence to save himself; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, wheresoever forms, or sounds, or odours, or tastes,

⁶⁰ 290 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Val a e07, or feelings strike upon him, shut to the gate of self-restraint at the six doors of his senses, cover up his mind in self-control, and continue constant in mindfulness and thoughtfulness to save his Samamaship. This, O king, is the fifth of the qualities of the tortoise he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the most excellent Samyutta Nikaya, in the Sutta of the parable of the tortoise :

⁶¹ “As the tortoise withdraws his limbs in his shell, Let the Bhikshu bury the thoughts of his mind, Himself Independent, injuring none,

⁶² Set free himself, speaking evil of none.”” 7. THE Bamsoo. 17. [872] ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the bamboo which you say he ought to take, which iets.

⁶³ ‘Just, O king, as the bamboo, whithersoever the gale blows, to that quarter does it bend accordingly, pursuing no other way of its own; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, conduct himself in accordance with the ninefold teaching of the Master, the word of the Buddha, the Blessed One, and stedfastly keeping to all things lawful and blameless, he should seek after the qualities of the Samazaship itself. This, O king, is the one quality of the bamboo he ought

⁶⁴ to have. For it was said, O king, by Rahula, the Elder : * The parable is in the 46th Samyutta. The verses are already published at vol. i, p. 7 of M. Seer’s edition for the P4lj Text Society.

⁶⁵ VII, 1, 109. OF MILINDA THE KING. 291 “Tn accord alway with Buddha’s ninefold word And stedfast in all lawful, blameless acts, I have passed beyond rebirth in evil states 1.”

⁶⁶) 8. Tue Bow. 18. ‘ Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the bow which you say he ought to have, which is it ?’ ‘Just, O king, as a well-made and balanced bow bends equally from end to end, and does not resist stiffly, like a post; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, bend easily in accord with all his brethren—whether elders, juniors, of medium seniority, or of like standing with himself —and not repel them. This, O king, is the one quality of the bow he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Vidhura Puzzaka Gataka :

⁶⁷ “ Let the wise bend as the bow, yield as the reed, Not be contrary. He shall dwell in the home of kings 7.” g. THE Crow.

⁶⁸ ‘ Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of the crow that you say he ought to take, which are teys ‘Just, O king, as the crow goes about full of apprehension and suspicion, [873] always on watch and guard; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, go about full of apprehension and suspicion, always on watch and guard,

⁶⁹ 292 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 1, 20. in full self-possession, with his senses under control. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of the crow he ought to have.

⁷⁰ ‘And again, O king, as the crow, whatever food he catches sight of, eats it, sharing with his kind ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never omit to share with virtuous co-religionists, and that without distinction of person or deliberation as to quantity !, whatever lawful gifts he may have lawfully received, down even to the contents of his begging-bowl. This, O king, is

the second of the qualities of the crow he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Sdariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith :

⁷¹ “Whate'er they may present to me, austere in life, All that, just as it comes, do I divide With all, and I myself then take my food 2.”

⁷² THE Monkey. 21. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of the monkey which you say he ought to have, which are they ?’

⁷³ ‘Just, O king, as the monkey, when about to take up his abode does so in some such place as a mighty tree, in a lonely place covered all over with branches, a sure place of refuge; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, choose as the teacher under whom to live a man modest, amiable, righteous, of beauty of character, learned in tradition and in the scriptures, lovable, venerable, worthy of

⁷⁴ * So Hinasi-kumburé understands this, his version agreeing with the quotation given by Mr. Trenckner from Buddhaghosa. * Not traced as yet.

⁷⁵ - VII, 3, 22. OF MILINDA THE KING. S93 reverence, a speaker of profitable things, meek, clever in admonition, in instruction, and in education, able to arouse, to incite, to gladden 1—such a friend should he choose as teacher. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of the monkey he ought to have.

⁷⁶ ‘And again, O king, as the monkey wanders about, and stands and sits, always on trees, and, if he goes to sleep, spends the night on them; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, stand and walk up and down thinking, [874] and lie down, and sleep, in the forest, and there enjoy the sense of self-possession. This, O king, is the second of the qualities of the monkey he ought to have. For it has been said, O king, by Sariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith:

⁷⁷ “Walking, or standing, sitting, lying down, *Tis in the forest that the Bhikshu shines. To dwell in wildernesses far remote Has been exalted by the Buddhas all *.”

⁷⁸ Here ends the First Chapter *. 2904 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Wide Book Vily
“CHAPTER 2: THE SIMILES (continued). 11. THE Gourp.

⁷⁹ ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the gourd which you say he ought to take, which is it ?’
‘Just, O king, as the gourd, climbing up with its tendrils! on to some other plant—whether a grass, or a thorn, or a creeper—grows all over it; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, who desires to grow up into Arahatsip, do so by climbing up with his mind over the ideas that present themselves (as subjects for the Kammaz- Chana meditations). This, O king, is the one quality of the gourd which he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Sariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith:

⁸⁰ “ As the gourd, clambering up with its tendrils, grows O’er the grass, or the thorn-bush, or creeper widespread, So the son of the Buddha on Arhatship bent, Climbs up o’er ideas, to perfection and peace ”.”

⁸¹ ‘ Somdikahi, which must mean here the tentacles or feelers of the gourd-creeper. The Sinhalese has simply Soxdim. I have only found the word elsewhere in the connection Sovdika kilaaga at Magghima I, 228 and Samyutta IV, 1, 6, 4.

⁸² * Not traced as yet. The last line is literally, ‘By climbing up on the arammazas should grow in the Fruit of those who have nothing left to learn’ (that is, in Arahatsip).

⁸³ - VII, 2, 4. OF MILINDA THE KING. 295 12, The Lorvs. 2. 'Venerable Nagasena, those three qualities of the lotus which you say he ought to take, which are they ?'

⁸⁴ 'Just, O king, as the lotus, though it is born in the water, and grows up in the water, yet remains undefiled by the water (for no water adheres to it); just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, remain undefiled by the support that he receives, or by the following of disciples that he obtains, or by fame, or by honour, or by veneration, or by the abundance of the requisites that he enjoys. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of the lotus that he ought to have.

⁸⁵ 'And again, O king, as the lotus remains lifted up far above the water; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, remain far above all worldly things. This, O king, is the second of the qualities of the lotus that he ought to have.

⁸⁶ 'And again, O king, as the lotus trembles when blown upon by the slightest breeze ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, exercise self-control in respect of the least of the evil dispositions, perceiving the danger (in the least offence). This, O king, is the third of the qualities of the lotus he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods :

⁸⁷ " Seeing danger in the least offence, he takes upon himself, trains himself in, the precepts ?." 2096 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 2, 5%

⁸⁸ s. 'Venerable NAgasena, those two qualities of seed which you say he ought to have, which are they ?' 'Just, O king, as seed, tiny though it be, yet if sown in good soil, and if the god rains aright, will give abundant fruit; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, so conduct himself aright that the righteousness of his life may give abundantly of the fruits of Samavzaship. This, O king, is the first quality of seed which he ought to have.

⁸⁹ 'And again, O king, as seed planted in wellweeded soil comes quickly to maturity; just so, O king, will his mind, when well-mastered?, and wellpurified in solitude, if it be cast by the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, into the excellent field of self-possession, come quickly to maturity. This, O king, is the second quality of seed which he ought to have. [876] For it was said, O king, by Anuruddha, the Elder :

⁹⁰ "Tf seed be sown on a well-weeded field, Its fruit, abounding, will rejoice the sower. So the recluse's heart, in solitude made pure, Matures full fast in self-possession's field 2."

⁹¹ THE SAL-TREE. 7. 'Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the Sal-tree which you say he ought to take, which oe a * Supariggahitam, which the Simhalese, p. 553, omits. ? Not in the published texts.

⁹² WIT, 2;°3) OF MILINDA THE KING, 297 'Just, O king, as the Sal-tree grows within the ground to the depth of a hundred cubits or more ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, perfect in solitude the four Fruits of Samazaship, the four Discriminations, the six forms of transcendental Insight, and all the qualities befitting a recluse. This, O king, is the one quality of the Sal-tree he ought to have. For it was said, O | king, by Rahula, the Elder:

⁹³ "The tree that's called the Sal-tree grows above the earth, And shoots beneath, a hundred cubits deep. As in the fullness of time, and at its highest

⁹⁴ growth That tree shoots in one day! a hundred cubits high, Just so do I, O Buddha, like the Sal, Increase, in solitude, in inward good."

⁹⁵ [HE Sup. 8. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those three qualities of the ship that you say he ought to take, which are miey ?’ ‘Just, O king, as a ship, by the combination of the quantity of the different kinds of timber of which it is composed, conveys many folk across ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, cross the whole world of existence, whether in heaven, or on earth, by the combination of a number of qualities arising out of good conduct, righteousness, virtue, and the performance of duty.

⁹⁶ 298 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VI, 2, 9. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of a ship he ought to have. 9. ‘And again, O king, just as a ship [877] can bear the onslaught of various thundering waves and of far-reaching whirlpools; so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be able to bear the onslaught of the waves of various evil inclinations, and the onslaught of the waves of varied evils—veneration and contempt, support and honour, praise and exaltation, offerings and homage, blame and commendation in families not his own. This, O king, is the second of the qualities of the ship he ought to have.

⁹⁷ ‘And again, O king, as the ship journeys over the great ocean, immeasurable and infinite though it be, without a further shore, unshaken in its depths, roaring with a mighty noise, and filled with crowds of fish and monsters and dragons of all sorts ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, make his mind journey through to penetration into the four Truths in their triple order, in their twelvefold form?. This, O king, is the third of the qualities of the ship he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the most excellent Samyutta Nikaya, in the Samyutta on the Truths ?:

⁹⁸ “Whenever you are thinking, O Bhikkhus, you should think : ‘Such is sorrow,’—you should think : ‘Such is the origin of sorrow, —you should think : ‘Such is the end of sorrow,—you should think: ‘Such is the path that leads to the end of sorrow, ”’

⁹⁹ * See ‘ Buddhist Suttas,’ pp. 150-152, and especially § 21, from which the expressions here used are taken. * This is the 55th Samyutta.

¹⁰⁰ MIT, 2,12. OF MILINDA THE KING. 299 16. THE ANCHOR. 11. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of the anchor which you say he ought to take, which are they ?’

¹⁰¹ ‘Just, O king, as the anchor, even in the mighty sea, in the expanse of waters agitated by the crowding of ever-varying waves, will fasten the ship, and keep it still, not letting the sea take it in one direction or another; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, keep his mind steadfast in the mighty struggle of thoughts, in the waters of the waves of lust and malice and dullness, not letting them divert it in one direction or another. This, O king, is the first quality of the anchor he ought to have.

¹⁰² ‘And again, O king, as the anchor floats not, but sinks down, and even in water a hundred cubits deep holds the ship fast, brings it to rest; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when he receives support, and fame, and honour, and veneration, and reverence, and offerings, and praise, [878] be not lifted up on the summit of the support or the fame, but keep his mind fixed on the idea of merely keeping his body alive. This, O king, is the second quality of the anchor he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Sariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith :

¹⁰³ “ As the anchor floats not, but sinks down beneath the waves, So be abased, not lifted up, by praise or gifts’.” 300 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 2, 13-

¹⁰⁴ THE Mast. 13. ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the mast which you say he ought to take, which is it ?’ ‘Just, O king, as the mast carries ropes and braces and sails!; just so should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, always have mindfulness and self-possession—when going out or coming back, when looking ahead or looking round, when stretching forth his arm or bending it back, when wearing clothes or carrying his bowl, when eating or drinking or swallowing or tasting, when easing himself or walking or standing or sitting, when asleep or awake, when talking and when silent, never should he lose his mindfulness and self-possession. This, O king, is the one quality of the mast he ought to have For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods:

¹⁰⁵ “Mindful, my brethren, should the Bhikshu remain, and self-possessed. This is my instruction to 30) you*. 18. THE Pinot.

¹⁰⁶ ‘Venerable Nagasena, those three qualities of the pilot which you say he ought to take, which are they?’ ‘Just, O king, as the pilot, day and night, with

¹⁰⁷ * Lakara. Childers says ‘a part of a ship, Dr. Morris (‘ Journal of the Pali Text Society,’ 1884, p. 100, note) says ‘a chain attached to a well.’ I follow the Sinhalese, p. 556, which has ruwala. See Gataka I, 112, and compare IV, ar.

¹⁰⁸ * The Sinhalese has here a page of matter not found in the Pali. * Digha Nikaya XVI, 2, 12. VEL 2, y26: OF MILINDA THE KING. 201

¹⁰⁹ continuous and unceasing zeal and effort, navigates! his ship; just so, O king, does the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when regulating his mind, continue night and day unceasingly zealous and earnest in regulating his mind by careful thought. This, O king, is the one quality of the pilot he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Dhammapada (the Collection of scripture verses) :

¹¹⁰ “ Be full of zeal, watch over your own thoughts ; Raise yourselves up out of the slough of endless births, As the strong elephant engulfed in depths of

¹¹¹ mud 2,” [879] 15. ‘And again, O king, as the pilot knows all that is in the sea, whether good or bad; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, know good from evil, and what is an offence from what is not, and what is mean from what is exalted, and what is dark from what is light. This, O king, is the second quality of the pilot he ought to have.

¹¹² ‘And again, O king, as the pilot puts a seal on the steering apparatus® lest any one should touch it; so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, put the seal of self-control on his heart, lest any evil or wrong thoughts should arise within it. This is the third quality of the pilot he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the

¹¹³ 302 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Wil,2, 27. as poe a Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the most excellent Samyutta Nikaya:

¹¹⁴ “Think, O Bhikshus, no evil or wrong thoughts, such as thoughts of lust, or of malice, or of delusion 1.” fo. THE SAILOR”

¹¹⁵ ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the sailor which you say he ought to take, which is it ?’ ‘Just as the sailor on board ship, O king, thinks thus: “I am a hireling, and am working for my wage on board this ship. By means of this ship is it that I get food and clothing. I must not be lazy, but zealously navigate the ship;” just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, think thus: “Gaining a thorough knowledge of this body of mine, put together of the four elements,

continuously and unceasingly will I be self-possessed in mindfulness and thoughtfulness, and tranquil and peaceful will exert myself to be set free from births, old age, disease, and death, grief, lamentation, sorrow, suffering, and despair.” This, O king, is the one quality of the sailor he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Sariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith: “ Understand what the body is, realise that again

¹¹⁶ and again, Seeing the nature of the body, put an end to erer®.” * Samyutta LV, 7. * Kammakaro. Hinai-kumburé translates this ‘handyman, artisan, ship’s carpenter.’

¹¹⁷ ° Not traced as yet. VII, 2, 109. OF MILINDA THE KING. 303 20. THE SRA. 18. [880] ‘Venerable Nagasena, those five qualities of the sea you say he ought to take, which are they?’

¹¹⁸ ‘Just, O king, as the sea brooks no contact with a corpse; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, brook no association with the stains of evil—lust and malice and dullness and pride and delusion, concealing the faults one has and claiming virtues one has not?, envy and avarice, deceit and treachery and trickiness, wickedness and sinfulness of life. This, O king, is the first quality of the sea he ought to have.

¹¹⁹ ‘And again, O king, just as the sea carries within it stores of all kinds of gems—pearls and diamonds and cat’s-eyes, and chank shells, and quartz*, and coral, and crystal, but conceals them all; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, though he have attained to the various gems of character—the Path, and the Fruits

¹²⁰ 8 Sila. Mr. Trenckner prints the passage as if sankhasila were to be taken together. But the use of the nominatives sankho sila in the corresponding list at Aullavagga IX, 1, 3, 4 shows that by sil, ‘rock,’ some kind of gem is meant. And that our author does not intend to deviate from the earlier authority is clear from his own work (above, p. 267 of the Pali), where he also gives the two nominatives in a similar, though longer, list of gems. What may be the particular gem referred to under the name ‘rock’ is doubtful. Hinasi-kumburé, p. 561, merely repeats the word sila; and Clough, besides ‘rock,’ gives as special meaning only ‘arsenic. At Xullavagga (‘ Vinaya Texts,’ III, 304) I have rendered it ‘rock,’ but ‘quartz’ now seems to me preferable.

¹²¹ 304 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES __ VII, 2, 20. thereof, and the four Ganas, and the eight Vimokkhas, and Samadhi, and the five Attainments (forms of ecstatic contemplation and Insight), and the six forms of Transcendental Knowledge+— conceal them and not bring them to the light. This, O king, is the second quality of the sea he ought to have.

¹²² ‘And again, O king, just as the sea associates with mighty creatures; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, associate himself with a fellow-disciple who desires little and is contented, who is pure in speech 2, whose conduct is directed to the eradication of evil, who is given to righteousness, modest, amiable, dignified, venerable, a speaker of profitable words, meek, one who will point out his associate’s faults, and blame him when he does wrong, clever in admonition, in instruction, and in education, able to arouse, to incite, and to gladden—with such a man as a friend, in righteousness should he dwell. This, O king, is the third quality of the sea he ought to have.

¹²³ ‘And again, O king, as the sea, though filled with the fresh water brought down by the Ganges, and the Jumna, and the A4iravati, and the Sarabha, and the Mahi, and by other rivers a hundred thousand in number, and by the rains of heaven, yet

¹²⁴ * It is very characteristic of our author that his interpretation of the gems into ethical conceptions is quite different from that of the Aullavagga, and much more mystic. In the older passage they are translated into the seven constituent characteristics of Arahatsip. (See 'Vinaya Texts,' loc. cit, p. 305.) Compare also Divyavadana, pp. 115, 229.

¹²⁵ * Dhuta-vado, not in Childers, and only found here. Perhaps 'who inculcates the keeping of the extra vows' Dhutdgawadiwf, says Hinasi-kumbur , p. 561.

¹²⁶ VII, 2, 22. OF MILINDA THE KING. 305 never overflows its shore; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never consciously transgress the precepts for the sake of support, or fame, or praise, or salutations, or reverence, or honour—no! not even for his life. This, O king, is the fourth of the qualities of the sea he ought to have. [881] For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods?!

¹²⁷ "Just, O king, as the great ocean has fixity as its characteristic, and never overflows its shores; just so, O king, should my disciples never overstep the regulations I have laid down for them—no! not even to save themselves alive 2,"

¹²⁸ 'And again, O king, as the sea is not filled even by all the rivers—the Ganges, and the Jumna, and the A4iravati, and the Sarabhi, and the Mahi— nor by the rains from heaven; just so, O king, should

¹²⁹ * Devatidevena. It is not known when this epithet, which our author so constantly applies to the Buddha, first came into use. It is not found in the Pifakas, and the Milinda is the oldest book in which it has been traced. It is given in the Mahavyutpatti, page I, as a recognised epithet, but not in the corresponding Pali list of epithets in the Abhidhana Padtpika (though deva-deva occurs there). The origin of the appellation is solemnly explained in the Divyavadana, p. 391. It is there said to have been first bestowed on the Buddha (when, as a child, he was presented in the temple), because all the gods bowed down before him. There is nothing about this in the corresponding passage of the Lalita Vistara, pp. 136-138. The epithet is used of the Buddha in an inscription of Toramana Shahi ('Epigraphia Indica' for October, 1889). It occurs also in a verse preserved in the commentaries on the Dhammapada and the Gataka (Gataka IV, 158= Dhammapada 148)—a verse not found in the Pitaka versions of the same episode—and is used in a kind of pun in the Mahavamsa, chap. i, verse 56. But these three passages are all of the fifth century a.p.

¹³⁰ x 306 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 2, 22. the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never be satisfied with receiving instruction, with asking and answering questions, with listening to the word, and learning it by heart, and examining into it, with hearing the Abhidhamma and the Vinaya, and the deep sayings of the Suttas, with analysis of forms, with learning the rules of right composition, conjunction, and grammatical construction, with listening to the ninefold teaching of the Conqueror. This, O king, is the fifth quality of the sea he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Sutasoma GAtaka ?:

¹³¹ "Just as the fire, in burning grass and sticks, Is never satisfied, nor the great sea Filled with the waters of all streams that flow— So are these students wise, O king of kings, Listening, ne'er sated with the words of truth®,"

¹³² Here ends the Second Chapter. ? The translation is here doubtful. The Simhalese apparently takes viggaha as qualifying pada, though it renders the whole by 'learning the rules of resolving words into

their elements, and of building them up into compounds, and of Sandhi, and of conjugation, and of declension.’

¹³³ * Not reached as yet in Professor Fausbdl’s edition. Mr. Trenckner says the verse quoted is No. 47 in the 537th Gataka.

¹³⁴ * The Sinhalese reads *Evam hi me* for *Evam h’ ime*, and renders ‘listening to me.’ Mr. Trenckner points out that the Gataka MSS. read *Evam pi te*.

¹³⁵ VII, 3, 3. OF MILINDA THE KING, 307 Boox VII. Cuapter 8. THE SIMILES (continued). 21. The Eartu. 1. [882] ‘ Venerable Nagasena, those five qualities of the earth which you say he ought to take, which are they ?’

¹³⁶ ‘Just, O king, as the earth remains just the same whether one scatter upon it desirable things or the reverse—whether camphor and aloes and jasmine and sandal-wood and saffron, or whether bile and phlegm and pus and blood and sweat and fat and saliva and mucus and the fluid which lubricates the joints and urine and faeces—still it is the same; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, remain the same, unmoved at support or neglect, at fame or dishonour, at blame or praise, in happiness or in woe. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of the earth he ought to have.

¹³⁷ ‘And again, O king, as the earth has no adornment, no garlands, but is suffused with the odour of itself ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, wear no finery, but rather be set round with the sweet savour of his own righteousness of life. This, O king, is the second quality of the earth he ought to have.

¹³⁸ ‘And again, O king, as the earth is solid, without holes or interstices, thick, dense, and spreads itself out on every side; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be endowed with an unbroken righteousness of life with no gaps

¹³⁹ x 308 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 3, 4. or cracks in it, thick, dense, and spreading itself out on every side. This, O king, is the third quality of the earth he ought to have.

¹⁴⁰ ‘And again, O king, as the earth is never weary, though it bears up the villages and towns and cities and countries, the trees and hills and rivers and ponds and lakes, the wild creatures and birds and men, multitudes of men and women ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be never weary in giving exhortation and admonition and instruction and education, in rousing and inciting and gladdening, and at the expositions of the faith. This, O king, is the fourth quality of the earth he ought to have,

¹⁴¹ ‘And again, O king, as the earth is free alike from fawning and from ill-will; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, continue in spirit, like the earth, free alike from fawning upon any man, from ill-will to any man. This is the fifth quality of the earth he ought to have. [883] For it was said, O king, by the devoted woman, Aulla Subhadda, when she was exalting the recluses of her own sect ?:

¹⁴² VII, 3, 8. OF MILINDA THE KING. 309 “ Were one, enraged, to cut their one arm with an axe, Another, pleased, to anoint the other with sweet scent, No ill-will would they bear the one, nor love the other. Their hearts are like the earth, unmoved are my

¹⁴³ BP ats recluses. 22. WATER. 6. ‘Venerable Nagasena, the five qualities of water which you say he ought to take, which are they?’

¹⁴⁴ ‘Just, O king, as water is firmly fixed (in pools, wells, &c.), shakes not, and (in its ordinary state) is not disturbed, and is pure by nature; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, putting away hypocrisy, and whining, and intimating their wants, and improper influences of all sorts, be fixed, unshaken, undisturbed, and pure in nature. This, O king, is the first quality of water he ought to have.

¹⁴⁵ ‘And again, O king, as water is always of a refreshing nature; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be full of pity, and love, and kindness to all beings, seeking the good of all, in mercy to all. This, O king, is the second quality of water he ought to have.

¹⁴⁶ ‘And again, O king, as water makes the dirty clean ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, of her sect were like, and she told him. Another verse from her description is quoted below, p. 387 of the Pali. The above story has been often repeated.

¹⁴⁷ 310 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES ViE35%0% a aecaneteee earnest in effort, be in all places, whether in the village or in the forest, free from disputes with, free from offence against his teachers, his masters, or those standing towards him like a teacher. This, O king, is the third quality of water he ought to have.

¹⁴⁸ ‘And again, O king, as water is desired of all men; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, wishing for little, content, given to solitude and retirement, be always an object of desire to all the world. This, O king, is the fourth quality of water he ought to have.

¹⁴⁹ ‘And again, O king, as water works no harm to any man; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never do any wrong, whether in deed or word or thought, which would produce in others either strife, or quarrel, or contention, or dispute, or a feeling .of emptiness, or anger}, or discontent. [884] This, O king, is the fifth quality of water he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Kazha Gataka?:

¹⁵⁰ “Tf you would grant a boon to me, O Sakka, lord of every creature,— Let none, Sakka, on my account, Be harmed, whether in mind or body, At any time or place. This, Sakka, This would I choose as boon of boons®.”

¹⁵¹ * These words are in the original ascribed, not to the Buddha himself, but to Kazha-kuméaro, the then Bodisat. - VII, 3, 15OF MILINDA THE KING. S13

¹⁵² Fire. 11. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those five qualities of fire which you say he ought to take, which are they ?’ ‘Just, O king, as fire burns grass, and sticks, and branches, and leaves; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, burn out in the fire of wisdom all evil dispositions which feed on objects of thought, whether subjective or objective, whether desirable or the reverse. This, O king, is the first quality of fire he ought to have.

¹⁵³ ‘And again, O king, as fire has no pity, neither mercy; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, show no pity, neither mercy, to any evil dispositions. This, O king, is the second quality of fire he ought to have.

¹⁵⁴ ‘And again, O king, as fire destroys cold ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, lighting up in his heart the burning fire of zeal, destroy all evil dispositions therein. This, O king, is the third quality of fire he ought to have.

¹⁵⁵ ‘And again, O king, as fire, seeking no favour of any man, bearing no ill-will to any man, makes heat for all; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, dwell in spirit like the

fire, fawning on none, bearing ill-will to none. This, O king, is the fourth quality of fire he ought to have.

¹⁵⁶ ‘And again, O king, as fire dispels darkness, and makes the light appear ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, dispel the

¹⁵⁷ 312 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 3, 16. darkness of ignorance, and make the light of knowledge to appear. This is the fifth quality of fire he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in his exhortation to Rahula, his son:

¹⁵⁸ “ Practise thyself, RAhula, in that meditation which acts like fire. Thereby shall no wrong dispositions, which have not yet arisen, arise within thee, nor shall they that have arisen bear sway over thy heart},”

¹⁵⁹ WIND, 16. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those five qualities of wind which you say he ought to take, which are they ?’ ‘Just, O king, as wind pervades the spaces in the woods and groves in flowering time; so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, rejoice in the groves of meditation that are all in blossom with the sweet flowers of emancipation. This, O king, is the first quality of wind he ought to have. ,

¹⁶⁰ ‘And again, O king, as wind sets all the trees that grow upon the earth in agitation, bends them * Not traced as yet exactly in these words. But the passage at Magghima NikAya I, 424, lines 3-6, agrees with it throughout, except that for akusala dhamma here we have there manapamanapa phass, which comes to much the same thing. As the words are there addressed to Réhula, and as our passage here is introduced with the same formula as the quotation below (p. 388 of the Pali) which is certainly taken from the same page of the Magghima, I think the above (M. I, 424, lines 3-6) is most probably the passage our author now intended to quote. If so, we have here a real case of difference in reading.

¹⁶¹ VII, 3, 20. OF MILINDA THE KING, 313 down; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, retiring into the midst of the woods, there examining into the true nature of all existing things (all phenomena, Samkhi4ras), beat down all evil dispositions. This, O king, is the second quality of wind he ought to have.

¹⁶² ‘And again, O king, as the wind wanders through the sky; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, accustom his mind to wander among transcendental things. This is the third quality of wind he ought to have.

¹⁶³ ‘And again, O king, as wind carries perfume along; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, carry along with him alway the fragrant perfume of his own righteousness of life. This, O king, is the fourth quality of wind he ought to have.

¹⁶⁴ ‘And again, O king, as wind has no house, no home to dwell in; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, remain alway without a house, without a home to dwell in, not addicted to society, set free in mind. This, O king, is the fifth quality of wind he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Sutta Nipata :

¹⁶⁵ “In friendship of the world anxiety is born, In household life distraction’s dust lies thick ; The state set free from home and friendship’s

¹⁶⁶ ties— That, and that only, is the recluse's aim }.” 314 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 3, 21. 25. Tse Rock. 21. ‘Venerable Nagasena, the five qualities of the rock that you say he ought to have, which are they ?’

¹⁶⁷ ‘Just, O king, as rock is firm, unshaken, immoveable; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never be excited by alluring things—forms, or sounds, or scents, or tastes, or touch—by veneration or contempt, by support or by neglect, by reverence or its absence, by honour or dishonour, by praise or blame, nor should he be offended by things that give offence, nor bewildered on occasions of bewilderment, neither should he quake nor tremble, but like a rock should he be firm. This, O king, is the first quality of the rock he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods:

¹⁶⁸ “The solid rock's not shaken by the wind, Just so the wise man falters not, nor shakes, At praise or blame’.” 22, ‘And again, O king, as a rock is firm, unmixed with extraneous things; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be firm and independent, given to association with none. This, O king, is the second quality of the rock he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods :

¹⁶⁹ “The man who mixes not with householders, Nor with the homeless, but who wanders lone, Without a home, and touched by few desires,— That is the man I call a Brahmana?2.”

¹⁷⁰ * Dhammapada 81. The first line recurs at Mahavagga V, 1, 27. * From the Sutta Nipata III, 9, 35. It is also included in the Dhammapada collection of Scripture verses (No. 404).

¹⁷¹ - VII, 3, 25. OF MILINDA THE KING. a18 23. ‘And again, O king, as on the rock no seed will take root; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never permit evil dispositions to take root in his mind. This, O king, is the third quality of rock that he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Subhuti, the Elder :

¹⁷² “When lustful thoughts arise within my heart, Examining myself, alone I beat them down. Thou who'rt by lust excited, who by things That give offence, allowest of offence,

¹⁷³ Feeling bewildered when strange things occur, Thou shouldst retire far from the lonely woods. For they're the dwelling-place of men made pure,

¹⁷⁴ Austere in life, free from the stains of sin. Defile not that pure place. Leave thou the woods },”

24. [887] ‘And again, just as the rock rises aloft, just so should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, rise aloft through knowledge. This is the fourth quality of the rock he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods:

¹⁷⁵ “When the wise man by earnestness has driven Vanity far away, the terraced heights Of wisdom doth he climb, and, free from care,

¹⁷⁶ Looks over the vain world, the careworn crowd— As he who standing on the mountain top Can watch his fellow-men still toiling on the

¹⁷⁷ plain ?.” 25. ‘And again, O king, just as the rock cannot 316 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 3, 26. be lifted up nor bent down; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be neither lifted up nor depressed. This, O king, is the fifth quality of the rock he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the devout woman, Aulla Subhadda, when she was exalting the recluses of her own sect:

¹⁷⁸ “The world is lifted up by gain, depressed by loss. My Samawas remain alike in gain or loss.” , 26. SPACE. 26. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those five qualities of space which you say he ought to have, which are they ?’

¹⁷⁹ ‘Just, O king, as space is everywhere impossible to grasp; just so, O king, should it be impossible for the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, to be anywhere taken hold of by evil dispositions. This, O king, is the first quality of space he ought to have.

¹⁸⁰ ‘And again, O king, as space is the familiar resort of /’zshis, and ascetics, and gods}, and flocks of birds; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, make his mind wander easily over all things with the knowledge that each individual (Samkhara) is impermanent, born to sorrow, and without any abiding principle (any soul). This, O king, is the second quality of space he ought to have.

¹⁸¹ * Bhtita, which the Sinhalese, Pp. 572, renders yaksha. I think it means all kinds of gods (except the highest), demigods, fairies, superhuman beings, &c.

¹⁸² - VII, 3, 30. OF MILINDA THE KING. S17 28. ‘And again, O king, as space inspires terror ; just so, O king [888], should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, train his mind to be in terror of rebirths in any kind of existence. To seek no happiness therein. This, O king, is the third quality of space he ought to have.

¹⁸³ ‘And again, O king, as space is infinite, boundless, immeasurable ; just so, O king, should the righteousness of the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, know no limit, and his knowledge be beyond measure. This, O king, is the fourth quality of space he ought to have.

¹⁸⁴ ‘And again, O king, as space does not hang on to anything, does not cling to anything, does not rest on anything, is not stopped by anything ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in ~ effort, neither in any way depend on, nor cling to, nor rest on, nor be hindered by either the families that minister to him, or the pupils who resort to him, or the support he receives, or the dwelling he occupies, or any obstacles to the religious life, or any requisites that he may want, or any kind of evil inclination. This, O king, is the fifth quality of space he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in his exhortation to R4hula, his son:

¹⁸⁵ “Just, Rahula, as space rests nowhere on anything, so shouldst thou practise thyself in that meditation which is like space. Thereby shall neither pleasant nor unpleasant sensations, as they severally arise, bear sway over thy heart?.” ’

¹⁸⁶ 318 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 3,31 27. THE Moon. 31. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those five qualities of the moon which you say he ought to have, which are they?’

¹⁸⁷ ‘Just, O king, as the moon, rising in the bright fortnight, waxes more and more; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, grow more and more in good conduct and righteousness and virtue and the constant performance of duty, and in knowledge of the scriptures and study’, and in the habit of retirement, and in self-possession, and in keeping the doors of his senses guarded, and in moderation in food, and in the practice of vigils. This, O king, is the first quality of the moon he ought to have.

¹⁸⁸ ‘And again, O king, as the moon is a mighty lord? ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be a mighty lord over his own will.

¹⁸⁹ a Agamadhigame. These are two, not one. Agama adhigama dekhi da says the Simhalese, p. 573.

* Ularadhipati. Dr. Morris in the 'Journal of the Pali Text Society' (1880, p. 107) ingeniously proposes to read *uuragAdhipati*, 'king and lord over the *uu*'s, the lunar mansions.' In that case the *udra* in the latter clause of the sentence would be a play upon words. But Mr. Trenckner's reading is confirmed by the Simhalese, which has *andra diwya-raga tema mahatwii sisiraguzayem adhipati wfyeya*, 'the moon, that heavenly king, is a lord by reason of his great coldness.' And the reading may well stand, for the mention, in the latter part of the clause, of the thing over which the Bhikshu is to be lord does not necessarily require a corresponding word in the first part. We have numerous instances in these similes of the ethical interpretation of the physical simile being an addition, with nothing corresponding to it in the type discussed. 'The moon was a god, lord over other things besides the lunar mansions.'

¹⁹⁰ VII, 3, 35 OF MILINDA THE KING. 319 This, O king, is the second quality of the moon he ought to have. 33. 'And again, O king, as the moon wanders at night ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be given to solitude. [889] This, O king, is the third quality of the moon he ought to have.

¹⁹¹ 'And again, O king, as the moon hoists a standard over his mansion'; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, hoist the standard of righteousness. This, O king, is the fourth quality of the moon he ought to have.

¹⁹² 'And again, O king, as the moon rises when begged and prayed to do so; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, frequent for alms those families who have asked and invited him to do so*. This, O king, is the fifth quality of the moon he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the most excellent Samyutta Nikaya :

¹⁹³ "Like the moon, O brethren, let your visits be paid to the laity. Drawing back alike in outward demeanour and in inward spirit, be ye always, as strangers on their first visit, retiring in the presence of the laity. [As the man who looks down a deep

¹⁹⁴ ' Kando vimana-ketu. 'Has his mansion, forty-nine yoganas in extent, as his banner,' says Hinai-kumbur . (A yogana is seven miles.) Vimawza does not mean lunar mansion, but the palace which every deity, and therefore also the moon, is supposed to inhabit.

¹⁹⁵ 320 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 3, 36. well, or a mountain precipice, or a river in flood, would be abashed alike in body and in mind; so be ye, O brethren, as the moon in your visits to the laity. Holding alike in your outward demeanour and your inward spirit, be ye always, as strangers on their first visit, retiring in the presence of the laity]'. "'

¹⁹⁶ Tue Sun. 36. 'Venerable Nagasena, the seven qualities of the sun you say he ought to have, which are they?' 'Just, O king, as the sun evaporates all water ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, cause all evil inclinations, without any exception, to dry up within him. This, O king, is the first quality of the sun he ought to have.

¹⁹⁷ 'And again, O king, as the sun dispels the darkness; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, dispel all the darkness of lust, and of anger, and of dullness, and of pride, and of heresy, and of evil, and of all unrighteousness. This, O king, is the second quality of the sun he ought to have.

¹⁹⁸ ‘And again, O king, as the sun is always in motion; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be ever thoughtful. This,

¹⁹⁹ VII, 3, 42. OF MILINDA THE KING. 4o O king, is the third quality of the sun he ought to have. 39. ‘And again, O king, as the sun has a halo of rays; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, have a halo of meditation. This, O king, is the fourth quality of the sun he ought to have.

²⁰⁰ ‘And again, O king, as the sun continually warms multitudes of people ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, rejoice the whole world of gods and men with good conduct, and righteousness, and virtue [890], and the performance of duty, and with the Ganas, and the Vimok- | khas, and Samadhi, and the Sam4pattis (various modes of transcendental meditation or ecstasy), and with the five moral powers, and the seven kinds of wisdom, and the four modes of being mindful and self-possessed, and the fourfold great struggle against evil, and the pursuit of the four roads to saintship. This, O king, is the fifth quality of the sun he ought to have.

²⁰¹ ‘And again, O king, as the sun is terrified with the fear of Rahu (the demon of eclipses) ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, seeing how beings are entangled in the waste wildernesses of evil life and rebirth in states of woe, caught in the net of the mournful results here of evil done in former births, or of punishment in purgatory, or of evil inclinations, terrify his mind with a great anxiety and fear. This, O king, is the sixth quality of the sun he ought to have.

²⁰² ‘And again, O king, as the sun makes manifest the evil and the good; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, make mani-

²⁰³ ¥ 222 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 3, 43. fest the moral powers, and the kinds of wisdom, and the modes of being mindful and self-possessed, and

²⁰⁴ the struggle against evil, and the paths to saintship, and all qualities temporal and spiritual. This, O king, is the seventh quality of the sun he ought to

²⁰⁵ have. For it was said, O king, by Vangisa, the Elder : ‘As the rising sun makes plain to all that live Forms pure and impure, forms both good and bad, So should the Bhikshu, like the rising orb,

²⁰⁶ Bearing the scriptures ever in his mind, Make manifest to men, in ignorance blind, The many-sided Noble Path of bliss 1.”’

²⁰⁷ . ‘Venerable Nagasena, the three qualities of Sakka (the king of the gods) which you say he ought to take, which are they ?’

²⁰⁸ ‘Just, O king, as Sakka enjoys perfect bliss ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, rejoice in the perfect bliss of retirement. This, O king, is the first quality of Sakka he ought to have.

²⁰⁹ ‘And again, O king, as when Sakka when he sees his gods around him keeps them in his favour, fills them with joy; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, keep his mind detached, alert, and tranquil, should make joy spring up within him, should rouse himself, exert himself, be full of zeal. [891] This, O king, is the second quality of Sakka he ought to have.

²¹⁰ * Not traced as yet. VII, 3, 47. OF MILINDA THE KING. Bo 45. ‘And again, O king, as Sakka feels no discontent; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never allow himself to become discontented with solitude. This, O king, is the third quality of Sakka he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Subhiati, the Elder:

²¹¹ “Since I, great hero, have renounced the world, According to the doctrine that you teach, I will not grant that any thought of lust Or craving care has risen in my breast },”

²¹² THE Sovran OVERLORD. 46. ‘Venerable Nagasena, the four qualities of the sovran overlord which you say he ought to take, which are they ?’

²¹³ ‘Just, O king, as the sovran overlord gains the favour of the people by the four elements of popularity (liberality, affability, justice, and impartiality) ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, find favour with, please, and gladden the hearts of the brethren and rulers of the Order and the laity of either sex. This, O king, is the quality of the sovran overlord he ought to have.

²¹⁴ ‘And again, O king, as the sovran overlord allows no robber bands to form in his realm; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never allow lustful or angry or cruel ideas to arise within him, This, O king, is the second quality of the sovran overlord he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods:

²¹⁵ + Not traced as yet, ee 2 324 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 3, 48. “The man who takes delight in the suppression Of evil thoughts, and alway self-possessed, Reflects on the impurity of things The world thinks beautiful, he will remove— Nay, cleave in twain, the bonds of the Evil One?.”

²¹⁶ ‘And again, O king, as the sovran overlord travels through ? the whole world even to its ocean boundary, examining into the evil and the good; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, examine himself day by day as to his acts and words and thoughts, saying to himself: “‘ How may I pass the day blameless in these three directions?” This, O king, [892] is the third quality of the sovran overlord he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the most excellent Ekuttara Nikaya:

²¹⁷ “With constant care should the recluse Himself examine day by day— ‘As days and nights pass quickly by How have they found me ? and how left ??”

²¹⁸ * This verse has not been elsewhere traced as yet, but is included in the Dhammapada collection, verse 350. Vitakka, which, in accord with the context and with Htnadi-kumburé, is rendered above ‘ evil thoughts,’ and by Professor Max Miiller ‘ doubts,’ really means simply ‘thoughts,’ and is sometimes used without any bad connotation. In the Pali the word Maru, which spoils the metre, may possibly be an ancient gloss introduced by mistake into the text.

²¹⁹ * Anuydyati, which is only found here, and which the Sinhalese, p. 577, renders anusasan karanneya. But compare anuyayin at Sutta Nipata V, 7, 3-5, and Tela Kaaha Gath ae; anuyayin above, p. 284 of the Pali, and AnuyAto at Tela Kaha Gatha 41.

²²⁰ * Mr. Trenckner points out that this passage is taken from the Anguttara X, 5, 8. Hinai-kumburé, who gives the Pali, prints it as verse, and translates the context at some length.

²²¹ VII, 3, 49. OF MILINDA THE KING. 325 49. ‘And again, O king, as the sovran overlord is completely provided with protection, both within and without ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, keep self-possession as his door-keeper for a protection against all evil, subjective and objective. This, O king, is the fourth quality of the sovran overlord he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods:

²²² “With self-possession as his door-keeper, O brethren, the disciple of the noble ones puts away evil and devotes himself to goodness, puts away what is matter of offence and devotes himself to blamelessness, preserves himself in purity of life*.”

²²³ Here ends the Third Chapter. 326 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Wit, Book VII. CuHaptTer 4. THE SIMILES (continued). 31. The Wuite Ant.

²²⁴ ‘Venerable NAgasena, that quality of the white ant which you say he ought to have, which is it?’ ‘Just, O king, as the white ant goes on with his work only when he has made a roof over himself, and covered himself up; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, on his round for alms, cover up his mind with righteousness and self-restraint as a roof. For in so doing, O king, will he have passed beyond all fear. This, O king, is the one quality of the white ant he ought to have. [393] For it was said, O king, by Upasena Vangantaputta, the Elder :

²²⁵ “The devotee who covers up his mind, Under the sheltering roof of righteousness And self-control, untarnished by the world

²²⁶ 1”? Remains, and is set free from every fear}. 4o.° Lhe CAT 2. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of the cat you say he ought to have, which are they?’ ‘Just, O king, as the cat, in frequenting caves and holes and the interiors of storied dwellings, does so only in the search after rats; just so, O king, should

²²⁷ VII, 4, 3. OF MILINDA THE KING. 307 the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, whether he have gone to the village or to the woods or to the foot of trees or into an empty house!, be continually and always zealous in the search after that which is his food, namely self-possession. This is the first quality of the cat he ought to have.

²²⁸ ‘And again, O king, as the cat in pursuing its prey always crouches down?; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, continue conscious of the origin and end 3 of those five groups of the characteristic marks of individuality which arise out of clinging to existence, thinking to himself: “Such is form, such is its origin, such its end. Such is sensation, such is its origin, such its end. Such are ideas, such is their origin, such their end. Such are the mental potentialities (the Confections, Samkhanda), such is their origin, such their end. Such is self-consciousness, such is its origin, such its end’,” This, O king, is the second quality of the cat he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods:

²²⁹ 328 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Wi, a; 4. “Seek not rebirths afar in future states. Pray, what could heaven itself advantage you! Now, in this present world, and in the state In which you find yourselves, be conquerors !”

²³⁰ THE Rat. 4. ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the rat you say he ought to take, which is it?’ ‘Just, O king, as the rat, wandering about backwards and forwards, is always smelling after food?; just so, O king, [894] should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be ever in his wanderings to and fro, bent upon thought. This is the quality of the rat he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Upasena Vanganta-putta, the Elder :

²³¹ “ Ever alert and calm, the man of insight, Esteeming wisdom as the best of all things, Keeps himself independent of all wants and cares®.”

²³² THE Scorpion. 5. ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the scorpion you say he ought to take, which is it?’ ‘Just, O king, as the scorpion, whose tail is its weapon, keeps its tail erect as it wanders

about; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, have knowledge as his weapon,

²³³ ? Upasimsako. Dr. Morris, in the 'Journal of the Pali Text Society' (1884, p. 75), suggests upasinghako. But the Sinhalese in the first clause (p. 589, last line) has patamim ma, 'hoping for, seeking for,' and in the second (p. 590, line 2) peettmem ma,

²³⁴ which is the same thing (from prarthana, which confirms Mr. Trenckner's reading). ? Not traced as yet. Wily aly: OF MILINDA THE KING. 329

²³⁵ and dwell with his weapon, knowledge, always drawn. This, O king, is the quality of the scorpion he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Upasena Vanganta-putta, the Elder: "With his sword of knowledge drawn, the man of insight Should ever be unconquerable in the fight, Set free from every fear },"

²³⁶ [He Muncoose. 6. 'Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the mungoose you say he ought to take, which is it ?' 'Just, O king, as the mungoose, when attacking a snake, only does so when he has covered his body with an antidote; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when going into the world where anger and hatred are rife, which is under the sway of quarrels, strife, disputes, and enmities, ever keep his mind anointed with the antidote of love. This, O king, is the quality of the mungoose he ought to have. For it was said, ~ O king, by Sariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith:

²³⁷ " Therefore should love be felt for one's own kin, And so for strangers too, and the whole wide world Should be pervaded with a heart of love—

²³⁸ This is the doctrine of the Buddhas all." 36. THE Otrp Mate JAcKAL. 7. [895] 'Venerable Nagasena, the two qualities of the old male jackal you say he ought to take, which are they ?'

²³⁹ 330 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Vil 4 'Just, O king, as the old male jackal, whatever kind of food he finds, feels no disgust, but eats of it as much as he requires; just so, O king, should the - strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, eat without disgust such food as he receives with the sole object of keeping himself alive. This, O king, is the first quality of the old male jackal he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Maha Kassapa, the Elder :

²⁴⁰ " Leaving my dwelling-place, I entered once Upon my round for alms, the village street. A leper there I saw eating his meal,

²⁴¹ And, as was meet, deliberately, in turn, I stood beside him too that he might give a gift. He, with his hand all leprous and diseased,

²⁴² Put in my bowl—'twas all he had to give— A ball of rice; and as he placed it there A finger, mortifying, broke and fell.

²⁴³ Seated behind a wall, that ball of food I ate, and neither when I ate it, nay, Nor afterwards, did any loathing thought Arise within my breast 4."

²⁴⁴ "And again, O king, as the old male jackal, when he gets any food, does not stop to examine it; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never stop to find out whether food given to him is bitter or sweet, well-flavoured or ill —Just as it is should he be satisfied with it. This, O king, is the second quality of the old male jackal

²⁴⁵ * Thera Gatha 1054-1056. The reading *pakkena hatthena* seems to me to be quite correct. Compare *pakka-gatto*, also of a leper, at M. I, 506; and above, p. 357 of the Pali.

²⁴⁶ VU, 4,9. OF MILINDA THE KING. eet he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Upasena Vanganta-putta, the Elder : “ Bitter food too should he enjoy,

²⁴⁷ Nor long for what is sweet to taste. The mind disturbed by lust of taste Can ne’er enjoy the ecstasies Of meditations high. The man content

²⁴⁸ With anything that’s given—in him alone Is Samazaship made perfect '.” 37. Tur Deer. 9. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those three qualities of the deer you say he ought to take, which are they ?’

²⁴⁹ ‘Just, O king, as the deer frequents the forest by day, and spends the night in the open air; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, pass the day in the forest, and the night under the open sky. This, O king, is the first quality of the deer he ought to have. [896] For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the exposition called the *Lomahamsana Pariyaya*:

²⁵⁰ “And I, Sdériputta, when the nights are cold and wintry, at the time of the eights (the *Ashfaka* festivals 2), when the snow is falling, at such times did I pass the night under the open sky, and the day in the woods. And in the last month of the hot season I spent the day under the open sky, and the night in the woods *.”

²⁵¹ § *Magghima Nikaya* I, p.79. To quote this passage here as an authority the Bhikshu ought still to follow, is a striking instance of

²⁵² 332 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 4, 10. 10. ‘And again, O king, as the deer, when a javelin or an arrow is falling upon him, dodges it and escapes, not allowing his body to remain in its way; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when evil inclinations fall upon him, dodge them, and escape, placing not his mind in their way. This, O king, is the second quality of the deer he ought to have.

²⁵³ ‘And again, O king, as the deer on catching sight of men escapes this way or that, that they may not see him; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when he sees men of quarrelsome habits, given to contentions and strife and disputes, wicked men and inert, fond of society— then should he escape hither or thither that neither should they see him, nor he them?. This, O king, is the third quality of the deer he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Sariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith :

²⁵⁴ “ Let not the man with evil in his heart, Inert, bereft of zeal, of wicked life, Knowing but little of the sacred words— Let not that man, at any time or place,

²⁵⁵ Be my companion, or associate with me*.” the fatal habit of quoting texts of Scripture apart from their context. As it stands, it seems as if it supported the proposition of our author. But it is really just the contrary. For it occurs in the description given by Gotama of what he had done before he arrived at insight, when he was carrying out that system of penance which he afterwards abandoned as useless, and indeed worse than useless.

²⁵⁶ ? Thera Gatha 987 (but the last words differ). VII, 4, 13. OF MILINDA THE KING. 333 38. Tue Butt. 12. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those four qualities of the bull you say he ought to take, which are they ?’

²⁵⁷ ‘Just, O king, as the bull never forsakes its own stall; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never abandon his own body on the ground that its nature is only the

decomposition, the wearing away, the dissolution, the destruction of that which is impermanent'. This, O king, is the first quality of the bull he ought to have.

²⁵⁸ 'And again, O king, as the bull, when he has once taken the yoke upon him, bears that yoke through all conditions of ease or of pain; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, [897] when he has once taken upon himself the life of a recluse, keep to it, in happiness or in woe, to the end of his life, to his latest breath. This, O king, is the second quality of the bull he ought to have.

²⁵⁹ 'And again, O king, as the bull drinks water with never satiated desire; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, receive the instruction of his teachers and masters with a desire, love, and pleasure that is never satiated*. This, O king, is the third quality of the bull he ought to have.

²⁶⁰ 'And again, O king, as the bull equally bears the yoke whoever puts it on him; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, accept with bowed head the admonitions and ex-

²⁶¹ 334 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 4, 16. hortations of the elders, of the brethren of junior or of middle standing, and of the believing laity alike. This, O king, is the fourth quality of the bull he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by SAriputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith :

²⁶² "A novice, seven years of age, a boy Only to-day received into our ranks, He too may teach me, and with bended head, His admonitions will I gladly bear. Time after time, where'er I meet him, still My strong approval, and my love, will I Lavish upon him—if he be but good,— And yield the honoured place of teacher to him ?."

²⁶³ THE Boar. 16. 'Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of the boar you say he ought to take, which are they ?' 'Just, O king, as the boar, in the sultry and scorching weather of the hot season, resorts to the water; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when his heart is distracted and ready to fall, all in a whirl, inflamed by anger, resort to the cool, ambrosial, sweet water of the meditation on love. This, O king, is the first quality of the boar he ought to have.

²⁶⁴ 'And again, O king, as the boar, resorting to muddy water, digs into the swamp with his snout, and making a trough for himself, lies down therein ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, put his body away in his mind, and

²⁶⁵ * Not traced as yet. Hinasi-kumbur , p594, takes santo in the sense of sat purusha guzayem yukta wa, VII, 4, 20. OF MILINDA THE KING. 335

²⁶⁶ lie down in the midst of contemplation. [898] This, O king, is the second quality of the boar he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Pindola Bharadvaga, the Elder: " Alone, with no one near, the man of insight,

²⁶⁷ Searching into and finding out the nature Of this body, can lay him down to rest On the sweet bed of contemplations deep}.

²⁶⁸ 0») 40, THE ELEphant. 18. 'Venerable Nagasena, the five qualities of the elephant he ought to take, which are they ?' 'Just, O king, as the elephant, as he walks about, crushes the earth; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, mastering the nature of the body, crush out all evil. This, O king, is the first quality of the elephant he ought to have.

²⁶⁹ 'And again, O king, as the elephant turns his whole body when he looks, always looking straight before him, not glancing round this way and that?; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu,

earnest in effort, turn his whole body when he looks, always looking straight before, not glancing round this way and that, not looking aloft, not looking at his feet, but keeping his eyes fixed about a yoke's length in front of him, This, O king, is the second quality of the elephant he ought to have.

²⁷⁰ 'And again, O king, as the elephant has no permanent lair, even in seeking his food does not always frequent the same spot, has no fixed place of

²⁷¹ 336 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 4, 21. abode; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, have no permanent resting-place, but without a home should go his rounds for alms. Full of insight, wherever he sees a pleasant suitable agreeable place, whether in a hut or at the foot of a tree, or in a cave, or on a mountain side, there should he dwell, not taking up a fixed abode. This, O king, is the third quality of the elephant he ought to have.

²⁷² 'And again, O king, as the elephant revels in the water, plunging into glorious lotus ponds full of clear pure cool water, and covered over with lotuses yellow, and blue, and red, and white, sporting there in the games in which the mighty beast delights ; [899] just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, plunge into the glorious pond of self-possession, covered with the flowers of emancipation, filled with the delicious waters of the pure and stainless clear and limpid Truth; there should he by knowledge shake off and drive away the Samkhadas 2, there should he revel in the sport that is the delight of the recluse. This, O king, is the fourth quality of the elephant he ought to have.

²⁷³ 'And again, O king, as the elephant lifts up his foot with care, and puts it down with care; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be mindful and self-possessed in lifting

²⁷⁴ * For dese bhavam the Sinhalese reads desa-bhaga, * SamkhAra is here used in the sense in which they are said at Dhammapada, verse 203, to be parama dukkha. The word is there explained by the commentator (wrongly, I think) as the five

²⁷⁵ Skandhas. The Sinhalese, p. 596, simply has sarva samskara dharmayam. VII, 4, 22. OF MILINDA THE KING. a" up his feet and in putting them down, in going or returning, in stretching his arm or drawing it back,— wherever he is he should be mindful and selfpossessed. This, O king, is the fifth quality of the elephant he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the most excellent Sawzyutta Nikaya : "Good is restraint in action, And good restraint in speech, Good is restraint in mind, Restraint throughout is good. Well guarded is he said to be Who is ashamed of sin, in all things self-controlled »."

²⁷⁶ Here ends the Fourth Chapter. [36] Zz 338 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES WIL, 5, T. Boox VII. CuHapter 5. THE SIMILES (continued).

²⁷⁷ 41. Tue Lion. 1. 'Venerable Nagasena, those seven qualities of the lion you say he ought to have, which are they ?'

²⁷⁸ 'Just, O king, as the lion is of a clear, stainless, and pure light yellow colour ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be clear, stainless, and pure light in mind, free from anger and moroseness. This, O king, is the first quality of the lion he ought to have.

²⁷⁹ 'And again, O king, as the lion has four paws as his means of travelling, and is rapid in his gait; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, move along the four paths of saintship. This, O king, is the second quality of the lion he ought to have.

²⁸⁰ ‘And again, O king, as the lion has a beautiful coat of hair, pleasant to behold; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, have a beautiful coat of righteousness, pleasant to behold. This, O king, is the third quality of the lion he ought to have.

²⁸¹ ‘And again, O king, as the lion, even were his life to cease, bows down before no man; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, even though he should cease to obtain all the requisites of a recluse—food and clothing and lodging and medicine for the sick—never bow down

²⁸² NaS . OF MILINDA THE KING. 339 to any man’. This is the fourth quality of the lion he ought to have. 5. ‘And again, O king, as the lion eats regularly on, wheresoever his prey falls there does he eat whatever he requires, and seeks not out the best morsels of flesh; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, stand for alms at each hut in regular order, not seeking out the families where he would be given better food, not missing out any house upon his rounds ?, he should not pick and choose in eating, wheresoever he may have received a mouthful of rice there should he eat it, seeking not for the best morsels. This, O king, is the fifth quality of the lion he ought to have.

²⁸³ ‘And again, O king, as the lion is not a storer up of what he eats, and when he has once eaten of his prey returns not again to it; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never be a storer up of food. This is the sixth quality of the lion he ought to have.

²⁸⁴ [401] ‘And again, O king, as the lion, even if he gets no food, is not alarmed, and if he does °, then he eats it without craving, without faintness, without sinking*; just so, O king, should the

²⁸⁵ * “Tf he does not,’ says the Sivhalese. * Anagghdpanno. The MSS. in parallel passages (Tevigga I, 27; Anguttara II, 5, 7; III, 131; Udana VU, 3, 10; Magghima I,

²⁸⁶ bP 340 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VAL, oe strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be not alarmed even if he gets no food, and if he does then should he eat it without craving, without faintness, without sinking, conscious of the danger in the lust of taste, in full knowledge of the right outcome of eating (the maintenance of life for the pursuit of holiness) 1. This, O king, is the seventh quality of the lion he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the most excellent Samyutta Nikaya, when he was exalting Maha Kassapa, the Elder :

²⁸⁷ “ This Kassapa, O Bhikshus, is content with such food as he receives, he magnifies the being content with whatever food one gets, he is not guilty of anything improper or unbecoming for the sake of an alms, if he receive none, yet is he not alarmed, and if he does then does he eat it without craving, without faintness, without sinking, conscious of danger, with full knowledge of the right object in taking food 2,”

²⁸⁸ . ‘Venerable Nagasena, those three qualities of the Aakravaka bird you say he ought to take, which are they ?’

²⁸⁹ ‘Just, O king, as the Kakravdka bird never forsakes his mate even to the close of his life; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, never, even

²⁹⁰ 173; Sumangala I, 59) have usually agghopanno. The Simhalese has 4hara tr7shw4wehi no geell. * Nissaraza-pass#ena. This Hinaé-kumburé renders nissaramikhyadtawi brahmaariydnugraha pimisa yanadiwft

²⁹¹ pratyaweksha #anayem yuktawt. * Samyutta XVI, 1, 3 (vol. ii, p194 of M. Léon Seer’s edition for the Pali Text Society). VII, 5, to. OF MILINDA THE KING. 341

²⁹² to the close of his life, give up the habit of thought. This, O king, is the first quality of the Kakravaka bird he ought to have.

²⁹³ g. ‘And again, O king, as the Kakravaka bird feeds on the Sevala and Pazaka (water-plants so called), and derives satisfaction therefrom, and being so satisfied, neither his strength nor his beauty grows less; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, find satisfaction in whatever he receives. And if he does so find satisfaction, O king, then does he decrease neither in power of meditation, nor in wisdom, nor in emancipation, nor in the insight that arises from the consciousness of emancipation, nor in any kind of goodness. [402] This, O king, is the second quality of the Kakravaka bird he ought to have.

²⁹⁴ 1o. ‘And again, O king, as the Kakravaka bird does no harm to living things ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, laying aside the cudgel, laying aside the sword, be full of modesty and pity, compassionate and kind to all creatures that have life. This, O king, is the third quality of the Kakravaka bird he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Kakravaka Gataka:

²⁹⁵ “The man who kills not, nor destroys, Oppresses not, nor causes other men To take from men that which is rightly theirs*—

²⁹⁶ ‘Buddhist Suttas,’ p. 189). 2Na gindti na gapaye. Both these forms are to be derived, I venture to think, from GVA (or its more primitive form G), and not from GI. It is true that Childers gives gin4ti as third

²⁹⁷ person singular of GI, and that (through the influence of the 342 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Wales ats And this from kindness to all things that live— No wrath with any man disturbs his peace ‘.’”

²⁹⁸ THE PEWAHIKA? BIRD. 11. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of the Pewahika bird you say he ought to take, which are they ?’

²⁹⁹ ‘Just, O king, as the Pezahika bird, through jealousy of her mate, refuses to nourish her young *; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be jealous of any evil dispositions

³⁰⁰ common word Gina) there has really, perhaps, been some confusion in Pali writers between the two roots, closely allied as they are both in form and meaning. But whether or not that be so elsewhere, we have here at least another instance of the frequent association of a simple verb with its own causal. Gdapeti, which occurs three times in the Milinda, and is always explained by Hinadé-kumburé in the same way (see my notes above on pp. 171, 227 of the Pali; here he has artha-hani no karawéa da), i neither for gapeti (as Dr. Edward Miller suggests in his grammar, p. 37) nor for gapayati, but for gyApayati. For the apparent confusion between GI, gayati, ‘conquer,’ and GYA, ginati, (1) ‘overcome, bring into subjection,’ (2) ‘oppress, extort,’ see the commentary on gine at Dhammapada, verse 103 (quoted also at Gataka I, 314), which runs ginitvana gayam Ahareyya; and on gayam at verse 201 (taken from Samyutta III, 2, 4, 7), which is explained by ginanto, and at verse 104 where gitam is explained by ginati. But in Pifaka texts I know of no instance where the two roots cannot be kept quite distinct; and it is quite possible that the Dhammapada commentator, while interpreting the one root by the other, is still conscious of the difference between them. Gina (the p.p. of ginti) is not given at all by Childers, but occurs Gataka III, 153, 223, 335; V, 90.

³⁰¹ * Gataka IV, 71. One word differs, and the lines are not spoken by the Buddha, but by the bird. * The Sinhalese (p. 600) has *kcendeettiya*, a word not in Clough.

³⁰² * Hinai-kumburé's translation of this clause shows that he had a different reading in his Pali text. Wile: OF MILINDA THE KING. 343

³⁰³ which arise within him, and putting them by his mindfulness into the excellent crevice of self-control, should dwell at the door of his mind in the constant practice of self-possession in all things relating to his body'. This, O king, is the first quality of the Peahika bird he ought to have.

³⁰⁴ 'And again, O king, as the Peahika bird spends the day in the forest in search of food, but at night time resorts for protection to the flock of birds to which she belongs; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, who has for a time resorted to solitary places for the purpose of emancipation from the ten Fetters, and found no satisfaction therein, repair back to the Order for protection against the danger of blame, and dwell under the shelter of the Order*. This, O king, is the second quality of the Pezahika bird he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Brahma Sahampati in the presence of the Blessed One:

³⁰⁵ " Seek lodgings distant from the haunts of men, Live there in freedom from the bonds of sin; But he who finds no peace in solitude May with the Order dwell, guarded in heart, Mindful and self-possessed °,"

³⁰⁶ 1 ‡As the Pevdhika, refusing to nourish her young in the nest, puts them into a crevice of a tree, and watches them there,' is the Sinhalese interpretation. And the word *susira* would not have been used in the second clause unless something corresponding to it had originally stood also in the first.

³⁰⁷ 344 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES _ VII, 5, 13. 44. THE HovusE-PIGEON. 13. [408] 'Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the house-pigeon you say he ought to take, which is it?'

³⁰⁸ 'Just, O king, as the house-pigeon, while dwelling in the abode of others, of men, does not become enamoured of anything that belongs to them, but remains neutral, taking notice only of things pertaining to birds; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, while resorting to other people's houses, never become enamoured of women or of men, of beds, or chairs, or garments, or jewelry, or things for use or enjoyment, or various forms of food that are there, but remain neutral always, addicted only to such ideas as become a recluse. This, O king, is the quality of the housepigeon he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Kulla Nanada Gataka :

³⁰⁹ " " Frequenting people's homes for food or drink, In food and drink alike be temperate, And let not beauty's form attract thy thoughts !."

³¹⁰ THE Owt. 14. 'Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of the owl you say he ought to take, which are they ?' 'Just, O king, as the owl, being at enmity with the crows, goes at night where the flocks of crows are, and kills numbers of them; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be Sdn shee eg sb Ne aE Te elias oe * Gataka IV, 223. There is a difference of reading, making no

³¹¹ difference to the sense; and the words are put into the mouth, not of the Buddha, but of the old ascetic, the Bodisat of the story.

³¹² Wits, 20. OF MILINDA THE KING. 345 at enmity with ignorance ; seated alone and in secret, he should crush it out of existence, cut it off at the root. This, O king, is the first quality of the owl he ought to have.

³¹³ ‘And again, O king, as the owl is a solitary bird; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be devoted to solitude, take delight in solitude. This, O king, is the second quality of the owl he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the most excellent Sawyutta Nikaya:

³¹⁴ “Let the Bhikshu, my brethren, be Ge to solitude, take delight in solitude, to the end that he may realise what sorrow really is, and what the origin of sorrow really is, [404] and what the cessation of sorrow really is, and what the path that leads to the cessation of sorrow really is.”

³¹⁵ THE INDIAN CRANE? 16. ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the Indian crane you say he ought to take, which is it ?’

³¹⁶ ‘Just, O king, as the Indian crane by its cry makes known to other folk the good fortune or disaster that is about to happen to them; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, make known to others by his preaching of the Dhamma how dreadful a state is purgatory, and how blissful is Nirvaza. This, O king, is the quality of the Indian crane he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Pizdola Bhara-dvaga, the elder:

³¹⁷ * Not traced as yet. 346 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII,-5, 27: “Two matters there are that the earnest recluse Should ever to others be making clear— How fearful, how terrible, purgatory is ; How great and how deep is Nirvaza’s bliss?.”

³¹⁸ THE Bat. 17. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of the bat you say he ought to take, which are they ?’ ‘Just, O king, as the bat, though it enters into men’s dwelling-places, and flies about in them, soon goes out from them, delays not therein; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when he has entered the village for alms, and gone on his rounds in regular order, depart quickly with the alms he has received, and delay not therein. This, O king, is the first quality of the bat he ought to have.

³¹⁹ ‘And again, O king, as the bat, while frequenting other folk’s houses, does them no harm; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when visiting the houses of the laity, never give them cause for vexation by persistent requests, or by pointing out what he wants, or by wrong demeanour, or by chattering, or by being indifferent to their prosperity or adversity; he should never take them away from their chief business occupations, but desire their success in all things. This, O king, is the second quality of the bat he ought to have. For it was said, O king, [405] by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Lakkhaza Suttanta:

³²⁰ “*Oh! How may others never suffer loss Or diminution, whether in their faith, * Not traced as yet. VII, 5, 19. OF MILINDA THE KING, 347

³²¹ Or righteousness, or knowledge of the word, Or understanding, or self-sacrifice, Or in religion, or in all good things, Or in their stores of wealth, or corn, or lands,

³²² Or tenements, or in their sons, or Wives, Or in their flocks and herds, or in their friends, And relatives, and kinsmen, or in strength,

³²³ In beauty, and in joy’—’tis thus he thinks— Longing for other men’s advantage and success!!”””

48. Tue Lercu. 19. ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the leech which you say he ought to take, which is it?’

³²⁴ ‘Just, O king, as the leech, wheresoever it is put on, there does it adhere firmly, drinking the blood; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, on whatsoever subject for meditation he may fix his mind, call that subject firmly up before him in respect of its colour, and shape, and position, and extension, and boundaries, and nature, and characteristic marks, drinking the delicious draught of the ambrosia of emancipation. This, O king, is the quality of the leech he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Anuruddha, the Elder: “With heart made pure, in meditation firm,

³²⁵ Drink deep of freedom’s never-failing draught?.”” ® Not traced as yet. Childers translates *asefana* by ‘charming,’ &c., apparently on the authority of Subhfti’s English gloss on *Abhidhana Padipikaé* 597. But that meaning is rather the point of union between all the synonyms given in the verse, and not the exact meaning of each of them. The word, either in its simple form, or with an added -ka, occurs in *Theri Gatha* 55; *Maggfima Nikaya* I, 114.

³²⁶ 348 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 5, 20. 49. THE SERPENT. 20. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those three qualities of the serpent you say he ought to take, which are they °°

³²⁷ ‘Just, O king, as the serpent progresses by means of its belly; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, progress by means of his knowledge. For the heart of the recluse, O king, who progresses by knowledge, continues in perception (of the four Truths), that which is inconsistent with the characteristics of a recluse! does he put away, that which is consistent with them does he develop in himself. This, [406] O king, is the first quality of the serpent he ought to have.

³²⁸ ‘And again, O king, just as the serpent as it moves avoids drugs?; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, go on his way avoiding unrighteousness. This, O king, is the second quality of the serpent he ought to have.

³²⁹ ‘And again, O king, as the serpent on catching sight of men is anxious, and pained, and seeks a way of escape®; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, when he finds himself thinking wrong thoughts, or discontent arising within him, be anxious and pained, and seek a way of escape, saying to himself: “This day must I have spent in carelessness, and never shall I be able to recover it.” This, O king, is the third quality of the

³³⁰ * *Vilakkhazam*, not found elsewhere. *Hitnasi-kumburé*, p. 604, renders it simply ‘dullness’ (*moha*). * ‘Goes slanting, avoiding medicinal plants, trees, &c.,’ says the *Simhalese*.

³³¹ * *Kintayati*, perhaps ‘put out.’ *Goelaw? yanta sitanneya*, says the *Simhalese*, p. 605. VII, 5, 23. OF MILINDA THE KING. 349

³³² serpent he ought to have. For it is a saying, O king, of the two fairy birds in the *Bhallatiya GAtaka* : “’Tis one night only, hunter, that we’ve spent Away from home, and that against our will, And thinking all night through of one another, Yet that one night is it that we bemoan,

³³³ And grieve; for nevermore can it return!!”” 50. THE ROOCK-SNAKE 2”. 23. ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the rock-snake that you say he ought to take, which is it?’

³³⁴ ‘Just, O king, as the rock-snake, immense as is its length of body, will go many days with empty belly, and, wretched, get no food to fill its stomach, yet in spite of that it will just manage to keep

itself alive ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, though he be addicted to obtaining his food by alms, dependent on the gifts that others may give, awaiting offers, abstaining from taking anything himself, and find it difficult to get his belly's-full, yet should he, if he seek after the highest good 3, even though he receive not so much as four or five mouthfuls to eat, fill up the void by water. This, O king, is the quality of the rock-snake he ought to have. For it was said, O king, [407] by Sériputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith:

³³⁵ @ Athavasikena, attha being rendered Nirvaza by the Simhalese. 350 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES WEL,5 523° “Whether it be dry food or wet he eats, Let him to full repletion never eat. The good recluse goes forth in emptiness, And keeps to moderation in his food. If but four mouthfuls or but five he get, Let him drink water. For what cares the man With mind on Arahatsip fixed for ease1!”

³³⁶ Here ends the Fifth Chapter. VII, 6, 2. OF MILINDA THE KING. 351 Book VII. Cuaprer 6. THE SIMILES (continued). 51. The Roap SPpIper.

³³⁷ ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the road spider you say he ought to have, which is it?’ ‘Just, O king, as the road spider weaves the cur-

³³⁸ tain of its net on the road, and whatsoever is caught therein, whether worm, or fly, or beetle, that does he catch and eat; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, spread the curtain of the net of self-possession over the six doors (of his six senses), and if any of the flies of evil are caught therein, there should he seize them. This, O king, is the quality of the road spider he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Anuruddha, the Elder:

³³⁹ “His heart should he shut in, at its six doors, By self-possession, best and chief of gifts, Should any evil thoughts be caught within, Them by the sword of insight should he slay '.”

³⁴⁰ THE Cuitp at THE Breast. 2. ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the child at the breast you say he ought to take, [408] which is it ?’

³⁴¹ ‘Just, O king, as the child at the breast sticks to its own advantage, and if it wants milk, cries for it; * Not traced as yet.

³⁴² 352 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 6, 3- just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, adhere to his own good, and in everything—in teaching, in asking and answering questions, in the conduct of life, in the habit of solitude, in association with his teachers, in the cultivation of the friendship of the good—should he act with knowledge of the Truth. This, O king, is the quality of the child at the breast he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Digha Nikaya, in the Suttanta of the Great Decease:

³⁴³ “Be zealous, rather, I beseech you, Ananda, in your own behalf. Devote yourselves to your own good. Be earnest, all aglow, intent on your own good?!”

³⁴⁴ THE Lanp Torroise*. 3. ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the land tortoise which you say he ought to take, which is it?’

³⁴⁵ ‘Just, O king, as the land tortoise, being afraid of the water, frequents places far from it, and by that habit of avoiding water its length of life is kept undiminished ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, seeing the danger in the want of earnestness, be mindful of the advantages that distinguish earnestness. For by that perception of

³⁴⁶ * Maha-parinibbana Suttanta V, 24, translated in ‘Buddhist Suttas,’ p. 91. The beginning of the exhortation has been already quoted above, p. 177 (of the Pali).

³⁴⁷ ® Kittaka-dhara-kummassa, literally ‘of the tortoise who wears the sectarian mark (on his forehead).’ The Simhalese repeats this phrase, which clearly distinguishes this tortoise from the other, the water tortoise, of VII, 1, 12.

³⁴⁸ VII, 6, g. OF MILINDA THE KING. eSB danger in carelessness, his Samazaship fades not away, but rather does he go forward to Nirvaza itself. This, O king, is the quality of the land tortoise he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Dhammapada: “The Bhikshu who in earnestness delights,

³⁴⁹ Who sees the danger of indifference, Shall fall not from his high estate away, But in the presence of Nirvaza dwell.” 54. Tae Mountain Heicur.

³⁵⁰ ‘Venerable Nagasena, those five qualities of the mountain height you say he ought to have, which are they?’ ‘Just, O king, as the mountain height is a hidingplace for the wicked; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, keep secret the offences and failings of others, revealing them not. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of the mountain height he ought to have.

³⁵¹ ‘And again, O king, just as the mountain height is void of many people; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, [409] earnest in effort, be void of lust, angers, follies, and pride, of the net of (wrong) views’, and of all evil dispositions. This, O king,

³⁵² ? Dhammapada, verse 32. The source from which the verse is taken is unknown now, and was also evidently unknown to our author. With the closing words nibbanass eva santike, compare verse 372,8a ve nibbana-santike. Santike, ‘immediate, close,’ is always used with the connotation of being in the very presence of. The local qualification, ‘near,’ is upanissaya, avidfre.

³⁵³ ? Disthi-gala, the net of delusions, those relating to the per- [36] mk 354 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 6, 6. is the second quality of the mountain height he ought to have.

³⁵⁴ ‘And again, O king, just as the mountain height is a lonely spot, free from crowding of men; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be given to solitude, and free from evil, unworthy qualities, from those that are not noble. This, O king, is the third quality of the mountain height he ought to have.

³⁵⁵ ‘And again, O king, just as the mountain height is clean and pure; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be good and pure, happy, and without self-righteousness. This, O king, is the fourth quality of the mountain height he ought to have.

³⁵⁶ ‘And again, O king, just as the mountain height is the resort of the noble ones; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be sought after by the noble ones. This, O king, is the fifth quality of the mountain height he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the most excellent Sazzyutta Nikaya :

³⁵⁷ “With solitary men, those noble ones, Whose minds, on Arahatsip strictly bent, Rise easily to contemplation’s heights, Stedfast in zeal and wise in holy writ—

³⁵⁸ With such should he resort, with such commune},” manence of any individuality, and the separateness of oneself from others, as well those now living as those in the future and the past.

³⁵⁹ * This is a favourite stanza. It occurs in the Samyutta XIV, 16-18, and is included in the verses ascribed, in the Thera Gatha, to the Arahats Somamitta and Vimala (verses 148, 266).

³⁶⁰ VII, 6, 11. OF MILINDA THE KING. 355 55. Tue TRree, 9. 'Venerable Nagasena, those three qualities of the tree you say he ought to take, which are they?'

³⁶¹ 'Just, O king, as the tree bears fruits and flowers ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, bear the flowers of emancipation and the fruits of Samazaship'. This, O king, is the first quality of the tree he ought to have.

³⁶² 'And again, O king, as the tree casts its shadow over the men who come to it, and stay beneath it; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, receive with kindness, both as regards their bodily wants and their religious necessities, those that wait upon him, and remain near by him. This, O king, is the second quality of the tree he ought to have.

³⁶³ 'And again, O king, just as the tree makes no kind of distinction in the shadow it affords; [410] just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, make no distinctions between all men, but nourish an equal love to those who rob, or hurt, or bear enmity to him, and to those who are like unto himself. This, O king, is the third quality of the tree he ought to have, For it was said, O king, by Sariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the-Faith ;

³⁶⁴ " Devadatta, who tried to murder him; Angulimala, highway robber chief; The elephant set loose to take his life ; And R&hula, the good, his only son— The sage is equal-minded to them all *."

³⁶⁵ Aa 2 356 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 6, 12. 56. Tue Rain. 12, 'Venerable Nagasena, those five qualities of the rain you say he ought to take, which are they ?'

³⁶⁶ ' Just, O king, as the rain lays any dust that arises ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, lay the dust and dirt of any evil dispositions that may arise within him. This, O king, is the first quality of the rain he ought to have.

³⁶⁷ 'And again, O king, just as the rain allays the heat of the ground; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, soothe the whole world of gods and men, with the feeling of his love. This, O king, is the second quality of the rain he ought to have.

³⁶⁸ 'And again, O king, as the rain makes all kinds of vegetation to grow; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, cause faith to spring up in all beings, and make that seed of faith grow up into the three Attainments, not only the lesser attainments of glorious rebirths in heaven or on earth, but also the attainment of the highest good, the bliss of Arahatsship?, This, O king, is the third quality of the rain he ought to have.

³⁶⁹ 'And again, O king, just as the rain-cloud, rising up in the hot season, affords protection to the grass, and trees, and creepers, and shrubs, and medicinal herbs, and to the monarchs of the woods that grow on the surface of the earth; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort,

³⁷⁰ where it is quoted with some variation. See the Commentary on the Dhammapada, p. 144. * In my note above, I, 146, I might have referred to this passage.

³⁷¹ VII, 6, 18. OF MILINDA THE KING. an cultivating the habit of thoughtfulness, afford protection by his thoughtfulness to his condition of Samazaship, for in thoughtfulness is it that all good qualities have their root. This, O king, is the fourth quality of the rain he ought to have.

³⁷² [411] ‘And again, O king, as the rain when it pours down fills the rivers, and reservoirs, and artificial lakes, the caves, and chasms, and ponds, and holes, and wells, with water; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, pour down the rain of the Dhamma according to the texts handed down by tradition, and so fill to satisfaction the mind of those who are longing for instruction. This, O king, is the fifth quality of the rain he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Sariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith:

³⁷³ ““When the Great Sage perceives a man afar, Were it a hundred or a thousand leagues, Ripe for enlightenment, straightway he goes

³⁷⁴ And guides him gently to the path of Truth*” 57. THE DRAMONP. 17. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those three qualities of the diamond you say he ought to take, which are they?’

³⁷⁵ ‘Just, O king, as the diamond is pure throughout ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be perfectly pure in his means of livelihood. This, O king, is the first quality of the diamond he ought to have.

³⁷⁶ ‘And again, O king, as the diamond cannot 358 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 6, 109. be alloyed with any other substance ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never mix with wicked men as friends. This, O king, is the second quality of the diamond he ought to have. 19. ‘And again, O king, just as the diamond is set together with the most costly gems; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, associate with those of the higher excellence, with men who have entered the first or the second or the third stage of the Noble Path, with the jewel treasures of the Arahats, of the recluses, of the threefold Wisdom, or of the sixfold Insight. This, O king, is the third quality of the diamond he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Sutta Nipata:

³⁷⁷ “Let the pure associate with the pure, Ever in recollection firm ; Dwelling harmoniously wise Thus shall ye put an end to griefs },”

³⁷⁸ Tue Hunter. 20, [412] ‘Venerable Nagasena, those four qualities of the hunter you say he ought to have, which are they?’

³⁷⁹ ‘Just, O king, as the hunter is indefatigable, so also, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be indefatigable. This, O king, is the first quality of the hunter he ought to have.

³⁸⁰ ‘And again, O king, just as the hunter keeps his attention fixed on the deer ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, keep his

³⁸¹ * Sutta Nipata II, 6, 10 (verse 282), VII, 6, 23. OF MILINDA THE KING, 3259 attention fixed on the particular object which is the subject of his thought. This, O king, is the second quality of the hunter he ought to have.

³⁸² ‘And again, O king, just as the hunter knows the right time for his work; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, know the right time for retirement, saying to himself: “ Now is the right time to retire. Now is the right time to come out of retirement.” This, O king, is the third quality of the hunter he ought to have.

³⁸³ ‘And again, O king, just as the hunter on catching sight of a deer experiences joy at the thought: “Him shall I get!” just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, rejoice at the sight of an object for contemplation, and experience joy at the thought: “ Thereby shall I grasp the specific

idea of which I am in search *.” This, O king, is the fourth quality of the hunter he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Mogharaga, the Elder:

³⁸⁴ 1 Uttarim visesam udhigakshissami. Hinasi-kumburé, p. 614, renders this, ‘shall I arrive at the advantage of the attainment of the fruits of the path’ And he may be right, as the word *uttarim* is used. But the context seems to imply the rendering I have ventured to give, which preserves the usual connotation in this connection of the other two words of the phrase. A Bhikshu, for instance, on seeing a faded flower, will try to realise, to conjure up before his mind, the real fact of the transitoriness of all earthly (and of all heavenly) things. That is the specific idea of which he is in search; the deer he has to catch. No doubt it is only an intermediate step to the realisation of the fruits of the path. But as *visesam adhigakkhati* is the technical term for success in such meditation, I cannot but think that the mind of our author was directed to the intermediate, rather than to the later stage of the Bhikshu’s endeavour. The Sinhalese has, perhaps, been guided by the verse, but there the word *visesam* is omitted.

³⁸⁵ 360 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 6, 24. “ The recluse who, with mind on Nirvāṇa bent, Has acquired an object his thoughts to guide, Should be filled with exceeding joy at the hope: ‘By this my uttermost aim shall I gain*’”

³⁸⁶ THE FISHERMAN. 24. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of the fisherman you say he ought to take, which are they ?’

³⁸⁷ ‘Just, O king, as the fisherman draws up the fish on his hook; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, draw up by his knowledge, and that to the uttermost, the fruits of Samāśīp. This, O king, is the first quality of the fisherman he ought to have.

³⁸⁸ ‘And again, O king, just as the fisherman by the sacrifice of a very little comes to great gain?; just so, O king, [418] should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, renounce the mean baits of worldly things ; then by that renunciation will he gain the mighty fruits of Samāśīp. This, O king, is the second quality of the fisherman he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Rāhula, the Elder :

³⁸⁹ “ Renouncing the baits of the world he shall gain The state that is void of lust, anger, and sin,— Those conditions of sentient life—and be free, Free from the cravings that mortals feel,

³⁹⁰ And the fruits of the stages of th’ Excellent Way And the six modes of Insight shall all be his %.” * Not traced as yet. There are stanzas of Mogha-raga’s both in the Sutta Nipata and the Thera Gāth, but this is not one of them.

³⁹¹ * By putting a small fish on his hook catches a big one. * Not traced as yet. VII, 6, 24. OF MILINDA THE KING. 361 60. THE CARPENTER.

³⁹² ‘Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of the carpenter he ought to take, which are they ?’ ‘Just, O king, as the carpenter saws off the wood along the line of the blackened string (he has put round it to guide him)!; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, standing on righteousness as a basis, and holding in the hand of faith the saw of knowledge, cut off his evil dispositions according to the doctrine laid down by the Conquerors. This, O king, is the first quality of the carpenter he ought to have.

³⁹³ ‘And again, O king, just as the carpenter, discarding the soft parts of the wood, takes the hard parts; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, forsaking the path of the

discussion of useless theses, to wit :—the everlasting life theory—the let-us-eat-and-drink-for-tomorrow-we-die theory *—the theory that the soul and the body are one and the same—that the soul is one thing, the body another—that all teachings are alike

³⁹⁴ * Kaa-suttam. See Dr. Morris's note in the ' Journal of the Pali Text Society, 1884, pp. 76-78, where he compares Maha Vastu, p. 17, and other passages. .

³⁹⁵ 262 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES _ VII, 6, 24. excellent —that what is not done is of no avail— that men's actions are of no importance—that holliness of life does not matter—that on the destruction of beings nine new sorts of beings appear—that the constituent elements of being are eternal ?—that he who commits an act experiences the result thereof— that one acts and another experiences the result of this action—and other such theories of Karma or wrong views on the result of actions—forsaking, I say, all such theses, paths which lead to heresy, he should learn what is the real nature of those constituent elements of which each individuality is, for the short term of its individuality, put together, and so reach forward to that state which is void of lusts, of malice, and of dullness, in which the excitements of individuality are known no more, and which is therefore designated the Void Supreme *.

³⁹⁶ * The Sinhalese takes all the four previous phrases as qualifying this last one. ' This passage will be found of the greatest importance for the history of the development of early Buddhist belief. In the present state of our knowledge—or rather of our ignorance—of that subject, its obscure allusions are no doubt unintelligible. But they will not always remain so.. And, when rightly understood, they will be expressly valuable inasmuch as they refer to that department of Buddhist belief of which we know, from other sources, the least. The development—or degeneration, if the expression be preferred —of Buddhist doctrine took place along three principal lines. Firstly, in the doctrine as to the person of the Buddha; secondly, in the pushing of Arahatsip into the background and the elevation, in its place, of Bodisatsip into the ideal; and thirdly, in the doctrine of the relation of man to the universe. We know a good deal of the growth of the legend of the Buddha, and of the change in the ethical standpoint. Of the evolution of the philosophic conceptions we know at present but little. It is on this last point that our author here lets us somewhat behind the scenes. The theses he

³⁹⁷ VII, 6, 24. OF MILINDA THE KING. Boe This, O king, is the second quality of the carpenter he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the

³⁹⁸ Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Sutta Nipata : “ Get rid of filth?! Put aside rubbish from you! Winnow away the chaff?, the men who hold Those who are not so, as true Samazas!

³⁹⁹ Get rid of those who harbour evil thoughts, Who follow after evil modes of life ! Thoughtful yourselves, and pure, with those resort, With those associate, who are pure themselves?!”

⁴⁰⁰ Here ends the Sixth Chapter. condemns are to some extent the same as those the discussion of which is condemned in the well-known passages in the Pitakas, where similar lists occur. In other respects they are evidence of a different and later stage of thought than appears in those parts of the Pitakas at present accessible. And on the positive side, in the closing words, though the author has evidently enough the old Arahatsip in view, yet he chooses expressions which became the germ of the much later nihilism of the Madhyamika school, which has had so much influence in the more corrupt Buddhisms, more especially in China. As these later views never penetrated into Ceylon (or at least never had any vogue there, and were forgotten when Hinasi-kumbur  wrote), it is not

surprising that the Sinhalese scholar should be at fault in his interpretation of this difficult passage. Sanskrit Buddhist texts will be here the best commentary.

⁴⁰¹ 364 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 7, 1. Boox VII. Cuaprer 7. THE SIMILES (continued). 61. THE WATERPOT. 1, [414] ‘Venerable Nagasena, that one quality of the waterpot you say he ought to take, which is it? ;

⁴⁰² ‘Just, O king, as the waterpot when it is full gives forth no sound; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, even when he has reached the summit of Samazaship, and knows all tradition and learning and interpretation, yet should give forth no sound, not pride himself thereon, not show himself puffed up, but putting away pride and self-righteousness, should be straightforward, not garrulous of himself, neither deprecating others. This, O king, is the quality of the waterpot he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods, in the Sutta Nipata:

⁴⁰³ “What is not full, that is the thing that sounds, That which is full is noiseless and at rest ; The fool is like an empty waterpot,

⁴⁰⁴ The wise man like a deep pool, clear and full 3.” 62. Biack Iron 2, 2. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of black iron you say he ought to take, which are they ?’ [415] ‘Just, O king, as black iron even when

⁴⁰⁵ * Sutta Nipata III, 11, 43 (verse 721). * Kadayasa. I suppose to distinguish it from bronze. Vib. gag. OF MILINDA THE KING. 365

⁴⁰⁶ beaten out’ carries weight; just so, O king, should the mind of the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be able, by his habit of thoughtfulness, to carry heavy burdens. This, O king, is the first quality of black iron he ought to have. -

⁴⁰⁷ ‘And again, O king, as black iron does not vomit up the water it has once soaked in?; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, never give up the faith he has once felt in the greatness of the Blessed One, the Supreme Buddha, in the perfection of his Doctrine, in the excellence of the Order—never give up the knowledge he has once acquired of the impermanence of forms, or of sensations, or of ideas, or of qualities, or of modes of consciousness. This, O king, is the second quality of black iron he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all gods :

⁴⁰⁸ “That man who is in insight purified, Trained in the doctrine of the Noble Ones, Grasping distinctions as they really are, What need hath he to tremble ? Not in part Only, but in its full extent, shall he

⁴⁰⁹ To the clear heights of Arahatsip attain *.” 63. THE SUNSHADE. 4. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those three qualities of the sunshade’ you say he ought to take, which are they ?’

⁴¹⁰ 366 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES 66 0 ‘Just, O king, as the sunshade goes along over one’s head; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be of a character above all evil dispositions. This, O king, is the first quality of the sunshade he ought to have.

⁴¹¹ ‘And again, O king, just as the sunshade is held over the head by a handle; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, have thoughtfulness as his handle. This, O king, is the second quality of the sunshade he ought to have.

⁴¹² ‘And again, O king, as the sunshade wards off winds and heat and storms of rain; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, ward off the empty winds of the opinions of the numerous Samazas and Brahmans who hold forth their various and divergent nostrums, ward off the heat of the threefold fire (of lust, malice, and dullness), and ward off the rains of evil dispositions. [416] This, O king, is the third quality of the sunshade he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Sdariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith:

⁴¹³ “As a broad sunshade spreading far and firm, Without a hole from rim to rim, wards off: The burning heat, and the god’s mighty rain; So doth the Buddha’s son, all pure within, Bearing the sunshade brave of righteousness, Ward off the rain of evil tendencies,

⁴¹⁴ And the dread heat of all the threefold fire,” ported, not by a short stick fixed underneath its centre, but by a long stick fastened to a point on its circumference; and carried, not by the person it shades, but by an attendant behind him.

⁴¹⁵ * Not traced as yet. VII, 7, 9. OF MILINDA THE KING. 367 64. THE Rice Fievp. 7, ‘Venerable Nagasena, those three qualities of the rice field you say he ought to have, which are they?’

⁴¹⁶ ‘Just, O king, as the rice field is provided with canals for irrigation; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be provided with the lists of the various duties incumbent on the righteous man—the canals that bring the water to the rice fields of the Buddha’s doctrine’. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of the rice field he ought to have.

⁴¹⁷ ‘And again, O king, just as the rice field is provided with embankments whereby men keep the water in, and so bring the crop to maturity; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be provided with the embankments of righteousness of life, and shame at sin, and thereby keep his Samazaship intact, and gain the fruits thereof. This, O king, is the second quality of the rice field he ought to have.

⁴¹⁸ 9g. ‘And again, O king, just as the rice field is fruitful, filling the heart of the farmer with joy, so that if the seed be little the crop is great, and if the seed be much the crop is greater still; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be fruitful to the bearing of much good fruit, making the hearts of those who support him to rejoice, so that where little is given the result is great, and where much is given the result is greater still.

⁴¹⁹ 368 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES _ VII, 7, 10. This, O king, is the third quality of the rice field he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Upali, the Elder, he who carried the rules of the Order in his head : “ Be fruitful as a rice field, yea, be rich In all good works! For that is the best field Which yieldeth to the sower the goodliest crop.”

⁴²⁰ , [417] ‘Venerable Nagasena, those two qualities of medicine you say he ought to take, which are. they ?’

⁴²¹ ‘Just, O king, as vermin are not produced in medicine; just so, O king, should no evil dispositions be allowed to arise in the mind of the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of medicine he ought to have.

⁴²² ‘And again, O king, just as medicine is an antidote to whatever poison may have _ been imparted by bites or contact, by eating or by drinking in any way; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, counteract in himself the poison of lusts, and malice, and dullness, and

pride, and wrong belief. This, O king, is the second of the qualities of medicine he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by the Blessed One, the god over all the gods:

⁴²³ “The strenuous recluse who longs to see Into the nature, and the meaning true, Of the constituent elements of things, Must as it were an antidote become,

⁴²⁴ To the destruction of all evil thoughts '.” Not traced as yet. VII,. 7; 09. OF MILINDA THE KING. 369 Rk a 66. Soon. 12. ‘Venerable Nagasena, those three qualities of food you say he ought to take, which are they ?’

⁴²⁵ ‘Just, O king, as food is the support of all beings, just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be a handle, as it were, by which all beings may open the door of the noble eightfold path. This, O king, is the first of the qualities of food he ought to have.

⁴²⁶ ‘And again, O king, just as food increases people's strength; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, grow in increase of virtue. This, O king, is the second of the qualities of food he ought to have.

⁴²⁷ ‘And again, O king, just as food is a thing desired of all beings; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, be desired of all the world. This, O king, is the third of the qualities of food he ought to have. For it was said, O king, by Maha Moggallana, the Elder :

⁴²⁸ “ By self-restraint, training, and righteousness, By duty done, and by attainments reached, The strenuous recluse should make himself To all men in the world a thing desired 1.”’

⁴²⁹ . [418] ‘Venerable Nagasena, those four qualities of the archer you say he ought to take, which are they?’

⁴³⁰ ‘Just, O king, as the archer, when discharging ? Not traced as yet. [36] Bb 370 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES VII, 7, 16. eS

⁴³¹ his arrows, plants both his feet firmly on the ground, keeps his knees straight, hangs his quiver against the narrow part of his waist, keeps his whole body steady, places both his hands firmly on the point of junction (of the arrow on the bow), closes his fists, leaves no openings between his fingers, stretches out his neck, shuts his mouth and one eye’, and takes aim? in joy at the thought: “I shall hit it*,” just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, plant firmly the feet of his zeal on the basis of righteousness, keep intact his kindness and tenderness of heart, fix his mind on subjugation of the senses, keep himself steady by selfrestraint and performance of duty, suppress excitement and sense of faintness, by continual thoughtfulness let no openings remain in his mind, reach forward in zeal, shut the six doors (of the five senses and the mind), and continue mindful and thoughtful in joy at the thought: “ By the javelin of my knowledge will I slay all my evil dispositions.” This, O king, is the first of the qualities of the archer he ought to have.

⁴³² #°And again, O king, as the archer carries a vice® for straightening out bent and crooked and * Literally ‘and his eyes.’

⁴³³ > Nimittam ugum karoti. ‘Keeps his mind directed,’ says Hinadi-kumburé, p. 621. * On other technical terms of archery, compare above, p. 352 (of the Pali).

⁴³⁴ * From this point to the end, Mr. Trenckner’s text is taken from a MS. brought from Siam, as explained in his Introduction, pp. vy, vi, and in my Introduction, I, xxiv. Hinaṭi-kumburé gives no indication of any change here in the MSS. he used.

⁴³⁵ VII, 7, 17. OF MILINDA THE KING. 241 uneven arrows ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, carry about with him, so long as he is in the body, the vice of mindfulness and thoughtfulness, wherewith he may straighten out any crooked and bent and shifty ideas. This, O king, is the second of the qualities of the archer he ought to have.

⁴³⁶ ‘And again, O king, as the archer practises ! at a target; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, practise, so long as he is in the body. And how, O king, should he practise ? He should practise himself in the idea of the impermanence of all things, of the sorrow inherent in individuality, in the absence in any thing or creature of any abiding principle (any soul); in the ideas of the diseases, sores, pains, aches, and ailments of the body that follow in the train of the necessary conditions of individuality ; in the ideas of its dependence on others”, and of its certain disintegration *; in the ideas of the calamities, dangers, fears, and misfortunes to which it is subject; of its instability under the changing conditions of life; of its liability to dissolution, its want of firmness, its being no true place of refuge, no cave of security, no home of protection, no right object of trust; of its vanity, emptiness, danger, and insubstantiality [419]; of its being the source of pains and subject to punish-

⁴³⁷ ® Palokato, from rug. Bb 372 THE QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES Vil, 7, 18: ments! and full of impurity, a mongrel compound of conditions and qualities that have no coherence; of its being the food alike of evil and of the Evil One’; of its inherent liability to rebirths, old age, disease, and death, to griefs, lamentations, despair ; and of the corruption of the cravings and delusions that are never absent from it. This, O king, is the third of the qualities of the archer he ought to have.

⁴³⁸ ‘And again, O king, just as the archer practises early and late ; just so, O king, should the strenuous Bhikshu, earnest in effort, practise meditation early and late. For it was said, O king, by Sariputta, the Elder, the Commander of the Faith: “ Early and late the true archer will practise,

⁴³⁹ Tis only by never neglecting his art, That he earns the reward and the wage of his skill. So the sons of the Buddha, too, practise their art.

⁴⁴⁰ It is just by never neglecting in thought The conditions of life in this bodily frame That they gain the rich fruits which the Arahats

⁴⁴¹ love §,” Here ends the fifth riddle, the riddle of the archer. Here end the two hundred and sixty-two questions of Milinda, as handed down in the book in its six parts, adorned with twenty-two chapters. Now those which have not been handed down are forty-

⁴⁴² " Vadhakato, ‘untrustworthy as the man who assassinates his friend,’ says Hinasi-kumburé, p. 623. * Maramisato, given by Hfnadi-kumburé both in the PAlI and Simhalese, but omitted by Mr. Trenckner. (Mrztyu-m4ra-klesa marayaua aharaya-wu-bewim.)

⁴⁴³ * Not traced as yet. Vary 208 OF MILINDA THE KING. Bey ek two'. Taking together all those that have been, and those that have not been, handed down, there are three hundred plus four, all of which are reckoned as ‘Questions of Milinda *.’

⁴⁴⁴ On the conclusion of this putting of puzzles and giving of solutions between the king and the Elder, this great earth, eighty-four thousand leagues in extent, shook six times even to its ocean boundary, the lightnings flashed, the gods poured down a rainfall of flowers from heaven, Maha Brahma himself signified his applause, and there was a mighty roar like the crashing and thundering of a storm in the mighty deep. And on beholding that wonder, the five hundred high ministers of the

field, where he was born. Every unnansé in Ceylon has such a local name in addition to his religious name. And the religious names being often identical (there are, for instance, many Sumangalas), the Bhikkhus are usually spoken of by the former, and not by the latter.]

⁴⁵⁶ PAR tf P. xxv. For 'Mahayana' read 'Madhyamika.' There is a Nagasena mentioned in the Bharhut Tope.

⁴⁵⁷ » 6, 1.1. Read 'to Tissa the Elder, the son of the Moggali.' The whole sentence had better perhaps have been rendered: 'And these two also were foreseen by our Buddha (just as he foresaw Tissa the Elder, the son of the Moggalt), in that he foretold, saying, &c.'

⁴⁵⁸ n.1. The phrase isi-vatam parivatam nagaram akamsu recurs at Gataka III, 142; Samanta Pasadika 316; Saddhamma Samgaha 41.

⁴⁵⁹ n. 1. Compare Saddhamma Samgaha, p. 42. 60, § 13. On the first simile, compare the Samyutta Nikaya XXII, LOZ ie 76, last line. For 'yoke' read 'yolk.'

⁴⁶⁰ It would have been better perhaps to have avoided the use of the words 'where' and 'there,' and to have rendered: 'In the case of beings who, having died, have been reborn elsewhere, time is, In the case of beings who, having died, have not been reborn elsewhere, time is not. And in the case of beings, &c.' The three cases are those of the Puthuggana, the Arahāt when dead, and the Arahāt alive. My note refers to the third case, not to the second; and should, I think, be modified accordingly. See Samyutta Nikaya III, 12, 35; Maha Parinibbana Sutta IV, 3; Dhammapada, verse 89; Sutta Nipata II, 13, 1, 12; Magghima Nikaya I, 235; Gataka IV, 453; and compare Udana, p. 80.

⁴⁶¹ Hinati-kumburé gives only a literal translation. A similar question is discussed in the Katha Vatthu XV, 3. 99, n. 1. For 'chapter' read 'book, p. 39.'

⁴⁶² 1.16. After 'brought about' insert a comma. 118, § 5. I now prefer 'initiation' instead of 'ordination' as the translation of Upasampada.

⁴⁶³ n. 1. This interpretation is confirmed by part ii, p. 197. 129,1. 7. The phrase, 'though his hands and feet were cut off,' seems, at first sight, out of place. But compare part ii, p. 147.

⁴⁶⁴ », 150, 1, 2. Read 'and not accepting them,' we S . ~ ~ a s » ~ . . 378 QUESTIONS AND PUZZLES OF MILINDA THE KING. P. 153, § 18. Read ' Kizka:' and compare Gataka IV, 189.

⁴⁶⁵ 164 (six lines from the bottom of the page), Read 'and then a subsequent ease to the pain he has given.' 176, § 39. In accordance with the note at part ii, pp. 86, 87, we must read 'a huge and mighty cauldron, full of water and crowded with grains of rice, is placed over a fireplace,'

⁴⁶⁶ », 179. On the problem of king Sivi and his new eyes, compare the question discussed in Katha Vatthu III, 7. » 229, D. 1,1. 6. For 'these' read ' those.'

⁴⁶⁷ n. 2. For 'But I never think' read ' But I now think.' », 241, § 20, For 'The Master said, Nagasena,?' read 'The Master

⁴⁶⁸ said, O king.' » 244, n. 2. For ' Gatharaggi' read ' Gatharaggi.' », 278, n. 1. For 'adika' read 'Aadika.' », 288, n. 3. For ' purdhita' read ' purohita.'

⁴⁶⁹ » 290,n. 2. This story, which I could not trace, is no doubt the one referred to in Kariya Pitaka I, 7. » » 291, 1. 22. Read ' Uposatha.'

⁴⁷⁰ " ~ PART: P. 27, last line but two. Read 'kdma-loka,' 29,n.2,1.7. Read 'samsara,' 139, 1. 4. For 'sun and moon' read 'moon and sun,'

⁴⁷¹ two lines from the bottom. For 'O king' read 'Sir? 150, four lines from the bottom. For 'destructions' read 'distinctions.'

⁴⁷² n.1. Read 'samahato, 219,n. 2. Read 'bhavana.' 252, 1.4. For 'pulling' read 'putting.' »» 271, n.1. Compare the 'Journal of the Pali Text Society,' 1887, p. 155. ~t S ~ S ~ S